

# **BEHAVIORAL AND BRAIN SCIENCES**

**Volume 2  
1979**

Reprinted with the permission of the original publisher  
by  
**Periodicals Service Company**  
Germantown, NY  
2006

**Printed on acid-free paper.**

**This reprint was reproduced from the  
best original edition copy available.**

**NOTE TO THE REPRINT EDITION:**

**In some cases full page advertisements which do not add to  
the scholarly value of this volume have been omitted.  
As a result, some reprinted volumes may have irregular pagination.**

# The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

*An International Journal of Current Research and  
Theory with Open Peer Commentary*

**ISSN 0140-525X**

**Editor**

Stevan Harnad

**Assistant Editor**

Helaine Randerson

**Associate Editors**

*Animal Intelligence*

David Premack

Department of Psychology, University of Pennsylvania

*Behavioral Biology*

Hans Kummer

Zoologisches Institut und Museum der Universität Zürich

*Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon W. Pylyshyn

Department of Psychology, University of Western Ontario

*Ethology and Neuroethology*

John C. Fentress

Department of Psychology, Dalhousie University, Halifax, N.S.

*Higher CNS Function*

Robert W. Doty

Center for Brain Research, University of Rochester

*History and Systems*

Julian Jaynes

Department of Psychology, Princeton University

*Language and Cognition*

Peter Wason

Psycholinguistics Research Unit, University College London

*Neurobiology*

Graham Hoyle

Department of Biology, University of Oregon

*Neurophysiology*

Barry H. Smith

Surgical Neurology Branch

National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, Md.

*Neuropsychology*

Karl Pribram

Department of Psychology, Stanford University

**Volume 2 1979**

Cambridge University Press

Cambridge

London      New York      New Rochelle

Melbourne      Sydney

1979

**Published by the Press Syndicate of The University of Cambridge**  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP  
32 East 57th Street, New York, NY 10022  
296 Beaconsfield Parade, Middle Park, Melbourne 3206

© Cambridge University Press 1979

*Printed in the United States of America by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania*

## Target Article

### Arbib, M. A. & Caplan, D. Neurolinguistics must be computational

449

#### Open Peer Commentary

- Blumstein, S. E. *Phrenology, "boxology," and neurology*  
Buckingham, H. W., Jr. *Must neurolinguistics be computational?*  
Cohen, G. *Are computational models like HEARSAY psychologically valid?*  
Frazier, L. *Constraining models in neurolinguistics*  
Freemon, F. R. *Computers are dumb*  
Gardner, H. *Computational neurolinguistics: promises, promises*  
Garrett, M. & Zurif, E. *Neurolinguistics must be more experimental before it can be effectively computational*  
Goodglass, H. *Is model building advancing neurolinguistics?*  
Greenblatt, S. H. *Is neurolinguistics ready for reductionism?*  
Halwes, T. *An embarrassment of riches in nascent neurolinguistics*  
Hudson, P. T. W. *What is computational neurolinguistics anyway?*

460	Kean, M.-L. & Smith, G. E. <i>Issues in core linguistic processing</i>	469
461	Langendoen, D. T. <i>Linguistics must be computational too</i>	470
462	Locke, S. <i>Localization, representation, and re-representation in neurolinguistics</i>	471
463	Marshall, J. C. <i>The sense of computation</i>	472
464	Reiss, R. F. <i>A neurolinguistic computation: how must "must" be understood?</i>	473
464	Richards, B. <i>Neurolinguistics: grammar and computation</i>	473
465	Schank, R. C. <i>Process models and language</i>	474
466	Schnitzer, M. L. <i>Computational neurolinguistics and the competence-performance distinction</i>	475
467		
467	<b>One Author's Response</b>	
468	Arbib, M. A. <i>Cooperative computation as a concept for brain theory</i>	475

## Continuing Commentary

### Pylyshyn, Z. W. (1978) Computational models and empirical constraints. BBS 1:93-127.

485

- Otto, H. R. *Models in cognitive psychology: contrast and constraint*

485	Pask, G. <i>A broader view of psychology and of computation</i>	486
-----	-----------------------------------------------------------------	-----

## Number 4, December 1979

#### Target Article

### O'Keefe, J., Nadel, L. Précis: *The hippocampus as a cognitive map*

487

#### Open Peer Commentary

- Amsel, A. *Hippocampus, memory and movement*  
Berger, T. W. *Selective activation of hippocampal neurons*  
Blanchard, D. C., Blanchard, R. J. *Behavioral analysis of the hippocampal syndrome*  
Bliss, T. V. P. O'Keefe & Nadel's three-stage model for hippocampal representation of space  
Bures, J. *The "neuroethological revolution" in unit studies*  
Douglas, R. J. *The hippocampus and its apparent migration to the parietal lobe*  
Downs, R. M. *On the nature of cognitive maps*  
Ellen, P. *The hippocampus and operant behavior*  
Gray, J. A. *Spatial mapping only a special case of hippocampal function*  
Greene, E. *On panspatial theories of brain and behavior*  
Hécaen, H. *Cortical areas involved in spatial function*  
Hirsh, R., Krajden, J. *Hippocampal function: logic, logic, and more logic*  
Holmes, J. E. *Waves and cells, maps and memories, space and time*

494	Horel, J. A. <i>Lost maps and memories</i>	506
495	Isaacson, R. L. <i>Hippocampal lesions and intermittent reinforcement</i>	507
496	Jackendoff, R. <i>What is a cognitive map?</i>	507
496	Jarrard, L. E. <i>Considerations in evaluating the cognitive mapping theory of hippocampal function</i>	509
497	Kesner, R. P. <i>Hippocampus and memory</i>	509
497	Moore, J. W. <i>The hippocampus and informational salience</i>	510
498	Nonneman, A. J. <i>Time: a fourth dimension for the hippocampal cognitive map</i>	511
499		
500	Olton, D. S. <i>Inner and outer space: the neuroanatomical bases of spatially organized behavior</i>	511
501	Pinker, S. <i>Mental maps, mental images, and intuitions about space</i>	513
503	Ranck, J. B. Jr. <i>On O'Keefe, Nadel, space and brain</i>	513
503	Squire, L. R. <i>The hippocampus, space, and human amnesia</i>	514
504	Swanson, L. W. <i>The anatomy of a cognitive map</i>	515
505	Thomas, G. J. <i>Cognition, memory, and the hippocampus</i>	515

Thompson, R. F., Solomon, P. R., Weisz, D. J. "Model systems" versus "neuroethological" approach to hippocampal function	517	Vonéche, J. J. <i>Cognitive maps: dimensionality and development</i>	519
Ursin, H. <i>Anatomical units in psychology</i>	518	<b>Authors' Response</b>	
Vanderwolf, C. H. Is hippocampal rhythmical slow activity specifically related to movement through space?	518	O'Keefe, J. & Nadel, L. <i>The cognitive map as a hippocampus</i>	520

## Target Article

### Kosslyn, S. M., Pinker, S., Smith, G. E., & Shwartz, S. P. On the demystification of mental imagery

535

#### Open Peer Commentary

Abelson, R. P. <i>Imagining the purpose of imagery</i>	548	Neisser, U. <i>Images, models, and human nature</i>	561
Antrobus, J. S. <i>Matters of definition in the demystification of mental imagery</i>	549	Paivio, A. <i>Computational versus operational approaches to imagery</i>	561
Bridgeman, B. <i>Neurologizing mental imagery: the physiological optics of the mind's eye</i>	550	Plyshyn, Z. <i>Imagery theory: not mysterious – just wrong</i>	561
Cooper, L. A. <i>Modeling the mind's eye</i>	550	Richardson, A. <i>Conscious and nonconscious imagery</i>	563
de Vega, M. <i>On interpretative processes in imagery</i>	551	Richman, C. L., Mitchell, D. B., & Reznick, J. S. <i>The demands of mental travel: demand characteristics of mental imagery experiments</i>	564
Feldman, J. A. <i>So many models – So little time</i>	551	Sankowski, E. <i>On demystifying the mental for psychology</i>	565
Hannay, A. <i>Images, memory, and perception</i>	552	Schank, R. C. <i>AI, imagery, and theories</i>	566
Hayes-Roth, F. <i>Understanding mental imagery: interpretive metaphors versus explanatory models</i>	553	Shanon, B. <i>The image-like and the quasi-verbal</i>	566
Heil, J. <i>Mental imagery and mystification</i>	554	Sheehan, P. W. <i>Metaphor versus reality in the understanding of imagery: the path from function to structure</i>	567
Hinton, G. <i>Imagery without arrays</i>	555	Smythe, W. E. & Kokers, P. A. <i>On spatial symbols</i>	568
Hunter, I. M. L. <i>Mental visualization in nonlaboratory situations</i>	556	Waltz, D. L. <i>On the function of mental imagery</i>	569
Johnson-Laird, P. N. <i>The "thoughtless imagery" controversy</i>	557	<b>Authors' Response</b>	
Keenan, J. M. & Olson, R. K. <i>The imagery debate: a controversy over terms and cognitive styles</i>	558	Kosslyn, S. M., Pinker, S., Smith, G. E. & Shwartz, S. P. <i>The how, what, and why of mental imagery</i>	570
Luce, R. D. <i>A conceptual, an experimental, and a modeling question about imagery research</i>			
Moran, T. P. <i>The imprecision of mental imagery</i>			

## Target Article

### Haber, R. N. Twenty years of haunting eidetic imagery: where's the ghost?

583

#### Open Peer Commentary

Ahsen, A. <i>Eidetics: redefinition of the ghost and its clinical application</i>	594	Julesz, B. <i>Random-dot correlogram test for eidetic imagery</i>	607
Ashton, R. <i>Eidetic imagery and stimulus control</i>	596	Lieblich, I. <i>Eidetic imagery: do not use ghosts to hunt ghosts of the same species</i>	608
Barber, T. X. <i>Eidetic imagery and the ability to hallucinate at will</i>	596	Lindauer, M. S. <i>Exorcising the ghosts in the study of eidetic imagery</i>	609
Blanc-Garin, J. <i>Is eidetic imagery still eidos?</i>	597	Marks, D. <i>Eidetic imagery: Haber's ghost and Hatakeyama's ghoul</i>	610
Bridgeman, B. <i>Toward a neurological theory of eidetic imagery</i>	598	Merritt, J. O. <i>None in a million: results of mass screening for eidetic ability using objective tests published in newspapers and magazines</i>	612
Bugelski, B. R. <i>Eidetic possession: is exorcism necessary?</i>	598	Neisser, U. <i>Tracing eidetic imagery</i>	612
Dennett, D. C. <i>Breeding cognitive strategies</i>	599	Richardson, A. <i>Eidetic imagery, occipital EEG activity, and palinopsia</i>	613
Doob, L. W. <i>The cross-cultural approach to eidetic images</i>	600	Roberts-Gray, C. <i>The visualization continuum</i>	614
Ericsson, K. A., Chase, W. G., & Simon, H. A. <i>Phenomenological reports as data</i>	601	Roodin, P. A. & Giray, E. F. <i>Eidetic imagery is not a ghost</i>	614
Furst, C. J. <i>The inside and outside of eidetic imagery</i>	602	Sheehan, P. W. <i>Eidetic imagery: continuing to be an enigmatic phenomenon</i>	615
Hannay, A. <i>Eidetic imagery: theories and ghosts</i>	603	Siegel, M. H. <i>Eidetic imagery: where's the ghost?</i>	616
Heinerth, K. <i>Autochthonous and phenomenal eidetic capacity</i>	604	Sipola, E. M. <i>The search for neurological correlates of eidetic imagery</i>	617
Holding, D. H. <i>Does being "eidetic" matter?</i>	604	Smith, G. <i>The need for strict differentiation between eidetics and noneidetics</i>	617
Hunter, I. M. L. <i>The easel procedure and eidetic characteristics</i>	605		
Jaynes, J. <i>Palaeolithic cave paintings as eidetic images</i>	605		

Wallace, B. <i>Eidetic imagery need not haunt us: a supportive example for the use of phenomenological reports</i>	618	<b>Author's Response</b>	
		Haber, R. N. <i>Eidetic imagery still lives, thanks to twenty-nine exorcists</i>	619

## Continuing Commentary

**Bindra, D.** (1978) How adaptive behavior is produced: a perceptual-motivational alternative to response-reinforcement. BBS 1:41–91.

Asratyan, E. A. <i>Pavlov's concept of reinforcement</i>	631	<b>Author's Response</b>	
		Bindra, D. B. <i>A nonPavlovian view of Pavlovian conditioning</i>	632

**Haugeland, J.** (1978) The nature and plausibility of Cognitivism. BBS 1:215–260.

Royce, J. R. <i>The conceptual range of "cognitivism"</i>	634	<b>Author's Response</b>	
		Haugeland, J.	634

**Rajecki, D. W., Lamb, M. E., and Obmascher, P.** (1978) Toward a general theory of infantile attachment: a comparative review of aspects of the social bond. BBS 1:417–464.

Baerends, G. P. <i>Programmed development</i>	635	Lewis, M. <i>Cognitive factors in attachment</i>	640
Bindra, D. <i>What next? A perceptual-motivational approach to attachment</i>	636	Main, M. <i>The ultimate causation of some infant attachment phenomena: further answers, further phenomena, and further questions</i>	640
Bornstein, M. H. <i>Two questions for a general theory of infantile attachment</i>	636	Weinraub, M. <i>Separation distress in human infants</i>	643
Bowlby, J. <i>The Bowlby-Ainsworth attachment theory</i>	637		
Greenberg, G. <i>Approach/withdrawal theory and infantile social bonding</i>	638	<b>Authors' Response</b>	
Kramer, D. A., and McKinney, W. T. Jr. <i>Ethology: the natural model</i>	639	Rajecki, D. W. & Lamb, M. E. <i>Infant attachment: some final thoughts about theory and method</i>	644