

DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 203

Page

Arbitration

Contract of insurance — Arbitration clause — Whether arbitration clause in contract of insurance binds third party State seeking compensation for loss and damage — England, High Court (Commercial Court)

UK P&I N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela

685

Claims

Inter-State cases — Claims for just satisfaction — Whether Article 41 of European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 applicable to inter-State cases — Judgment in *Cyprus v. Turkey* — Whether Article 41 of Convention applicable to present case — Whether present case fulfilling three criteria set out in *Cyprus v. Turkey* — Whether award of just satisfaction justified — Determination of sufficiently precise and objectively identifiable group of people — Criteria for award of just satisfaction for non-pecuniary damage — Requirement for distribution of damages to members of group — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction)

349

Comity

Respect for courts and tribunals of other jurisdictions — Contract of insurance — Exclusive jurisdiction clause — Arbitration clause — Third party State seeking to enforce contract of insurance — Requirement of comity — England, High Court (Commercial Court)

UK P&I N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela

685

Diplomatic Relations

Whether United Kingdom Government's continued diplomatic relations with Mr Maduro's representatives in England constituting implied recognition of Mr Maduro as *de facto* President — Whether Court of Appeal erred in introducing concept of implied *de facto* recognition — Whether scope for

Diplomatic Relations (*cont.*)

application of any notion of implied recognition by English courts
— United Kingdom, Supreme Court

*Maduro Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó
Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela*

612

General Principles of International Law

Estoppel — Whether part of international law — Conditions —
Clear and unequivocal statement — Reliance to detriment —
Maritime boundaries — Whether capable of being established by
estoppel — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special
Chamber)

*Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary
between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/
Côte d'Ivoire)*

376

Governments

Recognition — Rival governments — Venezuela — Disputed
2018 Venezuelan presidential election — Whether Mr Maduro
or Mr Guaidó President of Venezuela — Whether Maduro Board
or Guaidó Board entitled to give instructions on behalf of Central
Bank of Venezuela concerning its assets in England — United
Kingdom, Supreme Court

*Maduro Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó
Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela*

612

Human Rights

European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Article 41 —
Inter-State case — Claims for just satisfaction for breach of
human rights — Non-pecuniary damage — Whether victims
identifiable — Determination of sufficiently precise and
objectively identifiable group of people — Whether claim could
be submitted under Article 41 of Convention — Whether award
of just satisfaction justified — Criteria to be applied — European
Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction)

349

Freedom of expression — Right of access to information —
Freedom of opinion — Legitimate limitations — Proportionality
— Requirement of precise definition — Criminal defamation —

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights' Declaration of Principles on Freedom of Expression and Access to Information in Africa 2019 — African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda

254

International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Article 1(1) — Meaning of “national origin” — Whether including current nationality — Whether discrimination based on nationality prohibited by CERD — Whether Qatar's claim of discriminatory measures by United Arab Emirates falling within scope of CERD — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Right to equality and non-discrimination — African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981, Articles 2 and 3 — Whether Tanzania's exercise of presidential pardons arbitrary and discriminatory — Right to a fair trial — Article 7 — Whether Tanzania's sentencing of first and seventh applicants exceeding prescribed legal limits — African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights

Mango and Others v. United Republic of Tanzania

318

Right to fair trial — Right of access to court — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6 — State immunity — State Immunity Act 1978 — Section 13 — Immunity from injunction — Whether State immunity from injunction engages Article 6 rights — Whether State immunity from injunctive relief pursues legitimate objective — Whether State immunity from injunctive relief provided for in customary international law — Whether proportionate — Human Rights Act 1998, Section 3 — Whether Section 13 of the State Immunity Act 1978 capable of being read down — England, High Court (Commercial Court)

UK P&I N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela

685

Rights to non-discrimination — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — International law — Whether fight against terrorism justifying discrimination — Discrimination on ground of national or ethnic

Human Rights (*cont.*)

origin — Applicant State enforcing coercive measures against Respondent State in 2017 — Whether respondent State failing to enact measures to prohibit racial discrimination — Whether respondent State promoting racial discrimination — Whether respondent State violating international law — Whether respondent State violating Articles 2, 4, 5 and 6 of International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Whether Committee having jurisdiction — Admissibility of communication — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

International Court of Justice

Preliminary objections — Whether Court having jurisdiction under Article 22 of International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Whether discrimination based on nationality prohibited by CERD — Whether Qatar's claim of discriminatory measures by United Arab Emirates falling within scope of CERD Treaties — Interpretation — Scope — International Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Article 1(1) — Meaning of “national origin” — Whether including current nationality — Object and purpose of treaty — *Travaux préparatoires* — Whether CERD intending to prohibit discrimination based on nationality — Whether Qatar's claim of discriminatory measures by United Arab Emirates falling within scope of CERD — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Provisional measures — *Prima facie* jurisdiction — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 (“CERD”) — Article 22 — Whether the Court having *prima facie* jurisdiction *ratione materiae* — Distinction between “national origin” and “nationality” under CERD — Whether procedural preconditions to the Court's jurisdiction met — Prior negotiation — Exhaustion of CERD-based procedures — Plausibility — Whether the acts of which Qatar complained were plausibly acts of racial discrimination — Irreparable prejudice — Urgency — Whether evidence submitted

by Qatar proving that the rights claimed were under a real and imminent risk of irreparable prejudice — Reports of international organizations as evidence — Unilateral undertaking — Statement of 5 July 2018 by UAE — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) 1

Provisional measures requested by respondent State — Whether extending to protection of procedural rights — Procedural rights arising under Article 22 of CERD — Right to obtain compliance with provisional measures indicated earlier — *Prima facie* jurisdiction — Provisional measures for non-aggravation and non-extension of the dispute — Whether capable of being indicated only if provisional measures for protection of rights also indicated — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) 1

International Tribunals

African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights — Jurisdiction — Material jurisdiction — Whether Court having jurisdiction to hear application — Admissibility — Whether application admissible — Exhaustion of local remedies — Whether applicants obliged to exhaust remedies despite claims of judicial bias — African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights

Mango and Others v. United Republic of Tanzania 318

European Court of Human Rights — Damages — Non-pecuniary damages — Inter-State case — Damages awarded for distribution to group of nationals — Supervision of distribution — Role of Council of Ministers — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction) 349

Jurisdiction — African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights — Admissibility decisions — Contesting admissibility of Communication based on Article 56(7) of African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981 — *Res judicata* — African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda 254

International Tribunals (*cont.*)

Jurisdiction — Special agreement — Admissibility of request for delimitation of continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf — *Forum prorogatum* — International responsibility — Whether ITLOS having jurisdiction to decide on international responsibility of a State in accordance with UNCLOS — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/Côte d'Ivoire)

376

Jurisdiction and admissibility — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Discrimination on ground of national or ethnic origin — Inter-State communication — Whether Committee lacking jurisdiction — Scope of Article 11 of Convention — Nationality issue — Whether exception to jurisdiction — Interpretation of concept of racial discrimination prohibited by Convention — Whether raising preliminary issue of competence *ratione materiae* — Issue to be examined at same time as admissibility — Whether jurisdiction extending only to current and ongoing violations of Convention — Whether communication admissible — Non-exhaustion of domestic remedies — Issue to be examined jointly with merits — Concurrent proceedings — Nationality — Appointment of ad hoc Conciliation Commission — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965, Articles 11(2) and 12(1) — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

Provisional measures — Preservation of rights of Parties — Protection of marine environment — Protection of confidentiality of information relating to exploration and exploitation of natural resources of continental shelf — *Prima facie* jurisdiction — Agreement that Special Chamber having *prima facie* jurisdiction — Plausibility of rights — Côte d'Ivoire's claimed rights being plausibly based on United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Whether Ghana's activities in disputed area could cause irreparable prejudice to rights of Côte d'Ivoire — Problems of prescribing suspension of all oil exploration and exploitation —

Possibility for compensation of financially assessable damage — Report on compliance with provisional measures — Power of President of Special Chamber to request further information concerning compliance — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

Special Chamber of the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Constitution of the Special Chamber — Transfer of proceedings from an Annex VII arbitral tribunal to the Special Chamber — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — International Court of Justice — Concurrent proceedings — Article 22 of International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Whether principle of *lis pendens* or *electa via* applicable — Admissibility of communication — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — Weight to be given to practice of Committee — Jurisprudence of regional human rights courts — Relevance — Whether discrimination based on nationality prohibited by CERD — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Nationality

Distinction between citizens and non-citizens — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Article 1 — Prohibition of racial discrimination — Interpretation of concept of racial

Nationality (*cont.*)

discrimination — Discrimination on ground of national or ethnic origin — General Recommendation No 30 (2004) on discrimination against non-citizens — Differences of treatment based on nationality — Whether constituting discrimination as prohibited by Convention — Allegations in communication concerning racial discrimination — Whether Committee having competence *ratione materiae* — Admissibility of communication — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

Nature of citizenship — Bond between State and citizen — Whether distinct from “national origin” — International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965, Article 1 — International Court of Justice

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates)

1

Recognition

Whom United Kingdom Government recognizing as Head of State and Head of Government of Venezuela — Whether United Kingdom Foreign Secretary’s statement constituting unequivocal recognition of Mr Guaidó as Interim President — Whether United Kingdom Government’s recognition of Mr Guaidó *de facto* or *de jure* — “One voice” doctrine — Whether English courts obliged to accept United Kingdom Government’s recognition of Mr Guaidó as conclusive — Foreign act of State doctrine — Whether challenges to validity, under Venezuelan law, of the Transition Statute 2019 and Mr Guaidó’s appointments justiciable in English courts — Whether English courts should recognize judgments of the Supreme Tribunal of Justice of Venezuela nullifying the Transition Statute 2019 — Whether such recognition contravening UK public policy — United Kingdom, Supreme Court

Maduro Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela

612

Sea

Maritime boundary delimitation — Single maritime boundary — Territorial sea — Exclusive Economic Zone — Continental shelf — Continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Article 15 — Articles

74 and 83 — Equidistance/relevant circumstances — Angle bisector — Whether location of base points justified using a methodology other than equidistance/relevant circumstances — Whether coastal instability justified using a methodology other than equidistance/relevant circumstances — Whether same methodology applied to delimitation of all maritime zones — Relevant coast — Relevant area — Provisional equidistance line — Appropriate base points — Relevant circumstances — Concavity of coast — Cut-off effect — Location of natural resources — Conduct — Methodology for delimiting the continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — Entitlement to a continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles — Disproportionality test — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

State Immunity

State Immunity Act 1978 — Section 1 — Section 3 — Section 9 — Section 13 — Adjudicative immunity — *Jure imperii* — *Jure gestionis* — Whether initiating proceedings against insurers regarding sunken naval vessel a sovereign or commercial act — Enforcement immunity — State immunity from injunctive relief — Whether State immunity from injunctive relief engages human rights — England, High Court of Justice

UK P&I N.V. v. República Bolivariana de Venezuela

685

State Responsibility

Alleged responsibility for violation of sovereign rights — Alleged responsibility for violation of Article 83(1) of United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Whether Ghana's oil activities violating its obligations under Article 83(3) — Alleged responsibility for violating order on provisional measures of 25 April 2015 — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376

Obligation on State responsible for internationally wrongful act to make reparations — Just-satisfaction rule deriving from public international law principles relating to State liability — Duty of States to co-operate under European Convention on Human

State Responsibility (*cont.*)

Rights, 1950 — Obligation on State to abide by final judgment of European Court of Human Rights — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Georgia v. Russia (No 1) (Just Satisfaction)

349

Treaties

Human rights treaties — African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981 — Compliance of Rwanda's Penal Code 1977 with African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981 — Human rights obligations under regional and international human rights treaties — African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda

254

Interpretation — International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965 — Article 1 — Prohibition of racial discrimination — Interpretation of concept of racial discrimination — Discrimination on ground of national or ethnic origin — Meaning of national origin — "Nationality" excluded from definition — Distinction between citizens and non-citizens — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination — General Recommendation No 30 (2004) on discrimination against non-citizens — Differences of treatment based on nationality — Whether constituting discrimination as prohibited by Convention — Applicant State's allegations against respondent State in communication concerning violations of Convention — Whether allegations concerning ongoing and current violations of Convention — Issue relating to essential facts and to be examined at merits stage — Whether Committee having competence *ratione materiae* — Admissibility of communication — United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

Qatar v. United Arab Emirates

562

Tacit agreement — Oil practice — Maps — Seismic surveys — Drilling activities — National legislation — Representations to international organizations — Bilateral exchanges and negotiations — Standard of proof — Whether Côte d'Ivoire estopped from objecting to customary equidistance boundary claimed by Ghana — International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (Special Chamber)

Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean (Ghana/ Côte d'Ivoire)

376