

in which modern man views the world is a change in the way in which he understands authority. The only essential authority which he now recognizes is that provided by the appeal to experience—not in any narrow sense of the word, but in a sense which renders it impossible any more to appeal to an authoritative past, whether enshrined in a book or in a community, to provide unquestioned and unquestionable premisses for religious argument and reflection. Everything must be made to reveal its credentials. On the other hand there is no sound reason to believe that the future of religion lies with a non-dogmatic East. Eastern religion lacks the dynamism necessary for containing and embracing the forces of technological culture. Nor is there any reason to look optimistically to the new religions which are appearing in the secular West. There seems to be no viable alternative to the renewal of Christian faith if religion is to flourish again. Obviously the author's views on these points will be contested. For example, the ardent Marxist may counter his rejection of Marxism by alleging, not without some justification, that he has depicted Marxism at its dogmatic worst, and that if he is prepared to envisage a chastened and less dogmatic Christianity he ought equally to envisage a chastened and less dogmatic Marxism. However, Marxism leaves no room for the reality of God, and belief in God's reality is the nerve-centre of Mr Edwards' own faith.

When he turns to prophecy he suggests for our consideration a new shape for the Christian Church and a new statement of Christian belief. On both counts he is guardedly optimistic. He explores a number of ways in which it may be possible 'to keep the mystery of God present to men' and discovers growing-points even in the midst of the present over-organized and over-centralized ecclesiastical structures. Together with the reality of God he emphasizes the centrality of what he calls 'the credible Christ', and from the revelation of God in Christ he draws out a double theme of hope and patience. There is much in life that is inexplicably tragic, and the prophetic emphasis on redemption by Christ's sufferings is the message which speaks strongly to this condition. But tragedy has not the final word: 'the last word is joy', and 'the cross of Jesus, seen in the Easter light, reveals the inexhaustible patience of the transcendent, and in the end victorious, God'.

In many ways Mr Edwards is a traditionalist. He is not the Dean of King's for nothing. His prophecies will be insufficiently revolutionary for some, insufficiently gloomy for others. But it would be a mistake to dismiss them simply as soothing balm and soft comfort. They reveal a sturdy faith which is unafraid of the truth and are evidence of the sources and resources of a living tradition which contains among its treasures things old and new.

PETER BAEZL

MARXISM AND BEYOND: On historical understanding and individual responsibility, by Leszek Kolakowski. *Pall Mall Press*, London. 1969. 240 pp. 40s.

The films of Polanski and Munk, the poetry of Zbigniew Herbert, even the criticism of Jan Kott, have made many aware of the cultural revival in Poland since the 1956 'October'. The accompanying philosophical mutations are less recognized. Before 1939 Poland was famous for its logical and analytical school, flanked by the phenomenology/aesthetics emphasis of Cracow and the Neo-Thomist inquiries of Lublin. Those strands continued their conversation under the blanket of official Marxism from 1949-56, and their offspring is clearly Leszek Kolakowski. Trained by Tadeusz Kotarbinski, deeply engaged in debate with Catholic philosophy in his early career (*Essays on Catholic Philosophy*, 1955), and himself a playwright and critic, Kolakowski not only symbolizes but partially provoked the Polish October.

The three earliest essays in this collection, 'Intellectuals and the Communist Movement', 'Permanent and Transitory Aspects of Marxism', and 'The Concept of the Left', were influential prompters in 1955, moving from a plea for renewed theoretical bases of Marxism to a critique of 'Office Marxism', and thence to an attempt to spell out the criteria of a true 'Left'. The second essay in particular shows Kolakowski applying to the Party a critique previously developed in relation to the Church; Catholic readers can easily re-translate. At this stage many Polish thinkers were 'living in a perpetual translation' (cf. Brandys's *Memories of the Present Time*). After Gomulka's accession, debate was far more open. The four linked articles from 1957 that, under the title 'Responsibility and History', make up a quarter of this collection, reflect immediately

Four new titles for September:

FACING THE TRUTH

Martin D'Arcy, S.J.

Unerringly Fr D'Arcy puts his finger on the urgent issues in the Church today—issues like conscience, authority, liturgy, ethics. But he writes about them with quiet wisdom and non-partisan incisiveness, in a way to bring comfort—though no false comfort—to ordinary Catholics. cloth 25s

DEATH AND THEN WHAT?

Marc Oraison

'Death? A regrettable waste of time'—that is the aphorism with which the famous French priest begins this profound and searching study of death and of the Christian attitude to death. cloth 25s

THE POOR SINNER'S GOSPEL

Wilhelm Weitling

This fascinating and moving book is the work, not of some latter-day 'left Catholic', but of the pioneer German socialist who was an older contemporary and opponent of Marx. Enjoying a new popularity in Germany, it is now published in English for the first time. cloth 40s

THE PRIESTS WHO GO

W. Quant and others

That priests are leaving in disturbing numbers is well known; why they are leaving is still too much a matter of pure conjecture. This Dutch study is perhaps the first thorough and professional inquiry into the causes of this growing pastoral problem. cloth 30s

And three important new editions:

CULTURE AND THEOLOGY

Brian Wicker Facet Books 11s

SPIRITUAL LETTERS

Abbot John Chapman, O.S.B. New Ark Library 10s

THEOLOGY AND SANITY

F. J. Sheed New Ark Library 10s

the turmoil of this period. The first takes in part the form of a dramatic dialogue, between Clerk and Anti-Clerk, who speak for opposed tendencies that preoccupy Kolakowski throughout the volume, variously formulated as ethical socialism and Stalinism, 'sterile' utopianism and 'opportunist' realism, etc. Already in 'The Concept of the Left', Kolakowski had declared: 'The intellectual and moral values of communism are not luxurious ornaments of its activity, but the conditions of its existence' (102). In the notion of ethical socialism he begins to explore directly the connexions of moral evaluation and history: 'Can we formulate a general principle regulating the interrelationship between our knowledge of historical necessity and our moral convictions? Between the world of being and the world of values?' (130). One must either accept as logically prior some moral criteria of progress, which may lead one to oppose 'history', or predefine whatever happens in history as 'progress'. Kolakowski attempts to show the practical contradiction of any anti-evaluative determinism by pointing to the normative character of negations of ethical norms; this leaves him able, with Marx (e.g. discussing the British Raj), to judge an action as morally wrong yet historically progressive; but it leaves the sources of ethical criteria still unfounded. Despite this, we must, he asserts, be communists on moral not 'theoretical' grounds: '... when we have to accompany our theories with an act of practical choice, which means a pledge, then we act out of moral motivations, not theoretical concerns... practical choice is a choice of values, that is, a moral act, and that means an act for which everyone bears his own personal responsibility' (162).

The urgency of this assertion reflects its context: 'Only on this basis were we able to try SS men.' It was in 1957 that the period of 'concentration camp literature' in Poland (it was that or silence) came to an end; but the extermination of one-fifth of Poles burned into the moral fabric of the period:

History's skeletons are recorded in round figures
A thousand and one becomes just a thousand
The odd one might never have existed
(Szyborska)

That old woman who leads a goat on a string
is more necessary and more precious
than the seven wonders of the world
whoever thinks and feels that she is not necessary
is guilty of genocide (Rozewicz)

Sheed and Ward

This agony of awareness of the individual crushed within history was still the context for the appearance of Sartre's 'Marxism and Existentialism' (i.e. *Questions de Méthode*) in a special number of *Tworczosc* in 1957, and for Kolakowski's and Schaff's reactions. 'Everyone can if he wishes interpret himself historically and unearth the determining factors that made him what he is—his past—but he cannot do the same for the self he has not yet become' (176)—that self is an existential choice.

What that period of confused cross-fertilization had 'not yet become' is indicated in the two most recent essays in the collection. 'In Praise of Inconsistency' argues for an acceptance of the humanly necessary gap between belief and behaviour; the alternative is the logical fanaticism of Stalinism or the Final Solution. 'The Priest and the Jester' also eventually asserts the necessity of de-absolutizing allegiances, but in the first part of this essay—perhaps the most striking in the volume—Kolakowski circles back to his pre-1955 preoccupations, not now polemically but with an awareness that the old theological problems (nature/grace; faith/reason; incarnation; revelation; trinity and person) are pre-forms of the real questions engaged with in the intervening years in political-ethical areas. Kolakowski thus finds himself thinking alongside colleagues in Poland (Malewska, Mazowiecki) and Czechoslovakia (Machovec, Prucha) more directly involved in the Christian-Marxist dialogue.

The problem of locating ethical criteria remains (for both). In 'Responsibility and History', one response was to ask for simple

acceptance of the social fact of moral evaluations, as a co-determining factor in current political stance. In 'Karl Marx and the Classical Definition of Truth' (1958) this is explored further in an interesting examination of the epistemological grounds of the 1844 *EPM*. Kolakowski's recent work, particularly his major book *Religious Consciousness and Church Affiliation* (1965), has developed this strand towards a sociology of ideology—and again the parallel with Christian exploration is revealing. While Schaff has also developed from the 1957 breakthrough, with books on existentialism, semantics and language, leading to his explosive *Marxism and the Human Individual* (1965), Kolakowski seems uniquely to fuse both that development and the current movement within Christian theology. George Vass, S.J., commented of the Marienbad Paulusgesellschaft meeting: 'While the progressive Marxist philosophers try to work out the transcendent meaning of human life, Christian theologians are preoccupied in defining the historical role of their beliefs and institutions in an immanent perspective.' Kolakowski's stature is indicated by his deep concern with both.

One hopes that this collection will usher in English publication of his other work (*The Alienation of Reason* is already available in a U.S. edition). Perhaps with the next collection the editors will indicate chronology more adequately: the essays in this volume are best read, not as printed, but in the sequence indicated above, as a developing engagement with different forms of basic human questions. But in whatever order, they should, emphatically, be read.

BERNARD SHARRATT

DEPTH PSYCHOLOGY AND A NEW ETHIC, by Erich Neumann, tr. Eugene Rolfe. *Hodder and Stoughton*, London. 1969. 158 pp. 42s.

Neumann conceived this book during World War II. It was first published in German in 1949. By this time mankind was already becoming agonizedly aware of the fact that the shadow of self-obliteration hung more darkly than ever over the whole world. And it was apparent that the old ethics of Christianity, Mohammedanism and other great religions had proved themselves incapable of mastering the destructive forces in man. Neumann, a follower of Jung, finds the only possible solution to the human dilemma in the analytical depth psychology of Jung, whose far-reaching researches into the conscious and unconscious mind of man show him to be essentially a self-creative being, driven by an inner urge to find

his own wholeness. For Jung this entails establishing a relationship with his personal totality, and with Jung's particular image of God. Though no Christian could accept this image, he can still, in his own context, agree with the assertion that the first need of the human soul is for God; and that this need is experienced at every level of the psyche. But this is far from being the only content of the psyche. Man has also to face up to the fact that the world, nature and the human soul are also the scene of a perpetual rebirth of evil. Only if man can accept this side of himself, and endure the tension and the suffering of being crucified between these opposites, can he find his salvation, and avoid being overwhelmed by