

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 6 NUMBER 3 FALL 1980

Controlling Physician Oversupply
Through Certificate of Need

John T. Tierney, M.S.W.
William J. Waters, Ph.D.
Donald C. Williams, M.A.

Does the Hyde Amendment Violate
Religious Freedom? *Harris v.*
McRae and the First Amendment

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

Selected Recent Court Decisions

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Karen Carroll, J.D.
Bruce L. Watson, J.D.

Selected Book Releases,
Annotated

Denise Provost, B.A.

Maldistributed Health Care
Services: Restructuring the
Current Regulatory System

J. David Canarie, Jr.

Psychiatric Expert Witnesses:
Proposals for Change

James E. Needell

Published by the American Society of Law & Medicine

Editorial support provided by Boston University School of Law

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE was founded in response to the need for a scholarly yet pragmatic publication encompassing all aspects of medicolegal relations. The JOURNAL seeks to provide a broad perspective on our complex health care system, to encourage interdisciplinary communication, and to stimulate creative solutions to the pressing medicolegal problems of our time.

In addition to serving as a forum for analyses and proposals in such areas as health law and policy, legal insurance medicine, and bioethics, the JOURNAL offers a wide variety of pertinent reference materials in these and related areas.

The JOURNAL serves persons from a variety of fields who seek to understand and to influence medicolegal developments: physicians, other health care providers, and health administrators; lawyers; health analysts and planners; researchers and educators in health specialties; judges, legislators, and government administrators; insurance officials; consumer advocates and concerned members of the general public.

The JOURNAL is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine. Editorial support is provided by Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by the Editor-in-Chief on behalf of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, American Journal of Law & Medicine, 209 Bay State Road, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2953.

Business correspondence, including subscription and advertising correspondence, should be addressed to the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4992.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single issue price of \$10.

Subscriptions: \$40.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$15.00 for air mail postage or an additional \$5.00 for surface rate postage.

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$60.00 for 1979). Information concerning membership is available from the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4992.

Copyright © 1979 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. All or any part of materials appearing in the JOURNAL may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Contents of Current Legal Periodicals*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts, in accordance with Permit No. 55855 (Nonprofit Org.).

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 6 NUMBER 3 FALL 1980

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

STUDENT BOARD of EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

J. David Canarie

MANAGING EDITOR

Mary E. Bowler

ARTICLES EDITOR

Ronald Grosser

CASE and NOTE EDITORS

Denise Lachance

James E. Needell

Laurence J. Shulman

Susan E. Silbersweig

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Linda V. Tiano

BUSINESS EDITOR

Donald B. Shanin

TOPICS EDITOR

Nina P. Silfen

EDITORS

Cynthia A. Feigin

Judy K. Mencher

Ellen B. Shankman

Lawrence B. Slater

Michael Tabb

STUDENT STAFF

Ilyse Dawn Barkan

Robert J. Carolla

Randee L. Cassel

Ross Eatman

David F. Eisner

Michael Fertig

Linda Galler

Frederic Paul Gallin

Nancy R. Gottlieb

Kenneth S. Greenberg

Janet Isak Hawley

Karen J. Herlich

Marian Hertz

Lawrence R. Leonard

Theresa M. Mady

Susan Rosenfeld

Scott L. Salat

Matthew B. Schiff

Susan M. Schmidt

Harvey Shapiro

Vicki Volper

BOSTON COLLEGE LAW SCHOOL

STUDENT EDITORS

William F. Grieco

Warren J. Hurwitz

Scott Sherman

FACULTY ADVISER

Frances H. Miller, J.D.

Professor of Law

Boston University

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 6 NUMBER 3 FALL 1980

BOARD of EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Tufts Univ. School of Dental Med.
Boston Coll. & Boston U. Law Schools

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

A. Edward Doudera, J.D.

MANAGING EDITOR

Judith Lesser, J.D., M.S.

ASSISTANT MANAGING EDITOR

Thomas J. Lewis, J.D.

BOOK & PERIODICAL REVIEW EDITOR

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

CONTRIBUTING EDITOR

Stephen M. Weiner, LL.B.

Mark D. Altschule, M.D.
Harvard University

Donald B. Barkan, M.D., F.A.C.P.
Director, Employee Health, Lynn &
Union Hospitals

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Patrick Carroll, J.D.
Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel,
Massachusetts Hospital Ass'n

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.
Harvard University

Douglas Danner, J.D.
Trial Attorney

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.
General Counsel, Northwestern
Memorial Hospital

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Harvard Medical School

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.
General Counsel, Am. Med. Ass'n

Richard G. Huber, J.D.
Dean, Boston College Law School

Alan K. Kaplan, LL.B., M. Sci.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Georgetown Univ. Medical School

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale University

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

**Aubrey Milunsky, M.B.B.Ch.,
M.R.C.P., D.C.H.**
Harvard Medical School

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
Rutgers Medical School, College of
Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law

Honorable Max Rosenn
United States Court of Appeals

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Harvard Medical School
Boston College Law School

William Schwartz, J.D., M.A.
Dean ad interim,
Boston Univ. School of Law

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
Dean, New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.
Director, Medical Genetics Center
University of Texas at Houston

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.
Dean, Tufts Univ. School of
Dental Med.; Past Pres., ADA

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.
Grad. Sch. of Business Administration
Univ. of Michigan

Richard E. Speidel, J.D., LL.M.
Northwestern Law School

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
Director, Pittsburgh Inst. of Legal
Med.; Coroner, Allegheny County

RESEARCH ASSOCIATES

Karen Carroll, J.D.

Denise Provost, B.A.

Bruce L. Watson, J.D.

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

PRESIDENT

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Boston College Law School
Harvard Medical School

FIRST VICE-PRESIDENT

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney and Consultant in Health Law, Boston, Massachusetts
Editor-in-Chief, *American Journal of Law & Medicine*

VICE-PRESIDENT

Sidney Scherlis, M.D.
University of Maryland Medical School

SECRETARY

Aubrey Milunsky, M.B.B.Ch., M.R.C.P., D.C.H.
Harvard Medical School
Director, Genetics Division, Shriver Center

TREASURER

Barry C. Reed, LL.B.
Trial Attorney

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

A. Edward Doudera, J.D.
Managing Editor, *Mediolegal News*
Executive Editor, *American Journal of Law & Medicine*

GENERAL COUNSEL

Douglas Danner, J.D.
Trial Attorney

BACK ISSUES OF THE JOURNAL

A limited number of back issues through Volume 1 of the JOURNAL are available from the subscription office of the American Society of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215, at the single issue price of \$10.00, or per volume as follows:

Vol. 1 (1975)	\$15 (2 issues)	Vol. 4 (1978)	\$30 (4 issues)
Vol. 2 (1976)	\$15 (2 issues)	Vol. 5 (1979)	\$40 (4 issues)
Vol. 3 (1977)	\$30 (4 issues)	Vol. 6 (1980)	\$40 (4 issues)

Notice of American Journal of Law & Medicine Fellowship

The first two Joseph D. Norris, Esq., Health Law Fellowships for assisting in the publication of the *American Journal of Law & Medicine* have been announced. They have been awarded to Karen Carroll and Muriel Fudala, both of Boston, Massachusetts. Each fellowship award carries a stipend of \$1,000 for scholarly service to the *American Journal of Law & Medicine* for three weeks full-time or six weeks part-time. Those interested should apply to the Editorial Office of the *American Journal of Law & Medicine*, 209 Bay State Road, Boston, Massachusetts 02215, (617) 353-2953.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 6 NUMBER 3 FALL 1980

ARTICLE

- Controlling Physician
Oversupply Through
Certificate of Need 335
- John T. Tierney, M.S.W.
William J. Waters, Ph.D.
Donald C. Williams, M.A.

COMMENT

- Does the Hyde Amendment
Violate Religious Freedom?
Harris v. McRae and the
First Amendment 361
- Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- Selected Recent Court
Decisions 375
- John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Karen Carroll, J.D.
Bruce L. Watson, J.D.
- Selected Book Releases,
Annotated 390
- Denise Provost, B.A.

NOTES AND COMMENTS

- Maldistributed Health Care
Services: Restructuring the
Current Regulatory System 407
- J. David Canarie, Jr.
- Psychiatric Expert
Witnesses: Proposals for
Change 425
- James E. Needell