

THE UPANISHADS; A SECOND SELECTION. Translated from the Sanskrit, with notes by Swami Nikhilananda. (Phoenix House; 18s. od.)

This book forms the second volume of a projected four of the translation of the Upanishads published under the auspices of the Ramakrishna-Vivekananda Centre. The present volume includes the *Svetasvatara*, *Prasna*, and *Mandukya* Upanishads together with Gaudapada's *Karika* on the latter. Besides the translation there is a paraphrase of Sankara's commentary which is written from the point of view of absolute monism or, as the translator prefers to describe it, 'non-dualism'.

The Ramakrishna-Vivekananda Centre is avowedly concerned with the spread of Vedantin ideas as interpreted by Sankara: and the general public will be grateful to them for making available inexpensive translations of the Upanishads together with Sankara's commentary. Interest in Hindu religious ideas is spreading, and it is, therefore, essential that the public should be put in possession of accurate and readable translations of the Upanishads which constitute the religious basis of all orthodox Hindu thought. Hitherto the most accessible translations have been those of Hume and of Radhakrishnan who follows Hume almost slavishly. Both these translations are accurate, but they are not very readable. The present translation has the great virtue of being both readable and comprehensible. It has, however, one grave defect: it is rather a tendentious paraphrase than a translations.

Of the three Upanishads translated in this book the third, the *Mandukya*, is uncompromisingly monist, while the first, the *Svetasvatara*, is clearly theistic and dualist. The translator, then, renders the spirit of Sankara's commentary faithfully, for Sankara was concerned to show that, despite outward appearances to the contrary, all the evidence of scripture supported his extreme non-dualist position. When, however, Mr Nikhilananda twists the text to say something that it does not say, he sins both against scholarship and truth. This he does consistently: one example must suffice here, *Svetasvatara* 1.8. The Sanskrit text, literally translated, reads as follows:

'The Lord supports all this composite (universe), perishable and imperishable, manifest and unmanifest. Without the Lord the soul (*atma*) is bound because it experiences enjoyment. On knowing God (*deva*) it is released from all fetters.'

This is rendered as follows by Mr Nikhilananda:

'The Lord, Isa, supports all this which has been joined together—the perishable and the imperishable, the manifest (the effect) and the unmanifest (the cause).' So far so good. 'The same Lord (the Supreme Self), devoid of lordship [i.e. as the *jiva*], becomes bound because of

assuming the attitude of an enjoyer. The jiva again realizes the Supreme Self and is freed from all fetters.'

There are two serious and wilful, because tendentious, mistranslations here: (i) *atma*, which must mean the individual 'self' or soul here, is translated as 'the same Lord': (ii) *jnatva devam* (= *deo gnoto*) becomes transmuted into 'the jiva (individual soul) again realizes the Supreme Self'.

Mistranslation is the worst possible weapon in apologetics, for it implies that the translator is unsure of the soundness of his position. In this case it is totally unnecessary, for Sankara's commentary can be relied on to give a monistic interpretation to this and other texts without tampering with the sacred text itself.

This could have been a good and useful book. However, we still await a good, readable, and accurate translation of the Upanishads; and it is a pity that Mr Nikhilananda has not given us this, but has chosen to put sectarianism before accuracy in his translation of the sacred text. The Western public is entitled to know what the Upanishads actually say. Mr Nikhilananda has done that public a disservice by marring an otherwise attractive book with purposeful mistranslation.

R. C. ZAEHNER

THE PRACTICE OF PSYCHOTHERAPY. By C. G. Jung. (Collected Works, Vol. XVI.) Translated by R. F. C. Hull, with 14 illustrations. (Routledge and Kegan Paul; 30s.)

THE ORIGINS AND HISTORY OF CONSCIOUSNESS. By Erich Neumann. Foreword by C. G. Jung. Translated by R. F. C. Hull. (Routledge Kegan Paul; 30s.)

The third volume to be published of Jung's Collected Works contains eleven of his shorter monographs and papers dating from 1928 to 1951. It also contains the whole of his *Psychology of the Transference*, which occupies a separate volume in the German edition. The whole volume should be particularly welcome to practical Anglo-Saxon readers who may have been deterred by the exotic investigations of *Psychology and Alchemy* and the profound but somewhat theoretic insights and thought of the *Two Essays*. *Psychology of the Transference* is probably one of the finest of Jung's later writings, and merits repeated reading and pondering; English readers will find in it, for the first time, the practical applications to familiar psychological situations—both in the consulting room and in human relationships generally—of those alchemical researches undertaken in the earlier volume, but whose practical relevance it left somewhat obscure. The other contents will be of great interest, not only as expositions of Jung's practical techniques, but also for the light they shed on his position with regard