

# Industrial and Organizational Psychology

## Perspectives on Science and Practice

**Including focal articles with commentaries:**

*Putting an End to Bad Talent Management: A Call to Action for  
the Field of Industrial and Organizational Psychology*

**Christopher T. Rotolo, Allan H. Church, Seymour Adler,  
James W. Smither, Alan L. Colquitt, Amanda C. Shull,  
Karen B. Paul, and Garrett Foster**

*From “Her” Problem to “Our” Problem: Using an  
Individual Lens Versus a Social-Structural Lens to Understand  
Gender Inequity in STEM*

**Kathi N. Miner, Jessica M. Walker, Mindy E. Bergman, Vanessa A. Jean,  
Adrienne Carter-Sowell, Samantha C. January, and Christine Kaunas**

**And from the Practice Forum:**

*The Looming Cybersecurity Crisis and What It Means for the  
Practice of Industrial and Organizational Psychology*

**Rachel C. Dreibelbis, Jaclyn Martin,  
Michael D. Covert, and David W. Dorsey**



SOCIETY for  
INDUSTRIAL and  
ORGANIZATIONAL  
PSYCHOLOGY

SCIENCE FOR A SMARTER WORKPLACE



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

## **Industrial and Organizational Psychology Perspectives on Science and Practice**

The novel format of the journal focuses on an interactive exchanges on topics of importance to science and practice in the field of industrial and organizational psychology. The journal takes a focal article–peer commentary format.

A focal article is a position paper on an important issue for the field (or potentially a pair of papers taking opposite sides in a debate). Such a focal article might summarize evidence on an issue and take a position as to implications for science, practice, or public policy. The paper might focus on a basic science issue, an applied science issue, a practice issue, or a public policy issue; many would be a blend. The focal article is then followed by a series of peer commentaries. These could challenge or critique the original article, expand on issues not addressed in the focal article, or draw out implications not developed in the focal article. The goal is to include commentaries from various perspectives, including science, practice, and international perspectives.

### **EDITOR:**

John C. Scott, APTMetrics, Inc.

### **PRACTICE FORUM SECTION EDITOR:**

Mark Poteet, Organizational Research & Solutions, Inc.

### **SR. PUBLICATIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS MANAGER:**

Jenny Baker, Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology

### **EDITORIAL BOARD:**

Neil R. Anderson, Brunel University  
Winfred Arthur, Texas A & M University  
Tayla N. Bauer, Portland State University  
Michael J. Burke, Tulane University  
Stuart C. Carr, Massey University  
Allan H. Church, PepsiCo, Inc.  
José M. Cortina, George Mason University  
Satoris S. Culbertson, Kansas State University  
Fritz Drasgow, University of Illinois at  
Urbana-Champaign  
Mark Griffin, University of Western Australia  
Theodore Hayes, US Office of Personnel Management  
Beryl L. Hesketh, University of Western Sydney  
George P. Hollenbeck, Hollenbeck Associates  
Leaetta M. Hough, Dunnette Group, Ltd.  
Jeff W. Johnson, Personnel Decisions Research Institute  
Tracy Kantrowitz, SHL  
Jerard F. Kehoe, Selection and Assessment Counselling  
Richard J. Klimoski, George Mason University  
Allen I. Kraut, Baruch College, CUNY  
Hennie J. Kriek, Top Talent Solutions and University  
of South Africa

Morgan W. McCall, University of Southern California  
Jeffrey J. McHenry, Rainier Leadership Solutions  
S. Morton McPhail, Retired Consultant, USA  
Kevin Murphy, Lamorinda Consulting LLC and  
Colorado State University  
Kenneth Pearlman, Creative Personnel Management  
Consulting  
Hannah R. Rothstein, Baruch College, CUNY  
Ann Marie Ryan, Michigan State University  
Lise M. Saari, New York University  
Eduardo Salas, Rice University  
John C. Scott, APTMetrics, Inc.  
Robert F. Silzer, HR Assessment & Development and  
Baruch, Graduate Center, CUNY  
Stephen D. Steinhaus, HRAlignment  
William J. Strickland, Human Resources Research  
Organization  
Nancy T. Tippins, The Nancy T. Tippins Group  
Aharon Tziner, Netanya Academic College  
Sara P. Weiner, Glint  
Alan Witt, University of Houston

### **A journal of the Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology**

SIOP is the premier membership organization for those practicing and teaching I-O psychology. While an independent organization with its own governance, SIOP is also a division within the American Psychological Association and an organizational affiliate of the Association for Psychological Science.

SIOP membership includes online access to all issues of the journal as well as an optional print copy. Individuals can become members at <http://www.siop.org/Dues/payment.aspx>. Membership rates are \$100 for professional members (Fellows, Members, Associates, International Affiliates) and \$50 for Student Affiliates & Retired statuses.

© Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology

# Industrial and Organizational Psychology

## Perspectives on Science and Practice

---

VOLUME 11, ISSUE 2, JUNE 2018

### CONTENTS

#### INTRODUCTION

- From the Editor  
JOHN C. SCOTT AND MARK L. POTEET 173

#### FOCAL ARTICLE

- Putting an End to Bad Talent Management: A Call to Action for the Field of Industrial and Organizational Psychology  
CHRISTOPHER T. ROTOLO, ALLAN H. CHURCH, SEYMOUR ADLER, JAMES W. SMITHER, ALAN L. COLQUITT, AMANDA C. SHULL, KAREN B. PAUL, AND GARETT FOSTER 176

#### COMMENTARIES

- A Systems View of the Scientist–Practitioner Gap  
JEFFREY OLENICK, ROSS WALKER, JACOB BRADBURN, AND RICHARD P. DESHON 220
- What Curbs Frontiers Research? A Reaction to Rotolo et al.'s Article  
EDNA RABENU AND AHARON TZINER 227
- Being Competitive in the Talent Management Space  
BENJAMIN SCHNEIDER 231
- What if Any Science Will Do?  
FRED DELMHORST 236
- Engage Decision Makers or Someone Else Will: The Need for More Compelling I-O Psychology Communication  
MARC SOKOL 241
- Forever New Frontiers: Managing Messiness at the Edge  
PAUL R. YOST AND MATTHEW S. MAGILL 245
- Big Data Techniques and Talent Management: Recommendations for Organizations and a Research Agenda for I-O Psychologists  
MICHAEL C. CAMPION, MICHAEL A. CAMPION, AND EMILY D. CAMPION 250
- I-O Psychologists Can Help Make Sure Your HiPos Aren't NoPos  
LISA M. FINKELSTEIN, DAVID P. COSTANZA, AND GERALD F. GOODWIN 257

Critical Reflection or Existential Trap: Are We Making Too Much of Scientific Rigor in a Dynamic Business World?	
JOSEPH A. JONES, ASHLEY A. MILLER, MICHAEL J. SARETTE, RACHAEL M. JOHNSON-MURRAY, AND ALEX ALONSO	262

### **FOCAL ARTICLE**

From “Her” Problem to “Our” Problem: Using an Individual Lens Versus a Social-Structural Lens to Understand Gender Inequity in STEM	
KATHI N. MINER, JESSICA M. WALKER, MINDY E. BERGMAN, VANESSA A. JEAN, ADRIENNE CARTER-SOWELL, SAMANTHA C. JANUARY, AND CHRISTINE KAUNAS	267

### **COMMENTARIES**

Spotlight on Women of Color in STEM	
CATALINA FLORES	291

Intersectionally Insufficient: A Necessary Expansion of the Social-Structural Lens	
STEPHANIE E. V. BROWN AND SIN-NING CINDY LIU	296

A Cultural Perspective on Gender Inequity in STEM: The Japanese Context	
KATSUHIKO YOSHIKAWA, AKIKO KOKUBO, AND CHIA-HUEI WU	301

Gender Disparity in STEM Across Cultures	
ADITI RABINDRA SACHDEV	309

One Size Does Not Fit All: Gender Inequity in STEM Varies Between Subfields	
STEFANIE GISLER, ANNE E. KATO, SOOHYUN LEE, AND DESMOND W. LEUNG	314

Yes Virginia, There Is a Gender Disparity Problem—and It Goes Beyond STEM	
SATORIS S. HOWES, JAIME HENNING, MAURA J. MILLS, AND ANN HERGATT HUFFMAN	318

Issues of Gender Inequity Go Beyond STEM	
P. D. HARMS AND KAREN LANDAY	323

STEM-ming the Tide: A Different Approach to Shaping Diverse Participation in STEM Careers	
VALERIE N. STREETS, JAMES N. KURTESSIS, LINDSAY NORTON, AND ALEX ALONSO	326

Bridging Individual and Social-Structural Perspectives	
KRISTI LAVIGNE AND RACHEL RAUVOLA	331

Using Funds of Knowledge to Address Diversity Issues in STEM	
WENDY JACKELINE TORRES, JACQUELINE M. GILBERTO, AND MARGARET E. BEIER	335

Addressing the STEM Problem in Ways That Work	
KARAN SAGGI	339

Developing Leaders to Tackle “Our” Problem	
CATHLEEN CLERKIN AND MARIAN N. RUDERMAN	341

### **PRACTICE FORUM**

The Looming Cybersecurity Crisis and What It Means for the Practice of Industrial and Organizational Psychology	
RACHEL C. DREIBELBIS, JACLYN MARTIN, MICHAEL D. COOVERT, AND DAVID W. DORSEY	346