

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVIII NUMBERS 1 & 2 1992

RATIONING HEALTH CARE: SOCIAL, POLITICAL AND LEGAL PERSPECTIVES

Symposium Authors:

Daniel Callahan

Frances H. Miller

Carol Mason Spicer

David C. Hadorn

Sara Rosenbaum

Robert M. Veatch

CASE COMMENT: *MOORE V. REGENTS OF THE
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA*

Helen R. Bergman

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE AND THE
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$70.00 per year for institutions, and \$60 for individuals (payment must be on personal check) who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$30.00 for foreign postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$20 (includes postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$120.00 for 1992). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in LEXIS, WESTLAW, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (Nonprofit Org.).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D., (hon.), L.H.D., (hon.), *President*,

University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law

RONALD A. CASS, B.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

CLAYTON P. GILLETTE, B.A., J.D. *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

KENNETH W. SIMONS, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

CHRISTINE MITCHELL, R.N., M.S., M.T.S., *President*

RUTH B. PURTILO, Ph.D., *President-Elect*

ROBERT F. WEIR, Ph.D., *Secretary*

TROYEN A. BRENNAN, M.D., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

BERNARD M. DICKENS, Ph.D., LL.D., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD of EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF EMERITUS AND FOUNDER

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.

DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS

American Society of Law & Medicine
Merrill Kaitz

CIRCULATION MANAGER

Susan Reddy

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D.

Boston University Schools of Law
and Public Health

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.

Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D.

Boston University School of Law

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.

Harvard University School of
Public Health

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.

Dunn & Auton
Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.

Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.

American College of Legal Medicine

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.

Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D.

University of Pittsburgh
Graduate School of Public Health

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.

Wildman, Harold Allen & Dickson
Chicago, Illinois

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.

Hollowell & Silverstein
Raleigh, North Carolina

Richard G. Huber, J.D.

Boston College Law School

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.

Director, Program on Science Technology
and Society
Cornell University

Jay Katz, M.D.

Yale University Law School

Renée M. Landers, J.D.

Boston College Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.

New York University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.,

F.R.C.P., D.C.H.

Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.

University of Medicine and Dentistry
of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida
Jacksonville, Florida

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.

Founder, American Society of
Law & Medicine
Harvard Medical School

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.

New York Law School

Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B.

Medical College of Wisconsin

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.

Special Assistant to the President
Tufts University

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.

Grad. Sch. of Business Administration
University of Michigan

Paul R. Tremblay

Boston College Law School

David G. Warren, J.D.

Duke University

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.

Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal
Medicine

James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.

Armed Forces Institute of Pathology
Washington, D.C.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter
Director
Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

Dr. S.S. Fluss
Chief, Health Legislation
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch
Institute for Pharmaceutical and
Medical Law
University of Gottingen
Federal Republic of Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.
Professor
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice
Michael D. Kirby**
President, Court of Appeal
Supreme Court of New South Wales
Australia

Koichi Bai
Professor of Law
Director of Institute of Medical
Humanities
School of Medicine
Kitasato University
Japan

P.D.G. Skegg
Dean of Law
University of Otago
Dunedin
New Zealand

Prof. Dr. iur. Dieter Giesen
Institute for International, Foreign
and Comparative Law
Director,
Working Centre for International
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law
The Free University of Berlin
Federal Republic of Germany

Professor Amos Shapira
Lubowski Professor of Law &
Biomedical Ethics
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVIII NUMBERS 1&2 1992

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS
1991-1992

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Darca L. Boom

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Ann E. Drobot

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Cynthia J. Warren

MANAGING EDITOR

Jacqueline M. Sussman

PROJECTS EDITOR

Renee I. Solomon

ARTICLES EDITORS

Helen R. Bergman
Helen Galanopoulos

Stuart M. Katz
Daniel I. St. Hilaire

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Fred Estrada
Seth Gold
Audrey L. Hildes
Heather Binks Lang

Michele Shoueka
Marc N. Sperber
Lisa A. Turiel
Margaret M. Walker

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

David H. Ager
Mathieu R. Berman
Jill A. Cohen
Adrienne D. Cowen
Thomas H. Dolan
Amy Feinberg

Peter Y. Flynn
Elizabeth D. Glener
Lori J. Glucksman
Hilary M. Henkind
Robert G. Honigman

Patti J. Levine
Ira P. Lustbader
Marisa L. Mascaro
Rakel M. Meir
Gerald A. Reynolds
Ina B. Scherl

STAFF MEMBERS

Richard E. Aubin
Lisa A. Bail
Dahlia A. Balsam
Lincoln D. Bandlow
Andrew S. Brenner
Matthew H. Bruck
Maria T. CeloCruz
Suzanne Cocca
Peter Dichiaro
Amy Grossberg
Andrew Hanan
Michael D. Handler

Deborah T. Hardy
Vickie L. Henry
Mary Beth Hewitt
Jennifer Ann Kasmin
Jason Kravitz
Susan Korenberg
Michelle Maerov
Nancy Mahler
Dominic Massa
Matthew A. Miller
Simon J.K. Miller
Andrew L. Packard

Regan P. Remillard
Sarah Rosenblatt
Amy J. Rosengarten
Melissa L. Roy
Deborah Schectman
Sean C. Sheely
Laurie Slosberg
Dolly Vance
Ronald L. Wisor
Gabriel Zambrano
Anne T. Zecha
Hal S. Zemel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVIII NUMBERS 1&2 1992

The American Journal of Law & Medicine is pleased to announce its 1992-1993 Student Board of Editors.

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS 1992-1993

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Suzanne V. Cocca

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Anne T. Zecha

MANAGING EDITORS

Amy Grossberg
Michelle E. Maerov

PROJECTS EDITOR

Vickie L. Henry

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Michael D. Handler

ARTICLES EDITORS

Matthew H. Bruck
Maria T. CeloCruz
Simon J.K. Miller
Ronald L. Wisor, Jr.

ASLM DEVELOPMENTS EDITOR

Jennifer A. Kasmin

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Richard E. Aubin
Lisa A. Bail
Andrew S. Brenner
Nancy D. Mahler

Matthew A. Miller
Deborah Schectman
Sean C. Sheely
Laurie J. Slosberg

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

Dahlia A. Balsam
Lincoln D. Bandlow
Peter Dichiaro
Andrew Hanan
Deborah T. Hardy
Mary Beth Hewitt

Jason Kravitz
Susan Korenberg
Dominic Massa
Andrew L. Packard
Regan P. Remillard

Sarah E. Rosenblatt
Amy J. Rosengarten
Melissa L. Roy
Dolly Vance
Gabriel Zambrano
Hal S. Zemel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XVIII NUMBERS 1&2 1992

Rationing Health Care: Social, Political and Legal Perspectives

ARTICLES

- SYMBOLS, RATIONALITY, AND JUSTICE: RATIONING HEALTH CARE 1 Daniel Callahan
- MEDICALLY FUTILE CARE: THE ROLE OF THE PHYSICIAN IN SETTING LIMITS 15 Robert M. Veatch
Carol Mason Spicer
- DENIAL OF HEALTH CARE AND INFORMED CONSENT IN ENGLISH AND AMERICAN LAW 37 Frances H. Miller
- EMERGING PARALLELS IN THE AMERICAN HEALTH CARE AND LEGAL-JUDICIAL SYSTEMS 73 David C. Hadorn
- MOTHERS AND CHILDREN LAST: THE OREGON MEDICAID EXPERIMENT 97 Sara Rosenbaum

NOTES AND COMMENTS

- CASE COMMENT: *MOORE V. REGENTS OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA* 127 Helen R. Bergman

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS 147
- GUEST BOOK REVIEW 163

Copyright 1992 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. Unless otherwise noted, the materials appearing herein may be copied for classroom use, provided that (1) the user notify the Editor-in-Chief of *American Journal of Law & Medicine* of having made such copies; (2) the author and *American Journal of Law & Medicine* are identified; and (3) the proper notice of copyright is affixed to each copy.