

NEW BIBLIOGRAPHIES OF THE HISTORY OF BRAZIL

Joseph L. Love
University of Illinois at Urbana

- BIBLIOGRAPHIA BRASILIANA: RARE BOOKS ABOUT BRAZIL PUBLISHED FROM 1504 TO 1900 AND WORKS BY BRAZILIAN AUTHORS OF THE COLONIAL PERIOD.* By RUBENS BORBA DE MORAES. Revised and enlarged edition in two volumes. (Los Angeles: UCLA Latin American Center Publications; and Rio de Janeiro: Livraria Kosmos Editôra, 1983. Pp. 1075. \$150.00 set.)
- BRAZIL AND ITS RADICAL LEFT: AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ON THE COMMUNIST MOVEMENT AND THE RISE OF MARXISM, 1922–1972.* By RONALD H. CHILCOTE. (Milwood, N.Y.: Kraus International Publications, 1980. Pp. 455. \$60.00.)
- A GUIDE TO THE HISTORY OF BRAZIL, 1500–1822: THE LITERATURE IN ENGLISH.* By FRANCIS A. DUTRA. (Santa Barbara, Calif.: ABC-Clio, 1980. Pp. 625. \$52.50.)
- BRAZIL, 1822–1930: AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY FOR SOCIAL HISTORIANS.* By ROBERT M. LEVINE. (New York: Garland Press, 1983. Pp. 487. \$60.00.)
- BRAZIL SINCE 1930: AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY FOR SOCIAL HISTORIANS.* By ROBERT M. LEVINE. (New York: Garland Press, 1980. Pp. 336. \$35.00.)

These bibliographies on various aspects of Brazilian history from its beginnings to the present attest to the growing richness of Brazilian historiography as practiced by Brazilian and foreign scholars. All of the works are annotated, all of them include works in six to ten European languages (excepting Dutra's, which was intentionally limited to English-language sources). Although one—the most daunting achievement of all—was written by a Brazilian, all were published in the United States as expensive hardcovers; only Dutra's volume is also available in paper. One must therefore lament the fact that few copies will become workaday tomes on the desks of Brazilian researchers.

All the bibliographies except Chilcote's cut a broad swath of economic, political, social, and cultural history. All pass the critical test of utility to the researcher in being well indexed by subject as well as by

author, or else (as in Dutra's case) the material is arranged by topic and cross-referenced. The extent of annotation varies greatly, with Borba and Dutra often providing a thousand words or more on a single entry, while Levine and Chilcote are sometimes overly laconic, restricting themselves to a single sentence on many items. Levine and Chilcote, however, do provide information on archival materials, and they as well as Dutra include unpublished dissertations.

One of the books is already well known in an earlier version. Rubens Borba de Moraes's *Bibliographia Brasiliana: Rare Books about Brazil Published from 1504 to 1900 and Works by Brazilian Authors of the Colonial Period* is a revised edition, expanded some 50 percent, of the original published in Amsterdam in 1958. The criteria for the inclusion of works (pamphlets as well as books) are indicated in the title, but not all items about Brazil published outside the country in the nineteenth century were included. The author relied instead on his own perception of rareness in determining which works merited treatment. The core material on the colonial period (1500–1822), however, seems virtually complete.

In his acknowledgements, Borba de Moraes lists the major collections where he worked over the decades in Brazil, the United States, and Europe. Furthermore, each entry provides references to descriptions in other bibliographic guides. This enormous enterprise involving over ten thousand entries was facilitated by the fact that Portugal, unlike Spain, did not permit a printing press to be imported into its American dependencies until 1808.

The new ninety-four-page index with subject entries makes *Bibliographia Brasiliana* a much more valuable research tool than was the first edition. There are many entries in the index on African and Amerindian ethnography, as well as descriptions of social conditions by region and province. The user will also find subject headings on diseases and epidemics, agricultural techniques (by region), immigration, linguistics, and the international slave trade.

Renowned as a bibliographer, a librarian, and a bibliophile, Borba de Moraes addressed his bibliography to collectors and librarians as well as historians. He comments on the rarity and physical characteristics of each item, in addition to listing successive editions and translations of important works. Thus the annotations (sometimes a thousand words or more) concern the content, the biography of the author, and the production features of the item in question. Borba de Moraes took pains to reproduce precisely the original titles and other bibliographical information, a difficult task because of the frequency of long, descriptive subtitles and the orthographic changes over four hundred years in the many European languages in which the works were written.

Specialists on colonial Brazil will find this expanded and revised

edition of the *Bibliographia Brasiliana* indispensable. This reviewer's only regrets about the book are first, that its cost (\$150) represents a formidable sum for Brazilian libraries under current exchange conditions, and second, that no information is provided as to the repositories where the rare works were consulted.

Francis Dutra's *Guide to the History of Brazil, 1500–1822: The Literature in English* has many entries that overlap Borba's, but it focuses on the historiographic content exclusively. Dutra's guide seems to have begun as a more modest undertaking than the ultimate product, which contains almost a thousand entries. Some annotations cover more than a page of text and frequently consist of long quotations from the sources cited. Dutra comes close to covering everything in English, including translations of scores of travelers' accounts, unpublished dissertations, and modern published studies. Comparing the corpus of work presented here with the material on colonial Brazil in Robert A. Humphreys's *Latin American History: A Guide to the Literature in English* (1958) suggests that the literature has expanded by a factor of nine.

Dutra provides a chronology and glossary, a description of relevant bibliographies and works on the Portuguese background, as well as addressing the history of colonial Brazil as such. He covers not only economic, political, and social history but includes many items on painting, literature, architecture, and music. Attuned to the interests of the modern student, the work offers not only chapters on institutions and developments by regions and periods, but also chapters on women, Amerindians, and Africans, among others. The useful section on comparative studies describes books and articles on slavery, the frontier, and urbanization—studies that explicitly compare the Brazilian experience with that of other regions in the New World. Dutra ends with a chapter on historiography. It should also be noted that although all of the works surveyed were written in English, some describe studies in Portuguese and other languages.

One stylistic feature I find a little disconcerting, although Dutra may have a majority of colonial historians in his camp. I refer to Dutra's retaining sixteenth-, seventeenth-, and eighteenth-century orthography for works composed in English, while works of the same period translated more recently from other languages are spared that antiquarian quality, which focuses attention on the spelling rather than the text. Thus Sarmiento de Gamboa describes his stay in "Brazil," while his contemporary, John Cooke, writes of "Brazylle." How quaint, the English!

Robert Levine's companion volumes, *Brazil, 1822–1930* and *Brazil since 1930*, together cover the whole national period and complement Dutra's work chronologically. Levine explains in his preface that his criteria for selection are those of a social historian, *lato sensu*. The two

volumes have similar formats, with chapters on reference works, general histories, and historiography; other chapters or sections treat state and polity, economics, urban Brazil, society, culture, and education. The volume on the empire and the old republic also contains chapters on contemporary narratives (travelers' accounts and studies about them) as well as slavery, which is analogous to the chapter on rural Brazil in the volume on the period since 1930. Although the volume on the earlier period (published three years later) is 150 pages longer than that on Brazil since 1930, it contains fewer entries (1,673 versus 1,845). A certain number of these are reproduced from the volume on contemporary Brazil. For those scholars whose interests do not cross the 1930 boundary, Levine's decision to repeat an entry rather than to cross-reference it between the two volumes saves the researcher the trouble of working with both volumes.

Levine's coverage is impressive, including a number of Brazilian master's theses as well as films and screenplays relevant to social history. Levine even treats some of the pamphlet literature, although he does not give the location of such rare items. *Brazil, 1822–1930* includes a large number of government publications, but *Brazil since 1930* does not because, as Levine sensibly argues, to do so would double the length of the volume. Inevitably, there are some omissions. I would especially like to see Linda Lewin's article on social banditry and Joseph Sweigert's dissertation on nineteenth-century coffee factors included in the next edition of the 1822–1930 guide.¹

It is interesting to note that in both Levine's volumes there are fewer entries on "society" than on "state and polity," although these divisions are admittedly somewhat artificial (the chapters on society in both volumes include sections on sex roles and the family, ethnic and race relations, native Brazilians, and religion). The length of the sections probably reflects the state of historiography and social science research. Notable, for example, is the fact that while studies on slavery have flourished in the last two decades, those on postabolition race relations have been few. Of interest to historians of *la vie quotidienne* and folklorists is the section in both volumes on popular culture, with many entries on Carnival, as well as lengthy sections on the arts at all levels. The contemporary volume contains a section on "sports," which means soccer. In regard to primary sources on social history, Levine's survey seems to indicate that historians cannot hope for the kind of richness and depth that Theodore Zeldin was able to distill from the massive French documentation used in his *France: 1848–1945*.²

There are a couple of mischaracterizations in *Brazil since 1930*. Kahil (item 730) does not defend the structuralist interpretation of Brazilian inflation as alleged, and Veríssimo's *Time and the Wind* (English

version, item 1198) is not set in the 1930s, although an untranslated part of the Portuguese original is.

Ronald Chilcote treats in depth one of Levine's political themes in *Brazil and Its Radical Left: An Annotated Bibliography on the Communist Movement and the Rise of Marxism, 1922–1972*. This work covers the same period as his *Brazilian Communist Party*,³ the half-century following the founding of the Partido Comunista Brasileiro (PCB) in 1922. Yet as the subtitle of the bibliography implies, the range of *Brazil and Its Radical Left* is broader than the development of the party per se, including some material on anarchism, socialism, Maoism, Trotskyism, populism, and nationalism. Although the scope is limited to published materials, the rarity of pamphlets and some serials makes the precise locating of certain documents important. For a number of items, Chilcote provides this information. In particular, he refers the reader to printed materials in the Arquivo Edgard Leuenroth at the Universidade Estadual de Campinas in São Paulo and in the Archivo Storico del Movimento Operaio in Milan; the latter contains the papers of PCB founder Astrojildo Pereira and labor leader Roberto Morena. Chilcote also indicates which items are part of his personal collection and which have been micro-filmed by the journal he edits, *Latin American Perspectives*. The first section of *Brazil and Its Radical Left* covers books and pamphlets, the second and longest section covers articles, and the third lists periodicals, with location and dates of surviving issues. The compiler lists 3,084 annotated items, exclusive of the nearly 400 journals surveyed in the final section.

Chilcote's bibliography is a welcome guide to the history of the Brazilian Communist Party and leftist movements in general, but it is less useful to students of Marxism as a discipline. José Arthur Giannotti's *Origens da Dialética do Trabalho*,⁴ probably the most important work by a Brazilian on Marx's thought, is not treated. Caio Prado Júnior's *Dialética do Conhecimento* (two volumes) is unhelpfully described as "an essay in dialectics." Another Prado work is certainly "underdescribed." In *A Revolução Brasileira*, Prado argued that Brazil's economy had been capitalist in its basic features since the colonial era and that the PCB was therefore wrong to hold that Brazil was still in transition from feudalism to capitalism. The implication of Prado's work was that conditions were ripe for revolution and that the PCB was wrong to insist that Marxists must support the national bourgeoisie against a feudal-imperialist alliance. Although *A Revolução Brasileira* had a great impact on the urban guerrillas of 1968–70,⁵ Chilcote notes only that the book is "a critique of orthodox Marxist interpretations of Brazil." Thus Chilcote's subtitle claiming to cover the "rise of Marxism" apparently refers to the movement, not to the development of Marxist thought. At the same time,

Chilcote seems to have catalogued almost every bulletin the PCB produced, including such routine protocol output as its fraternal greetings to the French Communist Party on the occasion of the latter's fourteenth congress (item 2,655).

Yet one should not dwell on what the author omits or treats too sketchily. Chilcote's success in locating, organizing, and cataloguing a literature subject to repeated suppression and sometimes to systematic destruction is itself an impressive achievement. *Brazil and Its Radical Left* is of great interest to students of Communist organizations and the history of leftist politics.

Taken together, these bibliographies, plus others on Brazilian race relations (which have been reviewed separately in this journal⁶), indicate a growing maturity in the historiography of Brazil. In their several specialized areas, these books represent impressive advances since the publication of the most important bibliography for historians in the 1950s and 1960s, the *Manual Bibliográfico de Estudos Brasileiros* (1949), edited by Rubens Borba de Moraes and William Berrien. Except for the *Bibliographia Brasiliiana*, the works under review inevitably reflect the specific research interests and categories of those North American historians and social scientists who compiled them. Nonetheless, these works will greatly assist all those who explore the areas of Brazilian history covered; and few will be more grateful than students commencing dissertation research.

NOTES

1. Linda Lewin, "The Oligarchical Limitations of Social Banditry in Brazil: The Case of the 'Good' Thief Antônio Silvino," *Past and Present* 82 (Feb. 1979):116–46; Joseph E. Sweigert, "Financing and Marketing Brazilian Export Agriculture: The Coffee Factors of Rio de Janeiro, 1850–1880," Ph.D. diss., University of Texas at Austin, 1980.
2. Theodore Zeldin, *France: 1848–1945*, Volume 1: *Ambition, Love, and Politics*; Volume 2: *Intellect, Taste, and Anxiety* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1973, 1977).
3. Ronald H. Chilcote, *The Brazilian Communist Party: Conflict and Integration, 1922–1972* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1974).
4. Caio Prado Júnior, *Origens da Dialética de Trabalho* (São Paulo: Difusão Européia do Livro, 1966).
5. See Fernando Gabeira, *O Que É Isso, Companheiro?* (Rio de Janeiro: Codecri, 1979), 31–32.
6. These works include Robert Conrad, *Brazilian Slavery: An Annotated Research Bibliography* (Boston: G. K. Hall, 1977); and Dorothy B. Porter, *Afro-Braziliana: A Working Bibliography* (Boston: G. K. Hall, 1978). See Laurence Hallewell, "Charting the Middle Passage: Recent Reference Books on the African Diaspora," *LARR* 19, no. 3 (1984):217–22.