

## FORMULAE FOR NUMERICAL DIFFERENTIATION

By W. G. BICKLEY.

In a recent paper (1) formulae were given for the numerical integration of a function in terms of its values at a set of arguments at equal intervals. In this companion paper, formulae for numerical differentiation, using the same data, are collected. Their utility in enabling derivatives of a function given numerically at such a set of arguments to be computed is obvious, the need arises in several approximate methods which are coming more and more into use (2), (3). The formulae avoid the labour of preliminary differencing, and are indeed more convenient than the finite difference formulae when the derivative is required at all the points of subdivision of a limited range.

*Notation.*

If  $y=f(x)$  is a function of  $x$ , the value of  $y$  at  $x_p = x_0 + ph$  will be denoted by  $y_p$ ;  $h$  is the tabular interval, and  $p$  will (almost everywhere) denote an integer. With  $D$  denoting the differential operator,  $D^m y_p$  will denote the  $m$ th derivative of  $y$  at  $x_p$ .

*Basic formula and description of Tables (pp. 22-27).*

The Tables give, for a set of values of the various parameters, the numerical values of  ${}_{mn}A_{pr}$  and  ${}_{mn}E_p$  in the formula

$$\frac{h^m D^m y_p}{m!} = \frac{1}{n!} \sum_{r=0}^n {}_{mn}A_{pr} y_r + {}_{mn}E_p.$$

(In the Tables, the suffixes  $m$ ,  $n$ , and  $p$  are dropped,  $A_r$  and  $E$  simply being sufficient, since  $m$ ,  $n$ , and  $p$  are explicitly given.)  $E$  is the "error" term, and is normally a multiple of  $h^{n+1} D^{n+1} y(X)$ , where  $X$  is some (unspecified) value of  $x$  between  $x_0$  and  $x_n$ . Occasionally  $E$  is of a higher order, such cases are clearly indicated.

For  $n=2(1)6$  the complete set of coefficients (*i.e.*,  $p=0(1)n=m$ ) is given; for  $n=8$  and  $10$  advantage is taken of the symmetry of these matrices to save space. Also, in the latter cases, coefficients for the first four derivatives only are given; if higher derivatives are required they may be obtained by repeated applications of the formula. For instance,  $D^6y$  can be computed by first finding  $D^4y_p = z_p$  for  $p=0(1)n$ , and then computing  $D^2z_p$ .

*Calculation and checking of coefficients.*

It is clear that the  $A$  are multiples of the derivatives of the Lagrangian interpolation polynomials for the values  $x_p$  of  $x$ . For  $n=2(1)6$  the coefficients were in fact calculated from these polynomials. For  $n=7(1)10$  use was made of the formula

$${}_{mn}A_{pr} = n_m, {}_{n-1}A_{pr} + (-)^{n-r} \binom{n}{r} {}_{mn}A_{pn}.$$

The value of  ${}_{mn}A_{pr}$  were obtained from tables prepared in connection with another investigation.

This formula was also used to check the coefficients for  $n=2(1)6$ . For  $n=8$  and 10 (in calculating which the values for 7 and 9 had also to be obtained) the symmetry (or anti-symmetry) of the complete matrices was an almost conclusive check—after the few errors which it disclosed had been corrected, no further error was detected.

Finally, the proofs have been checked by means of the equations

$$\sum_{r=0}^n {}_{mn}A_{pr} = 0, \quad \sum_{r=0}^n r_{mn}A_{pr} = \begin{cases} n! & (m=1) \\ 0 & (m>1) \end{cases},$$

which are the results of applying the formulae to the functions  $y=1$  and  $y=x$  with  $h=1$ .

The author wishes to thank Dr. J. C. P. Miller for an additional check.

#### *A further application of the formulae.*

The author's original idea as to the use of these formulae was their application to the step-by-step numerical integration of differential equations. Choosing  $n$  and  $h$  so that the error term is sufficiently small to justify the expectation that the desired degree of accuracy may be achieved, suppose that  $y_0, y_1, \dots, y_{n-1}$  have been determined (e.g., by Maclaurin's series). The successive derivatives of  $y$  at  $x_n$  are expressed in terms of  $y_0, y_1, \dots, y_n$ , and these expressions are substituted in the differential equation, which thereby becomes an algebraic equation for  $y_n$ .

Having thus determined  $y_n$ , we use  $y_1, y_2, \dots, y_n$  to determine  $y_{n+1}, \dots$ , and so on.

The method is susceptible of elaboration and refinement, but we content ourselves here with a crude application to a very simple differential equation, namely to approximate to  $e^x$  as a solution of the equation  $Dy=y$ , taking  $h=0.1$ .

By 3-1-3,

$$0.1Dy_3 = (11y_3 - 18y_2 + 9y_1 - 2y_0)/6$$

or, since  $Dy_3 = y_3$ ,

$$10.4y_3 = 18y_2 - 9y_1 + 2y_0.$$

Similarly,  $10.4y_4 = 18y_3 - 9y_2 + 2y_1$ ,  
and so on.

If we apply the more accurate formula 4-1-4, we find

$$47.6y_4 = 96y_3 - 72y_2 + 32y_1 - 6y_0.$$

A start was made by use of the eight decimal values of  $e^x$  obtained from tables ; they are given in column 1. Columns 2 and 3

give the results of successive applications of 3-1-3 and 4-1-4 respectively

$x$	1 $e^x$	2 3-1-3	3 4-1-4
0.0	1.00000 000		
0.1	1.10517 092		
0.2	1.22140 276		
0.3	1.34985 881	1.34987 610	
0.4	1.49182 470	1.49187 373	1.49182 598
0.5	1.64872 127	1.64881 228	1.64872 527
0.6	1.82211 880	1.82226 054	1.82212 648
0.7	2.01375 271	2.01395 449	2.01376 473
0.8	2.22554 093	2.22581 352	2.22555 800
0.9	2.45960 311	2.45995 904	2.45962 612
1.0	2.71828 183	2.71873 558	2.71831 185

Enough decimals have been carried to ensure that the error is not obscured by "rounding-off errors". With 4-1-4, the error  $E$  at any stage is less than  $10^{-5}y_n/5$ —since  $D^5y = y$ —so that the sum of the errors due to the steps from  $y_4$  to  $y_{10}$  is less than

$$\frac{1}{5} \times \frac{24}{47.6} \times 10^{-5} \sum_4^{10} y_n = 1.44 \times 10^{-5}$$

The actual error at  $x = 1.0$  turns out to be about double this,

$$(3.0 \dots \times 10^{-5}).$$

The discrepancy is due, of course, to the cumulative effect of the errors of the approximation made in previous lines. It is possible to obtain a check which will indicate roughly the amount of the error at each stage, and so to correct it, and the elaborated and refined—but more laborious—procedure can be expected to give considerably reduced errors.

#### REFERENCES.

- (1) W. G. Bickley, "Formulae for Numerical Integration". *Math. Gazette*, XXIII, pp. 352-359, Oct. 1939.
- (2) K. N. E. Bradfield and R. V. Southwell, "Relaxation Methods Applied to Engineering Problems". *Proc. Roy. Soc., A*, 161, pp. 155-181, July 1937.
- (3) P. D. Crout, "An Application of Polynomial Approximation to the Solution of Integral Equations arising in Physical Problems". *J. Math. and Phys.*, XIX, pp. 34-91, Jan. 1940. (Crout gives coefficients for  $m = 1, 2$ , and 3, with  $n = 2, 4$ , and 6.)

---

While stocks last, copies of this paper, and of the companion paper "Formulae for Numerical Integration" (*Math. Gazette*, XXIII, pp. 352-359, Oct. 1939), can be obtained from the author, Dr W G. Bickley, 27, Cuckoo Hill, Pinner, Middlesex, at a small charge to defray the cost of postage and off-prints, namely, 4d. per copy, or 4 copies for 1s., post free.

$n$	$m$	$p$	$A_0$	$A_1$	$A_2$	$A_3$	$E$
2	1	0	-3	4	-1		+1/3 . $h^3 f^{111}$
		1	-1	0	1		-1/6
		2	1	-4	3		+1/3
2	2	0	1	-2	1		-1/2
		1	1	-2	1		-1/24 . $h^4 f^{1V}$
		2	1	-2	1		+1/2 . $h^3 f^{111}$
3	1	0	-11	18	-9	2	-1/4 . $h^4 f^{1V}$
		1	-2	-3	6	-1	+1/12
		2	1	-6	3	2	-1/12
		3	-2	9	-18	11	+1/4
3	2	0	6	-15	12	-3	+11/24
		1	3	-6	3	0	-1/24
		2	0	3	-6	3	-1/24
		3	-3	12	-15	6	+11/24
3	3	0	-1	3	-3	1	-1/4
		1	-1	3	-3	1	-1/12
		2	-1	3	-3	1	+1/12
		3	-1	3	-3	1	+1/4

$n$	$m$	$p$	$A_0$	$A_1$	$A_2$	$A_3$	$A_4$	$E$
4	1	0	-50	96	-72	32	-6	+1/5 . $h^5 f^V$
		1	-6	-20	36	-12	2	-1/20
		2	2	-16	0	16	-2	+1/30
		3	-2	12	-36	20	6	-1/20
		4	6	-32	72	-96	50	+1/5
4	2	0	35	-104	114	-56	11	-5/12
		1	11	-20	6	4	-1	+1/24
		2	-1	16	-30	16	-1	+1/180 . $h^6 f^{V1}$
		3	-1	4	6	-20	11	-1/24 . $h^5 f^V$
		4	11	-56	114	-104	35	+5/12
4	3	0	-10	36	-48	28	-6	+7/24
		1	-6	20	-24	12	-2	+1/24
		2	-2	4	0	-4	2	-1/24
		3	2	-12	24	-20	6	+1/24
		4	6	-28	48	-36	10	+7/24
4	4	0	1	-4	6	-4	1	-1/12
		1	1	-4	6	-4	1	-1/24
		2	1	-4	6	-4	1	-1/144 . $h^6 f^{V1}$
		3	1	-4	6	-4	1	+1/24 . $h^5 f^V$
		4	1	-4	6	-4	1	+1/12

<i>n</i>	<i>m</i>	<i>p</i>	<i>A</i> <sub>0</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>1</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>2</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>3</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>4</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>6</sub>	<i>E</i>
5	1	0	-274	600	-600	400	-150	24	-1/6. <i>h</i> <sup>6</sup> <i>f</i> v1
		1	-24	-130	240	-120	40	-6	+1/30
		2	6	-60	-40	120	-30	4	-1/60
		3	-4	30	-120	40	60	-6	+1/60
		4	6	-40	120	-240	130	24	-1/30
		5	-24	150	-400	600	-600	274	+1/6
5	2	0	225	-770	1070	-780	305	-50	+137/360
		1	50	-75	-20	70	-30	5	-13/360
		2	-5	80	-150	80	-5	0	+1/180
		3	0	-5	80	-150	80	-5	+1/180
		4	5	-30	70	-20	-75	50	-13/360
		5	-50	305	-780	1070	-770	225	+137/360
5	3	0	-85	355	-590	490	-205	35	-5/16
		1	-35	125	-170	110	-35	5	-1/48
		2	-5	-5	50	-70	35	-5	+1/48
		3	5	-35	70	-50	5	5	-1/48
		4	-5	35	-110	170	-125	35	+1/48
		5	-35	205	-490	590	-355	85	+5/16
5	4	0	15	-70	130	-120	55	-10	+17/144
		1	10	-45	80	-70	30	-5	+5/144
		2	5	-20	30	-20	5	0	-1/144
		3	0	5	-20	30	-20	5	-1/144
		4	-5	30	-70	80	-45	10	+5/144
		5	-10	55	-120	130	-70	15	+17/144
5	5	0	-1	5	-10	10	-5	1	-1/48
		1	-1	5	-10	10	-5	1	-1/80
		2	-1	5	-10	10	-5	1	-1/240
		3	-1	5	-10	10	-5	1	+1/240
		4	-1	5	-10	10	-5	1	+1/80
		5	-1	5	-10	10	-5	1	+1/48

<i>n</i>	<i>m</i>	<i>p</i>	<i>A</i> <sub>0</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>1</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>2</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>3</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>4</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>5</sub>	<i>A</i> <sub>6</sub>	<i>E</i>
6	1	0	-1764	4320	-5400	4800	-2700	864	-120	+1/7 . <i>h</i> <sup>7</sup> <i>f</i> <sup>vii</sup>
		1	-120	-924	1800	-1200	600	-180	24	-1/42
		2	24	-288	-420	960	-360	96	-12	+1/105
		3	-12	108	-540	0	540	-108	12	-1/140
		4	12	-96	360	-960	420	288	-24	+1/105
		5	-24	180	-600	1200	-1800	924	120	-1/42
6	2	6	120	-864	2700	-4800	5400	-4320	1764	+1/7
		0	1624	-6264	10530	-10160	5940	-1944	274	-7/20
		1	274	-294	-510	940	-570	186	-26	+11/360
		2	-26	456	-840	400	30	-24	4	-1/180
		3	4	-54	540	-980	540	-54	4	-1/1120 <i>h</i> <sup>8</sup> <i>f</i> <sup>viii</sup>
		4	4	-24	30	400	-840	456	-26	+1/180 <i>h</i> <sup>7</sup> <i>f</i> <sup>vii</sup>
6	3	5	-26	186	-570	940	-510	-294	274	-11/360
		6	274	-1944	5940	-10160	10530	-6264	1624	+7/20
		0	-735	3480	-6915	7440	-4605	1560	-225	+29/90
		1	-225	840	-1245	960	-435	120	-15	+7/720
		2	-15	-120	525	-720	435	-120	15	-1/90
		3	15	-120	195	0	-195	120	-15	+7/720
6	4	4	-15	120	-435	720	-525	120	15	-1/90
		5	15	-120	435	-960	1245	-840	225	+7/720
		6	225	-1560	4605	-7440	6915	-3480	735	+29/90
		0	175	-930	2055	-2420	1605	-570	85	-7/48
		1	85	-420	855	-920	555	-180	25	-1/36
		2	25	-90	105	-20	-45	30	-5	+1/144
6	5	3	-5	60	-195	280	-195	60	-5	+7/5760 <i>h</i> <sup>8</sup> <i>f</i> <sup>viii</sup>
		4	-5	30	-45	-20	105	-90	25	-1/144 <i>h</i> <sup>7</sup> <i>f</i> <sup>vii</sup>
		5	25	-180	555	-920	855	-420	85	+1/36
		6	85	-570	1605	-2420	2055	-930	175	+7/48
		0	-21	120	-285	360	-255	96	-15	+5/144
		1	-15	84	-195	240	-165	60	-9	+1/72
6	6	2	-9	48	-105	120	-75	24	-3	+1/720
		3	-3	12	-15	0	15	-12	3	-1/360
		4	3	-24	75	-120	105	-48	9	+1/720
		5	9	-60	165	-240	195	-84	15	+1/72
		6	15	-96	255	-360	285	-120	21	+5/144
		0	1	-6	15	-20	15	-6	1	-1/240
6	7	1	1	-6	15	-20	15	-6	1	-1/360
		2	1	-6	15	-20	15	-6	1	-1/720
		3	1	-6	15	-20	15	-6	1	-1/2880 <i>h</i> <sup>8</sup> <i>f</i> <sup>viii</sup>
		4	1	-6	15	-20	15	-6	1	+1/720 <i>h</i> <sup>7</sup> <i>f</i> <sup>vii</sup>
		5	1	-6	15	-20	15	-6	1	+1/360
		6	1	-6	15	-20	15	-6	1	+1/240

$n$	$m$	$p$	$A_0$	$A_1$	$A_2$	$A_3$	$A_4$	$E$
8	1	0	-1 09584	3 22560	-5 64480	7 52640	-7 05600	8 + 1/9 . $h^9 f_{\text{fix}}$
		1	-5 040	-6 4224	1 41120	-1 41120	1 17600	7 - 1/72
		2	720	-11 520	-3 8304	8 0640	-5 0400	6 + 1/252
		3	-240	2880	-20 160	-18 144	5 0400	5 - 1/504
		4	144	-1 536	8 064	-3 2256	0 4	+ 1/630
		5	-144	1 440	-6 720	2 0160	-5 0400	3 - 1/504
		6	240	-2 304	1 0080	-2 6880	5 0400	2 + 1/252
		7	-720	6 720	-2 8224	7 0560	-1 17600	1 - 1/72
		8	5040	-4 6080	1 88160	-4 51584	7 05600	0 + 1/9
	3	0	-6 7284	3 90880	-10 27768	16 06752	-16 31840	8 + 29531/90720
		1	-13 132	5 0904	-8 1872	7 5320	-4 7880	7 - 1/5670
		2	-140	-11 872	4 5864	-7 0112	5 7680	6 - 331/90720
		3	252	-2 408	-2 800	2 4696	-3 8360	5 + 59/22680
		4	-196	2 016	-9 464	1 3664	0 4	-41/18144
		5	196	-1 960	9 072	-2 5928	3 8360	3 + 59/22680
		6	-252	2 464	-1 1032	3 0240	-5 7680	2 - 331/90720
		7	140	-1 512	7 504	-2 2792	4 7880	1 - 1/5670
		8	13132	-1 18048	4 71240	-10 95584	16 31840	0 + 29531/90720
			$-A_8$	$-A_7$	$-A_6$	$-A_5$	$-A_4$	$p$
$n$	$m$	$p$	$A_0$	$A_1$	$A_2$	$A_3$	$A_4$	$E$
8	2	0	1 18124	-5 54112	12 51936	-17 94688	17 41320	8 - 761/2520 $h^9 f_{\text{fix}}$
		1	13068	512	-8 3664	1 54224	-1 48120	7 + 223/10080
		2	-1044	22464	-3 7072	4032	22680	6 - 19/5040
		3	188	-2 736	29232	-5 2864	27720	5 + 1/1120
		4	-36	512	-4 032	3 2256	-5 7400	4 + 1/6300 $h^{10} f_{\text{fix}}$
		5	-36	288	-784	-1 008	27720	3 - 1/1120 $h^9 f_{\text{fix}}$
		6	188	-1 728	7056	-1 6576	22680	2 + 19/5040
		7	-1044	9584	-3 9312	9 4752	-1 48120	1 - 223/10080
		8	13068	-1 18056	4 80032	-11 37024	17 41320	0 + 761/2520
	4	0	22449	-1 47392	4 28092	-7 20384	7 69510	8 - 89/480
		1	6769	-3 8472	96292	-1 40504	1 32510	7 - 101/5760
		2	889	-1 232	-6 468	2 616	-2 8490	6 + 13/2880
		3	-231	2968	-9 548	1 2936	-7 490	5 - 7/5760
		4	49	-672	4 732	-1 3664	1 9110	4 - 41/181440 . $h^{10} f_{\text{fix}}$
		5	49	-392	1 092	616	-7 490	3 + 7/5760 . $h^9 f_{\text{fix}}$
		6	-231	2128	-8 708	2 0496	-2 8490	2 - 13/2880
		7	889	-8 232	3 4132	-8 3384	1 32510	1 + 101/5760
		8	6769	-6 0032	2 35452	-5 34464	7 69510	0 + 89/480
			$A_8$	$A_7$	$A_6$	$A_5$	$A_4$	$p$

$n$	$m$	$p$	$A_0$	$A_1$	$A_2$	$A_3$	$A_4$	$A_5$	$E$
10	0	-10628840	36288000	-81648000	145152000	-190512000	18891520	10	+1/11·hni xi
	1	-362880	-6636960	16329600	-21772800	25401600	-22861440	9	-1/110
	2	40320	-806400	-44193600	9676800	-8467200	6773760	8	+1/495
	3	-10680	151200	-1360800	-2756160	6350400	-3810240	7	-1/1320
	4	4320	-57600	388800	-2973600	-1330560	4354560	6	+1/2310
	5	-2880	36000	-216000	864000	-3024000	0	-1/2772	
	6	2880	-34560	194400	-691200	1814400	-4354560	4	+1/2310
	7	-4320	50400	-272160	907200	-2116800	3810240	3	-1/1320
	8	10980	-115200	604800	-1935360	4233600	-6773760	2	+1/495
	9	-40320	453600	-2332800	7257600	-15240960	22881440	1	-1/110
10	3	62880	-4032000	20412000	-62208000	12708000	-182891520	0	+1/11
	0	-8409500	57537360	-187795260	384555840	-541968840	542959200	10	+16103/50400
	1	-1172700	4490200	-6961140	5700240	-2435160	-181440	9	-4111200
	2	8540	-1266640	4959900	-8370240	8518440	-6380640	8	-593/453600
	3	7900	-78360	-832140	3656400	-5763240	4868640	7	+263/302400
	4	-5340	66640	-3720600	48960	1894200	-3296160	6	-13/21600
	5	4100	-50440	292140	-1048560	1401960	0	+479/907200	
	6	-4300	49200	-275940	968640	-2401560	3296160	4	-13/21600
	7	5340	-62280	342900	-1157040	2730840	-4868640	3	+263/302400
	8	-7900	92240	-497340	1646400	-3764040	6380640	2	-593/453600
10	9	-8540	866040	-3774460	911760	-1171800	181440	1	-41/11200
	10	1172700	-12908240	64584540	-193872960	387902760	-542959200	0	+16103/50400
			$-A_{10}$	$-A_9$	$-A_8$	$-A_7$	$-A_6$	$-A_5$	$p$

$n$	$m$	$p$	$A_0$	$A_1$	$A_2$	$A_3$	$A_4$	$A_5$	$E$
10	0	127 53576	-699 98400	1983 20400	-3767 61600	5103 75600	-4991 05152	10	$-671/2520 \cdot h^{11} f_{xi}$
	1	10 26576	14 61240	-155 36720	289 35360	-379 91520	360 97488	9	$+419/25200$
	2	-69264	17 88480	-23 48280	-21 08160	60 7840	-59 91552	8	$-31/12600$
	3	11016	-1 90440	23 94360	-41 65920	15 27120	9 88848	7	$+29/50400$
	4	-2664	40320	-3 36960	28 33920	-50 45940	27 57888	6	$-1/6300$
	5	576	-9000	72000	-4 32000	30 24000	-53 11152	5	$-1/33264$
	6	576	-5760	22680	-23040	-2 41920	27 57888	4	$+1/6300$
	7	-2664	29880	-1 52280	4 62240	-9 02160	9 88848	3	$-29/50400$
	8	11016	-1 23840	6 35760	-19 69920	40 97520	-59 91552	2	$+31/12600$
	9	-69264	7 72920	-39 33360	120 64320	-248 2740	360 97488	1	$-419/25200$
10	10	26576	-113 61600	572 34600	-1733 18400	3508 34400	-4991 05152	0	$+671/2520$
	0	34 16930	-265 57640	953 16120	-2081 94720	3060 06540	-3152 46960	10	$-7645/36288$
	1	7 23680	-45 43550	132 44760	-240 91080	306 19680	-283 33020	9	$-2041/181440$
	2	50840	-17 47350	48 36160	-73 13880	71 31000	8	$+167/60480$	
	3	-12790	1 91530	-5 39010	3 63000	6 33460	-14 04900	7	$-277/362880$
	4	3590	-52280	3 88980	-11 3360	15 47700	-10 23120	6	$+41/181440$
	5	-820	12610	-97380	5 24280	-14 01960	19 26540	5	$+479/10886400$
	6	-820	8200	-32490	37920	2 53680	-10 23120	4	$-41/181440$
	7	3590	-40310	2 05650	-6 24840	12 22020	-14 04900	3	$+277/362880$
	8	-12790	1 44280	-7 43760	23 16000	-48 45540	71 31000	2	$-167/60480$
10	9	50840	-5 72030	29 40480	-91 32360	190 93200	-283 33620	1	$+2041/181440$
	10	7 23680	-79 09640	392 30370	-1164 66720	2296 82040	-3152 46960	0	$+7645/36288$
			$-A_{10}$	$A_9$	$A_8$	$A_7$	$A_4$	$A_6$	$p$