

BLACKFRIARS

States, of the Renaissance in Italy and Humanism throughout Europe, and the survey is concluded by the presentation of the social development of Europe at the end of the Middle Ages (pp. 415-734). Good maps are of great help in following the history of these two sections.

The last hundred pages are devoted to the ancient and mediæval Philosophy and committed to Professor A. E. Taylor (pp. 739-845). What he has to say on Greek philosophy is, as was to be expected, eminently accurate; but the account of mediæval philosophy is far too brief—barely forty pages including even the Patristic period. It is not to be wondered, therefore, that it is too schematic and rather a mere catalogue of some features of Scholasticism. But we admire the skill and consummate art of Prof. Taylor in succeeding to condense many facts in such a small space. He acknowledges his special debt for parts of this section to the various works of Prof. E. Gilson. We understand however that Prof. Gilson has modified many of the views which he had expressed in his *Philosophie au Moyen Age*.

Repetition is almost inevitable in a work like this written by various contributors. Further, several slips have crept in here and there. We note one in particular, which we have already noticed in works otherwise quite accurate. On p. 244 Joachim of Flora is presented as the most prominent member produced by the party of Spiritual Franciscans who resisted the organization begun by Elias, whereas it is well known that Joachim had died in 1202.

D. A. CALLUS, O.P.

NOTICES

VIE INTERIEURE. By the Abbé Jacques Leclercq. (Editions de la Cité Chrétienne, Bruxelles; 27 B. frs.)

This is the third of a series of essays on Catholic morality in which the Abbé Leclercq is giving a readable exposition of the Christian conception of life, based on faith and reason and issuing in perfection. Apart from the introductory chapter, and chapters each on external activity and the Holy Eucharist, the present essay of 400 pages is entirely devoted to prayer in all its forms. The Abbé has an historical sense, and he writes with clearness and insight, giving a balanced survey of modern tendencies and movements. But he is inclined sometimes to over-emphasize dubious psychological effects of Catholic practices, and there are departures from the general high standard of his work. In the chapter on *Action* we are told that external activity, apostolic, charitable or professional, is a means of perfection for many, sometimes even the principal one; but the spiritual value

NOTICES

of this activity is envisaged mainly from a psychological angle, and there is no mention of the merit which makes work done for the love of God a direct means of spiritual progress. The doctrine of the efficaciousness of prayer is insufficiently stated. It would hardly be an adequate description even of the meritorious value which prayer has in common with every other supernaturally virtuous act to say that it was a drawing down of the Divine good-will, but to limit the effect of prayer to the attraction of God's favour, as the author does, is to rob prayer of its special impetratory value. One consequence is that the suggested justification of prayers to the Saints falls short of the full doctrine of Trent. Fr. Garrigou-Lagrange will be a little surprised to find himself quoted as agreeing that infused contemplation differs only in degree from ordinary prayer. B. O'D.

CATHOLICISM AND SCOTLAND. By Compton Mackenzie. (Routledge; 5/-.)

The traditions of a Scottish Catholicism having survived so much political and economic change were almost submerged beneath the tidal waves of Irish immigration. It is opportune that they should be restated by a Scottish nationalist. Mr. Compton Mackenzie has written a study of the past relations between Scotland and the Church. It is inevitably compressed, for 1,200 years are covered by 180 pages, and at times the clear flexible prose and the convincing sincerity seem accompanied by some foreshortening of perspective. The post-Reformation period would seem to be studied from beyond the Highland line and there is an attempt to estimate in detail the causes of the Catholic survivals to the east and south; the fitful significance of the Drummonds or of the Ogilvies or the life around Terregles or Traquair. Yet such influences were to create the Lowland Catholicism of the late eighteenth century, represented and perpetuated by Bishop Hay. Something of the same simplification marks the section upon the sixteenth century. It is tenable that Cardinal Beaton was a great patriot as well as a great ecclesiastic and that Mary of Guise had a character of singular beauty, but the essential astringent quality of John Knox is hardly conveyed by the terms "cowardly" and "weak." Still some simplification was unavoidable; this study is an essay rather than a chronicle. As an essay it possesses a considerable and perhaps a permanent value, for it helps to emphasize that there can be no necessary conflict between Catholicism and Scottish nationalism. In Scotland, as in France and Ireland, Catholicism may stress rather than erase the traits of a purely national culture. G. M.

BLACKFRIARS

SAINT THOMAS: SOMME THEOLOGIQUE: L'AU DELA (Suppl., QQ. 69-74). Traduction française par J. D. Folghera, O.P. Notes et Appendices par J. Wébert, O.P. Parallel Latin and French texts. (Editions de la Revue des Jeunes. Desclée et Cie; 10 frs.)

With the *Summa*, where every article is a gold-mine and every reply a gem, it is a great pity that none of the present texts—especially small editions such as this one, carefully designed for convenience and clarity—should not show a more intelligible spacing of the parts. Even wide separation of objections and replies from the body of each article, and of these among themselves, at cost to the size of type if necessary, would be a material help in nowise to be scorned on account of its materiality. Any one who works through the text of the *Summa*, day after day, knows the preciousness of such material helps.

That is the sole manifest criticism of this carefully prepared, and excellently annotated and indexed, text. Indeed it is the best of the small "pocket" texts we have seen. And the translating is extremely well done. N. D.

NOTRE BAPTEME D'APRES SAINT PAUL. By A. Lemonnier, O.P. (Editions de la Revue des Jeunes. Desclée et Cie; 5 frs.)

A co-ordination and massing of New Testament sources, at once beautiful and strong. The treatment is exegetical and theological: positive and speculative elements interplay with striking vitality—the living unity of real Theology.

Incorporation into the Mystical Body of Christ, through the transforming breath of His Spirit. Crucifixion of ourselves with Him. New life and the pledge of glory. Such is Liturgy in its widest, deepest source, in its origin in the order of its generation—Baptism.

Incidentally, work of this character constitutes most precious, if only incidental and elementary, apologetic. The very treatment and ordering of texts shows Paul in real dependence on, and living doctrinal touch with, Christ. His conversion is motivated by the hypnotic strength and majesty of the Man Christ, known, loved, held. Hence one of those bridges from Paul to Jesus, on which even a Schweitzer has never laid his hands, however far they widened the illusory "gap." N. D.

ROME FROM WITHIN. Selden P. Delany. (Bruce Publishing Co., Milwaukee; G. E. J. Coldwell, London; \$2.00 or 8/6.)

Neither the seamy side of Rome nor the ruminations of an apostate—despite the title—but an extremely engaging sample of what apologetic writing should be. The author himself called it "an essay in appreciation, an attempt to appraise some of the positive values of the Church . . ."—a refreshing change from

NOTICES

the personal reminiscences of so many conversion narratives. Details:—it is tantalizing for the ordinary reader to be told that the explanation of transubstantiation “presents no difficulty for anyone who understands the meaning of the word ‘substance’ as used in scholastic philosophy” (p. 92). As regards the Latin Vulgate, the Church has done more than declared that it is “the official text for liturgical use” (p. 151). The author is enthusiastic about the “Louvain School” of scholastic philosophers; but one doubts whether Father Garrigou-Lagrange and M. Maritain would look upon themselves as protagonists of neo-scholasticism (p. 155). But it is perhaps ungracious to note such points in a book that is redolent of Christian charity and eminently suitable for lending to non-Catholic friends. R. D. P.

THE PLAY

The four plays of Ibsen’s full maturity of thought, which have been running at the CRITERION THEATRE, must to many of us bring a strangely different impression from what they made in his lifetime. Then Ibsen appeared as the dramatist of positivism, the exponent of social theses to be hotly debated. To-day he lives as a superb craftsman, but still more as a poet, one like Matthew Arnold,

Wandering between two worlds, one dead,
The other powerless to be born.

There seems indeed a conflict in him between inspiration and theory; there is an undercurrent of prophetic insight, like a music drowning the spoken words, freeing what in one sense must now appear as “period” plays from the narrower limits of space or time. Like Shakespeare in his darker moods, Ibsen seems haunted by a sense of vast destruction and frustration, stretching far beyond the society he actually portrays. What emerges seems indeed almost to run counter to what he intended, and where his contemporaries hailed materialistic determinism, heredity (his King Charles’ Head), or what not, we feel the impact of spiritual forces. Nietzsche’s ideas allured him, but his would-be supermen are overthrown, not by “sickly conscience” as he would have us believe, or by tradition in the blood, but like Lucifer in Meredith’s sonnet, by “the army of unalterable law.” Just as in *Emperor and Galilean* (to Ibsen’s own mind his magnum opus), Julian the Apostate becomes the tool of the “World-will” for the purification of Christianity, Rosmer and Rebecca seek expiation in suicide, and the Master Builder falls like Prometheus from his aspiring tower.

The Dolls’ House belongs to an earlier, naturalistic period. But *Rosmersholm*, for all the brilliant individuation of its characters and its Norwegian atmosphere, may seem now an ominous mirror held up to the world at large, the tragedy of the idealists, who

BLACKFRIARS

having lost their faith in God, lose faith also in the ideals to which they cling (freedom, the dignity of man, the ennoblement of the people, Christian ideals, like flowers cut from their roots and therefore bound to wither), and can find no issue but death.

In *Hedda Gabbler* again, while ambitious, dominating Hedda, who, like Rebecca, would mould a man's soul to "greatness," brings destruction and perishes, one is left with the sense that what remain and count are the little, humble virtues—good, plodding Tesman, foolish little Thea, and Tesman's aunt, who, when her invalid sister dies, must seek some other poor soul who needs tending. And yet again, in the *Master Builder*, Hilda Wangel, speaking like the others with the voice of the Tempter, "ye shall be as gods," is destructive of what she would create. But in the *Master Builder*, who abandoned building churches to build homes for human beings, and now yearned to build a house indeed, but with a pinnacle stretching upward into heaven, Ibsen portrayed something of himself, consciously, and yet, still more, unconsciously. "He could not climb as high as he could build." He could build higher than he could climb; it is that that gives his plays their life for us to-day.

The performance of the *Master Builder* was less convincing than that of the other plays; there seemed a clash between the symbolic plane and the actual; it was more impressive in memory (when the symbol made the dominant pattern) than when it was being played before one's eyes, and Lydia Lopokova, admirable actress though she is, was not equal to making Hilda fully credible. Whereas *Rosmersholm* in the last act seemed to pass imperceptibly from fact to symbol as though by a change of key, preventing all questioning of probable or improbable. The whole production was competent, but the honours go to Jean Forbes-Robertson; there could be no better Hedda, no better Rebecca West.

BARBARA BARCLAY CARTER.

GRAMOPHONE

Non solum discens sed et patiens divina. . . . To have sympathy as well as technical skill is essential not only to the seer but to the interpreter of the contemplation as well. Decca issue this month the Bach A minor violin concerto, less frequently heard than the E major, perhaps, but if so, undeservedly. It is meditative in spirit; and the words of pseudo-Denys come to mind as one plays this recording, for the style of Yvonne Astruc is in harmony with the music. The string accompaniment is delicate; it is happily not thickened by the organ part sometimes added, though on the other hand it might with advantage, one feels, be a trifle fuller. The first movement, too, might well be accelerated somewhat (for if *non tanto* it is after all *allegro*), and, as played, provides too

NOTICES

small a contrast with the succeeding *andante*. But the second and third movements are beautifully done, and the tone of the soloist admirable throughout (CA 8225-6). The *New World*, if not *divina*, is at any rate Dvorák. When the Dvorák family hit the holiday trail for Spilville in 1893 it had just been finished. And while a great deal has been said about its debt to negro melodies and American landscapes and what-not (the what-not even going so far as to include *Hiawatha*) the important thing is that it is Dvorák at his strongest. The usual characteristics are here, orchestral colour, melodic prodigality; the usual defects almost absent. And in the Stokowski version issued this month by H.M.V. the orchestra's expected verve is in harmony with the vitality of Dvorak's music, while the excellent recording does justice to his colour. Only the last movement is disappointing, for here the incessant sudden changes of tempo and manner make for disruption and the unity is destroyed (DB 2543-47). Another outstanding example of finesse in interpretation is provided by Horowitz playing the Chopin *Mazurka* in C sharp minor and *Etudes* in C sharp minor and G flat major, and of course another by this month's Elisabeth Schumann recording of Kreisler's *Caprice Viennois* and Weingartner's *Vogel Lied* (but why, oh why, will she keep giving us the bird?) (DA 1455).

The union of word and music in the Sitwell-Walton *Façade*, in which the poems are spoken against a background of witty and arresting melody, was a revelation when it first appeared and has lost none of its charm. H.M.V. now issue a recording of the music alone, conducted by the composer (C 2836-7); Decca have the poems as well, spoken by Edith Sitwell and Constant Lambert (T 124-5). It will be perhaps a matter of taste which version to adopt; it seems at first a pity to be deprived of the poems; and yet on the other hand the music is so well worth an undistracted hearing. The best solution of course is to possess both recordings. There are moreover some differences of selection.

A Vaughan Williams recording is a thing to be excited about. The Boyd Neel play and the composer supervizes the *Tallis Fantasia*, which is lovely, though one has the impression not of development but of reiteration (K 815-6).

The technique of the opera stage is one thing, that of the microphone another; and too often a disc reveals defects which across the footlights are non-existent. Viorica Ursuleac singing two arias from Puccini provides an example of this magnifying of slight wobbles, gurgitations, or the intake of breath, which at such close quarters are noticeable and infelicitous (CA 8277).

Swing music. It is surely time that something drastic were done about these vocalists. Ambrose has not lost his cunning in *Swing and If You Love Me* (F 5919); Armstrong does *The Music Goes*

BLACKFRIARS

Round well enough (F 5895); but both discs are unplayable because of the shattering subhumanity of the crooning. George Nepia, the All-Black, who sings some Maori songs on F 5906, is very clever at football. Even Elsie Carlisle is disappointing; she really ought not to devote her talents to the mawkishmammy-shirleytemplerism of *He's an Angel* (F 5902). A bright spot is provided in this somewhat gloomy collection by Ann Penn, who gives clever impersonations of the Houston Sisters, Zasu Pitts, the Western Brothers and (particularly brilliant) Gracie Fields. The other side is occupied by an amusing but singularly suggestive yodelling song (F 5907).

(Key.—H.M.V.: DB series, 6/-; C, 4/-; DA, 4/-. Decca: CA series, 4/-; K, 2/6; F, 1/6; T, 3/6.)

G. V.

BOOKS RECEIVED

- AUGUSTE PICARD (Paris): *Le laïc théologien: Introduction à l'étude de la théologie*, Denys Gorce.
- BURNS, OATES: *Church and State: Cambridge Summer School Lectures 1935* (7/6); *A Short Life of St. Francis of Assisi*, adapted from St. Bonaventure by Anne Pritchard (2/6).
- DISTRIBUTIST LEAGUE: *Land Settlement Colonisation*, C. Duvall Bishop (6d.).
- FABER & FABER: *The Necessity of Belief*, Eric Gill (7/6).
- GREGORIANUM (Rome): *Sancti Thomas Aquinatis De Unitate Intellectus*, ed. L. W. Keeler, S.J.
- HERDER: *The Life of Jesus Christ in the Land of Israel and among its People*, Franz M. Willam (15/-).
- LONGMANS: *The Coming of the Monster, A Tale of the Masterful Monk*, Owen F. Dudley (6/-); *Catholicism in England, 1535-1935*, David Mathew, Litt.D. (9/-); *The Reformation, the Mass and the Priesthood*, Ernest C. Messenger (18/-).
- MACMILLAN: *Sparkenbroke*, Charles Morgan (8/6).
- RUSHWORTH & DREAPER (Liverpool): *Laudate Dominum: A Benediction Manual compiled chiefly from English MSS.*, by V.G.L.
- SHEED & WARD: *Religions of Mankind*, Otto Karrer, tr. E. I. Watkin (10/6); *God and Mammon*, François Mauriac (*Essays in Order*, new series No. 1) (2/6); *The Future of Bolshevism*, Waldemar Gurian (3/6); *The Veil of Veronica*, Gertrud von le Fort (cheap edn. 3/6).
- SIMPKIN MARSHALL: *Melrose Abbey Then and Now*, Arthur E. Henderson (2/-).
- S.P.C.K.: *The Church in France, 1848-1907*, C. S. Phillips (12/6); *Divine Humanity: Doctrinal Essays on New Testament Problems*, W. K. Lowther Clarke, D.D. (5/-).
- TEQUI (Paris): *Le Réalisme méthodique*, Etienne Gilson (11 frs.).
- UNIVERSITA DI SIENNA, CATTEDRA CATERINIANNA: *Fontes Vitae S. Catherinae Senensis historici, Fasc. I. Documenti*, ed. M. H. Laurent, O.P., and F. Valli.

Printed in Great Britain by Samuel Walker, Hinckley, Leicestershire, and published for the Proprietors by The Rolls House Publishing Co., Ltd., Rolls House, 2 Breams Buildings, London, E.C.4.