

The
Review
of
Politics

ARTICLES

William F. Byrne, “William Graham Sumner and the Problem of Liberal Democracy”

Ella Myers, “From Pluralism to Liberalism: Rereading Isaiah Berlin”

Patti Tamara Lenard, “Culture, Free Movement, and Open Borders”

Megan C. Thomas, “Orientalism and Comparative Political Theory”

Roundtable on Michael Gillespie’s *Theological Origins of Modernity*

Timothy Fuller, “The Theologico-Political Question in Our Time: The Argument of Michael Gillespie’s *Theological Origins of Modernity*”

Thomas W. Merrill, “Metaphysics or Theology? A Comment on Michael Gillespie’s *Theological Origins of Modernity*”

Kirstie M. McClure, “Reflections on Michael Gillespie’s *Theological Origins of Modernity*”

Michael Gillespie, “Response to My Critics”

THE UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Editor

CATHERINE H. ZUCKERT

Executive Associate Editor

DENNIS WM MORAN

Book Review Editor

PETER R. MOODY, JR.

Assistant Editor

LES HARRIS

Editorial Interns:

Joshua M. Bandoch

Andrew W. Bramsen

Associate Editors

Fred Dallmayr
E.A. Goerner
A. James McAdams

Ruth M. Abbey
Daniel Philpott
James Turner

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian
M.A. Fitzsimons
Thomas Stritch

Frederick J. Crosson
Donald P. Kommers
Walter Nicgorski

Editorial Advisory Board

Shlomo Avineri
*Hebrew University of
Jerusalem*
Barry Cooper
University of Calgary
John Dunn
Cambridge University
Jean Bethke Elshtain
University of Chicago
Michael A. Gillespie
Duke University
Leslie Goldstein
University of Delaware
Russel Hittinger
University of Tulsa
Axel Honneth
*Institute for Social Research,
Frankfurt*
Shozo Iijima
*Waseda University,
Tokyo*

Ramin Jahanbegloo
University of Toronto
Pierre Manent
*L'Ecole des Hautes Etudes en
sciences sociales*
Harvey C. Mansfield
Harvard University
Mary Nichols
Baylor University
Bruce M. Russett
Yale University
Arlene Saxonhouse
University of Michigan
Steven B. Smith
Yale University
Peter Steinberger
Reed College
John Witte, Jr.
Emory University
Jean M. Yarbrough
Bowdoin College

Administrative Assistant: Kelli Brown

The Review of Politics publishes primarily philosophical and historical studies of politics, especially those concentrating on political theory and American political thought. The journal also includes thoughtful scholarly reflections on all aspects of politics—including analysis of institutions and techniques, international relations, comparative politics, literary reflections on politics or political interpretations of literary works, constitutional theory and practices.

TABLE OF CONTENTS FALL 2010

Vol. 72 FALL 2010 No. 4

William F. Byrne
William Graham Sumner and the Problem of
Liberal Democracy 571

Ella Myers
From Pluralism to Liberalism: Rereading Isaiah Berlin 599

Patti Tamara Lenard
Culture, Free Movement, and Open Borders 627

Megan C. Thomas
Orientalism and Comparative Political Theory 653

Roundtable on Michael Gillespie's *Theological Origins of Modernity*

Timothy Fuller
The Theologico-Political Question in Our Time:
The Argument of Michael Gillespie's *Theological
Origins of Modernity* 679

Thomas W. Merrill
Metaphysics or Theology? A Comment on
Michael Gillespie's *Theological Origins of Modernity* 687

Kirstie M. McClure
Reflections on Michael Gillespie's *Theological
Origins of Modernity* 697

Michael A. Gillespie
Response to My Critics 705

Reviews:

Kurt W. Radtke: BEYOND EUROPE
Review of Jack Goody's *The Eurasian Miracle* 711

Lisa Pace Vetter: HISTORICAL RECONSTRUCTION
Review of J. G. A. Pocock's *Political Thought and History:
Essays on Theory and Method* 714

Grant Tapsell: NOT SO REVOLUTIONARY	
Review of Steve Pincus's <i>1688: The First Modern Revolution</i>	717
Christopher S. McClure: A VERY MORAL HOBBS	
Review of Perez Zagorin's <i>Hobbes and the Law of Nature</i>	723
Terry Peach: NEW LIFE TO OLD CLICHÉS	
Review of Murray Milgate and Shannon C. Stimson's <i>After Adam Smith: A Century of Transformation in Politics and Political Economy</i>	726
Robert K. Faulkner: REASONABLE LIVING	
Review of Harry Clor's <i>On Moderation: Defending an Ancient Virtue in a Modern World</i>	728
Jeffrey Church: THE ANTI-ANTI-ENLIGHTENMENT THINKER	
Review of Zeev Sternhell's <i>The Anti-Enlightenment Tradition</i>	731
Brent Edwin Cushner: SOPHOCLES PHILOSOPHOS	
Review of Peter J. Ahrens Dorf's <i>Greek Tragedy and Political Philosophy: Rationalism and Religion in Sophocles' Theban Plays</i>	733
Edmund R. Goode: ENLIGHTENED PURITAN	
Review of Neal Dolan's <i>Emerson's Liberalism</i>	736
David Rondel: INDIVIDUALITY OVERCOMING DOCILITY	
Review of Alex Zakaras's <i>Individuality and Mass Democracy: Mill, Emerson, and the Burdens of Citizenship</i>	738
Robert S. Taylor: MUSCULAR, AMBITIOUS, PRACTICAL ASSERTION OF TRUTH	
Review of Susan Meld Shell's <i>Kant and the Limits of Autonomy</i>	740
Alan Milchman and Alan Rosenberg: HEIDEGGER'S UMWELT	
Review of Emmanuel Faye's <i>The Introduction of Nazism into Philosophy</i>	742
Andrew Biro: MAKING A COMMON ACADEMIC ATLANTIC CULTURE	
Review of Thomas Wheatland's <i>The Frankfurt School in Exile</i>	746
Kody W. Cooper: CREATION MYTHS	
Review of Donald Drakeman's <i>Church, State, and Original Intent</i>	749

Charles McDaniel: INTELLECTUALS AND MONEY	
Review of Alan S. Kahan's <i>Mind vs. Money: The War between Intellectuals and Capitalism</i>	753
Jill Locke: FOREMOTHERS	
Review of Penny A. Weiss's <i>Canon Fodder: Historical Women Political Thinkers</i>	755
Elizabeth Eastman: FOR THE PEOPLE, NOT BY THE PEOPLE	
Review of Will Morrisey's <i>The Dilemma of Progressivism: How Roosevelt, Taft, and Wilson Reshaped the American Regime of Self-Government</i>	758
Daniel J. Reagan: PLUS ÇA CHANGE	
Review of W. J. Rorabaugh's <i>The Real Making of the President: Kennedy, Nixon, and the 1960 Election</i>	760
List of Reviewers	765
Index to Volume 72	769

CONTRIBUTORS TO THIS ISSUE

WILLIAM F. BYRNE is Assistant Professor of Government and Politics at St. John's University, Staten Island. **ELLA MYERS** is Assistant Professor at the University of Utah with a joint appointment in the Department of Political Science and the Program in Gender Studies. **PATTI TAMARA LENARD** is Assistant Professor of Political Philosophy at the Social Sciences Graduate School of Public and International Affairs at the University of Ottawa. **MEGAN C. THOMAS** is Associate Professor of Politics at the University of California, Santa Cruz. **TIMOTHY FULLER** is Lloyd E. Worner Distinguished Service Professor at Colorado College. **THOMAS MERRILL** is Assistant Professor in the Department of Government in the School of Public Affairs at American University. **KIRSTIE M. McCLURE** is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Los Angeles. **MICHAEL A. GILLESPIE** is the Jerry G. and Patricia Crawford Hubbard Professor of Political Science at Duke University.

KURT W. RADTKE is Professor Emeritus of Leiden University, and had been Professor of Japanese and Chinese Studies at Waseda University, Tokyo. **LISA PACE VETTER** is Instructor in the Department of Political Science at the University of Maryland, Baltimore County. **GRANT TAPSELL** is Lecturer in early modern British & Irish and European history at the University of St. Andrews. **CHRISTOPHER SCOTT McCLURE** is a doctoral candidate in the Department of Government at Georgetown University. **TERRY PEACH** is Senior Lecturer in the School of Social Sciences at the University of Manchester. **ROBERT K. FAULKNER** is Professor of Political Science at Boston College. **JEFFREY CHURCH** is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Houston. **BRENT EDWIN CUSHER** is the Jack Miller Center Veritas Fund Postdoctoral Fellow in the Department of Political Science at Rhodes College for 2009–10. **EDMUND R. GOODE** is Assistant Professor of English at Villanova University. **DAVID RONDEL** is Visiting Assistant

Professor in the Department of Philosophy at Trent University. **ROBERT S. TAYLOR** is Associate Professor of Political Science, University of California, Davis. **ALAN ROSENBERG** is Assistant Professor in the Department of Philosophy at Queens College, CUNY. **ALAN MILCHMAN** is Lecturer in the Department of Political Science, Queens College, CUNY. **ANDREW BIRO** is Canada Research Chair in Political Ecology and Environmental Political Theory Coordinator, Graduate Program in Social and Political Thought, Department of Political Science at Acadia University. **KODY COOPER** is a Visiting Scholar at Wolfson College, Cambridge, UK. **CHARLES McDANIEL** is Associate Director of the J. M. Dawson Institute at Baylor University. **JILL LOCKE** is Associate Professor and Chair of the Political Science Department at Gustavus Adolphus College. **ELIZABETH EASTMAN** is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Chapman University. **DANIEL REAGAN** is Associate Professor of Political Science at Ball State University.

Subscription Information: *The Review of Politics* (ISSN 0034-6705) is published quarterly in February, May, August and November by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 USA/The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK for the University of Notre Dame. Annual subscription rates for Volume 73 (2011): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$128.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £73.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$116.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £62.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$123.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £66.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$38.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £19.00 + VAT elsewhere. Correspondence concerning subscriptions should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

Editorial Office: All correspondence concerning submissions and manuscripts under review should be sent to *The Review of Politics*, University of Notre Dame, 547 Flanner Hall, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Phone: 574-631-6623. Email: ROP.Editor.1@nd.edu. Website: www.nd.edu/~rop

Abstracting and Indexing Information: Articles in *The Review of Politics* are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index; abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts; and abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI., Historical Abstracts, Social Science Index (also available in the electronic versions), Book Review Index, and International Bibliography of the Social Sciences.

Copyright © 2010 University of Notre Dame. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press, Rights and Permissions Manager, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 USA. For further information see <http://us.cambridge.org/information/rights/>.

Periodicals postage paid in New York, NY and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes to *The Review of Politics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133 USA.

Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: the Item-Fee Code for the publication (0034-6705/10 \$9.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) provided that the appropriate remittance of \$9.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.