

NATIVES AND SPANIARDS IN EARLY COLONIAL MEXICO AND PERU

John F. Schwaller

Academy of American Franciscan History

TRANSATLANTIC ENCOUNTERS: EUROPEANS AND ANDEANS IN THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY. Edited by Kenneth J. Andrien and Rolena Adorno. (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1991. Pp. 295. \$45.00.)

THE ENCOMENDEROS OF NEW SPAIN, 1521–1555. By Robert Himmerich y Valencia. (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1991. Pp. 348. \$40.00.)

MEXICO'S MERCHANT ELITE, 1590–1660: SILVER, STATE, AND SOCIETY. By Louisa Schell Hoberman. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1991. Pp. 352. \$39.95.)

EL TERCER CONCILIO LIMENSE Y LA ACULTURACION DE LOS INDIGENAS SUDAMERICANOS. By Francisco Leonardo Lisi. (Salamanca: Ediciones Universidad de Salamanca, 1990. Pp. 382.)

NAHUAS AND SPANIARDS: POSTCONQUEST CENTRAL MEXICAN HISTORY AND PHILOLOGY. By James Lockhart. (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press and UCLA Latin American Center Publications, 1991. Pp. 304. \$42.50 cloth, \$18.95 paper.)

RELIGION IN THE ANDES: VISION AND IMAGINATION IN EARLY COLONIAL PERU. By Sabine MacCormack. (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1991. Pp. 488. \$39.50.)

This set of three works on early colonial New Spain and three on early colonial Peru demonstrates some of the best of the scholarly tradition in setting new paths for the future. Most scholars recognize that in the 1960s, colonial Latin American history underwent a dramatic shift in moving from political history and studies of purely Spanish institutions to a broadened focus on the natives and the dynamic of change brought about by the juxtaposition of two cultures in the Americas. New kinds of documentation emerged that allowed scholars to ask new questions, while greater emphasis on the native languages and cultures sought to rectify an imbalance in the study of the region in its previous focus on the Spaniards, Spanish institutions, and Spanish-language documents.

Key figures in this realignment were John Murra and James Lockhart. Murra was one of the first scholars to employ ethnographical

methods in studying Andean history, focusing his work on the natives rather than on the Spaniards.¹ Lockhart's ground-breaking work on early Spanish Peru was the first to use notarial records extensively. He then shifted his gaze to New Spain, studied Nahuatl, and (along with Arthur J. O. Anderson and Frances Berdan) took historians beyond the codices.² Not surprisingly, Lockhart reappears among the authors of these very recent works, concentrating again on both Peru and New Spain. His recent book, *Spaniards and Nahuas: Postconquest Central Mexican History and Philology*, is a collection of essays (nine of them previously published) now revised and published together. In many ways, these essays serve as mileposts along Lockhart's journey through the study of early colonial Mexico, especially his fascination with Nahuatl, the language of the Aztecs. Following his seminal work on early Peru, Lockhart concluded that as long as he relied solely on Spanish-language documents, he was missing much of the story of colonial Latin America, given the fact that the native majority was usually viewed only through the prism of accounts by Spaniards. Looking first in Peru, Lockhart did not find significant documentation written in native languages (mainly Quechua). On approaching New Spain, however, he discovered thousands of pieces written by natives in native languages, most of them in Nahuatl. This discovery marked the turning point in his career.

Some twenty years later, Lockhart is producing the culmination of his work with Nahuatl and the native peoples of Mexico. *Spaniards and Nahuas* marks the first of two major works that bring closure to this body of research. The other, *The Nahuas after the Conquest*, has just been published and will be compared with Charles Gibson's classic *Aztecs under Spanish Rule*.³ *Spaniards and Nahuas* contains thirteen essays divided into four sections: Nahuas, Nahuatl Philology, Historiography, and Spaniards. In some ways, this book is a companion piece to his newest monograph, *The Nahuas after the Conquest*.

At the core of both the collection of essays and the monograph is what Lockhart calls "the new philology," which entails analyzing texts for more than just their objective contents. In traditional Latin American colonial history, a scholar would consult hundreds of manuscripts to build a composite vision of the past based on the many different pieces of

1. See, for example, John Murra, *La organización económica del estado inca* (Mexico City: Siglo Veintiuno, 1978); and *Formaciones económicas y políticas del mundo andino* (Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, 1975).

2. James Lockhart, *Spanish Peru, 1532–1560* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968); and *Beyond the Codices: The Nahua View of Colonial Mexico*, edited by Arthur J. O. Anderson, Frances Berdan, and James Lockhart (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1976).

3. James Lockhart, *The Nahuas after the Conquest* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1992); and Charles Gibson, *Aztecs under Spanish Rule* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1964).

evidence. Because Nahuatl documentation is more limited than Spanish records, a different technique was needed to allow scholars to draw valid conclusions from the limited resources. In Lockhart's view, this is the role played by the new philology. Just as philology during the Renaissance allowed scholars to understand their immediate past by analyzing language and texts, so the new philology allows contemporary scholars to learn of the past through critical methods. Central to this undertaking is careful study of the language and language change.

In the first part of *Nahuas and Spaniards*, Lockhart studies the vision of postconquest Nahua society and culture gained through using Nahuatl documentation. The first chapter explores the complexity of Nahua society and culture as reflected in native-language documentation, which was prepared for Spanish courts. This theme carries over into the second essay on the complex municipalities developed by the Nahuas prior to the conquest, which survived in various forms following Spanish domination. The *altepetl* (city) and its subject units, *calpulli* (often called *sujetos* by the Spaniards), remained an important geopolitical reality during the colonial period. Lockhart points out that Spanish attempts to understand the institution merely tended to force native structures into a Spanish mold. In this essay, he focuses on the different structures of the municipalities of Tulancingo and Tlaxcala. The last essay in this part of the book considers corporate awareness into the later colonial period. Even far into the colonial period, Lockhart finds that the *altepetl*, or city-state, continued to dominate an entire region, although it lacked the cohesion of earlier periods.

In the second part on Nahuatl philology, Lockhart reconsiders several issues he studied earlier. Of these six pieces, two are translations and analyses of specific Nahuatl documents. Another, "The Tulancingo Perspective," consists of translations and analyses of four short pieces from the Tulancingo Collection at UCLA. These three contributions exemplify Lockhart's command of Nahuatl and the way in which individual documents can open up new vistas in understanding the colonial past. The remaining three essays in this section focus on specific issues of philology. "A Language Transition in Eighteenth-Century Mexico" charts the course of native-language record-keeping in the Toluca Valley in central Mexico. Here Lockhart considers four short documents and explains how they demonstrate changes in language use in Nahuatl, especially the acquisition of words, syntax, and other features from Spanish. Chapter Eight studies Nahuatl phoneticity in older documents, delving into the inner working of Nahuatl as it came to be recorded on paper. Lockhart scrutinizes three late-colonial documents in an attempt to understand differences between the spoken and the written language and how these features changed over time.

The last essay in this part reviews John Bierhorst's translation and

study titled *Cantares Mexicanos*.⁴ This work stirred a major controversy among scholars of Nahuatl when it appeared in 1985. While Bierhorst's transcription of the manuscript has been widely hailed as definitive, his translation and analysis have been difficult for most students of Nahuatl to accept. Traditional analysis of the *Cantares* held that these songs were the products of poet-kings of the preconquest period. A variation on that thesis posited that although the songs appeared later, their purpose was to evoke the memory of the earlier mythic figures. Bierhorst took this reasoning one step further, positing that the songs were meant to revivify the spirits of the dead warriors, not unlike the ghost-dance tradition of the Plains Indians. In his view, the songs are part of a tradition of native resistance to colonial domination. Lockhart differs greatly with Bierhorst on several points, including the central ghost-dance thesis. Lockhart also disputes Bierhorst on several issues of interpretation and translation, although he praises Bierhorst's careful transcription of the manuscript.

The third part of *Nahuas and Spaniards* deals with colonial Mexican historiography. The first essay assesses the contributions of Charles Gibson to colonial Mexican history, having originated as a paper presented at a 1986 session of the American Historical Association honoring Gibson. The second essay covers some recent contributions to Mexican ethnohistory, principally by Lockhart's own students.

The last part of *Nahuas and Spaniards* deals with the Spaniards. Most of the research for these two essays dates from the late 1960s and early 1970s. The first is a revised essay that represents a kind of culmination of Lockhart's work on Toluca. Its valuable contribution is a cross-sectional view of the city and province at a single point in time, near the end of the sixteenth century. The last essay deals with the magistrate of Zacualpan, specifically the close social and economic ties between the local magistrate and the Spaniards in the community.

Nahuas and Spaniards is an intriguing collection containing an array of materials on varied topics of interest to specialists in colonial Mexico. This work marks a dramatic shift away from Lockhart's early prosopographical work in Peru. Yet those works too have spawned many imitations. One monograph that draws heavily on the methodology of his early work, especially *The Men of Cajamarca*, is Robert Himmerich y Valencia's *The Encomenderos of New Spain, 1521–1555*.

In this work, Himmerich y Valencia focuses on New Spanish *encomenderos* from 1521 to 1555 and analyzes the group prosopographically. The first part examines the *encomenderos* as a group, studying each of the major variables among them, while the second part presents individ-

4. John Bierhorst, *Cantares Mexicanos: Songs of the Aztecs* (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 1985); and *A Nahuatl and English Dictionary and Concordance to the Cantares Mexicanos* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1985).

ual biographical sketches. Himmerich y Valencia divides the *encomenderos* into five basic categories. After the conquest, *encomiendas* were granted to conquerors and settlers as incentives to remain and populate the colony. The *encomenderos* included conquerors of Mexico, men who participated in later conquests, early settlers, more recent arrivals, and Indians. These are the five basic groups, which Himmerich y Valencia calls first conquerors, conquerors, *antiguos pobladores*, *pobladores*, and Indians. Looking at each subgroup, one can discern slightly different patterns among them. For example, Extremadura provided fully a quarter of the *antiguos pobladores* but only 11 percent of the conquerors.

The second part of the book deals with the biographies of the individual *encomenderos*. These useful thumbnail sketches fill out the too-brief references in Peter Gerhard's *A Guide to the Historical Geography of New Spain*. In compiling these biographies and this work as a whole, Himmerich y Valencia relied solely on printed materials ranging from Gerhard's *Guide* to Francisco Icaza's *Diccionario autobiográfico de conquistadores y pobladores de la Nueva España*. Here a bit of caution must be expressed. Because Himmerich y Valencia did not consult any significant archival material, his study has limitations. For instance, Icaza's *Diccionario*, one of Himmerich y Valencia's main sources, is merely a transcription of a manuscript held at the Archivo General de Indias in Seville.⁵ In his "Methodological Essay," Himmerich y Valencia explains his lack of primary sources: "The study attempts to show patterns by tying biographical data on *encomenderos* to data on *encomiendas* held." He then compares his work with that of Lockhart in *Men of Cajamarca*, noting that although Lockhart presented much biographical information, he provided little on the *encomiendas*. Then Himmerich y Valencia points out that although Lockhart relied heavily on notarial documents for his work, in Mexico one finds very few notarial documents for the immediate post-conquest period, and indeed up into the early seventeenth century. What Himmerich y Valencia does not take into account is that the Peruvian notarial records are qualitatively different from those in Mexico. One does not find the kinds of details in early New Spanish notarial documents that one finds in Peru. In the absence of the notarials, Himmerich y Valencia could have filled in many gaps about the men and their *encomiendas* through use of the *relaciones de méritos y servicios*.

An example of the pitfalls of Himmerich y Valencia's technique is the case of the two Juan de Cuellars. Both were conquerors, having arrived in the Narváez expedition. Both received *encomiendas*. Both married women named Ana. Having consulted the *relaciones* associated with each man, I am not at present convinced that he has correctly identified each one. The *relaciones* provide additional details that allow these

5. AGI, Mexico, 1064, lib. 1.

questions to be resolved. Often children and spouses are named, and events are recalled in great detail. For instance, each Juan de Cuellar had daughters who eventually entered the same convent, while other siblings received stipends from the crown to compensate them for the loss of their father's *encomienda*. Himmerich y Valencia lists Cuellar Verdugo as having only one daughter, who married an *encomendero*, while it seems that in fact he had four girls.⁶

Overall, Himmerich y Valencia has done a fine job in bringing together and analyzing the information from numerous printed sources. *The Encomenderos of New Spain, 1521–1555* will serve as a basic point of departure for further research on the social history of sixteenth-century New Spain. It is unfortunate, however, that he did not have the opportunity to use archival materials to clarify and amplify his findings.

Concerned with a period somewhat later than Himmerich y Valencia, Louisa Hoberman's *Mexico's Merchant Elite, 1590–1660: Silver, State, and Society* goes beyond examining the mercantile sector of the society to describe the interplay between the merchants and the civil bureaucracy. Most research on merchants in colonial Latin America has concentrated on the late colonial period, especially the fifty years preceding independence. Hoberman's welcome contribution to the literature is not merely a study of the seventeenth century that complements David Brading's but a thorough examination of the context.⁷ Although the period she considers has often been called "New Spain's century of depression," her research reveals a great deal of vitality within the merchant sector.

The first chapter of *Mexico's Merchant Elite* describes this sector's formation, paying special attention to sources of capital like dowries, commissions, and credit. The next two chapters examine special areas of merchant activity, specifically mining and agriculture. Hoberman's valuable fourth chapter analyzes the merchant elite's entrance into the bureaucracy of colonial New Spain. The following chapter deals with taxes and trade restrictions, especially with reference to the trans-Atlantic and trans-Pacific trades. Finally, Hoberman questions the old Spanish adage of "Padre pulpero, hijo caballero y nieto prodioso" (Merchant father, gentleman son, beggar grandson). Although popularized in myth and legend, this proverb does not seem to have described the norm (p. 223).

A major contribution is Hoberman's analysis of the relationship of merchants to the royal bureaucracy and the pattern of merchants holding government positions. Much of the contact between merchants and bureaucrats resulted from the sale of public offices and the practice of renting tax collection. Merchants were prime customers for these offices,

6. AGI, Contaduría, 693, Data—Conquistadores; and AGI, Contaduría, 699, Data—Conquistadores.

7. David Brading, *Miners and Merchants in Bourbon Mexico, 1763–1810* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1971).

having access to capital and wanting to find positions of authority with a stable source of income for their offspring. Unlike modern-day public servants, the merchants who served in the royal bureaucracy were expected to profit from their position, although some of their practices may not have been entirely legal or ethical even in the seventeenth century.

Hoberman's *Mexico's Merchant Elite* fills a gap in the study of New Spanish society. Peggy Liss focused her attention on an earlier generation of bureaucrats, and Jonathan Israel studied the same period but with more emphasis on the bureaucracy and less on merchants.⁸ David Brading and others looked at the merchants but did not concentrate on the interplay between the merchant elite and the bureaucracy.

Transatlantic Encounters: Europeans and Andeans in the Sixteenth Century, a collection of essays edited by Kenneth Andrien and Rolena Adorno, focuses on Indian-European contacts in colonial Peru. Lockhart reappears here as the author of an essay, one of his few incursions into Peruvian history since undertaking the new philology. The collection is divided into three sections: the first focuses on European antecedents to the colonial period; the second deals with the various resources at Europeans' and Andeans' disposal in the encounter period; and the third addresses artistic and cultural encounters. The contributions originated at a conference held at the Ohio State University in the fall of 1986.

The first essay by William and Carla Phillips deals with Spain in the fifteenth century and provides excellent background for the rest of the collection. Phillips and Phillips do a fine job of outlining the major threads of Spanish history emerging in the fifteenth century. They look specifically to Spain's commercial ties with the rest of Europe and the conquest and settlement of the Canary Islands as the models on which the New World encounter was based. John Guilmartin considers the conquest of Tawantinsuyu, the Inca empire. Unlike recent analyses of the subject, Guilmartin views the conquest militarily, concerned with the cutting edge. He finds that the Spanish enjoyed clear superiority over the Andeans in more sophisticated weapons as well as in better use of them on the battlefield. Moreover, cultural and religious factors reinforced the Spaniards' advantage. The Andeans were quick to adapt to the new technologies intelligently, but the gap separating Andeans and Europeans was so large that the natives could not reject their old patterns and adopt the new technology for their own purposes.

In the second part, John Murra studies early European perceptions of Andean achievements. Beginning with casual contact from the time of Vasco Núñez de Balboa in 1513, he follows the thread up to the time of the

8. Peggy Liss, *Mexico under Spain, 1521–1556: Society and the Origins of Nationality* (Chicago, Ill.: University of Chicago Press, 1975); and Jonathan I. Israel, *Race, Class, and Politics in Colonial Mexico, 1610–1670* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1975).

conquest and beyond, noting the paucity of documentation for the early years of Pacific exploration. In the postconquest period, Murra focuses on the efforts of the early chronicler Pedro Cieza de León to win wider recognition for Andean accomplishments and the continual tension between the encomienda and efforts to protect and succor the Indians. Following the conquest, the native rulers of Peru even offered to “buy out” the Spaniards if they would abolish the encomienda and return the land to its native rulers. Murra observes that all this speculation ended with the great reforms of Viceroy Francisco de Toledo.

James Lockhart focuses on communications in Tawantinsuyu. In “Trunk Lines and Feeder Lines: The Spanish Reaction to American Resources,” he studies the economic ideas of the first conquerors. His curious title highlights contrasting views of the conquest and settlement of the Americas. From earliest times, many viewed the enterprise as rather romantic and almost otherworldly. Yet as Lockhart points out, the conquerors and early settlers were highly pragmatic and quick to adjust to the new conditions encountered in the New World. The conquerors were undeniably economically driven, establishing an industrial complex based on mining and agriculture and using the family as the basis of social organization. Lockhart perceives a primary pull exerted by the silver-producing regions and a secondary influence of the large sedentary populations, the trunk and feeder lines. These two forces determined the economic geography of the Spanish colonial enterprise.

Kenneth Andrien’s essay explores the centrality of the reforms by Toledo to sixteenth-century Peruvian history. He begins by describing the various institutions and procedures that developed in Peru between the civil wars and the appointment of Toledo as viceroy. Andrien views the encomienda and the Spanish *cabildo* (municipal council) as the central institutions. Yet both had decayed by the 1560s, causing a political and economic crisis. Toledo found Peru ripe for native rebellion, with only a tenuous Spanish presence in the countryside. To aid the extraction of tribute and labor, the viceroy ordered forced resettlement of the natives. He reformed the system of local magistrates and instituted many other changes to strengthen Spanish rule in the province. Yet according to Andrien, the one flaw in Toledo’s system that eventually weakened the whole structure was corruption. Rampant within the corps of magistrates and linked by the resurgence of local partisan interests among Spanish colonists, corruption led to the eventual perversion of the Toledan system. Andrien concludes that Toledo’s centralization proved to be merely a passing phenomenon and that with time, local interests and government bureaucrats replaced the conqueror and encomendero elite as lords of the land.

The last section of *Transatlantic Encounters* contains three essays dealing with cultural aspects of the encounter of Andeans and Euro-

peans, especially in art. These intriguing essays are full of suggestions for historians. Directly or indirectly, the writings of the partially Hispanized native chronicler Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala serve as interpreter and guide in these studies.

Tom Zuidema finds in the work of Guaman Poma an interpretation of Inca iconography and the depictions of Inca royal dress. Lacking a written alphabet, the Inca used iconography to relate the historical sequence of rulers to the months of their sophisticated court calendar. Designs called *tucapus*, which were used to embellish the tunics (*uncus*) of the rulers, linked the calendar to the traditional depiction of the rulers. Having identified this relationship, Zuidema then considers the geographical organization of the empire into four provinces (*suyus*). These too were tied into the traditional design system and related to expansion of the empire and celebration of the cycle of feasts. Zuidema relates these designs and associated features back to the feasts to develop a hierarchy of feasts. The last part of the essay traces the survival of the tunics and the design system in the colonial period and their appearance in colonial painting. Zuidema's well-crafted essay requires close reading but provides a decisive insight into the Andean system of communication.

Zuidema's discussion of the tunics provides an introduction for Thomas Cummins's essay on the portraits of the traditional native rulers, the *kurakakuna*. Cummins seeks to understand the presence of these rulers in colonial portraits where they serve as reminders of the ancient native lords of the region in notably European depictions. He rightly considers the *kurakakuna* as intermediaries between the native masses and the Spanish rulers. As the Spanish transformed the native leaders into a version of petty Spanish nobles, so the European-style portraiture presented them wearing versions of traditional garb. Yet it is not the dress but the portrait form that expresses the most about the *kuraka*. These portraits also included other symbols of the leaders' traditional authority. Cummins concludes that the portraits recorded the rupture between the native rulers and their people, the fact that the colonial culture of the *kurakakuna* was primarily Spanish and not native. He believes that the iconography in the portraits expressed much to Spanish observers who would have perceived it as exotic, but it might have appeared incomprehensible to natives.

In the final essay of the collection, Rolena Adorno analyzes the characterization of Guaman Poma and others as *indios ladinos* (Hispanized Indians). The term *ladino* came to describe anyone who spoke Spanish as a second language, although it was also used almost interchangeably with *mestizo* in many regions of Latin America. In the Andean region, the term referred more commonly to native translators. Two of the most famous of the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries were Guaman Poma and Joan de Santacruz Pachacuti Yamqui Salcamaygua.

Guaman Poma recognized his similarity to the *indios ladinos* but felt himself to be their social superior; Santacruz Pachacuti descended from the *kurakakuna* and therefore was unequivocally the social superior of most Andeans. Adorno considers the various roles played by *indios ladinos* in colonial society: messianic leader, assistant to a judicial investigator, petitioner, and writer. She concludes that the persona of the *indio ladino* reflected all the complex facets of the interplay of two cultures. *Indios ladinos* were isolated individuals because they did not fit well into either European or Andean society.

Taken as a whole, *Transatlantic Encounters* offers fascinating windows on the European and Andean worlds as they came into contact. The essays will make valuable points of departure for scholars in further consideration of the cultural contact in the Andes.

Sabine MacCormack's *Religion in the Andes: Vision and Imagination in Early Colonial Peru* builds on many of the themes developed in the Adorno and Andrien collection. MacCormack traces the confrontation of cultures in the Andes by studying European attempts to understand Andean religion.

Europeans had great difficulty in comprehending Andean religion. MacCormack's prologue and first chapter present a philosophical overview of the problem, followed by chronological chapters starting with the first contacts and continuing into the middle of the seventeenth century. The first chapter details the relationship between religion and philosophy in the late-fifteenth- and early-sixteenth-century European world. Closely associated were beliefs in spirits and devils as well as issues regarding perceptions of reality. Demonic power was conceived of as a real force operating in the world. While in Europe, the Europeans were distinguishing among a series of subtle differences in theology, but when they traveled to the Andes, most of the features of commonality were lost when they were forced to confront a totally alien situation.

For MacCormack, the period of first contacts became an attempt on the part of the Europeans to understand Andean and Incan religion in Spanish-Christian terms. The most common image emerging was that of the devil as the major influence in Andean religion, which was viewed as merely a set of ritual divinations used by the devil to confuse the natives. The importance of native oracles became evident to the conquerors when they confronted the shrine of Pachacamac, located near what is now the city of Lima. This encounter was followed by the Spaniards' experiences in Cuzco, the center of the Inca empire. There too the Spaniards were baffled by the nature of the place and its rituals.

Throughout *Religion in the Andes*, MacCormack contrasts the Spaniards' perceptions and thoughts with those of the Andeans, as best they can be reconstructed. This approach is especially important in the middle chapters where she details Spaniards' changing perceptions of Andean

religion. It is a story of the slow unfolding of a complex picture that only a few Spaniards were perceptive enough to comprehend. For example, the second generation of Spanish historians—Cieza de León, Juan de Betanzos, and Francisco Villacastín—were far more methodical and reflective than their predecessors. Yet individuals like Polo de Ondegardo were able to fathom certain details of the Inca geographic-religious thought that escaped the rest. Guaman Poma provides a more Andean version of the details presented by Cieza and Polo.

MacCormack deals next with the impact of the writings of Friar Bartolomé de las Casas on European perceptions of the Andeans. Las Casas sought to depict the American Indians in terms of classical antiquity, thus placing their rites and beliefs in a context more familiar to Europeans. His understanding of Inca religion was that they shared the notion of the single god in the form of Viracocha, the sun god and provider. In his view, an early knowledge of monotheism had become perverted into the polytheism perceived by the Spaniards on their arrival, a change brought about by demonic forces. Once the Spaniards introduced the natives to true religion, they should have also restored the lands and titles taken from the Indians. The leading Jesuit, José de Acosta, did not hold the Andean religions in such a favorable light, however. The contrast between the perceptions of these two clerics and the Andean reality they studied forms the core of the fifth and sixth chapters.

Acosta embraced a far different notion of the missionary obligation than did Las Casas. Acosta saw nothing in the native religion that hinted at a purer, older form. Everything reminded him of the idolatrous worship roundly condemned in the Bible. He also detected perversions of Christian doctrine in native trinities. Consequently, he saw little to be salvaged. More important, Acosta's writings reflected a general shift in European thought. He felt that the Andeans themselves were responsible for their religion, which resulted from the exercise of their imaginations, not from demonic inspiration. As the sixteenth century ended and the seventeenth began, European authors either recognized the existence of demonic forces without belaboring the issue or sought root causes in other forces and influences.

MacCormack's eighth chapter focuses on the writings of the two Hispanized Andeans already mentioned, Guaman Poma and Santacruz Pachacuti Yamqui. MacCormack analyzes the perspectives of these two authors by comparing an event that both described (the legendary vision of the Inca Pachacuti) and by contrasting their versions with those related by others. MacCormack then analyzes how each of the two perceived the pre-Hispanic past. Both viewed the ancient times from a mixed perspective of Andean traditions and Christian legends. Neither was ready to dismiss the whole pre-Christian past and saw value in many ancient traditions.

The next important author was the mestizo Garcilaso de la Vega, el

Inca. MacCormack details the Renaissance humanist underpinnings of Garcilaso that deeply influenced his perception of Andean religion. He followed a path already paved by Las Casas and further elaborated by Guaman Poma and Santacruz Pachacuti Yamqui in placing value on the pre-Hispanic past. Garcilaso's perspective, deeply colored by his own Platonist leanings, sought order and balance. He also relied on philology and his own understanding of Quechua to try to render Andean religion intelligible to the Europeans. Drawing on Garcilaso's works but for his own missionizing purposes was the Augustinian priest Antonio de la Calancha. He used Garcilaso's writings as a starting point for his own investigations, which often resulted in contradictions. In the end, nevertheless, Garcilaso and his followers developed a vision of the Spanish invasion and conversion as the work of divine providence.

MacCormack concludes by examining Andean religion in theory and practice in the period before 1650 and relates the practices of this period to their pre-Hispanic roots. For background, she drew on the work of contemporaneous historians José de Arriaga and Bernabé Cobo as well as on the accounts of the idolatry trials led by Francisco de Avila. MacCormack concludes that even a century after the conquest, "Andeans still formulated their beliefs and rituals within a sacred topography that would have been recognizable to their forebears" (p. 433).

Religion in the Andes is a dense work dealing with the ponderous subjects of religion and philosophy. MacCormack does a fine job of balancing what Europeans were writing about Andeans with the reality of the subject as perceived by Andeans. Readers will gain a tremendous amount of knowledge of Andean religion and the perception of that religion held by various Europeans. In this regard, MacCormack focuses more completely on religion and philosophy than Benjamin Keen did in *Aztec Image in Western Thought*, a similar work that deals more generally with Aztec culture.⁹ MacCormack's time frame is much shorter, basically the century from the conquest until about 1650, while Keen carried his study into the twentieth century.

The last work to be considered is Francisco Leonardo Lisi's *El tercer concilio limense y la aculturación de los indígenas sudamericanos*. Among all the provincial synods and councils, the most significant in the colonial period were unquestionably the Third Council of Lima (1583) and the Third Council of Mexico (1585). At each gathering, the assembled bishops had the opportunity to bring local canon law into full accord with the recent decrees of the Council of Trent (1563). The councils also took the opportunity to investigate most aspects of colonial social and religious life and to promulgate decrees necessary for their regulation. Thus the records of

9. Benjamin Keen, *Aztec Image in Western Thought* (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1971).

the councils provide a valuable view of the colony as it neared the end of its first century.

Lisi's work is divided into three main parts. The first part studies the evangelical policy of the Peruvian Catholic Church as manifested in the decrees of the Third Council. Lisi considers the antecedents to the council and the role played by Jesuit leader José de Acosta, also comparing the various manuscripts on which this edition is based. The second part contains the original Latin and a Spanish translation of the decrees and related documents. The last section provides a detailed commentary on the decrees, followed by a documentary appendix.

This work will be very useful to scholars interested in the Third Council's impact on Peruvian colonial history in providing an authoritative and accessible account. Yet while the decrees are important, the other products of the council are equally important. Hence it would have been preferable to edit all the works of the council, including the decrees, catechism, and other papers. As the matter stands, it is still necessary to consult several different editions of the various products of the council.

When considered as a whole, the six works reviewed here reflect many of the new gains in the study of early colonial Latin America. One marked trend is the greater concern for sources, especially those in the native tradition or produced by natives, as exemplified by the work of Lockhart and his new philology. The essays presented by Andrien and Adorno manifest this same concern with new sources of evidence. Lisi's volume, although it does not involve native production, provides a helpful window on the colonial world. MacCormack's study moves easily between the world of the native tradition and the observations made by Europeans on that world.

Another major theme that goes hand in hand with the interest in new sources is the greater concern over determining the native contribution to the encounter of two worlds. To gain glimpses of it, scholars have had to seek out new documentation. All these developments have enabled historians of the early colonial period to attain a more balanced vision of that social and cultural world.

Louisa Hoberman concentrates not on the natives or the encounter of cultures but on the role of the merchants in the early colonial Mexican society and economy, while remaining sensitive to the role of the bureaucracy. In this approach, her work manifests the current trend for historians to cut across the traditional boundaries dividing social history from economic or political history in order to present a better developed, more broadly focused work. Overall, these works provide scholars with much to consider. In breaking new ground, they serve as fitting memorials in the scholarly world to commemorate the quincentenary of the encounter of the two worlds.