

Caldecott succeeds in showing us the breadth and beauty of Tolkien's imagination and the hidden presence, as he calls it, of Tolkien's Catholicism. He also fills in the background that is in the twelve volumes of *The History of Middle Earth*. This is a great service for those like me, who love *The Lord of the Rings* and have never managed to get through *The Silmarillion*.

Caldecott also recognises the crucial contribution Tolkien makes to Christian aesthetics:

Tolkien thus stands with the rest of the Inklings and those who believe that Christianity does not abolish *mythopoeia* or poetic knowledge, but makes possible a new era of "baptised mythology", mythology that is no longer religion but "fairy-tale", an indispensable poetic evocation of a great mystery that is still unfolding within the world (p. 115).

As the mother of three sons and therefore well versed in Advanced Dungeons and Dragons, Mushing, (Multiple-User Shared Hallucination) and Warhammer, I have seen how necessary stories are, and how compelling Tolkien's are compared to other fantasy writers. Tolkien's world has real heroes, and real evil. His universe is charged with the grandeur of God, though little is explicitly religious, and that evokes a strong response.

This book is a great addition to the library of a Tolkien fan. Even better, it is a book to give someone who has never read *The Lord of the Rings*. And best of all, it would be a great book to give someone who is a fan of Tolkien but who cannot make the explicit connection with Christianity.

CHRISTINE FLETCHER

SAINT FRANCIS OF ASSISI by Jacques Le Goff, translated by Christine Rhone, *Routledge/Taylor & Francis Books Ltd, London, 2004, Pp. xix + 159, £14.99 pbk.*

This study of the life of St Francis of Assisi comes from a scholar of international reputation, Jacques Le Goff, Director of Studies at the *École des hautes Études en Science Sociales* in Paris. Four studies on *il poverello* and his followers, published in journals and the proceedings of conferences between 1967 and 1981, form this monograph. *Saint François d'Assise* was published in 1999 and has been translated into English by Christine Rhone, an experienced translator. The chapters deal with Francis and medieval society, the quest for the real saint, the social categories employed by the saint and his biographers, and the use of cultural models in Franciscan literature. The impact of these new forces on the thought and behaviour of Francis is

explained. One of these factors was the way in which avarice, linked to the advance of an economy based on money, supplanted pride in the list of vices. While friars' chronicles furnish ample references to pride, "the supreme vice of feudalism", they were much more interested in lampooning avarice and enumerated the problems which it caused in urban centres. Francis's biographers presented him as a man whose ideal of evangelical poverty castigated those who sought to amass greater wealth. Avarice was a major theme in the friars' preaching and John Pecham maintained that the rise of the order was a providential response to the ravages of that vice.

There is a full treatment of how Francis's writings should be read and understood. The lost documents, including the primitive Rule and some letters, diminish our understanding of the saint and his message. The question of the influences at work in the composition of the Rule is explored and it is clear that there were external pressures on Francis and the fraternity in the aftermath of the rejection of the Rule of 1221. The re-drafting of the Rule in the next two years, culminating in its papal confirmation on 29 November 1223, brought many ideological views and tensions to the surface and these are described by the saint's companions, Leo, Rufino and Angelo. The friction between the founder and the ministers ultimately led to division within the order. The influence of Cardinal Ugolino was pivotal and in *Quo elongati* of 28 September 1230 he refers to his contribution to the Rule and his understanding of the saint's views. The saint looked upon his disciples as companions, whom he was moulding into a fraternity. Images of family life appear in his writings and his biographies. The growth of the movement and its petition for papal approbation resulted in an *ordo* which began to replace *fraternitas* in the early 1220s. The order acquired the marks of an international movement, spreading throughout western Europe, producing the adjustments and safeguards required by the papal court.

This portrait of Francis is painted on a large canvas and it contains several contentious statements on the death-knell of the monastic schools, Gregory IX's judgement on the weight to be attached to Francis's *Testament*, the integrity of the members of the Roman Curia, the clericalisation of the order, the friars' promotion of annual confession (pp. 7, 19, 32–3, 59, 110, 124). Such summary treatment of major questions and the lack of due qualifications detract from the value of this otherwise attractive volume. Moreover, Le Goff is careless in his claims that the Humiliati were divided into three groups by Innocent III in 1196, that is, two years before his election, and that Laurence of Beauvais was the second brother to enter the order in England (pp. 10, 107). A similar inattention to detail results in the statements that Francis was canonised on 17 July instead of 16 July 1228 and that Richard of Bonington instead of Conington was the author of a treatise on poverty in the early fourteenth century

(pp. 45, 107). It is doubtful whether the Friars Minor Conventual share the author's view that John XXII's constitution *Cum inter nonnullos* was a triumph for them in 1322 (p. 18). This quarrel led to the detention and eventual deposition of the minister general, Michael of Cesena, in 1328. There is some overlapping material in the four chapters and repetitions, notably on the authenticity of the letter to St Anthony of Padua (pp. 16, 84). Although some subsequent amendments were made to the first chapter, the author has not brought his bibliography up-to-date and the reader is left with references which were available in the 1970s and early 1980s (pp. 149, 155, nn. 7, 97). In the intervening quarter of a century the Messaggero Press in Padua has published the critical editions of the lives of Saint Anthony by Fr Vergilio Gamboso, OFM Conv. in six volumes. I have not been able to obtain a copy of *Saint François d'Assise* and remain unsure whether responsibility for Thomas of Spalato (pp. 56, 118, 149) and Sarum (p. 122) instead of Split and Salisbury lies with the author or the translator. There are some unfortunate translations, such as Humiliates for Humiliati (pp. 9, 10, 32, 40, 59), ministry general for minister general (p. 18), education for edification (p. 49) and speech for sermon (p. 100). There is some inconsistency over the name of the bishop of Assisi; Guy occurs twice and Guido once (pp. 31, 33, 35). The occasional typographical errors produce Ruffino for Rufino, largess for largesse, and happed for happened (pp. 21, 24, 39).

MICHAEL ROBSON OFM Conv.

CAPITAL PUNISHMENT AND THE ROMAN CATHOLIC MORAL TRADITION by E. Christian Brugger, *University of Notre Dame Press, Indiana, 2003, Pp. x + 281, \$50.00 hbk.*

Aquinas taught that though the fifth commandment was exceptionless (*indispensabile*) it did not forbid all killing – only what was not “due” (*debitum*). Killing is due *for* an offence which is of a kind to deprive the offender of his dignity and *from* someone acting on behalf of a just order subverted by the offence in question. Thus, Abraham, representing the divine order, rightly tried to deal Isaac the death due to us all for Adam's sin, and a judge can rightly order death in accordance with just laws upholding the common good, to which the good of the individual is subordinate.

Christian Brugger objects to the idea that the good of a man is subordinate to that of the human community, as a limb is to that of the body. Brugger belongs to the ethical school founded by Germain Grisez, and thinks that all intentional killing of men is intrinsically