

# Social Philosophy & Policy

Contemporary Political



## CONTENTS

GREGORY S. KAVKA	Why Even Morally Perfect People Would Need Government	1
DAVID GAUTHIER	Public Reason	19
GERALD J. POSTEMA	Public Practical Reason: An Archeology	43
AMY GUTMANN AND DENNIS THOMPSON	Moral Disagreement in a Democracy	87
JOHN GRAY	Agonistic Liberalism	111
GEORGE SHER	Liberal Neutrality and the Value of Autonomy	136
G. A. COHEN	The Pareto Argument for Inequality	160
ERIC MACK	The Self-Ownership Proviso: A New and Improved Lockean Proviso	186
SAMUEL SCHEFFLER	Individual Responsibility in a Global Age	219

# Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

**Editor:** Ellen Frankel Paul

**Associate Editors:** Fred D. Miller, Jr., and Jeffrey Paul

**Managing Editor:** Harry Dolan

*Social Philosophy and Policy Center*

## Editorial Board

David Braybrooke  
*University of Texas, Austin*

Baruch Brody  
*Rice University*

Allen Buchanan  
*University of Wisconsin, Madison*

James Buchanan  
*Center for Study of Public Choice,  
George Mason University*

Jules Coleman  
*Yale University*

Jack Douglas  
*University of California, San Diego*

Richard Epstein  
*University of Chicago Law School*

James Fishkin  
*University of Texas, Austin*

Antony G.N. Flew  
*University of Reading (Emeritus)*

Charles Fried  
*Harvard Law School*

Martin Golding  
*Duke University*

John Gray  
*Jesus College, Oxford University*

Gilbert Harman  
*Princeton University*

Seymour Martin Lipset  
*George Mason University and  
Hoover Institution, Stanford University*

Eric Mack  
*Tulane University*

Harvey Mansfield, Jr.  
*Harvard University*

Wallace I. Matson  
*University of California, Berkeley*

Jan Narveson  
*University of Waterloo*

Robert Nozick  
*Harvard University*

Nicholas Rescher  
*University of Pittsburgh*

David Sidorsky  
*Columbia University*

Hillel Steiner  
*University of Manchester*

James Q. Wilson  
*University of California,  
Los Angeles*

Leland B. Yeager  
*Auburn University*

*Social Philosophy & Policy* is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

**Editorial Office:** Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403, USA.

**Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information:** See inside back cover.

Copyright © 1995 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/95 \$7.50+.10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance per article is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

## CONTRIBUTORS

**Gregory S. Kavka** served as Professor of Philosophy and Social Science at the University of California, Irvine, where he taught moral and political philosophy. His books include *Hobbesian Moral and Political Theory* (1986) and *Moral Paradoxes of Nuclear Deterrence* (1987).

**David Gauthier** is Distinguished Service Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. His most recent books, *Morals by Agreement* (1986) and *Moral Dealing: Contract, Ethics, and Reason* (1990), present a rational contractarian theory of morals. His writings on the history of moral and political thought include a book and several papers on Hobbes, and papers on Locke, Hume, Rousseau, and Kant. His current studies include the contractarian theory of law, the role of intention in rational deliberation, and the relation between social theory and autobiography in the writings of Rousseau.

**Gerald J. Postema** is Professor of Philosophy at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. He has been Chair of the UNC Philosophy Department since 1989, and has taught at Johns Hopkins University, Yale University, and Boalt Hall School of Law at the University of California at Berkeley. The author of *Bentham and the Common Law Tradition* (1986, 1989), he has published widely on topics in the philosophy of law, political theory, professional ethics, and the history of moral philosophy. His essay in this volume is part of a larger study of the role of public justification in morality, politics, and law. He is currently writing a series of essays on Hume's theory of justice.

**Amy Gutmann** is Laurance S. Rockefeller University Professor of Politics at Princeton University, and is the Director of the University Center for Human Values and the Program in Ethics and Public Affairs. She is the author of *Democratic Education* (1987) and *Liberal Equality* (1980), and the editor of *Multiculturalism and "The Politics of Recognition"* (1992), *Democracy and the Welfare State* (1988), and *Ethics and Politics* (with Dennis Thompson; 1984, 1990). Her essays in moral and political philosophy and practical ethics have appeared in *Ethics, Philosophy & Public Affairs*, *Political Theory*, *The New Republic*, and other journals.

**Dennis Thompson** is Alfred North Whitehead Professor of Political Philosophy jointly in the Government Department and the John F. Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University. He is also the founding

## CONTRIBUTORS

director of the university-wide Program in Ethics and the Professions. His most recent book, *Political Ethics and Public Office* (1987), won the American Political Science Association's award for the "best political science publication in the field of U.S. national policy" in 1987. He is also the author of *The Democratic Citizen: Social Science and Democratic Theory in the Twentieth Century* (1970) and *John Stuart Mill and Representative Government* (1976), and the coeditor (with Amy Gutmann) of *Ethics and Politics* (1984, 1990).

John Gray is a Fellow of Jesus College, Oxford University. He was educated at Exeter College, Oxford, where he received his B.A., M.A., and D.Phil. degrees. His books include *Mill on Liberty: A Defence* (1983), *Hayek on Liberty* (1984, 1986), *Liberalism* (1986), *Liberalisms: Essays in Political Philosophy* (1989), and *Post-Liberalism: Studies in Political Thought* (1993). He has been Visiting Professor in Government at Harvard University; Visiting Distinguished Professor in Political Economy at the Murphy Institute, Tulane University; Visiting Olmsted Professor at Yale University; and Visiting Professor in Philosophy at Bowling Green State University. Much of his research over the past several years has been conducted during periods of residence as Stranahan Distinguished Research Fellow at the Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University. He is currently working on a history of twentieth-century thought.

George Sher is Herbert S. Autrey Professor of Philosophy and Chair of the Philosophy Department at Rice University. He has written numerous essays in moral and political philosophy, and is the author of *Desert* (1987). He is currently writing a book on liberalism entitled *Beyond Neutrality: Perfectionism and Politics*.

G. A. Cohen is Chichele Professor of Social and Political Theory and a Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford University, where he has taught since 1985. He received his B.A. in Philosophy and Politics from McGill University and his B.Phil. in Philosophy from Oxford in 1963, and for twenty-two years was a Lecturer and then a Reader in Philosophy at University College, London. He is the author of *Karl Marx's Theory of History: A Defence* (1978) and *History, Labour, and Freedom* (1988). He was made a Fellow of the British Academy in 1985.

Eric Mack is Professor of Philosophy, Chair of the Philosophy Department, and a member of the Murphy Institute of Political Economy at Tulane University. He has published numerous articles in moral, political, and legal philosophy in such journals as *Ethics*, *The Monist*, *Philosophical Studies*, *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, and *Philosophy & Public Affairs*, and in many scholarly anthologies.

## CONTRIBUTORS

**Samuel Scheffler** is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California at Berkeley. He is the author of *The Rejection of Consequentialism* (1982) and *Human Morality* (1992), and the editor of *Consequentialism and Its Critics* (1988).

*The editors note with deep regret the death of Gregory Kavka on February 16, 1994. This volume is dedicated to his memory.*