

shift in African missions from a more radical egalitarianism to benevolent paternalism at the end of the nineteenth century.

Englund's discussion of the nuances among those missionaries traditionally seen as liberal leads to his interventions in the broader scholarly debates around missionaries to Africa. Simplified binaries of liberals versus primitivists, or imperial collaborators versus resisters, are thrown out. Missionaries cannot all be lumped in as unofficial imperialists or a simple extension of colonial rule, but, as Englund demonstrates, there was an array of differences between missionaries, even those of similar societies, locations or dispositions. Scott is an interesting case study in that his nationalism and fears of Portuguese takeover led him to support British political actions to control the Shire Highlands around Blantyre, but he soon became, according to Englund, the new administration's fiercest critic. Scott contrasted the militarism of the British against the negotiated *mandu* tactics of the chiefs they were subduing. He berated Harry Johnston and the newly-installed British administration for receiving what amounted to a bribe by Cecil Rhodes so that the British would look the other way while Rhodes 'looted' the country. He asked probing questions about the fairness of using Africans' taxes to help pay for Rhodes's schemes instead of the people the British were there to protect. Sounding the alarm over European land-greed and land-grabbing did not win Scott many friends in the administration, yet he continued to assert that the land was not theirs, and though he believed legitimate commerce brought potential benefits to African people, it often was used by Europeans to cover up selfish motives. Scott's interracial vision of the future was incompatible with Johnston's view of a racialised division of labour, and he used his platform to try and get Europeans to reflect on the purposes of colonisation and mission work and how failing to protect native rights would harm the potential to work and live together in pursuit of joint prosperity.

Not only is this a thought-provoking book, but it is very well written. The prose in places draws the reader in as Englund writes in very moving ways about issues of death and friendship. *Visions for racial equality* is an invaluable study for those interested in intellectual biographies related to Africa, the challenges of imperialism in the past and present, and for all interested in being co-knowers across racial divides.

REGIS UNIVERSITY,  
COLORADO

ETHAN R. SANDERS

*The Bantu Presbyterian Church of South Africa. A history of the Free Church of Scotland mission.* By Graham A. Duncan. (Scottish Religious Cultures: Historical Perspectives.) Pp. xiv + 237. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2022. £85. 978 1 3995 0393 8

*JEH* (74) 2023; doi:10.1017/S0022046923000970

Scholarship on the history of the mission-founded Churches of Africa has been meagre in comparison with the numerous volumes devoted to the African-instituted Churches and, more recently, the neo-Pentecostal churches. This relative neglect may betray a questionable assumption that Africans who have remained loyal to the historic mission churches have been lacking in initiative or theological creativity. Graham Duncan's study of the Bantu Presbyterian Church

of South Africa (BPCSA), its denominational predecessors and successors, is thus to be warmly welcomed. The BPCSA, established in 1923, was the first African Church formed in southern Africa other than by a schism from a mission Church. It was also the only African Church to be given a voice in the Native Affairs Commission set up by the South African government in the same year. The BPCSA was the product of the missionary work of the United Free Church of Scotland and its two forebears, the Free Church of Scotland and the United Presbyterian Church. It was quite distinct from the Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa (the Church formed by Scottish settlers in the region), and also excluded a substantial number of Black congregations within the Presbytery of Kaffraria, whose missionary leaders were fearful of the degree of power given to Black leadership in the new Church. The BPCSA continued under its original name until 1999, when the new multiracial climate created by the end of White rule in 1994 led to the abandonment of the discredited label of 'Bantu', and a change of name to the Reformed Presbyterian Church of South Africa. Union with White Presbyterians followed in 1999, creating the Uniting Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa. One further piece in this complex denominational jigsaw was provided by the older Presbyterian Church of Africa, an 'Ethiopian' style of Black Church created in 1898 when Pambani Mzimba, an outstanding ministerial product of the Lovedale Mission of the Free Church of Scotland, seceded from the Free Church Mission with many of his followers in a dispute over mission funds and property.

Duncan presents engaging studies of key African Presbyterian leaders such as Mzimba and the Scottish-trained Xhosa minister Tiyo Soga (1829–71). Soga was the first Black African to be trained and ordained to the ministry in Scotland; the United Presbyterian Church sent him back to Africa as a missionary to his own people. Attention is also paid to the lesser-known figure of Edward Tsewu, another fruit of the Lovedale Institution, who in 1896 had led an earlier secession from the Free Church mission in Johannesburg. Duncan also includes *vignettes* of important Presbyterian women in South Africa, such as the pioneering medical missionary Dr Jane Waterston and Charity Majiza from the Ciskei, who in 1978 became the first woman to be ordained as a minister of the BPCSA; in 1998 she was appointed General Secretary of the South African Council of Churches.

Duncan's history focuses on complicated institutional developments and arguments – which were more often about money and property (and hence ultimately about power) than about theology. It is at its most illuminating in its exposition of how the mission councils, set up by the Foreign Mission Committee of the United Free Church with the noble ideal of preparing the native Churches for self-government, self-funding and self-propagation, in practice functioned as arenas of White male missionary control and barriers to African advancement. In this respect, Duncan's history forms a Presbyterian equivalent to C. Peter Williams's *The ideal of the self-governing Church* (1990), a path-breaking study of how the Church Missionary Society failed to be true to its own three-self ideals, though Williams's book covered all areas of the Anglican society's work, rather than just one field as in Duncan's book.

This book is not an easy read, particularly to those unfamiliar with Presbyterian ecclesiastical structures and terminology. The reader's task is made more difficult

by the choice of a social-science author-date form of referencing rather than the humanities style of footnotes. As a commendable variety of archival sources have been consulted, the result is that too many paragraphs are continually broken up by often lengthy archival references inserted in parentheses. It also has to be said that the text has been very poorly copy-edited and as such departs from the normal high standards of the *Scottish Religious Cultures Historical Perspectives* series. There are quite frequent typographical errors or omissions, and some unfortunate instances where blocks of text are duplicated on different pages, sometimes more than once. A number of sources referenced in the text do not appear within the bibliography, which confusingly lists individual documents incorporated in a single alphabetical sequence alongside printed works; it also contains some duplication. The Revd Tiyo Burnside Soga (1871–1936) was the nephew of Tiyo Soga and not his son, as stated on p. 135. The index confuses the two by combining them in a single entry. A list of abbreviations would have been helpful to guide the non-specialist through the maze of different Scottish and South African Presbyterian Churches.

Whilst this work will be a useful quarry for scholars working on the history of mission Christianity in South Africa, it is unlikely to set new intellectual agendas. Amidst the welter of information on church and mission structures and conflicts, the reader is inclined to look for more insight into the dynamics of regular church life, worship, preaching and evangelistic expansion. The author, who writes as a critical inside observer – he was a Church of Scotland missionary assigned to work within the BPCSA – concludes fairly that this was a ‘Scottish church in South Africa’ (p. 124), lacking in contextual relevance. It was decidedly formal, cerebral and non-affective in its Reformed patterns of worship (p. 128). Readers can be forgiven for reaching the depressing conclusion that this mission Church was, after all, largely an alien import, far removed from the vibrant styles of African Christianity that now form the object of so much scholarly attention.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

BRIAN STANLEY

*Dangerous memory in Nagasaki. Prayers, protests and Catholic survivor narratives.*

By Gwyn McClelland. (*Asia's Transformations*, 55.) Pp. xxx + 216 incl. 31 figs and 2 maps. London–New York: Routledge, 2020. £120. 978 0 367 21775 4

*JEH* (74) 2023; doi:10.1017/S0022046923001082

On 9 August 1945, a six-strong squadron of the United States Air Force set off for Japan carrying a plutonium bomb almost twice as powerful as the enriched-uranium bomb dropped on Hiroshima three days earlier. Their intended target was the city of Kokura, with its major munitions plants. However, when they arrived, heavy cloud cover forced the pilots to revert to their secondary target, Nagasaki. But cloud cover was heavy there too, and with fuel running critically low the bomber *Bockscar* dropped its bomb inland, nearly two miles away from the planned target site. As a result, the twenty-two-kiloton explosion was not quite as devastating as the direct hit at Hiroshima. The brunt was born by the Urakami valley, and the hills surrounding the valley gave some protection to the