

ideal present for young people entering marriage, but perhaps it is just to point out that it is obviously written for a less sophisticated inquirer than the former book. Whereas Fr Gilby makes clear what are the limits set to legitimate co-operation with the physical laws governing human fertility, Fr Kelly deplors the fact that any cognisance should be taken of them at all on the plea that such action makes love self-conscious and destroys its essential spontaneity and generosity. This divergence of views is an important one and corresponds broadly to the legitimate variety of interpretation which exists among theologians.

CATHERINE DANIEL

WE SAW HER. By B. G. Sandhurst. (Longmans, Green; 12s. 6d.)

The author anticipates the feeling that there is no place for another book about Lourdes. In fact, this book is amply justified by what it is: a collation of the accounts of the apparitions given by Bernadette herself and those who actually saw her at the grotto. This material, as a whole, has not before been available in English. We have had the account of J. B. Estrade, who was indeed *one* of these valuable witnesses, but not as Mr Sandhurst points out, always entirely reliable. *We Saw Her*, by giving a background introduction, sorting the witnesses and linking them with a commentary, gives an extraordinarily vivid and fascinating account of the events.

The commentary is sometimes a little over-obtrusive; and the author occasionally seems too ready to decide what was meant by some particular detail. It is hard to draw the line between helpfully suggesting an explanation of some puzzle and officiously imposing a meaning of one's own.

The besetting temptation of writers on Lourdes, Fatima, and preternatural events in general, seems to be to try to use them as a means of driving unbelievers into a corner where they can be mercilessly forced to admit that they have no explanations left. Just what has then been achieved it is difficult to see; it seems to have nothing to do with the gift of faith. A careful reading of this book should, if anything, bring out the fact that a point is never quite reached when natural explanations become wholly untenable. It would be pleasant to be able to clear the author of ever yielding to this temptation; in fact, however, he falls for it occasionally, but not heavily. One of the chief objects of his book—and one in which it should succeed—is to increase our love for St Bernadette. He records a saying of hers which should be the watchword not only of writers on such events but also of all who ever act as mouthpieces for the witnessing Church in apologetic: 'I have been told to tell you what I saw. It is not my business to make you believe it.'

C.H.