

the review of  
**metaphysics**

*a philosophical quarterly*

ISSN 0034-8632

DECEMBER 1990 | VOL. XLIV, No. 2 | ISSUE No. 174 | \$10.00

*articles*

*books received*

*philosophical abstracts*

*announcements*

---

**GIAN-CARLO ROTA**

*Mathematics and Philosophy:  
The Story of a Misunderstanding*

**EDWARD G. SPARROW**

*Erasing and Redrawing the Number Line:  
An Exercise in Rationality*

**ALBERT SHALOM**

*Temporality and the Concept of Being*

**PAUL WEISS**

*On the Impossibility of  
Artificial Intelligence*

**KENNETH DORTER**

*Levels of Knowledge in the Theaetetus*

**WOOSUK PARK**

*Haecceitas and the Bare Particular*

**MARK M. HURLEY AND STAFF**

*Summaries and Comments*

*philosophical abstracts*

*announcements*

Individual Subscriptions \$23.00    Institutional Subscriptions \$40.00    Student/Retired Subscriptions \$12.00

Jude P. Dougherty, Editor  
The Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C. 20064

---

# PHILOSOPHICAL INVESTIGATIONS

---

*Edited by D Z Phillips*

**Philosophical Investigations** has developed a tradition of publishing scholarly and thought-provoking articles in all branches of philosophy. These articles are complemented by a *Discussion* section and an extensive *Book Review* section. Special issues are occasionally published.

**Recent articles include:**  
Essay on the Notion of Reading  
*Simone Weil*  
An Anti-Sceptical Fugue  
*Grant Gillett*  
The Idea of Transcendence  
*Robert C Coburn*  
Working with Wittgenstein's Builders  
*Douglas Birsch and Jon Dorbolo*

---

## ORDER FORM

## PHILOSOPHICAL INVESTIGATIONS

Subscription Rates, Volume 14, 1991

Individuals £24.00 (UK), £27.50 (Europe), \$54.50 (N America), £30.00 (Rest of World)  
Institutions £58.00 (UK), £62.00 (Europe), \$133.50 (N America), £73.50 (Rest of World)  
Published quarterly

- Please enter my subscription/send me a sample copy  
 I enclose a cheque/money order made payable to Basil Blackwell  
 Please charge my Access/American Express/Diners Club/Mastercard/Visa account number

Expiry Date \_\_\_\_\_

For payments via the National Girobank, the Basil Blackwell account number is 236 6053

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

Postcode \_\_\_\_\_

Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

Payment must accompany orders

Please return this form to: Journals Marketing Manager, Basil Blackwell, 108 Cowley Road, Oxford OX41JF, England. Registered No. 180277. Or to: Journals Marketing Manager, Basil Blackwell, Three Cambridge Center, Cambridge, MA 02142, USA

---

**Basil Blackwell**

**Oxford and Cambridge MA**

---

# Cambridge

## Sources of the Self

The Making of the Modern Identity

**CHARLES TAYLOR**

Charles Taylor's latest book sets out to define the modern identity by tracing its genesis. This definition is then taken as the starting point for a renewed understanding of modernity.

'Sources of the Self' is in every sense a large book . . . in the generosity and breadth of its sympathies and its interest in humanity.' *New York Review of Books*

£32.50 net HB 0 521 38331 5 608 pp.

*Now in paperback*

## Hegel

Religion, Economics and the Politics of Spirit 1770-1807

**LAURENCE DICKEY**

'The scholarship with which Dickey presents his case is remarkable for both its depth and its range . . . His book is a remarkable one and will prove indispensable to Hegel specialists, but also of great interest to historians of ideas in general.'

Michael Inwood, *The Times Literary Supplement*

£13.95 net PB 0 521 38912 7 480 pp.  
*Ideas in Context*

## Critique and Construction

A Symposium on Roberto Unger's Politics

Edited by **ROBIN W. LOVIN** and **MICHAEL PERRY**

The publication of Robert Mangabeira Unger's provocative and controversial work *Politics* (CUP, 1988) was a major event for political and social theorists. This volume contains essays on Unger's work by a wide range of social, political and legal theorists.

£32.50 net HB 0 521 35208 8 344 pp.

*Now in paperback*

## Rethinking Democracy

Freedom and Social Cooperation in Politics, Economy and Society

**CAROL C. GOULD**

In this book Carol Gould offers a fundamental reconsideration of the theory of democracy, arguing that democratic decision-making should apply not only to politics but also to economic and social life.

'A more impartial and fair-minded advocate it would be hard to find.'

Maurice Cranston, *The Times Literary Supplement*

£11.95 net PB 0 521 38629 2 376 pp.

## The Philosophy in Christianity

Edited by **GODFREY VESEY**

This important collection examines the central doctrines of Christianity and the ways in which, in the formulation of these doctrines, Christians have drawn on philosophical ideas.

£10.95 net HB 0 521 37578 9 300 pp.  
*Royal Institute of Philosophy Lectures 25*



**Cambridge  
University Press**

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK.

# Cambridge

## Deciding for Others

The Ethics of Surrogate Decision-making  
**ALLEN BUCHANAN** and **DAN W. BROCK**

This book is the most comprehensive treatment available of one of the most urgent – and in some respects most neglected – problems in bioethics: decision-making for incompetents. The authors' approach combines a probing analysis of fundamental issues in ethical theory with a sensitive awareness of the concrete realities of health care institutions and the highly personal and individual character of difficult practical problems.

£32.50 net HB 0 521 32422 X 440 pp.

£11.95 net PB 0 521 31196 9

*Studies in Philosophy and Health Policy*

*Now in paperback*

## Hard Choices

Decision Making Under Unresolved Conflict

**ISAAC LEVI**

In this account of rational decision-making, Isaac Levi argues that agents should often choose between competing values without having balanced those values and that rationality does not require that an act be optimal, only that it be what Levi terms 'admissible'.

£10.95 net HB 0 521 38630 6 272 pp.

## On Action

**CARL GINET**

This book deals with foundational issues in the theory of the nature of action, the intentionality of action, the compatibility of freedom of action with determinism, and the explanation of action. By demonstrating that every action has as its core a 'simple' mental action, Ginet develops a sophisticated account of the individuation of actions.

£25.00 net HB 0 521 38124 X

£9.50 net PB 0 521 38818 X

*Cambridge Studies in Philosophy*

## Rationality in Action

Contemporary Approaches

Edited by **PAUL K. MOSER**

This anthology includes twenty-one selections falling under three main categories: individual decision theory; game theory and group decision-making; reasons, desires and intentionality.

£40.00 net HB 0 521 38572 5 450 pp.

£14.95 net PB 0 521 38598 9

## A Combinatorial Theory of Possibility

**D. M. ARMSTRONG**

Taking Wittgenstein's *Tractatus* as his point of departure, Professor Armstrong argues that nonactual possibilities and possible worlds are recombinations of actually existing elements, and as such are useful fictions.

£25.00 net HB 0 521 37427 8 176 pp.

£8.50 net PB 0 521 37780 3

*Cambridge Studies in Philosophy*



The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK.

# Cambridge

## The Sophismata of Richard Kilvington

Translated by **NORMAN KRETZMANN** and **BARBARA ENSIGN KRETZMANN**

Richard Kilvington was an obscure fourteenth-century philosopher whose *Sophismata* deal with a series of logic-linguistics conundrums of a sort which featured extensively in philosophical discussions of the period. This is the first ever translation of his work and is accompanied by a detailed commentary.

£32.50 net HB 0 521 35419 6 450 pp.

## The Mundane Matter of the Mental Language

**J. CHRISTOPHER MALONEY**

Christopher Maloney offers an explanation of the fundamental nature of thought by positing the idea that thinking involves the processing of mental representations that take the form of sentences in a covert language encoded in the mind.

£29.95 net HB 0 521 37031 0 350 pp.

*Cambridge Studies in Philosophy*

## A Theory of Property

**STEPHEN R. MUNZER**

In this book, Stephen R. Munzer argues for the justification of some rights of private property while showing why unequal distributions of private property are indefensible. The book represents a major new statement on the issue of property rights.

£37.50 net HB 0 521 37284 4 512 pp.

£13.95 net PB 0 521 37886 9

## Systems of Logic

**NORMAN M. MARTIN**

This is an advanced study of systems of propositional logic which offers a comprehensive account of a wide variety of logical systems and which encourages students to take a critical stance on the subject.

£30.00 net HB 0 521 36589 9 320 pp.

£11.95 net PB 0 521 36770 0

## Computability and Logic

*Third Edition*

**GEORGE S. BOOLOS** and **RICHARD C. JEFFREY**

A text for second course in logic for graduate and advanced undergraduate students. This third edition has been corrected and contains thoroughly revised versions of the chapters on Ramsey and provability, with new exercises provided for three other chapters.

£37.50 net HB 0 521 38026 X 316 pp.

£13.95 net PB 0 521 38923 2



The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK.

# CAMBRIDGE TEXTS IN THE HISTORY OF POLITICAL THOUGHT

*Eight new titles in this major textbook series*

*Making available to students and teachers the  
most important texts in the history of  
political thought.*

## **Hobbes: Leviathan**

Edited by **RICHARD TUCK**

£27.50 net HB 0 521 39492 9

£6.95 net PB 0 521 39641 7

560 pp.

## **Kant: Political Writings**

Edited by **H. S. REISS**

Translated by **H. B. NISBET**

£27.50 net HB 0 521 39185 7

£9.95 net PB 0 521 39837 1

320 pp.

## **Cicero: On Duties**

Edited by **MIRIAM GRIFFIN** and  
**MARGARET ATKINS**

£19.50 net HB 0 521 34338 0

£6.95 net PB 0 521 34835 8

200 pp.

## **Milton: Political Writings**

Edited by **MARTIN DZELZAINIS**

Translated by **CLAIRE GRUZELIER**

£27.50 net HB 0 521 34394 1

£9.95 net PB 0 521 34866 8

304 pp.

## **Bakunin: Statism and Anarchy**

Edited by **MARSHALL SHATZ**

£27.50 net HB 0 521 36182 6

£9.95 net PB 0 521 36973 8

288 pp.

## **Filmer: Patriarcha and Other Writings**

Edited by **JOHANN P.**

**SOMMERVILLE**

£27.50 net HB 0 521 37491 X

£9.95 net PB 0 521 39903 3

368 pp.

## **John of Salisbury: Policraticus**

Edited by **CARY J. NEDERMAN**

£27.50 net HB 0 521 36399 3

£9.95 net PB 0 521 36701 8

264 pp.

## **Bossuet: Politics Drawn From the Very Words of Holy Scripture**

Edited by **PATRICK RILEY**

£40.00 net HB 0 521 36237 7

544 pp.



**Cambridge  
University Press**

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK.

**Proceedings of the Annual Conferences  
of the U.K. Association for Legal and Social Philosophy  
in the series  
Archiv für Rechts- und Sozialphilosophie. Beihefte**

36. **Richard Bellamy, ed.: Liberalism and Recent Legal and Social Philosophy**  
Fifteenth Conference, 7th–9th April, 1988. 1989. 126 pages. Kart. DM 44,—  
*With contributions by:* J. Bell, R. Bellamy, R. Brownsword, C. Coope, S. Guest, P. Jones, S. Mendus,  
A. Ryan, M. Stokes
34. **Robert N. Moles, ed.: Law and Economics**  
Fourteenth Conference, 2nd–4th April, 1987. 1988. 134 pages. Kart. DM 40,—  
*With contributions by:* R. N. Moles, A. Ogus, R. Harrison, J. Williams, J. Moreh, A. Hunt, S. Leader,  
H. Collins, R. Shiner, J. L. Gorman, C. McCarthy
32. **Mark Ockelton, ed.: Medicine, Ethics and Law**  
Thirteenth Conference, 4th–6th April, 1986. 1987. 111 pages. Kart. DM 36,—  
*With contributions by:* D. D. Raphael, J. Jackson, R. D. MacKay, E. F. Kingdom, A. Samuels, A. T.  
H. Smith, J. Cottingham, R. G. Lee, J. Harris
28. **Gerry Maher, ed.: Freedom of Speech: Basis and Limits**  
Twelfth Conference 29th–31st March, 1985. 1986. 88 pages. Kart. DM 28,—  
*With contributions by:* R. A. Shiner, R. Bellamy, S. S. Kleinberg, A. J. M. Milne, T. C. Gibbons, D.  
J. Goldberg, D. Galbraith, S. A. Wolfson
21. **Stephen Guest / Alan Milne, eds.: Equality and Discrimination: Essays in  
Freedom and Justice**  
Eleventh Conference, 6th–8th April, 1984. 1985. 102 pages. Kart. DM 38,—  
*With contributions by:* S. Guest, J. Waldron, K. O'Donovan, S. Marshall, C. McCrudden, A. Sen,  
B. Williams, H. Steiner, P. Day, P. Ingram
19. **Antony Duff / Nigel Simmonds, eds.: Philosophy and the Criminal Law**  
Tenth Conference, 8th–10th April, 1983. 1984. 120 pages. Kart. DM 38,—  
*With contributions by:* N. Simmonds, T. Eckhoff, N. Lacey, A. Duff, M. Wasik, H. Gross, T.  
Honderich, A. Ashworth, J. Harris, G. Maher, J. Cottingham
16. **William Twining, ed.: Facts in Law**  
Ninth Conference, 2nd–4th April, 1982. 1983. IX, 157 pages. Kart. DM 48,—  
*With contributions by:* L. J. Cohen, R. Eggleston, G. J. Postema, W. Twining, J. D. Jackson, M. Oc-  
kelton, A. R. White, R. S. Summers, D. Holcroft, A. Zuckerman



**Franz Steiner Verlag Stuttgart**  
Postfach 10 15 26 — D - 7000 Stuttgart 10

## REVUE INTERNATIONALE DE PHILOSOPHIE

Editor: Michel MEYER

143, av. A. Buyl, 1050 Brussels, Belgium

Each number is devoted to a particular movement, a particular philosopher, or a particular problem.

We publish 4 issues annually. Articles are written in English, French, German, or Italian.

Our last issue was devoted to *Foucault*

Articles by: A. Kremer-Marietti, *Présentation* – M. Foucault, *La psychologie de 1850 à 1950* – D. Huisman, *Note sur l'article de Michel Foucault* – S. Delivoyatsis, *Le pouvoir de la différence* – P. Major-Poetzl, *The Disorder of Things* – H. L. Dreyfus, *Foucault et la psychothérapie* – K. Racevskis, *The Conative Function of the Other in Les Mots et les Choses* – A. Kremer-Marietti, *De la matérialité du discours saisi dans l'institution* – J.-M. Auzias, *Les gisants et les pleureuses. Pour un tombeau de Michel Foucault* – Analysis and reviews.

Coming numbers: *Le Questionnement* – *Critique du jugement (I and II)* – *Bergson*



---

# THE PHILOSOPHICAL QUARTERLY

---

Edited by Neil Cooper

Founded in 1950, **The Philosophical Quarterly** is one of the best-established journals in its field. The journal aims to foster and publish significant contributions in every branch of the subject, promoting discussion of recent philosophical work and providing critical reviews of recent books.

## Recent and Forthcoming

### Articles include:

Expressions of Passage

*Gilbert Plummer*

Whose Language Is It

Anyway?

*Alexander George*

Why Content Must Be A

Matter of Truth Conditions

*Angus Ross*

Posthumous Harm

*Dorothy Grover*

---

## ORDER FORM

## THE PHILOSOPHICAL QUARTERLY

Subscription Rates, Volume 40, 1990

Individuals £14.00 (UK), £17.00 (Europe), \$29.00 (N America), £17.50 (overseas)

Institutions £37.00 (UK), £47.00 (Europe), \$83.00 (N America), £50.00 (overseas)

Published January, April, July and October

- Please enter my subscription/send me a sample copy
- I enclose a cheque/money order made payable to Basil Blackwell
- Please charge my Access/American Express/Barclaycard/Diners Club/Mastercard/Visa account number

Expiry Date \_\_\_\_\_

For payments via the National Girobank, the Basil Blackwell account number is 236 6053

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

Payment must accompany orders

Please return this form to: Journals Marketing Manager, Basil Blackwell,  
108 Cowley Road, Oxford OX41JF, England or to: Journals Marketing Manager, Basil  
Blackwell, Three Cambridge Center, Cambridge, MA 02142, USA

---

**Basil Blackwell**

**Oxford and Cambridge MA**

---



Detail from *Tér Plein* by Edouard Manet. Courtesy of the National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.

LOVE AND ITS  
PLACE IN NATURE  
JONATHAN LEAR

A PHILOSOPHICAL INTERPRETATION  
OF FREUDIAN PSYCHOANALYSIS

**"A wonderful, brilliant, and wise book."**

— Leonard Shengold, M.D.  
author of *Soul Murder*

"Jonathan Lear makes one understand how psychoanalysis works not only on the therapist's couch but also as a condition of being alive... *Love and Its Place in Nature* not only offers a form of spiritual nutriment for the self, it also defines that self with a clear profundity that few readers will have encountered before."

— Christopher Lehmann-Haupt  
*The New York Times*

FARRAR • STRAUS • GIROUX

Available at bookstores everywhere or call 1-800-631-8571

# Information for Authors

Prospective authors should send their contributions, typed and double-spaced on quarto or A4 paper, to the Editor, Mr Renford Bambrough, Royal Institute of Philosophy, 14 Gordon Square, London WC1H 0AG. They should retain a second copy for the purpose of checking proofs. Articles submitted should conform to *Hart's Rules for Compositors and Readers* (Oxford University Press, 1967). The Editor may alter manuscripts wherever necessary to make them conform to the stylistic and bibliographical conventions of the journal. Single quotation marks should be used except where there is a quotation within another. The titles of books and journals should be underlined (i.e. to be printed in italics), as should foreign words. Titles of articles should be in single quotation marks.

Notes and references will be printed as footnotes and should be typed (double-spacing) on a separate sheet, numbered consecutively. They should be referred to in the text by superscripts. Citations should be as follows:

<sup>1</sup>H. B. Acton, *The Philosophy of Punishment* (London: Macmillan, 1969), 192–198.

<sup>2</sup>R. S. Downie and Elizabeth Telfer, 'Autonomy', *Philosophy* **46**, No. 178 (October 1971), 295.

<sup>3</sup>Op. cit. note 1, 101–112.

<sup>4</sup>W. C. Wimsatt, 'Some Problems with the Concept of Feedback', *Boston Studies in the Philosophy of Science*, VIII, R. C. Buck and R. S. Cohen (eds.) (Dordrecht: D. Reidel, 1971), 242.

The return of contributions cannot be guaranteed unless they are accompanied by stamps, or in the case of contributions from abroad, by international coupons, to cover postage. A self-addressed envelope should also be enclosed.

Only corrections of printer's errors can be allowed in proofs. Authors are therefore asked to send any alterations or additions to Mr Bambrough as soon as possible after receiving his letter of acceptance.

Authors of articles, discussion papers and review articles will receive twenty-five offprints free of charge. Additional offprints can be ordered when proofs are returned by arrangement with the Institute.

Books for review should be sent to the Editor at the Institute and not to Cambridge University Press. Publishers are asked to note that non-philosophical works are not reviewed in *Philosophy*.

Authors' corrected proofs should be sent to Mr Bambrough at St John's College, Cambridge. All other correspondence should be addressed to the Institute and not to any address in Cambridge.

# Philosophy

VOLUME 66 NO 256 APRIL 1991

Editorial: Penny Bundles	141
Socrates' Critique of Cognitivism – WALLACE I. MATSON and ADAM LEITE	145
The Art of Philosophy – NEIL COOPER	169
Capital Punishment and Realism – DAVID COCKBURN	177
The Neurophilosophy of Pain – G. R. GILLETT	191
Kant's Psychological Hedonism – A. PHILLIPS GRIFFITHS	207
<i>Sachverhalt</i> and <i>Gegenstand</i> are Dead – E. F. THOMPSON	217
Discussion	
Knowing Good and Evil – C. J. F. WILLIAMS	235
Not Over Yet: Prior's 'Thank Goodness' Argument – KIERNAN DELMAS-LEWIS	241
Cohen on Einstein's Simultaneity <i>Gedankenexperiment</i> – V. ALAN WHITE	244
New Books	
Reviews	246
Booknotes	257
Books Received	259
Notebook	264

© The Royal Institute of Philosophy 1991

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA  
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

*Typeset by Precise Printing Company Limited, Reigate, Surrey*  
*Printed in Great Britain by the University Press, Cambridge*