

# JOURNAL of Law and Religion

Volume XIII

Number 2

1998-99

---

## Articles

- Assisted Suicide *Elliot N. Dorff*
- Jewish Law Perspectives on Suicide and Physician-Assisted Dying *Steven H. Resnicoff*
- The Obligation to Heal and Patient Autonomy in Jewish Law *Daniel Sinclair*
- Jewish Perspectives on Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia *Ze'ev W. Falk*
- Suicide, Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia: A Buddhist Perspective *Damien Keown*
- A Response to Damien Keown's *Suicide, Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia: A Buddhist Perspective* *Peter Harvey*
- A Response to Damien Keown's *Suicide, Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia: A Buddhist Perspective* *R.E. Florida*

## Assisted Suicide Book Reviews

- A Different Death: Euthanasia and the Christian Tradition*, by Edward J. Larson & Darrel W. Amundsen *John Keown*
- Physician-Assisted Suicide: Expanding the Debate*, edited by Margaret P. Battin, Rosamond Rhodes & Anita Silvers *Henry J. Bourguignon*
- Physician-Assisted Suicide* (Medical Ethics Series), edited by Robert F. Weir *M. Therese Lysaught*
- Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide*, by Gerald Dworkin, R.G. Frey & Sissela Bok *Marshall B. Kapp*
- Euthanasia Examined: Ethical, Clinical and Legal Perspectives*, edited by John Keown *Kevin O'Rourke, O.P.*
-

**Sponsored by:** Hamline University School of Law

**Published by:** Hamline University School of Law  
ISSN: 0748-0814

# THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XIII

1998-99

NUMBER 2

## EDITORIAL STAFF

### *Editors*

MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law  
PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Theological Seminary

### *Managing & Book Editor*

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

### *Book Review Editor*

EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR, Valparaiso University School of Law

### ASSOCIATE EDITOR

MICHAEL HERRIGES

### STUDENT SUBSCRIPTION MANAGER

JULIE C. TESSIER

### PRODUCTION MANAGER

LINDA BERGLIN

ALLEN BLAIR  
ANNE D. BYRNE  
KARA M. KIRKEBY

### EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

CHARLES R. KRAUSE  
KRISTINE K. NOGOSEK  
CAROLINE S. PALMER

JASON W. SCHULLER  
JASON H. THOMAS  
BRENDA TOFTE

## EDITORIAL BOARD

THOMAS PORTER, *Attorney at Law, Boston, Massachusetts, Chair*  
AZIZAH AL-HIBRI, *T.C. Williams School of Law, University of Richmond*  
EDWIN J. BUTTERFOSS, *Hamline University School of Law*  
STEPHEN L. CARTER, *Yale Law School*  
MARIE FAILINGER, *Hamline University School of Law*  
EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., *Valparaiso University School of Law*  
EMILY HARTIGAN, *Saint Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law*  
CATHLEEN KAVENY, *Notre Dame University Law School*  
PATRICK KEIFERT, *Luther Theological Seminary, Saint Paul, Minnesota*  
HOWARD LESNICK, *University of Pennsylvania Law School*  
ROBIN LOVIN, *Southern Methodist University, Perkins School of Theology*  
ELIZABETH MENSCH, *State University of New York at Buffalo, School of Law*  
NANCY MILLER-HERRON, *Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee*  
MICHAEL J. PERRY, *Wake Forest University School of Law*  
EARL SCHWARTZ, *Saint Paul, Minnesota*  
DOUGLAS STURM, *Professor Emeritus, Bucknell University*  
HOWARD J. VOGEL, *Hamline University School of Law*  
AMINA WADUD, *Virginia Commonwealth University*  
WILSON YATES, *United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities*  
ROBERT YAZZIE, *Office of the Chief Justice – Navajo Nation*

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

*MILTON KONVITZ, Professor Emeritus, Cornell University of New York, Co-chair*

*DOUGLAS STURM, Professor Emeritus, Bucknell University, Co-chair*

*TAHA JABIR ALALWANI, The Graduate School of Islamic & Social Sciences*

*RICHARD BAEPLER, Valparaiso University*

*MILNER BALL, University of Georgia*

*HAROLD BERMAN, Emory University School of Law*

*GERARD BRADLEY, Notre Dame University Law School*

*JAMES BRESNAHAN, Northwestern University Medical School*

*LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law*

*FRED CARNEY, Southern Methodist University*

*ROGER CRAMTON, Cornell University School of Law*

*CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law*

*RICHARD HIERS, University of Florida*

*DAMIEN KEOWN, University of London, Goldsmiths*

*LEIGH LERNER, Rabbi, Montreal, Canada*

*SANFORD LEVINSON, University of Texas School of Law*

*DAVID LITTLE, Harvard Divinity School*

*MARTIN MARTY, University of Chicago Divinity School*

*NOOR MOHAMMAD, Professor Emeritus, University of Baltimore School of Law*

*SEYYED HUSSEIN NASR, George Washington University*

*LOUIS NEWMAN, Carleton College*

*KAY PRANIS, MN Department of Correction, Restorative Justice*

*ELIZABETH SCHUESSLER-FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School*

*THOMAS SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School*

*PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law*

*CHARLES VILLA-VICENCIO, University of Cape Town, South Africa*

*ROSALIE WAHL, Associate Justice, Retired, Minnesota Supreme Court*

*MICHAEL WELKER, University of Heidelberg, Germany*

*JOHN WITTE, Jr., Emory University School of Law*

*WILSON YATES, United Theological Seminary*

*STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, Saint Paul*

*The Journal of Law and Religion* is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a nonprofit, nonpartisan publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to *The Journal of Law and Religion*, which is published twice annually, are \$15 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$25 for institutions, and \$10 for students. Add an additional \$10 for foreign airmail service. Subscription requests, manuscripts, book reviews, books to be reviewed, and general correspondence should be addressed to:

*The Journal of Law and Religion*  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55104  
or [jlr@gw.hamline.edu](mailto:jlr@gw.hamline.edu)

Commencing with Volume X, citations conform to: *The University of Chicago Manual of Legal Citation* (1989) copyright by the University of Chicago. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual and back issues and complete sets of *The Journal of Law and Religion* may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209.

The views and opinions expressed in *The Journal of Law and Religion* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of *The Journal of Law and Religion*.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by The H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on line on a variety of computer database services.

Articles are also indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*; book reviews are indexed in *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*. Both indexes are published by the American Theological Library Association, Chicago, and are available online through BRS Information Technologies (Latham, New York) and DIALOG Information Services (Palo Alto, California).

Internet access to *The Journal of Law and Religion*, including an index to past issues, is available at <http://web.hamline.edu/law/lawreign/jlr/>

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 13 J LAW & RELIG 2

## JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

### STATEMENT OF PERSPECTIVE

*The Journal of Law and Religion* was initiated in 1982 as a collaborative effort of the Council on Religion and Law and the Hamline University School of Law. It was born of a sense of historical malaise. The modern age with its strong propensity toward the secularization of all areas of life, while not without merit in its liberating effects, nonetheless has its dark side.

We live, some say, in a time of profound historical crisis. Domestically and globally, we confront massive issues which force us to reconsider, in fundamental ways, the shape and quality of our common life. Yet many of the disciplines of thought and practice that should be a rich resource in such a time are found wanting—among them, law and religion. Law, a discipline presumably devoted to the ways of justice, has all too often become a set of complex, technical tools without concern for higher purpose. Religion, presumably given to the all-embracing promises and prescriptions implied in the sense of the sacred, has all too often become privatized and neglectful of our public life.

*The Journal of Law and Religion* is dedicated to a fundamental reappraisal of the disciplines of law and religion as they impinge on each other, might instruct each other, and taken in their conjunction, might offer a constructive response to the major issues of our times. As such its concerns are sixfold.

- Historical** The *Journal* intends to encourage the examination of historical developments, movements, thinkers, and issues to enrich our understanding of how law and religion have, in various ways, been mutually influential.
- Theoretical** The *Journal* intends to promote constructive work in religious and legal thought about fundamental theological and jurisprudential questions pertaining to professional practice and the structures of our public life.
- Ethical** The *Journal* intends to support explorations into the foundations of ethical judgment and normative critiques of our social life, particularly as they draw upon resources from the life of law and religion.
- Global** The *Journal* intends to be encompassing in its reach, seeking out voices from all the religious and legal traditions throughout the world and bringing them into conversations with each other.
- Professional** The *Journal* intends to stimulate collaboration between jurists and religious leaders given their respective commitments, as professionals, to the common good of all peoples.
- Spiritual** The *Journal* recognizes that human existence is grounded in the spiritual, which is represented in many forms and expressions.

The *Journal* is thus a forum within which the disciplines of law and religion might together consider with utmost seriousness their joint responsibility for the creation of a civilization of genuine peace and justice. Within the compass of that purpose, the *Journal* intends to be open-minded and non-prejudicial; it is receptive to submissions from all persuasions and perspectives.

**HAMLIN  
UNIVERSITY  
SCHOOL OF LAW**

A subscription to the  
**JOURNAL OF LAW AND  
RELIGION**

Cost per volume (two issues):

\$15.00 individual (USA)  
\$25.00 individual (foreign)  
\$25.00 institution (USA)  
\$35.00 institution (foreign)  
\$10.00 student

Circulation Manager  
Journal of Law and Religion  
Hamline University School of Law  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55104

Payment Enclosed

Please Bill

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

City: \_\_\_\_\_ State: \_\_\_\_\_ Zip: \_\_\_\_\_

Phone: \_\_\_\_\_ Fax: \_\_\_\_\_ E-Mail: \_\_\_\_\_

# ANNOUNCEMENT

We have acquired the entire  
back stock, reprint and  
microform rights to the

## **JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION**

Complete sets to date  
are now available.  
We can also furnish  
single volumes and issues.

**WILLIAM S. HEIN & COMPANY, INC.**  
1285 Main Street  
Buffalo, New York 14209



# THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XIII

1998-99

NUMBER 2

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface xi

### ARTICLES

Elliot N. Dorff	Assisted Suicide .....	263
Steven H. Resnicoff	Jewish Law Perspectives on Suicide and Physician-Assisted Dying .....	289
Daniel Sinclair	The Obligation to Heal and Patient Autonomy in Jewish Law.....	351
Ze'ev W. Falk	Jewish Perspectives on Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia .....	379
Damien Keown	Suicide, Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia: A Buddhist Perspective .....	385
Peter Harvey	A Response to Damien Keown's <i>Suicide, Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia: A Buddhist Perspective</i> .....	407
R. E. Florida	A Response to Damien Keown's <i>Suicide, Assisted Suicide and Euthanasia: A Buddhist Perspective</i> .....	413

## JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

### ASSISTED SUICIDE BOOK REVIEWS

- John Keown            *A Different Death: Euthanasia and the Christian Tradition*, by Edward J. Larson & Darrel W. Amundsen ..... 417
- Henry J. Bourguignon    *Physician-Assisted Suicide: Expanding the Debate*, edited by Margaret P. Battin, Rosamond Rhodes & Anita Silvers..... 423
- M. Therese Lysaught    *Physician-Assisted Suicide (Medical Ethics Series)*, edited by Robert F. Weir ..... 431
- Marshall B. Kapp        *Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide*, by Gerald Dworkin, R.G. Frey & Sissela Bok.. 441
- Kevin O'Rourke, O.P.    *Euthanasia Examined: Ethical, Clinical and Legal Perspectives*, edited by John Keown ..... 445

### NEW ZEALAND SYMPOSIUM

- Rex J. Ahdar            A Christian State?..... 453
- John Stenhouse        Churches, State and the New Zealand Wars: 1860-1872 ..... 483
- Reid Mortensen        A Christian State? A Comment..... 509
- John Evans              Government Support of the Church in the Modern Era ..... 517

### BOOK REVIEWS

- Samuel J. Levine        *The Challenges of Religious Neutrality The Rhetoric of Church and State: A Critical Analysis of Religion Clause Jurisprudence*, by Frederick Mark Gedicks..... 531

*JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION*

- Bernard V. Brady      *Catholicism and Liberalism: Contributions to American Public Philosophy*, edited by R. Bruce Douglass & David Hollenbach ..... 549
- Robert G. Goldenberg      *Between the Babylonian and Palestinian Talmuds: Accounting for Halakhic Difference in Selected Sugyot from Tractate Avodah Zarah*, by Christine Elizabeth Hayes ..... 559

**ARTICLE**

- Kif Augustine-Adams      The Web of Membership: The Consonance and Conflict of Being American and Latter-Day Saint ..... 567

*Check out our website!*

# Journal of Law & Religion

<http://web.hamline.edu/law/lawreign/jlr/index.html>

Cumulative Index by Subject and Author



Survey of Trends and Developments on  
Religious Liberty in the Courts



Table of U.S. Supreme Court Decisions  
Relating to Religious Liberty



Announcements of Coming Events



Soon to be added:  
Article Abstracts of  
Past and Current Issues