

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 28 NUMBERS 2 & 3 2002

## THE GENETICS REVOLUTION: CONFLICTS, CHALLENGES AND CONUNDRAS

Foreword

**Frances H. Miller**

Symposium Authors

**Mary R. Anderlik**

**Lori B. Andrews**

**George J. Annas**

**Janlori Goldman**

**Joanne L. Husted**

**Rosario M. Isasi**

**David Korn**

**Jennifer Kulynych**

**Maxwell J. Mehlman**

**Kirsten M. Rabe**

**Patricia A. Roche**

**Mark A. Rothstein**

**Sonia Mateu Suter**

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

**Ruth K. Miller**

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS AND  
THE BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

A JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE (AJLM) is published by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics (ASLME) and Boston University School of Law (BUSL). All decisions concerning the content of AJLM are made by a joint ASLME-BUSL editorial policy committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, ASLME, or BUSL.

The editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see the inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1672, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Telephone: 617-353-2912.

Address subscription or membership correspondence to the Membership Director, ASLME, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1634, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Telephone: 617-262-4990 ext. 15. Fax: 617-437-7596. Requests for permission to reproduce AJLM material should be addressed to the Managing Editor, at the preceding address. Telephone: 617-262-4990 ext. 13. Fax: 617-437-7596.

AJLM subscriptions are \$215 per year for institutions and \$115 per year for individuals (payment for individual subscriptions must be on a personal check) who are not members of ASLME. All foreign subscribers must remit an additional \$35 per year for foreign postage fees. ASLME members receive AJLM as part of their member benefits. AJLM is published quarterly: Spring; Summer & Fall (double issue); and Winter.

Missing copies of AJLM will be sent free of charge to ASLME subscribers or members, provided that notice of such a claim is received by ASLME *within one month of receipt of the next issue published*. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single-issue price of \$40 (members) and \$50 (nonmembers) and the regular double-issue price of \$55 (members) and \$65 (nonmembers).

AJLM is available online, indexed or abstracted, in *LEXIS*, *Westlaw*, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *MedWebPlus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *SSRN Health Law & Policy*, and *EMBASE/Excerpta Medica*.

Library of Congress Catalog No. 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588. U.S. postage paid at Hanover, Pennsylvania, in accordance with Permit No. 4 (non-profit organization).

#### **ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW**

JOHN R. SILBER, M.A., Ph.D., LL.D. (hon.), L.H.D. (hon.), *Chancellor, Interim President, University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

RONALD A. CASS, J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH F. BRODLEY, LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law*

STEPHEN MARKS, J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law*

DANIEL J. FREEHLING, J.D., *Associate Dean for Administration and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

#### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS**

MARY CARROLL SULLIVAN, R.N., M.T.S., J.D., *President*

RUTH MICKELSEN, J.D., M.P.H., *Immediate Past President*

BENJAMIN W. MOULTON, J.D., M.P.H., *Executive Vice President*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D. (dec.), *Founder and First President*

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## BOARD OF EDITORS

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

**Frances H. Miller, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

**EMERITUS AND FOUNDER**  
**John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.**  
Harvard University

### MANAGING EDITOR

**Kelly A.M. McDonald, J.D.**  
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

### EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT

**Benjamin W. Moulton, J.D., M.P.H.**  
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

## EDITORS

**Gail B. Agrawal, J.D., M.P.H.**  
University of North Carolina School of Law

**Michael Baram, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

**Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.**  
Boston College Law School

**Lee J. Dunn Jr., J.D., LL.M.**  
Law Offices of Lee Dunn, Boston

**Jay A. Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**  
MetaStar, Inc., Madison

**Ernest M. Haddad, J.D.**  
Partners HealthCare System, Inc., Boston

**Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.**  
Duke University School of Law

**Nathan Hershey, LL.B.**  
University of Pittsburgh  
Graduate School of Public Health

**David A. Hyman, M.D., J.D.**  
University of Maryland School of Law

**Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.**  
Harvard University  
Kennedy School of Government

**Timothy S. Jost, J.D.**  
Washington and Lee  
University School of Law

**Jay Katz, M.D.**  
Yale University Law School

**Stephen Latham, J.D., Ph.D.**  
Director, Ctr. for Health Law & Policy  
Quinnipiac University School of Law

**Sylvia A. Law, J.D.**  
New York University School of Law

**David T. Morris, J.D.**  
Latham & Watkins, San Francisco

**Joseph P. Newhouse, Ph.D.**  
Harvard Medical School  
Department of Health Care Policy

**Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.**  
University of Washington School of Medicine

**Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.**  
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida

**Arti K. Rai, J.D.**  
University of Pennsylvania Law School

**Philip R. Reilly, M.D., J.D.**  
Interleukin Genetics, Inc., Waltham

**Marc A. Rodwin, J.D., Ph.D.**  
Indiana University School of Public &  
Environmental Affairs

**Mark A. Rothstein, J.D.**  
University of Louisville School of Medicine  
Institute for Bioethics, Health Policy and Law

**E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.**  
New York Law School

**David S. Szabo, J.D.**  
Nutter, McClennen & Fish, LLP, Boston

**Linda V. Tiano, J.D.**  
Empire Blue Cross Blue Shield, Melville, NY

**Sidney D. Watson, J.D.**  
Saint Louis University School of Law

**Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.**  
Saint Francis Central Hospital, Pittsburgh  
Corner of Allegheny County

**James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**  
AEGON, Monumental Life Ins. Co., Baltimore

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## INTERNATIONAL BOARD OF EDITORS

**Koichi Bai**  
Director, Institute of Medical Humanities  
Kitasato University School of Medicine  
Japan

**Erwin Deutsch**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Göttingen  
Germany

**Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.**  
Faculties of Law and Medicine  
University of Toronto  
Canada

**Sev S. Fluss**  
World Health Organization  
Switzerland

**Honorable Justice Michael D. Kirby**  
President, Court of Appeal  
Supreme Court of New South Wales  
Australia

**H.J.J. Leenen**  
Em. Prof., Social Medicine and Health Law  
University of Amsterdam  
The Netherlands

**Christopher Newdick**  
Reader in Health Law  
University of Reading  
United Kingdom

**Amos Shapira**  
Faculty of Law  
Tel Aviv University  
Israel

**Peter D.G. Skegg**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Otago  
New Zealand

**M.A.M. Wachter**  
Director, Institute of Bioethics  
The Netherlands

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE  
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS  
2001–2002

## EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Francine Murray

## EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Ruth K. Miller

## MANAGING EDITORS

Jennings Aske

Elizabeth McGinty

## SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Nicholas Vegliante

## ARTICLES EDITORS

Kerry Dunne

Laura Martin

William Mekrut

Thomas Utzinger

## PROJECTS EDITOR

Jodie Hamill

## CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Melissa Arnold

Michele Carlucci

Cara Feldberg

Catherine Olender

Vineetha Reddy

Angela Verrecchio

## THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

Randi Burnstine

Nicole Castagna

Andrea Curti

Edward F. Dombroski, Jr.

Taruna Garg

Aviva Halpern

John Hofmann

Brian Holohan

Sabre Kaszynski

Danielle Krause

Ian Prior

Kathleen Romanow

Tal Sapeika

Sarah Smegal

Amy Stewart

Mary Katherine Welte

Brian Winner

Mary Zendran

## STAFF MEMBERS

Bruce Anderson  
Catherine Bailly  
Sara Beliveau  
Neil Bloomfield  
Carol Botros  
Carrie Buchanan  
Jacqueline Ceurvels  
Judith Donovan  
Kristofor Erickson  
Christine Flood  
Jodie Friedman  
Katherine Gehringer

Rebecca Greenfield  
C. Murray Harris  
Amanda N. Hill  
Elizabeth Hokanson-Russo  
Kristin Jenkins  
Judith Joseph  
Robert Kanapka  
Caren H. Kang  
Sandhya Kawatra  
Stacy E. Kern  
Rajpreet Kochhar  
Peter Mello

Richard Montgomery  
Laura Nicholson  
Jennifer Norton  
Allison Pearsall  
Anna Piazza  
John Quick  
Rachel Regenold  
Andrew Saxon  
Jeremy Shure  
Charlotte Spears  
Yaroslava Tyler  
Christine Vargas

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

The American Journal of Law & Medicine  
is pleased to introduce its  
Student Board of Editors for  
2002–2003

**EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**

C. Murray Harris

**EXECUTIVE EDITOR**

Stacy E. Kern

**MANAGING EDITORS**

Andrew E. Saxon

Yaroslava Tyler

**SYMPOSIUM EDITOR**

Katherine Gehringer

**ARTICLES EDITORS**

Rajpreet K. Kochhar

Laura A. Nicholson

Jennifer A. Norton

Christine Vargas

**PROJECTS EDITOR**

Rachel C. Regenold

**CASE & NOTE EDITORS**

Sara Beliveau

Carol Botros

Jacqueline Ceurvels

Richard Montgomery

Anna M. Piazza

**THIRD-YEAR EDITORS**

Bruce Anderson

Catherine Bailly

Neil Bloomfield

Carrie Buchanan

Judith Donovan

Kristofor Erickson

Christine Flood

Jodie Friedman

Rebecca Greenfield

Amanda N. Hill

Elizabeth M. H. Russo

Kristin L. Jenkins

Judith Joseph

Robert Kanapka

Caren H. Kang

Sandhya P. Kawatra

Peter Mello

Allison P. Miller

John Quick

Jeremy Shure

Charlotte Spears

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 28 NUMBERS 2 & 3 2002

## The Genetics Revolution: Conflicts, Challenges and Conundra

### ARTICLES

- |  |     |  |
|--|-----|--|
| FOREWORD: PHASE II OF THE GENETICS<br>REVOLUTION: SOPHISTICATED ISSUES FOR<br>HOME AND ABROAD                                      | 145 | Frances H. Miller                                      |
| PROTECTING THE ENDANGERED HUMAN:<br>TOWARD AN INTERNATIONAL TREATY<br>PROHIBITING CLONING AND INHERITABLE<br>ALTERATIONS           | 151 | George J. Annas<br>Lori B. Andrews<br>Rosario M. Isasi |
| ANY DNA TO DECLARE? REGULATING<br>OFFSHORE ACCESS TO GENETIC<br>ENHANCEMENT  | 179 | Maxwell J. Mehlman<br>Kirsten M. Rabe                  |
| DNA-BASED IDENTITY TESTING AND THE<br>FUTURE OF THE FAMILY: A RESEARCH<br>AGENDA   | 215 | Mary R. Anderlik<br>Mark A. Rothstein                  |
| THE ROUTINIZATION OF PRENATAL TESTING  | 233 | Sonia Mateu Suter                                      |
| THE GENETIC REVOLUTION AT WORK:<br>LEGISLATIVE EFFORTS TO PROTECT<br>EMPLOYEES   | 271 | Patricia A. Roche                                      |
| GENETICS AND PRIVACY   | 285 | Joanne L. Hustead<br>Janlori Goldman                   |
| USE AND DISCLOSURE OF HEALTH<br>INFORMATION IN GENETIC RESEARCH:<br>WEIGHING THE IMPACT OF THE NEW<br>FEDERAL MEDICAL PRIVACY RULE | 309 | Jennifer Kulynych<br>David Korn                        |

Copyright 2002 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc., and Boston University School of Law. All rights reserved. For permission to photocopy articles or other materials appearing in the AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, contact Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, Massachusetts 01923; tel. 978-750-8400; fax 978-750-4470; or contact the Managing Editor, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Ste. 1634, Boston, Massachusetts 02215; tel. 617-262-4990 ext. 13; fax 617-437-7596; email [kmcdonald@aslme.org](mailto:kmcdonald@aslme.org).

**NOTES AND COMMENTS**

INFORMED CONSENT IN THE MILITARY: 325 Ruth K. Miller  
FIGHTING A LOSING BATTLE AGAINST  
THE ANTHRAX VACCINE

**RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN HEALTH LAW**

SELECT RECENT COURT DECISIONS 345  
ASLME CONFERENCE CALENDAR 354