

Industrial and Organizational Psychology

Perspectives on Science and Practice

Including focal articles with commentaries:

*Qualitative Research in I-O Psychology:
Maps, Myths, and Moving Forward*

Michael G. Pratt and Silvia Bonaccio

The Evolution and Devolution of 360° Feedback

David W. Bracken, Dale S. Rose, and Allan H. Church



SOCIETY for
INDUSTRIAL and
ORGANIZATIONAL
PSYCHOLOGY



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Industrial and Organizational Psychology Perspectives on Science and Practice

The novel format of the journal focuses on an interactive exchanges on topics of importance to science and practice in the field of industrial and organizational psychology. The journal takes a focal article–peer commentary format.

A focal article is a position paper on an important issue for the field (or potentially a pair of papers taking opposite sides in a debate). Such a focal article might summarize evidence on an issue and take a position as to implications for science, practice, or public policy. The paper might focus on a basic science issue, an applied science issue, a practice issue, or a public policy issue; many would be a blend. The focal article is then followed by a series of peer commentaries. These could challenge or critique the original article, expand on issues not addressed in the focal article, or draw out implications not developed in the focal article. The goal is to include commentaries from various perspectives, including science, practice, and international perspectives.

EDITOR:

John C. Scott, APTMetrics, Inc.

PRACTICE FORUM SECTION EDITOR:

Mark Poteet, Organizational Research & Solutions, Inc.

PUBLICATIONS MANAGER:

Jenny Baker, Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology

EDITORIAL BOARD:

Neil R. Anderson, Brunel University
Winfred Arthur, Texas A & M University
Tayla N. Bauer, Portland State University
Michael J. Burke, Tulane University
Stuart C. Carr, Massey University
Allan H. Church, PepsiCo, Inc.
José M. Cortina, George Mason University
Satoris S. Culbertson, Kansas State University
Fritz Drasgow, University of Illinois at
Urbana-Champaign
Mark Griffin, University of Western Australia
Theodore Hayes, US Office of Personnel Management
Beryl L. Hesketh, University of Western Sydney
George P. Hollenbeck, Hollenbeck Associates
Leaetta M. Hough, Dunnette Group, Ltd.
Jeff W. Johnson, Personnel Decisions Research
Institute
Tracy Kantrowitz, SHL
Jerard F. Kehoe, Selection and Assessment Counselling
Richard J. Klimoski, George Mason University

Allen I. Kraut, Baruch College, CUNY
Hennie J. Kriek, Top Talent Solutions and University
of South Africa
Morgan W. McCall, University of Southern California
Jeffrey J. McHenry, Rainier Leadership Solutions
S. Morton McPhail, Retired Consultant, USA
Kenneth Pearlman, Creative Personnel Management
Consulting
Hannah R. Rothstein, Baruch College, CUNY
Ann Marie Ryan, Michigan State University
Lise M. Saari, New York University
Eduardo Salas, University of Central Florida
John C. Scott, APTMetrics, Inc.
Robert F. Silzer, HR Assessment & Development and
Baruch, Graduate Center, CUNY
Stephen D. Steinhaus, HRAlignment
William J. Strickland, Human Resources Organization
Nancy T. Tippins, CEB Valtera
Sara P. Weiner, IBM
Alan Witt, University of Houston

A journal of the Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology

SIOP is the premier membership organization for those practicing and teaching I-O psychology. While an independent organization with its own governance, SIOP is also a division within the American Psychological Association and an organizational affiliate of the Association for Psychological Science.

SIOP membership includes online access to all issues of the journal as well as an optional print copy. Individuals can become members at <http://www.siop.org/Dues/payment.aspx>. Membership rates are \$100 for professional members (Fellows, Members, Associates, International Affiliates) and \$50 for Student Affiliates & Retired statuses.

© Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology

Industrial and Organizational Psychology

Perspectives on Science and Practice

VOLUME 9, ISSUE 4, DECEMBER 2016

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

- From the Editor
JOHN C. SCOTT 691

FOCAL ARTICLE

- Qualitative Research in I-O Psychology: Maps, Myths, and Moving Forward
MICHAEL G. PRATT AND SILVIA BONACCIO 693

COMMENTARIES

- Qualitative Researchers, Heal (and Help) Thyself Too
MICHAEL J. ZICKAR 716
- Why I-O Journals Do Not Publish Qualitative Work
MARK FICHMAN 720
- Journal Guidelines for Qualitative Research? A Balancing Act That Might Be Worth It
ANNIKA WILHELMY 726
- Additional Suggestions for Breaking Barriers Against Qualitative Research in I-O
DAVID M. FISHER AND ANUPAMA NARAYAN 732
- Understanding Deep, Socially Embedded Human Motivations and Aspirations for
Work From Whole Person and Interdisciplinary Perspectives
TERESA J. ROTHAUSEN 735
- Taking Qualitative Methods a Step Further to Team Science
LORENA SOLIS, THERESA ARISTOMENE, JENNIFER FEITOSA, AND EBONY SMITH 739
- Qualitative I-O Psychology: A View From Europe
GILLIAN SYMON AND CATHERINE CASSELL 744
- Integrating Qualitative and Quantitative Methods in Doctoral Education: A Case
Study
ROBERT M. BICKMEIER, STEVEN G. ROGELBERG, AND GREGORY C. BERKA 748

It's Like Doing a Job Analysis: You Know More About Qualitative Methods Than You
May Think
ALICE M. BRAWLEY AND CYNTHIA L. S. PURY 753

FOCAL ARTICLE

The Evolution and Devolution of 360° Feedback
DAVID W. BRACKEN, DALE S. ROSE, AND ALLAN H. CHURCH 761

COMMENTARIES

Don't Give Up on the Self Too Quickly
SCOTT N. TAYLOR 795

Comparing Rater Groups: How To Disentangle Rating Reliability From
Construct-Level Disagreements
CHOCKALINGAM VISWESVARAN, DENIZ S. ONES, AND FRANK L. SCHMIDT 800

Why the Qualms With Qualitative? Utilizing Qualitative Methods in 360° Feedback
ADAM KABINS 806

Holding Leaders Accountable During the 360° Feedback Process
STEPHEN F. YOUNG, WILLIAM A. GENTRY, AND PHILLIP W. BRADY 811

PRACTICE FORUM

I-O Practice in Action: Solving the Leadership Potential Identification Challenge in
Organizations
ROB SILZER, ALLAN H. CHURCH, CHRISTOPHER T. ROTOLO, AND JOHN C. SCOTT 814