



# THE JOURNAL OF THE GILDED AGE AND PROGRESSIVE ERA

VOLUME 23 • NUMBER 4 • OCTOBER 2024



**Editor:** Brian M. Ingrassia, West Texas A&M University  
**Book Review Editor:** Daniel Platt, University of Illinois Springfield  
**Editorial Assistant:** Gabe Martinez, West Texas A&M University  
**Founding Editor, 2000–2003:** Maureen A. Flanagan, Michigan State University  
**Editor, 2004–2014:** Alan Lessoff, Illinois State University  
**Editors, 2013–2018:** Benjamin H. Johnson, Loyola University Chicago  
 Robert D. Johnston, University of Illinois at Chicago  
**Editors, 2017–2020:** Boyd Cothran, York University  
 C. Joseph Genetin-Pilawa, George Mason University  
**Editors, 2020–2022:** Boyd Cothran, York University  
 Rosanne Currarino, Queen's University  
**Editor, 2022–2024:** Rosanne Currarino, Queen's University

### Editorial Board

Robert David Bland University of Tennessee, Knoxville	Sara Egge Centre College
Jeffrey D. Broxmeyer University of Toledo	Douglas Flowe Washington University in St. Louis
Cathleen D. Cahill Penn State University	Lawrence B. Glickman Cornell University
Gregg Cantrell Texas Christian University	Katie M. Hemphill University of Arizona
Constance Chen Loyola Marymount University	Julian Lim Arizona State University
Laura Crossley George Mason University	Karen Phoenix Washington State University
Michael Patrick Cullinane Dickinson State University	John Troutman National Museum of American History
Lawrence Culver Utah State University	Andrea L. Turpin Baylor University

Chris McKeen, *ex officio*

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in *America: History and Life*, *Historical Abstracts*, *Scopus*, and in the Thompson Reuters *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Arts & Humanities Citation Index*, and *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*.

Instructions appear at the end of this issue for accessing the online edition at Cambridge Journals Online, <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>. All content is available from Volume 1, Number 1 through the present. The journal is also archived in JSTOR, [www.jstor.org](http://www.jstor.org), with issues older than five years available to subscribers of JSTOR's Arts & Sciences V Collection.

Change of Address: Contact [hamlinka@miamioh.edu](mailto:hamlinka@miamioh.edu) or go to <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* (1537-7814) is a peer-reviewed journal published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006 / Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K., for the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE). It publishes original scholarly essays covering the period 1865 to 1920 and reviews scholarly books on that time period.

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, U.S.A. (for U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K. (for U.K. and elsewhere).

Annual institutional subscription rates for Volume 23, 2024, are \$254.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £167.00 elsewhere for print and electronic subscriptions; and \$190.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £120.00 elsewhere for electronic subscriptions only. The rate for regular members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$50.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for sustaining members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$50.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for student members is £20/\$31 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for lifetime membership in SHGAPE is \$400.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. Prices include postage and insurance. *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* and all other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/>.

Individual subscriptions include a membership in SHGAPE, which in addition to publishing this journal offers book and article prizes, sponsors sessions at the annual meetings of the American Historical Association and Organization of American Historians, and edits H-SHGAPE, an H-Net discussion list.

For back issues, please contact Periodicals Service Company, 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526; email: [psc@periodicals.com](mailto:psc@periodicals.com)

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* accepts manuscript submissions through the Scholar One Manuscripts system at <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jgape>. Please note that we do not accept submissions via postal mail. Before submitting any manuscript, please consult <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga> for details on correct format and citation style. Information may also be obtained at <https://www.shgape.org/journal/>.

© Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) 2025. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com), email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

Forwarding and return postage guaranteed, address correction requested.

The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era  
Volume 23 • Number 4 • October 2024

CONTENTS

SHGAPE PRESIDENT'S NOTE

WENDY GAMBER, Editorial Comings and Goings 361

EDITOR'S NOTE 362

SHGAPE GRADUATE STUDENT ESSAY PRIZE

DAVID DRY, Autonomy Through Allotment: Political Strategies of the Ottawa Tribe in Indian Territory, 1870–1892 364

ARTICLES

PETER H. ARGERSINGER, Great Conspiracies, Stealing Seats, and Anarchy: Senatorial Elections in Disputed States, 1892–1893 384

MATTHEW C. O'NEAL, The Long Red Summer on the Railroads: Labor, Race, and Exclusion in Appalachia 407

SPECIAL FORUM

KIMBERLY A. HAMLIN, CATHLEEN D. CAHILL, ANDREW WENDER COHEN, ALLISON K. LANGE, LAUREN MACIVOR THOMPSON, NICHOLAS L. SYRETT AND MAGDALENE ZIER, The History and Legacy of Anthony Comstock and the Comstock Laws 431

BOOK REVIEWS

RAYMOND JAMES KROHN, *Abolitionist Twilights: History, Meaning, and the Fate of Racial Egalitarianism, 1865–1909*  
(Kathryn Angelica) 482

C. W. GOODYEAR, *President Garfield: From Radical to Unifier*  
(Michael R. D. Connolly) 484

AARON PRIDE, *Apocalyptic Rhetoric and the Black Protest Movement: William Monroe Trotter's Civil Rights Activism in Early Twentieth-Century Boston*  
(Adam Lee Cilli) 486

**On the cover:** Tulsa, Oklahoma. Tracks at roundhouse of the Frisco railroad. Photograph taken by Farm Security Administration photographer John Vachon, circa October 1942. Image from Library of Congress, Prints & Photographs Division, FSA/OWI Collection, Reproduction Number, LC-USW3-009553-D (b&w film neg.)

JOHN WEBER, <i>William Hanson and the Texas-Mexico Border: Violence, Corruption, and the Making of the Gatekeeper State</i> (Eladio B. Bobadilla)	488
ADRIENNE D. DE NOYELLES, <i>The Lung Block: Plagues, Parks, and Power in Progressive-Era New York</i> (Catherine McNeur)	490
DANIEL PLATT, <i>The Price of Misfortune: Rights and Wrongs in Indebted America</i> (Joseph S. Moore)	492
ANDREW MONTEITH, <i>Christian Nationalism and the Birth of the War on Drugs</i> (William S. Cossen)	494