

**BEHAVIORAL
AND
BRAIN SCIENCES**

**Volume 1
1978**

Reprinted with the permission of the original publisher
by
Periodicals Service Company
Germantown, NY
2006

Printed on acid-free paper.

**This reprint was reproduced from the
best original edition copy available.**

**NOTE TO THE REPRINT EDITION:
In some cases full page advertisements which do not add to
the scholarly value of this volume have been omitted.
As a result, some reprinted volumes may have irregular pagination.**

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

*An International Journal of Current Research and
Theory with Open Peer Commentary*

ISSN 0140-525X

Editor

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Assistant

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Animal Intelligence

David Premack

Department of Psychology, University of Pennsylvania

Behavioral Biology

Hans Kummer

Zoologisches Institut und Museum der Universität Zürich

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn

Department of Psychology, University of Western Ontario

Ethology and Neuroethology

John C. Fentress

Department of Psychology, Dalhousie University, Halifax, N.S.

Higher CNS Function

Robert W. Doty

Center for Brain Research, University of Rochester

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes

Department of Psychology, Princeton University

Language and Cognition

Peter Wason

Psycholinguistics Research Unit, University College London

Neurobiology

Barry H. Smith

Surgical Neurology Branch

National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, Md.

Neuropsychology

Karl Pribram

Department of Psychology, Stanford University

Volume 1 1978

Cambridge University Press

Cambridge London New York

1978

Published by the Syndics of The Cambridge University Press
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
Bentley House, 200 Euston Road, London NW1 2DB
32 East 57th Street, New York, NY 10022

© Cambridge University Press 1978

Printed in the United States of America by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania

Author's Response

Pylyshyn, Z. The A.I. debate: generality, goals, and methodological parochialism 121

Target Article

Roland, P. E. Sensory feedback to the cerebral cortex during voluntary movement in man 129

Open Peer Commentary

Chapple, W. D. *Consciousness and the limitations of psychophysical approaches* 148
Dickinson, J. *The function of sensory feedback* 148
Duysens, J. & Loeb, G. *Precortical processing of somatosensory information* 149
Dybre-Poulsen, P. *Possible sources of discriminative kinaesthetic information* 150
Freund, H.-J. *The role of extrapyramidal structures* 150
Goodwin, G. M. *The neural mechanisms subserving kinesthesia* 151
Granit, R. *Breaking down open doors* 152
Grigg, P. *On the attribution of a functional role to joint afferent neurons* 152
Iannone, A. M. *What constitutes "proof" in the study of neural control of movement?* 153
Kelso, J. A. S. *Changing views of feedforward and feedback in voluntary movement* 153
Levitt, M. *On the role of mental set in voluntary movement* 154
Libet, B. *What is conscious sensory experience, operationally?* 156
McCloskey, D. I. *Sense of effort and sense of muscular tension* 156
Millar, J. *Lab strategy vs. life strategy* 157
Mpitsos, G. J. *Musculotendinous receptors in conscious human behavior: experimental factors* 157
Pribram, K. H. *Movements and acts: distinguishing their neurophysiology* 158
Pubols, L. M. *On intellectual compensation and deafferentation* 159
Roberts, T. D. M. *The transmission of parameters by neural messages* 159
Shebilske, W. L. *Sensory feedback during eye movements reconsidered* 160
Somjen, G. G. *What muscle spindles and Golgi tendon organs could and could not signal to the brain* 161
Sontag, K.-H. *Conscious and unconscious motor decisions* 162
Stein, J. *The interaction of motor and sensory signals in proprioception* 162
Stevens, J. K. *The corollary discharge: is it a sense of position or a sense of space?* 163
Trevorthen, C. *Cortical collaboration and consciousness* 165
Walsh, E. G. *Sensing springiness* 166
Wells, M. J. *Invertebrate stretch receptors and consciousness* 166
Wiesendanger, M. *Toward contextual instead of either/or thinking* 167

Author's Response

Roland, P. E. The cerebral cortex and conscious kinaesthetic and tensional information 167

Number 2, June 1978

Target Article

Brainerd, C. J. The stage question in cognitive-developmental theory 173

Open Peer Commentary

Baldwin, J. D. & J. I. *Stages resulting from continuous underlying variables* 182
Berndt, T. J. *Stages as descriptions, explanations, and testable constraints* 183
Ennis, R. H. *Description, explanation, and circularity* 184
Epstein, H. T. *Some additional data relevant to considerations about the existence of cognitive-developmental stages* 185
Fischer, K. W. *Structural explanation of developmental change* 186
Flavell, J. H. *Developmental stage: explanans or explanandum?* 187
Gibson, K. R. *Cortical maturation: an antecedent of Piaget's behavioral stages* 188
Karmiloff-Smith, A. *On stage: the importance of being a nonconserver* 188
Kendler, T. S. *On falsifying descriptions* 190
Kinsbourne, M. *Maturational succession vs. cumulative learning* 191
Klahr, D. *Rages over stages* 191
Kurtines, W. M. *Measurability, description, and explanation: the explanatory adequacy of stage models* 192
Lipsitt, L. P. *"Stages" in developmental psychology* 194
Markman, E. M. *Problems of logic and evidence* 194
Neimark, E. D. *Improper questions cannot be properly answered* 195
Nelson, K. *Structural and developmental explanations: stages in theoretical development* 196
Olson, D. R. *A structuralist view of explanation: a critique of Brainerd* 197
Parker, S. T. *Species-specific acquisition vs. universal sequence of acquisition* 199
Pascual-Leone, J. *Piaget's two main stage criteria: a selective reply to Brainerd* 200
Rosenthal, T. L. *Agnostic gauges and Geneva stages* 201

Scandura, J. M. <i>"Measurement sequences," Piagetian structures, and high-order rules</i>	201
Siegler, R. S. <i>Is Piaget a Pied Piper?</i>	202
Smedslund, J. <i>Measurement sequences, logical necessity, and common sense</i>	203
Uzgiris, I. C. <i>Holistic aspects of the stage notion</i>	204
Wetherick, N. E. <i>In defense of circularity</i>	205
White, S. H. <i>Which comes first—describing or explaining?</i>	205
Yonas, A. & Carleton, L. R. <i>Conjoint construct validation</i>	206

Author's Response

Brainerd, C. J. <i>Invariant sequences, explanation, and other stage criteria: reflections and replies</i>	207
--	-----

Target Article

Haugeland, J. <i>The nature and plausibility of Cognitivism</i>	215
---	-----

Open Peer Commentary

Andreae, J. H. <i>On inference from input/output</i>	226
Arbib, M. A. <i>On making distinctions that are not maintained</i>	227
Atherton, M. <i>The scope of cognitivism</i>	228
Baron, R. J. <i>On explanation, holograms, moods, and skills</i>	229
Charniak, E. <i>How to register dissatisfaction with A.I.</i>	230
Cummins, R. <i>Systems and cognitive capacities</i>	231
Dennett, D. C. <i>Co-opting holograms</i>	232
Domotor, Z. <i>Cognitive problems and problems of cognitivism</i>	233
Dreyfus, H. L. <i>Cognitivism vs. hermeneutics</i>	233
Economos, J. <i>Mind that last step; I think it's loose</i>	234
Greeno, J. G. <i>Systems and explanations</i>	235
Harré, R. <i>Half-way to realism: some sympathetic comments on Haugeland's defence of cognitivism</i>	236
Hayes, P. J. <i>Cognitivism as a paradigm</i>	238
Matthews, R. J. <i>Two remarks on the characterization of IBBs</i>	239
Maxwell, G. <i>Cognitivism, psychology, and physics</i>	240
McCarthy, J. <i>Competence cognitivism vs. performance cognitivism</i>	241
Monk, R. <i>Cognitivism and cognitive psychology</i>	242
Natsoulas, T. <i>Haugeland's first hurdle</i>	243
Otto, H. R. <i>A program is not an explanation</i>	243
Pinker, S. <i>Mind and brain revisited: forestalling the doom of cognitivism</i>	244
Pribram, K. H. <i>Image, information, and fast Fourier transforms</i>	245
Puccetti, R. <i>Are right hemisphere activities cognitivistic?</i>	245
Rey, G. <i>Worries about Haugeland's worries</i>	246
Rorty, R. <i>A middle ground between neurons and holograms</i>	248
Schwartz, R. <i>Some limits and problems of cognitivism</i>	248
Simon, T. W. <i>On Cognitivism's explanations and limitations</i>	249
Taylor, C. <i>Indivisible performances, implicit grasp, and the problem of meaningfulness</i>	250
Tweney, R. D. <i>Is making reasonable sense reasonable?</i>	251
von Glasersfeld, E. <i>Some problems of intentionality</i>	252
Wilson, C. <i>Cognitivism's contributions: some questions</i>	253
Yevick, M. L. <i>The two modes of identifying objects: descriptive and holistic for concrete objects; recursive and ostensive for abstract objects</i>	253

Author's Response

Haugeland, J. <i>The critical assessment of Cognitivism: a closer look</i>	254
--	-----

Target Articles

Corballis, M. C. & Morgan, M. J. <i>On the biological basis of human laterality: I. Evidence for a maturational left-right gradient</i>	261
Morgan, M. J. & Corballis, M. C. <i>On the biological basis of human laterality: II. The mechanisms of inheritance</i>	270

Open Peer Commentary

Abler, W. L. <i>Asymmetry and evolution</i>	277
Annett, M. <i>Throwing loaded and unloaded dice</i>	278
Bakan, P. <i>Why left-handedness?</i>	279
Beaumont, J. G. <i>On testing the maturational left-right gradient hypothesis</i>	280
Berlucchi, G. <i>Does bigger equal better, functionally?</i>	281
Bertelson, P. <i>Interpreting developmental studies of human hemispheric specialization</i>	281
Boklage, C. E. <i>On cellular mechanisms for heritably transmitting structural information</i>	282
Bradshaw, J. L. <i>Handedness and human cerebral asymmetry: some unanswered questions</i>	286
Bryden, M. P. <i>Handedness, heritability, and perceptual laterality studies</i>	287
Bureš, J. <i>A fictitious gradient</i>	288
Černáček, J. & Podivinský, F. <i>Environmental influence on lateralization</i>	289

Chaurasia, B. D. <i>Motor asymmetries of the human body other than handedness</i>	289
Collins, R. L. <i>In the beginning was the asymmetry gradient, even when it was null: a propositional framework for a general theory of the inheritance of asymmetry</i>	289
Davidson, R. J. <i>Lateral specialization in the human brain: speculations concerning its origins and development</i>	291
Davis, T. A. <i>Reversible and irreversible lateralities in some animals</i>	291
Dimond, S. J. <i>Lateralization and unitarianism</i>	293
Ettlinger, G. <i>Have we forgotten the infant?</i>	294
Fuller, J. L. <i>If genes are not right-handed, what is?</i>	295
Geffen, G. <i>Human laterality: cerebral dominance and handedness</i>	295
Geschwind, N. <i>Pathological right-handedness</i>	296
Goodglass, H. <i>Objections to a growth gradient theory of cerebral dominance</i>	296
Goodwin, B. C. <i>Symmetry-breaking processes and morphogenesis</i>	297
Guerrier, P. <i>Evidence for absence of preformed genetic or plasmatic laterality during early embryonic development</i>	297
Hardyck, C. & Leiman, A. L. <i>On the probable genetic basis of human handedness</i>	298
Hicks, R. E. <i>On the homogeneity of human handedness</i>	299
Hudson, P. T. W. & Marshall, J. C. <i>Is a unified (cross-species) theory of asymmetries feasible?</i>	300
Jantz, R. L. <i>Dermatoglyphics, development and human laterality</i>	300
Kasinov, V. B. <i>Is there a single basis for biological laterality?</i>	301
Kinsbourne, M. <i>Pitfalls in the box score approach to evolutionary modelling</i>	302
Kopp, N. <i>Possible contribution of neuroanatomy to the comprehension of growth and inheritance of human cerebral asymmetries</i>	302
Layton, Jr., W. M. <i>The determination of morphological asymmetry</i>	303
LeMay, M. <i>Prominence of the right side of the brain</i>	304
Lepori, N. G. <i>Asymmetric blastomere movement during gastrulation</i>	304
Meshcheryakov, V. N. <i>Are genes left-right agnostic?</i>	305
Mittwoch, U. <i>Changes in the direction of the lateral growth gradient in human development—left to right and right to left</i>	306
Molfese, D. L. & Schmidt, A. L. <i>Human laterality: is it unidimensional?</i>	307
Ness, A. R. <i>Enter the sea-unicorn</i>	308
Neville, A. C. <i>On the general problem of asymmetry</i>	308
Nottebohm, F. <i>Precocial skills for the precocial hemisphere? Several untested hypotheses</i>	309
Oppenheimer, J. M. <i>Gradients and genes</i>	310
Perzigian, A. J. <i>The nature and nurture of human laterality</i>	310
Porac, C. & Coren, S. <i>Relationships among lateral preference behaviors in human beings</i>	311
Preilowski, B. <i>Problems with “grand schemes” and handedness</i>	312
Reeve, E. C. R. <i>Asymmetry in the narwhal, alpheus, and drosophila</i>	313
Rife, D. C. <i>Heredity and handedness</i>	313
Siegel, M. I. <i>Microenvironmental effects and fluctuating asymmetry</i>	314
Singh, I. & Chhibber, S. R. <i>Anatomical asymmetries in the limbs of man and other vertebrates</i>	315
Skibinski, D. O. F. <i>Is variation in cytoplasmic codes heritable?</i>	315
Springer, S. P. <i>Handedness and cerebral organization in twins—implications for the biological basis of human laterality</i>	316
Steklis, H. D. <i>Of gonads and ganglia</i>	317
Taylor, D. C. <i>The biases of sex and maturation in lateralisation: “isomeric” and compensatory left-handedness</i>	318
Van Valen, L. <i>The control of handedness</i>	320
Vermeij, G. J. <i>Left asymmetry in the animal kingdom</i>	320
von Heyden, H. W. <i>Cellular laterality</i>	322
Warren, J. M. <i>The Left Force: homology or analogy</i>	322
Wehrmaker, A. <i>Left-handedness: etiological clues from situs inversus</i>	322
Whitaker, H. A. <i>Is the right leftover?</i>	323
Wolpert, L. <i>The problem of directed left-right asymmetry in development</i>	324

Authors' Response

Morgan, M. J. <i>Genetic models of asymmetry should be asymmetrical</i>	325
Corballis, M. C. <i>Brain twisters and hand wringers</i>	331

Number 3, September 1978

Target Article

Puccetti, R. & Dykes, R. W. <i>Sensory cortex and the mind-brain problem</i>	337
--	-----

Open Peer Commentary

Scheibel, A. B. <i>On textural variance and the neocortical mission: a lightning rod for the obvious</i>	344
Anderson, Jr., R. M. <i>Relativistic color coding as a model for quality differences</i>	345

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

*An International Journal of Current Research and
Theory with Open Peer Commentary*

Volume 1 no. 1

1978

Cambridge University Press

March 1978
Volume 1
Number 1

ISSN 0140-525X



The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

*An International Journal of Current Research and
Theory with Open Peer Commentary*

In this issue

The Command Neuron Concept

3

by Irving Kupfermann and Klaudiusz R. Weiss

With Commentary by G. Hoyle, J. H. Andreae, P. Balaban, M. V. L. Bennett, T. H. Bullock, R. E. Burke, W. D. Chapple, W. J. Davis, W. H. Evoy, J. C. Fentress, C. A. Fowler and M. T. Turvey, P. Fraser, S. Grillner, A. Herman, G. A. Horridge, J. F. Iles, S. B. Kater and B. Granzow, F. Krasne, W. B. Kristan, Jr. and J. Weeks, J. L. Larimer, E. R. Lewis, R. Llinás and M. Bunge, J. C. Lynch, J. McCarthy, D. A. Rosenbaum, P. S. G. Stein, Y. Tsukada, C. A. G. Wiersma, J. J. Wine, R. S. Zucker

How Adaptive Behavior is Produced: A Perceptual-Motivational Alternative to Response-Reinforcement

41

by Dalbir Bindra

With Commentary by M. E. Bitterman, A. H. Black, R. C. Bolles, D. A. Booth, A. C. Catania, D. C. Dennett, R. Epstein, J. C. Fentress, J. P. Flynn, C. R. Gallistel, R. M. Gilbert, E. R. Hilgard, S. H. Hulse, F. W. Irwin, H. M. Jenkins, H. H. Kendler, P. R. Killeen, M. J. Klingsporn, F. A. Logan, N. J. Mackintosh, J. E. Mazur, E. W. Menzel, Jr., O. H. Mowrer, E. J. Murray, D. J. Navarick, J. M. Notterman, K. H. Pribram, J. S. Rosenblatt, T. A. Ryan, K. Salzinger, S. S. Soltysik, A. W. Staats, D. G. Stein, R. C. Teevan, E. von Glasersfeld, J. M. Warren, E. A. Wasserman, R. Wong, W. S. Wood

Computational Models and Empirical Constraints

93

by Zenon Pylyshyn

With Commentary by J. H. Andreae, M. A. Arbib, M. L. Atherton, L. J. Cohen, S. Cushing and N. Hornstein, D. C. Dennett, Z. Domotor, H. L. Dreyfus, H. Goodluck, L. D. Harmon, J. Haugeland, P. J. Hayes, P. N. Johnson-Laird, K. N. Leibovic, D. B. Lenat, C. Longuet-Higgins, J. McDermott, A. Newell, A. Ortony, J. Pascual-Leone, K. H. Pribram, R. S. Rodger, R. C. Schank, T. W. Simon, A. Sloman, N. S. Sutherland, M. Treisman, S. Ullman, W. B. Weimer, Y. Wilks,

Sensory Feedback to the Cerebral Cortex During Voluntary Movement in Man

129

by P. E. Roland

With Commentary by W. D. Chapple, J. Dickinson, J. Duysens and G. Loeb, P. Dyhre-Poulsen, H.-J. Freund, G. M. Goodwin, R. Granit, P. Grigg, A. M. Iannone, J. A. S. Kelso, M. Levitt, B. Libet, D. I. McCloskey, J. Millar, G. J. Mptsos, K. H. Pribram, L. M. Pubols, T. D. M. Roberts, W. L. Shebilske, G. G. Somjen, K.-H. Sontag, J. Stein, J. K. Stevens, C. Trevarthen, E. G. Walsh, M. J. Wells, M. Wiesendanger

Cambridge
University
Press