

---

# *History of Education Quarterly*

---

*Fall 1991*

---

V o l u m e  
3 1  
N u m b e r  
3

# History of Education Society

The History of Education Society is an international scholarly society. Its purposes are to encourage and facilitate research in the history of education; to promote and improve the teaching of history of education; to encourage cooperation among specialists in history of education; and to promote an appreciation of the value of historical perspective in the making of educational policy. The Society is affiliated with the International Standing Conference for the History of Education, and members of the Society are automatically members of the Standing Conference.

## *Officers (1991)*

|                            |  |
|----------------------------|--|
| <i>President</i>           | DONALD WARREN, <i>Indiana University</i>   |
| <i>Vice-President</i>      | JAMES ANDERSON, <i>University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign</i>  |
| <i>Secretary-Treasurer</i> | C. H. EDSON, <i>University of Oregon, 1991–94</i>  |
| <i>Directors</i>           | MAXINE SCHWARTZ SELLER, <i>Past President, 1990, University at Buffalo, State University of New York</i> |
|                            | LYNN D. GORDON, <i>University of Rochester, 1988–91</i>  |
|                            | BARBARA BRENZEL, <i>Wellesley College, 1989–92</i>   |
|                            | SUSAN CARTER, <i>University of California, Riverside, 1990–93</i>  |

**THE HENRY BARNARD PRIZE:** This prize of \$250 is awarded biennially to the best essay in the history of education by a graduate student. The next award will be presented at the fall 1991 meeting of the History of Education Society. The recipient will have the essay published in the *History of Education Quarterly*.

**THE HISTORY OF EDUCATION SOCIETY AWARD:** This award of \$250 will be made biennially to the best essay in the history of education published in any journal over the previous two years. The next award will be presented at the fall 1992 meeting of the History of Education Society. Any article published in 1990 or 1991 will be eligible for the award.

The Society reserves the right not to make awards in years when the Prize Committee judges all entries to be of insufficient quality.

Inquiries regarding these awards should be directed to the chairperson of the Prize Committee: James Albisetti, Department of History, University of Kentucky, Lexington, KY 40506

**OUTSTANDING BOOK AWARD:** This award of \$250 is made biennially to the author of the best book published in the two previous years. The committee will accept nominations but will also make every effort to review all relevant works, whether or not they have been nominated. The award for books bearing 1989 and 1990 publication dates will be announced at the annual meeting of the Society in 1991.

Inquiries regarding the Outstanding Book Award should be directed to the chairperson of the committee: Maris Vinovskis, Dept. of History, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109.

# *History of Education Quarterly*

## **Editorial Staff**

|                              |  |
|------------------------------|--|
| <i>Editor</i>                | WILLIAM J. REESE, <i>Indiana University</i>          |
| <i>Associate Editor</i>      | RONALD D. COHEN, <i>Indiana University–Northwest</i> |
| <i>Associate Editor</i>      | DAVID W. ADAMS, <i>Cleveland State University</i>    |
| <i>Managing Editor</i>       | AMY C. SCHUTT  |
| <i>Subscriptions Manager</i> | TED STAHLY   |
| <i>Editorial Secretary</i>   | MARGARET A. MILLER                                   |
| <i>Editorial Assistant</i>   | MARY LAMBETH   |

## **Editorial Board**

|  |
|--|
| RICHARD EDWARD ALDRICH, <i>University of London Institute of Education</i> |
| ANN TAYLOR ALLEN, <i>University of Louisville</i>                          |
| JEAN BARMAN, <i>University of British Columbia</i>                         |
| GERALDINE JONČICH CLIFFORD, <i>University of California, Berkeley</i>      |
| BRUCE CURTIS, <i>Wilfrid Laurier University</i>                            |
| PAULA S. FASS, <i>University of California, Berkeley</i>                   |
| BARRY M. FRANKLIN, <i>Kennesaw State College</i>                           |
| V. P. FRANKLIN, <i>Drexel University</i>                                   |
| RUBY HEAP, <i>University of Ottawa</i>                                     |
| WILLIAM R. JOHNSON, <i>University of Maryland Baltimore County</i>         |
| DAVID F. LABAREE, <i>Michigan State University</i>                         |
| ELLEN CONDLIFFE LAGEMANN, <i>Teachers College, Columbia University</i>     |
| GARY McCULLOCH, <i>University of Auckland</i>                              |
| PAVLA MILLER, <i>Phillip Institute of Technology</i>                       |
| JEFFREY MIREL, <i>Northern Illinois University</i>                         |
| NATALIE NAYLOR, <i>Hofstra University</i>                                  |
| JOSEPH W. NEWMAN, <i>University of South Alabama</i>                       |
| SHELDON ROTHBLATT, <i>University of California, Berkeley</i>               |
| RICHARD RUBINGER, <i>Indiana University</i>                                |
| JOHN THELIN, <i>College of William and Mary</i>                            |
| MARJORIE R. THEOBALD, <i>University of Melbourne</i>                       |
| MARIS A. VINOVSIS, <i>University of Michigan</i>                           |
| DONALD WARREN, <i>Indiana University</i>                                   |
| SUE ZSCHOCHÉ, <i>Kansas State University</i>                               |

The *History of Education Quarterly* (ISSN US 00 182680) is published spring, summer, fall, and winter by the History of Education Society in cooperation with the School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405, with additional support from Indiana University–Northwest and Cleveland State University. Membership in the Society, which includes subscription to the *Quarterly*, is available at the following rates: students, \$15; others, \$25 (non-U.S. members add \$2 to cover additional postage, surface mail; add \$16 for overseas airmail). Institutional subscription rates are: \$47, U.S.; \$50, non-U.S. All payment must be made in U.S. dollars. Single copies of some back issues available at \$8. Second-class postage paid at Bloomington, Ind. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405.

*History of Education Quarterly* Vol. 31 No. 3 Fall 1991

Copyright 1991 by the History of Education Society.

## History of Education Society

**INDIVIDUAL MEMBERSHIP:** Membership is open to all persons interested in the study of the history of education. Membership provides for subscription to the *History of Education Quarterly*; subscription to *Network*, a newsletter published jointly with Division F of the American Educational Research Association; and receipt of the program of the annual meeting of the Society. Members of the Society are automatically members of the International Standing Conference for the History of Education. Membership offers subscription to publications on a calendar-year basis only. Dues are \$15 for students, \$25 for others. Non-U.S. members should add \$2 to cover additional postage for surface mail; \$16 for airmail. The portions of dues designated for support of the *Quarterly* are \$15 of student dues, \$20 of other individual dues. To become a member, send a check for the appropriate amount in U.S. dollars only to the *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405. Make checks payable to History of Education Society. Indicate preferred mailing address and the calendar year in which your subscription should begin.

### *History of Education Quarterly*

**INSTITUTIONAL SUBSCRIPTIONS:** Institutions may subscribe to the *History of Education Quarterly* directly (send checks to *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405) or through subscription agencies. Rates are \$47, U.S.; \$50, non-U.S., U.S. dollars only.

**BACK ISSUES:** Some back issues are available (cost \$8 per issue).

**INDEXES:** Two indexes are available: Index to Vols. I–X (1961–1970), by Murray S. Shereshevsky (\$5) and Index to Vols. XI–XX (1971–1980), by Paul Mattingly and Marilyn Tobias (\$7). A set of both indexes may be purchased for \$10.

**ARTICLE SUBMISSIONS:** Contributions should be addressed to: Editor, *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405. See last page of this issue for guidelines on submission. The editor will only consider articles that have been submitted *exclusively* to the *History of Education Quarterly*.

**BOOK REVIEWS:** Assignments of reviews are made from a file of potential reviewers by the associate editor. To have your name added to the file, send vita to the editor. Requests to review particular books cannot be honored.

The *History of Education Quarterly* is printed by Indiana University Printing Services. Design by Dennis H. Hill, Indiana University Publications.

# *History of Education Quarterly*

---

Volume 31 • Number 3 • Fall 1991

## Contents

---

### *Articles*

- 323 Science, Education, and Antebellum Reform: The Case  
of Alexander Dallas Bache  
*by Hugh R. Slotten*
- 343 An Education in the Validity of Pluralism: The Meeting  
between Presbyterian Mission Teachers and Hispanic  
Catholics in New Mexico, 1870–1912  
*by Susan M. Yohn*
- 365 Transforming the University: Administrators, Physicists,  
and Industrial and Federal Patronage at Stanford,  
1935–49  
*by Rebecca S. Lowen*
- 

### *Essay Review*

- 389 Political Socialization and Schooling  
*by Gregory P. Wegner*
- 

### *Book Reviews*

- 393 Tyack and Hansot, *Learning Together*  
*by Joseph F. Kett*
- 395 Clifford, ed., *Lone Voyagers*  
*by Sarah Stage*
- 397 Helsing, Sheets, and Veeder, *The Woman Question*  
*by Sarah Deutsch*

- 399 Dyhouse, *Feminism and the Family in England*  
by Philippa Levine
- 400 Kean, *Challenging the State?*  
by Kevin J. Brehony
- 402 Lux, *Patronage and Royal Science*  
by Paula Findlen
- 404 Konrad, *Andragogische Aktivitäten*  
by Francis J. Dannerbeck
- 406 Gidney and Millar, *Inventing Secondary Education*  
by Alison Prentice
- 409 Axelrod, *Making a Middle Class*  
by Doug Owram
- 411 Fletcher, *Clean, Clad, and Courteous and Documents*  
by Pavla Miller
- 414 Soucy and Stankiewicz, eds., *Framing the Past*  
by Phyllis D. Krasnick
- 416 Baatz, *Knowledge, Culture, and Science*  
by Martin Schiesl
- 418 Plank and Ginsberg, eds., *Southern Cities, Southern Schools*  
by Theodore R. Mitchell
- 421 Allmendinger, *Ruffin*  
by Daniel Dupre
- 422 Cmiel, *Democratic Eloquence*  
by Michelle Condit
- 425 Stephens, *One-Room School*  
by Courtney Vaughn-Roberson
- 426 Paringer, *John Dewey, and Lean and Eaton, Education or Catastrophe?*  
by Richard A. Brosio
- 428 Smith, *Killing the Spirit*  
by Judith Block McLaughlin
- 431 **Book Notes**
- 433 **Letters to the Editor**