

(a) 'Those who are not Muslims cannot endorse these high praises (sc. of the Qur'ân). Even in translation the consecutive reading of several pages of the earlier messages leaves an impression of power. Much of the book is marked by sound common sense, the middle way, for God does not make religion hard for men. Probably this accounts for much of its success. The story of Joseph is the longest and best constructed tale but it shows clearly that Muhammad, like George Washington, though in another sense, could not tell a story.

'The Koran was sent down from the highest heaven in the month of Ramadan on the night of power to the house of might; thence it was revealed in the space of twenty years to the prophet.'

(b) 'Amulets are hung round the necks of animals. A Turk gave to an Englishwoman his greatest treasure, the blue bead, which his mother had sewn on to his first shirt and which had always been on some garment of his till he was over six feet tall.'

To criticise the factual scholarship of the work would be presumptuous cavilling, and I anticipate finding it as generally reliable for handy reference as Professor Tritton's earlier *Muslim Theology*. The persistent dating of the Hijrah as 621 A.D. may be based on evidence not in my possession, while deliberate simplification is no doubt responsible for the implication on p. 22, that '*ulamâ* is a specifically Sunnite term corresponding to an exclusively Shi'ite counterpart in *mujtahids*; similarly with the over-precise statement of the divisions of the prayers on p. 24. One frequently recurring linguistic infelicity deserves notice; an example is to be found in: 'Extremists . . . are called *ghulât*. . . from a verb meaning to boil, be expensive'. An elementary dictionary would support this, but, surely, these last two meanings are farther extended from the fundamental sense of the root ('to exceed, go beyond', and hence 'boil over, be too dear') than is 'extremist' itself! Etymologically and out of consideration for the reader, the author doubtless does well to ignore the distinction between final radicals 'w' and 'y' in this case. The Bibliography could well be freshened up: in particular, Macdonald's ageing and somewhat scrappy *Muslim Theology* has recently been handsomely superseded by the 'Dominican' *Introduction à la Théologie Musulmane*.

G. M. WICKENS

THE GIFTS OF THE HOLY GHOST. By John of St Thomas. Translated from the Latin by Dominic Hughes, O.P., with a foreword by Walter Farrell, O.P. (Sheed and Ward; 16s.)

In the past thirty years, one might say, the Holy Ghost has come into his own! Several important works in French have had a wide circulation, and Dr Leen's excellent book must not be forgotten. Readers of P. Gardeil and other French writers may have had their appetites

whetted by the quotations they give from the classic treatise on the Gifts by John of Saint Thomas. The present book offers them a complete English translation of that treatise, together with two introductions, one historical, the other theological, an appendix containing certain elucidations concerning the gift of fear, drawn from another part of the work of the same Dominican commentator, and a general index, one of the proper names and one of scriptural references.

The book is not easy going. Those who have delighted in the works of Dom Marmion and Dr Leen will find here something much more difficult to assimilate; reading will not be enough; the book, to be of any profit must be worked through, and the labour will be considerable. Indeed, whilst no one could question the translator's courage in attempting the complete rendering of a scholastic treatise, it is open to question whether this is the best way of popularising the doctrine. For the ordinary reader who is not familiar with the mould in which it is cast, it will be difficult on this score alone. Moreover, in this particular case, the nature of the great commentator's work entails the omission of certain important points. For, as Fr Farrell's foreword reminds us, John of St Thomas treats the 'hard matters of mysticism' not as a mystic, but as a scholar of his time. The result is that whereas controversy, particularly with Scotus and Suarez, bulks large in the work, there is no explicit treatment of the necessity of the gifts for salvation, a cardinal point in the teaching of St Thomas. It is true that P. Gardeil says somewhere, when confessing to his admiration for John of St Thomas, that often the real essence of the teaching on some point is contained in the last lines of the last answer to the last objection, but how much hard and careful reading is required to get so far; for even those who love him best recognise him as wordily prolix, and rich in digressions. In spite of all this, however, to those who persevere the treatise offers a rich reward, so that this translation is welcome, especially as it is not easy to come by either in the Latin original or the French translation by Mme Raïssa Maritain, which in any case was not complete. For this reason too, the work will prove useful to many theologians who are unable to get access to the original. In this regard, its usefulness would have been increased if exact references had been given in the respective chapters and sections of the translation to the corresponding articles of the original.

There is a short historical introduction on John of St Thomas, including a pleasing application of his teaching on the Gifts to himself. This makes us wish that the translator had given greater development to the theological introduction, particularly with reference to the necessity of the Gifts. The translation is clear and readable; but we fear that to those unpractised in scholastic terminology it will offer many

difficulties. What for instance will they make of the following on p. 123? 'Two things are to be noted in making any distinctions among the habits and virtues: The first is the formal nature under which each proceeds, for this formal principle specifies the act and the habit', etc. It would be only too easy to multiply examples. It would have been useful if short notes had been added to help the uninitiated reader. We feel, too, that in some passages, the translator has missed the almost lyric quality of the original; for instance the passage translated on p. 101 is almost entirely composed of biblical allusions, which give it its particular savour, and somehow this seems to be lost in the translation. We think, too, that references to the biblical texts alluded to might have been given in such a passage as this (in fact only one out of twenty-two is given).

ANTONINUS FINILI, O.P.

THE CASE OF THERESA NEUMANN. By Hilda C. Graf. (Mercier Press; 12s. 6d.)

The general conclusion of this book is that 'a supernatural origin of the phenomena exhibited by Theresa Neumann is not *necessarily* demanded by the evidence at our disposal which, admittedly, is not as complete, in many respects, as one might desire'. The general impression made upon the reader, however, will be that the evidence has been subjected to such destructive examination, that there is very little left to support any kind of origin other than a pathological one; and that the author is unduly modest in her conclusion.

Some years before there was any sign of phenomena which could be described as 'mystical' or miraculous, Theresa had contracted an illness following upon the fright and exhaustion of helping to put out a fire. This started with pains in the back, leading to paralysis, abdominal symptoms of all kinds, blindness, etc. It all certainly pointed to hysteria, and the condition was diagnosed as such by four doctors. Next came the sudden 'cures' of sores, contractures, blindness, and 'appendicitis'. Then followed visions, the stigmata, apparent cessation of eating, clairvoyance, knowledge of strange tongues and so forth. So remarkable have been these manifestations that to some observers there has seemed to be no doubt of their supernatural nature; one of these is her parish priest, and another Bishop Teodorowicz, from whose writings the author quotes extensively. The observations of others, such as the Professor who investigated the case for the Congregation of Sacred Rites, lead to the conclusion that all these phenomena can be explained on the basis of hysteria. For example, Theresa passes into states of trance during which she has visions of the Passion; this is followed by a condition of complete childishness, and then at times a state of 'exalted rest'. The author of this book makes some very