

# INTERNATIONAL & COMPARATIVE LAW QUARTERLY

VOLUME 63

PART 3

JULY 2014

## ARTICLES

Determining the Seat of an International Arbitration: Party Autonomy  
and the Interpretation of Arbitration Agreements

Jonathan Hill

Reflections of Customary International Law: The Authority of  
Codification Conventions and ILC Draft Articles in  
International Law

Fernando Lusa Bordin

Deconstructing Data Protection: The 'Added-Value' of a Right to  
Data Protection in the EU Legal Order

Orla Lynskey

Severing Reservations

Kasey L. McCall-Smith

Reviewing the United Kingdom's ICCPR Immigration Reservation  
in Hong Kong Courts

Michael Ramsden

Corporate Human Rights Accountability: The Objections of Western  
Governments to the Alien Tort Statute

Uta Kohl

The Alien Tort Statute After *Kiobel*: The Possibility for Unlawful  
Assertions of Universal Civil Jurisdiction Still Remains

Paul David Mora

Shorter Articles and Notes and Book Reviews—see back cover



**British Institute of  
International and  
Comparative Law**

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

## EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

GUIDO ALPA  
JEAN-BERNARD AUBY  
JOOST BLOM  
MARISE CREMONA  
MARTIN DAVIES  
CHRISTOF HEYNS

ERIK JAYME  
CAMPBELL MCLACHLAN  
DONALD MCRAE  
FRANCISCO ORREGO VICUÑA  
MUTHUCUMARASWAMY SORNARAJAH  
GILLIAN TRIGGS

## British Institute of International and Comparative Law

*President* : DAME ROSALYN HIGGINS DBE QC

*Vice Presidents*: THE RT HON THE LORD COLLINS OF MAPESBURY,  
THE RIGHT HON SIR DAVID EDWARD KCMG PC QC LL D FRSE and  
SIR CHRISTOPHER GREENWOOD KCMG QC

### DIRECTOR

PROFESSOR ROBERT MCCORQUODALE

### BOARD OF TRUSTEES

*Chairman of the Board of Trustees*: SIR FRANKLIN BERMAN KCMG QC

CLARE ALGAR  
THE HON SIR WILLIAM BLAIR  
GARY B BORN  
SUSAN BRIGHT  
LORD JUSTICE STANLEY BURTON  
IAN HOBBS FCA  
SIR FRANCIS JACOBS KCMG QC  
SIR PAUL JENKINS KCB QC  
PROFESSOR ROSA LASTRA LLB MA LL M PHD

PAUL LOMAS  
LORETTA MALINTOPPI  
PROFESSOR DAWN OLIVER QC MA PHD FBA  
TIMOTHY OTTY QC  
KEITH RUDDOCK  
PROFESSOR MALCOLM N SHAW QC  
THE HON MR JUSTICE SINGH  
PROFESSOR STEPHEN WEATHERILL

ADVISORS TO THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
THE RT HON DAME MARY ARDEN DBE  
MARTIN PAISNER CBE

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

2014

## **BOARD OF EDITORS**

### *General Editors*

PROFESSOR MALCOLM EVANS OBE, University of Bristol  
PROFESSOR ROBERT MCCORQUODALE, Director of BIICL

PROFESSOR IAN CRAM, University of Leeds  
PROFESSOR JAMES FAWCETT, University of Nottingham  
PROFESSOR PAULA GILIKER, University of Bristol  
DR LOUISE MERRETT, University of Cambridge  
PROFESSOR DOMINIC MCGOLDRICK, University of Nottingham  
PROFESSOR CHRISTINE GRAY, University of Cambridge  
PROFESSOR JOANNE SCOTT, University College London

### *Publications Editor*

Anna Riddell

## **BOOK REVIEW EDITOR**

PROFESSOR IAN CRAM, University of Leeds

## INSTRUCTIONS FOR CONTRIBUTORS

The ICLQ welcomes the submission of contributions for consideration by the Board of Editors with a view to publication. All manuscripts must be submitted online via the website: <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/iclq>

The Board of Editors will only consider material which complies with the following:

1. The submission should be an original, unpublished work not currently under consideration for publication elsewhere. Please note that our exclusive submission policy means you cannot submit your work to another journal until you have received a decision from us. If you would like to submit to another journal, you must withdraw your article from consideration by the ICLQ.
2. The ICLQ publishes articles that deal with public international law, private international law, comparative law, human rights law and European Union law. It particularly encourages the submission of innovative and original articles whose theme or content illuminate more than one of these subject areas. Articles which do no more than rehearse familiar and well-known material, or which are concerned only with national law (other than private international law) in a non-comparative way, should not be submitted.
3. *Long articles should not exceed 12,000 words (16,000 words including footnotes).* Pieces of up to 6,000 words will usually be considered for the 'Shorter Articles and Notes' section. The editors will decide on the section to which all contributions, irrespective of length, are best suited should they be accepted for publication. ScholarOne will require you to enter the word count (including footnotes) when submitting your article, and to indicate if you intend it for the 'Shorter Articles and Notes' section.
4. Footnotes should be numbered consecutively throughout the article and be in the form normally used by the ICLQ. Please see the Style Guide for further information. *Footnoting should not be excessive.*
5. A short (50–100 words) abstract of the article should be supplied. We reserve the right to edit abstracts for length and style. Please also supply a minimum of five keywords (maximum ten) for your article to enable digital searching.
6. Authors should state their present academic or professional affiliation and indicate any professional or personal involvement in the subject matter of the article.
7. The ICLQ only accepts submissions online via the ScholarOne platform. To upload your manuscript please go to: <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/iclq>. Detailed instructions for submitting your manuscript online can be found at the submission website by clicking on the 'Instructions and Forms' link in the top right of the screen; and then clicking on the 'Author Submission Instructions' icon on the following page. The Editor will acknowledge receipt of the manuscript, with a reference number, which should be quoted in all correspondence.

For the ICLQ Style Guide, please visit [www.journals.cambridge.org/iclq/ifc](http://www.journals.cambridge.org/iclq/ifc). In all matters not included in this Guide, the ICLQ follows the OSCOLA citation system for house style; please visit [www.law.ox.ac.uk](http://www.law.ox.ac.uk) for details.

## SUBSCRIPTIONS

Subscriptions, orders, and enquiries should be sent to the British Institute of International and Comparative Law, Charles Clore House, 17 Russell Square, London WC1B 5JP, telephone 020 7862 5151. The subscription to the *ICLQ* for 2014 is £253, \$505, air mail postage extra. There may be other subscription rates available; for a complete listing please visit [journals.cambridge.org/ICLQ](http://journals.cambridge.org/ICLQ). Back issues of all volumes are now available at the current cover price (casebound extra).

The views expressed in the contributions to this journal are those of their author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views either of the board of editors of the journal or of the British Institute of International and Comparative Law (BIICL). BIICL is a registered charity and an independent research institute committed to supporting high standards of scholarship in all aspects of international and comparative law.

The ICLQ has been selected for coverage in Thomson Reuters' products and services. The journal will be indexed and abstracted in the Social Sciences Citation Index, the Journals Citation Reports/Social Sciences Edition and Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences

## PERMISSIONS

For all matters concerning rights and permissions please contact Linda Nicol, Cambridge University Press, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8RU

© 2014

British Institute of International and Comparative Law

Printed in the United Kingdom by Bell and Bain Ltd, Glasgow

This journal issue has been printed on FSC-certified paper and cover board. FSC is an independent, non-governmental, not-for-profit organization established to promote the responsible management of the world's forests. Please see [www.fsc.org](http://www.fsc.org) for information.

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

---

Volume 63

July 2014

Part 3

---

## ARTICLES

- DETERMINING THE SEAT OF AN INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION: PARTY  
AUTONOMY AND THE INTERPRETATION OF ARBITRATION  
AGREEMENTS *Jonathan Hill* 517
- REFLECTIONS OF CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW: THE AUTHORITY OF  
CODIFICATION CONVENTIONS AND ILC DRAFT ARTICLES IN INTERNATIONAL  
LAW *Fernando Lusa Bordin* 535
- DECONSTRUCTING DATA PROTECTION: THE 'ADDED-VALUE' OF A RIGHT TO  
DATA PROTECTION IN THE EU LEGAL ORDER *Orla Lynskey* 569
- SEVERING RESERVATIONS *Kasey L. McCall-Smith* 599
- REVIEWING THE UNITED KINGDOM'S ICCPR IMMIGRATION RESERVATION IN  
HONG KONG COURTS *Michael Ramsden* 635
- CORPORATE HUMAN RIGHTS ACCOUNTABILITY: THE OBJECTIONS OF WESTERN  
GOVERNMENTS TO THE ALIEN TORT STATUTE *Uta Kohl* 665
- THE ALIEN TORT STATUTE AFTER *KIOBEL*: THE POSSIBILITY FOR  
UNLAWFUL ASSERTIONS OF UNIVERSAL CIVIL JURISDICITON  
STILL REMAINS *Paul David Mora* 699

## SHORTER ARTICLES

- THE WARSAW CLIMATE NEGOTIATIONS: EMERGING UNDERSTANDINGS AND  
BATTLE LINES ON THE ROAD TO THE 2015 CLIMATE  
AGREEMENT *Lavanya Rajamani* 721
- APPLICABLE LAWS TO ARBITRATION AGREEMENTS UNDER CURRENT  
ARBITRATION LAW AND PRACTICE IN MAINLAND CHINA *Fan Yang* 741
- THE PRODUCT LIABILITY SYSTEM IN CHINA: RECENT CHANGES AND  
PROSPECTS *Kristie Thomas* 755

## BOOK REVIEWS

MICHAL BOBEK <i>Comparative Reasoning in European Supreme Courts</i> (John Bell)	777
MICHAEL BYERS <i>International Law and the Arctic</i> (Andrew Serdy)	778
MICHAEL P SCHARF <i>Customary International Law in Times of Fundamental Change: Recognizing Grotian Moments</i> (James A Green)	781
H PATRICK GLENN <i>The Cosmopolitan State</i> (Emma Patrignani)	782
BOOKS RECEIVED	785