

quotes my exposition of that logic, to show how Dr. Rush's opinions are "belabored," does not even insinuate that I have misrepresented the text.

Respectfully yours,
PLINY EARLE.

Leicester, Massachusetts,
November 14, 1856.

The Military Lunatic Hospital; a Summary of the Minutes of Evidence taken before the Select Committee on the Medical Department (Army) so far as they relate to the re-establishment of that Hospital. By C. Lockhart Robertson, M.B. Cantab., &c., &c., &c.

At the last annual meeting of the association at the Derby County Asylum, on the 1st of August, I had the honour of moving the following resolutions relative to the military lunatic asylum, based on the report of Mr. Stafford's select parliamentary committee which had just before been printed by order of the House :

1. *That this Association view with unqualified satisfaction the recommendation contained in the 16th section of the report of the Select Committee of the House of Commons, appointed on the medical department of the army, and that a Military Lunatic Asylum be provided as embraced in the design for the new Military Hospital at Southampton.*

2. *That this Association desire respectfully to convey to the Right Honourable the Minister of War and to the Director General of the Army Medical Department, the satisfaction it will afford the members of the association to place their practical experience in the arrangements of such institutions, at the disposal of those to whom the fitting up and charge of the new Military Lunatic Hospital may be entrusted.*

3. *That a copy of these two resolutions be forwarded to the Minister of War and to the Director General of the Army Medical Department.**

* In the following letters the Director General and the Right Hon. the Secretary of State for War thus courteously acknowledge the receipt of these resolutions:

6, Whitehall Yard, Westminster, Oct. 17th, 1856.

1. Sir,—In acknowledging the receipt of your letter of the 16th inst., I have to inform you that it has afforded me much gratification to find that the

v²

These resolutions were seconded by Dr. Forbes Winslow and unanimously adopted by the meeting.

Since the date of that meeting (August 1) the minutes of evidence taken before the select parliamentary committee have been published. From this large volume of evidence, comprising 4683 questions and answers and a large appendix, I have selected that which relates to the military lunatic hospital, and which lies scattered among the many other important subjects on which the several witnesses were examined. I have not deemed it necessary to print every question and answer *verbatim* relating to the military lunatic hospital, as such a plan would occupy more space than I could claim for the purpose, but I have fairly re-produced the subject matter brought in evidence by each witness examined on the question of the treatment of the insane patients of the army.

1. *H.R.H. The Duke of Cambridge* was asked by Colonel North. (question 3708) "It has been stated in the course of the evidence given before this committee, that we have no lunatic asylum for soldiers, but that lunatic soldiers are sent to different county asylums, and so on; is your Royal Highness of opinion that it would be advantageous if there were some general establishment or asylum to which insane soldiers might be sent?" "*I should say so decidedly;*" was the reply.

2. *Major-Gen. Sir R. Airey, K.C.B.* Colonel North put this same question to Sir R. Airey, who replied—"Yes; it would only be what is right." Colonel North then added "to

committee of the association of medical officers of asylums and hospitals for the insane, consider the measure about to be adopted by the government a satisfactory one, and that every disposition exists to aid us in carrying it out.

I beg you will be pleased to express my best thanks to the committee and state that I shall have pleasure in availing myself of the offer so generously made as soon as the official preliminaries shall have been completed.

I have the honour to be, Sir,

Your most obedient humble servant,

A. SMITH, M.D., Director General.

C. L. Robertson, Esq., M.B.

Honorary Secretary to the Association of Medical Officers
of Asylums and Hospitals for the Insane.

War Department, November 13, 1856.

2. Sir,—I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter of the 16th ult. enclosing copies of resolutions passed at the General Meeting of the Association of Medical Officers of Asylums and Hospitals for the Insane, and in conveying to you the thanks of the Secretary of State for War for the offer of the services of the members of the Association, to state that the subject of a military lunatic hospital has not failed to obtain the serious attention of his Lordship.

I am, Sir, your obedient servant,

K. BACON.

Dr. C. L. Robertson, &c, &c.

put the asylum on the same footing with the navy?"—Yes, was the reply. When asked at the conclusion of his evidence, if he had any suggestions to offer to the committee, Sir Richard, among other points, observed, "I would recommend the establishment of a military lunatic asylum."

3. *Major-General Lord de Ros.* In answer to a question by Colonel North, his Lordship observes, "I think the providing a lunatic asylum would be a great boon to the soldier. I have often heard bitter complaints made by the friends of soldiers who have become lunatic in consequence of the hardships they have experienced while on service, that they are handed about and sent to their parishes and to the county hospitals without that care being taken of them to which their condition entitles them." (2687.)

4. *J. R. Hume, Esq., M.D., Commissioner in Lunacy.* Dr. Hume was asked by the chairman, after he had given an account of how and where the insane patients of the army are placed, "Do you think it would be advantageous to have a lunatic asylum for soldiers alone?" and he replied, "I think it would be; but I believe there are various difficulties in the way. There are not a great number of them," (2795.) The chairman, rather struck, apparently, by this doubtful answer of Dr. Hume's, renewed his question, saying, "But if there be an asylum for the Navy, and for the soldiers belonging to the East India Company, do you not think that there ought to be one for a great Army like ours?" To this, Dr. Hume has only in reply, "Dr. Williams's house, where the East India Company's soldiers are, is a private asylum. I was physician for several years to the East India Company, and we endeavoured to get them to build a hospital, but they demurred at the expense." (2796.)

It must be a matter of regret that Dr. Hume should have thus failed in bearing distinct testimony to the very principle on which the commission of which he is a member is based, viz.: the practical recognition of the imperative necessity of placing the insane poor of all classes (civil and military alike,) under the protection and care which a public institution alone affords them.

5. *Dr. Dartnell, Deputy Inspector-General of Hospitals.* Dr. Dartnell having been two years in charge of the military lunatic hospital at Yarmouth, and having during that period carried out many improvements, to the satisfaction of the Commissioners in Lunacy, was an important witness.

Colonel North, who appears to take a warm interest in

the re-establishment of the military lunatic hospital, thus examined Dr. Dartnell:

(2308) Would you be in favour of confining military lunatics to civil hospitals? I think not.

(2309) Will you state why not? I think a military asylum would be more beneficial to the soldier and to the service. I think that a soldier-lunatic would be better managed in a military asylum.

(2310) In which asylum do you think that any attempt at malingering would be discovered soonest, in a military or a civil hospital? I think in a military hospital.

(2311) Do you think that even in the insanity of soldiers military discipline is of any use in preserving order? I think it is of considerable use in giving them habits of order and regularity.

(2324 Chairman.) Will you give an illustration of the way in which you think military discipline exists in the management of insane soldiers? I found myself that a lunatic soldier when receiving an order from a person in plain clothes, has disobeyed him and said, 'I do not know you; you are not an officer; I have nothing to say to you.'

(2325 Colonel North.) What was the reason that the lunatic hospital that you presided over at Yarmouth was done away with? The patients were removed from it because the buildings belonged to the admiralty, and on the breaking out of the war they required it for a naval hospital, for which it was originally built.

(2326.) Has it been used as such? Never; there has never been a patient in it since, I believe.

(2327 Sir Henry Davie.) Are the medical officers who have charge of the military lunatic hospitals, gentlemen who have given their attention particularly to the management of lunatics? There is no lunatic hospital since the breaking up of the establishment at Yarmouth.

(2328 Colonel North.) Do you not think it would be an advantage to have a regular asylum for insane soldiers? Yes, I do certainly.

(2329 Chairman.) Are there any examinations for army surgeons in reference to the treatment of lunatics? No, I think not.

(2330.) Do any of the army surgeons at all turn their attention to that branch of the profession? No, I do not think they do; as long as the asylum at Yarmouth lasted, of course those who were appointed to it, made a point of doing so.

(2331) They learnt their profession after going there and not before going there? Yes.

(2332) Therefore they entered that asylum wholly unacquainted with the treatment of lunatics? Yes, except as far as their general knowledge went.

(2333) What experimental knowledge could they have upon the subject? Every medical man studies more or less the subject of insanity.

(2334) In the examination through which every army surgeon has to pass before he is appointed, are any questions put as to the treatment of lunatics? There is no examination I believe on that head.

6. *J. A. Bostock, Esq., surgeon Scots Fusiliers.* Colonel North asked Mr. Bostock his opinion with regard to the establishment of an asylum for insane soldiers, instead of their being sent to private establishments, to which Mr. Bostock replied, that he would decidedly prefer sending them to a military asylum.

7 *William Lindsay, Esq., Inspector of Hospitals at Haslar.* The following questions were put to Mr. Lindsay during his examination:

(2532 Colonel North.) Is there a lunatic asylum for the navy? Yes.

(2533) Not a civil hospital but a naval one? Yes, a part of Haslar hospital is set apart for that purpose; there is a staff-surgeon who has charge of it, and he has a staff assisting him.

(2534) And any officers who may be insane are at that establishment? They are.

(2535) And the men too? And the men too.

(2536) And the men are not returned to their parishes to be sent to county hospitals, but are taken care of by the government? Yes, if they are permanently insane.

(2537 Chairman.) The system is one of moral and not of physical restraint? Yes.

(2538) Do you consider that the present arrangements of that hospital are satisfactory or otherwise? I think they are extremely satisfactory.

(2539) Do you think that the influence of discipline is brought to bear upon those lunatics with good effect? Decidedly.

(2540) Which could not be done in a civil hospital? Not so well, I think.

This evidence which I have thus brought together, had its due weight with the committee, and led them in their

report, to recommend that a military lunatic asylum be provided as embraced in the design for the new military hospital at Southampton, while the letter from the Director-General, which I have printed above, (foot note, p. 271), in reply to the resolutions of this association, leads to the belief that the new military lunatic hospital will be in every way worthy of the nation.

A Letter to the Committee of Visitors of the Surrey Lunatic Asylum, by Charles Snape, Medical Superintendent. Pamphlet. Churchill.

Since the notice given in this Journal of the prosecution of Mr. Snape, the affair has gone through several stages. The prosecution has failed. Enquiry has been made before the visitors of the Surrey asylum, and a Jury of medical celebrities, viz., Dr. Addison, Dr. Sutherland, Dr. R. B. Todd, Dr. Babbington, Dr. R. Quain, and Mr. W. Bowman. Consequent on the opinion expressed by those gentlemen, Mr. Snape has been re-instated in his office of medical superintendent. The precise terms of the verdict thus given has not transpired. Mr. Snape has embraced the opportunity of publishing that which he had previously been advised to reserve, his statement in defence. Under the extraordinary circumstances which had enveloped him, he had suffered what few are subjected to. His defence is not pure of the spirit of counter attack, which clears him less than it reflects on others. It is, however, pointed, and contains matter that is well put, that requires professional consideration, and needs to have its value more definitely determined than is to be expected in personal controversy. It is the more necessary that Mr. Snape's opinions should have full publicity, because the Press, seldom neglectful of what is exciting to the public taste, has indulged itself in the publication of attack only, while it is equal publicity that awards popular justice.

It is perhaps unfortunate for Mr. Snape, as it is unfortunate for the profession in lunacy, that the determinate enquiry did not take place in open court.

It is now needless to repeat or expose the deficiency of evidence that the patient Dolly's death was consequent on, as it was subsequent to, his undergoing the shower bath. Mr. Snape, however, adds to the information which tended to shew that his decease was irrespective of his treatment. He also