Reviews

THE PAPACY. An illustrated history, edited by Christopher Hollis. Weidenfeld and Nicolson, *£6 6s.*

Of all institutions the papacy is by far the most photogenic. It has all the advantages of history, art, architecture, dazzling display, refined showmanship and eminent personal magnetism. As a setting for a crowd, a pageant or a ceremony, how can even Versailles or the Escorial be mentioned in the same breath with St Peter's? What uniform in the world can match that of the Swiss Guards?

This book, a prize exhibit in the so-called 'coffee-table' class, is, for the pictures alone, fully worth the six guineas of its price. Between the subterranean masonry of the first pages and the glimpses of the reigning pontiff and Vatican II on the last, passes the whole kaleidoscope of the ages. Altogether, there must be between four and five hundred illustrations, including many fullpage reproductions in colour. Most of the celebrated portaits are here: Justinian in mosaic from San Vitale at Ravenna, Innocent III in two of Giotto's predelle: Boniface VIII in another of Giotto's intuitions; Pinturrichio's Alexander VI; Melozzo's Sixtus IV, Titian's Paul III (a very good plate), an unfamiliar mannerist likeness of Pius V, back to back with another unfamiliar view of the Christian fleet ready for Lepanto; Velasquez's Innocent X (another of the fifteen decisive portaits of the world); David's Pius VII. Among unusual views are two skilful plates of perspective painting, one from Sant'Ignazio the other a ceiling in the Palazzo Barberini; an early photograph of the Porta Ripetta and a petition to Clement VII by the bishops and magnates of England begging for a annulment of the marriage of Henry VIII and Katherine of Aragon. From more modern times come two fine photographs of Pio Nono, a studio

piece of Antonelli, looking curiously like his contemporary, Stonewall Jackson; immediately above, one of Victor Emmanuel looking like a comedian; a very engaging likeness of the great and saintly near-pope, omnium consensu capax imperii, Cardinal Rampolla, and a group at the signing of the Lateran Treaty in 1929 in which the Duce looks several degrees handsomer than Cardinal Gasparri, Pascal's death mask and a watercolour sketch of Pius IX driving across the piazza of St Peter's in 1855, among top-hats and crinolines, are thrown in as unexpected hors d'oeuvre. The colour plates are on the whole disappointing to those who know the originals; some of the best are the architectural views, such as the Piazza del Popolo (p. 175) and the Leonine walls (p. 166). It is a pity that the location of the works of art is rarely mentioned in the caption, and often omitted even in the list of photographic acknowledgements at the end of the book.

The letterpress in such a volume inevitably seems less significant than the illustrations. The editor has collected a varied team, almost all European or American academics of distinction, but the general result is not satisfying. The text is not as a rule linked to the illustrations, and many of the contributors have provided a section of political history too detailed for the general reader and unhelpful for the specialist. One or two strike exactly the right note - Hubert Jedin on the early Reformation, Professor Latourette and Mr E. E. Y. Hales on modern times, the editor in two chapters at the end. Professor Paolo Brazzi of Naples has three excellent sections on Roman architecture. A row of four Jesuit historians could not be expected to be fully impartial with the contro-

Reviews

versies of the seventeenth century and the suppression of the Society. *En revanche*, St Thomas Aquinas is not mentioned in the text until the pontificate of Leo XIII is reached. What is wanted is vulgarization at a high level, a well informed presentation of eras, trends and personalities. Perhaps the ideal solution to the problem of a volume such as this would be an essay of wide perspectives by a single historian, but it would not be easy to find the ideal writer. As it is, the reader can, and will, always return to the illustrations.

David Knowles

BISHOPS: THEIR STATUS AND FUNCTION, by Karl Rahner, S.J., translated by Edward Quinn. Burns and Oates, 7s 6d

This translation of a work written by Karl Rahner in 1963 is the latest addition to the valuable 'Compass' series. It is excellently produced and the translation, apart from the endless parentheses, is very clear. This does not mean to say, however, that it makes easy reading. Every sentence has relevance to the development of the argument and there are no literary flourishes. The notes are suitably relegated to the end of the book.

The work is already out of date from one point of view and ahead of its time from another. Anything written on this subject before the Third Session of Vatican II was bound to be revised and to some extent re-written post eventum. And although it is prophetic of much that has happened, it cannot give the authoritative delineation that people will want. It is surprising therefore that it should have been translated and published in England in what can only at best be an interim form.

On the other hand, the very perceptive chapter on 'The Bishop and his Priests' is only likely to be crystalized in Vatican II. And as Fr Rahner – though admittedly nearer to the Third Session of Vatican II than to subsequent councils – has proved so good a prophet of what would eventuate, we may safely assume that he is not far wide of the mark for the future when he speaks so powerfully of the collegiality of priests with their bishop.

There is much to learn anyhow from this very succinct little work. And although we shall look forward to many theological commentaries on *De Pastorali Episcoporum Munere*, we can here and now understand something of the status questionis.

Gordon Wheeler

SCHISM IN THE EARLY CHURCH by S. L. Greenslade. S C M Press, 16s.

A new paper back edition of this book is very welcome. First published in 1953, it is by way of being an ecumenical classic. Professor Greenslade speaks with the authority of historical and theological learning, yet vividly and with lucidity. He traces for us the intricate and complex history of schism in the early centuries with generosity and Christian understanding, bred of a deep concern for Christian unity. He represents what is best in the central Anglican outlook, scholarly and influenced by the evangelical tradition. He holds episcopacy to be of the *bene esse* of the Church, but not a necessity of its constitution, jure divino

The Abbot of Downside's recent book *The Idea* of *The Church*, also scholarly and equally generous in approach, is a challenge from the Roman Catholic side to the main conclusion set out by Professor Greenslade in his final chapter, under the title, 'Some Reflections on Christian Unity'. This conclusion is for the acceptance, on empirical grounds, of the Church as, alas, an externally divided entity, despite the weight of historical tradition to the contrary. The main argument for this has a theological basis in the