

Nineteenth-Century Music *Review*



Brahms and the Influence of Beethoven

Volume 18 • Issue 2 • August 2021

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

Nineteenth-Century Music Review locates music within all aspects of culture in the long nineteenth century, covering the widest possible range of methods, topics and concepts. Articles provide both depth and breadth in their contribution to this expanding field. A rich supply of book, CD, DVD and score reviews reflects the journal's commitment to stimulate and advance critical discussion.

General Editor

BENNETT ZON, *Durham University, UK*

Editorial Board

ANDREAS GIGER

Louisiana State University, USA

JAMES SOBASKIE (CD/DVD Review Editor)

Mississippi State University, USA

NANCY NOVEMBER (Score Review Editor)

University of Auckland, New Zealand

HEATHER PLATT (Digital Review Editor)

Ball State University, USA

SANNA PEDERSON (Book Review Editor)

University of Oklahoma, USA

KATHERINE PRESTON

William & Mary, USA

WILLIAM WEBER

California State University, Long Beach, USA

BENJAMIN M. KORSTVEDT

Clark University, USA

Advisory Board

PHILIP V. BOHLMAN

University of Chicago, USA

ANDREW BOWIE

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

SUZANNAH CLARK

Harvard University, USA

NICHOLAS COOK

University of Cambridge, UK

JOHN DEATHRIDGE

King's College, University of London, UK

JAMES DEAVILLE

Carleton University, Canada

JEREMY DIBBLE

Durham University, UK

STEPHEN DOWNES

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

KATHARINE ELLIS

University of Cambridge, UK

ANNEGRET FAUSER

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

PETER FRANKLIN

University of Oxford, UK

SOPHIE FULLER

Trinity College of Music, UK

LYDIA GOEHR

Columbia University, USA

THOMAS GREY

Stanford University, USA

SARAH HIBBERD

University of Bristol, UK

JULIAN HORTON

Durham University, UK

LINDA HUTCHEON

University of Toronto, Canada

HERVÉ LACOMBE

Université Rennes 2, Haute Bretagne, France

ALICIA LEVIN

University of Kansas, USA

RALPH LOCKE

Eastman School of Music, USA

ROBERTA MARVIN

University of Massachusetts, USA

SIMON McVEIGH

Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

JULIAN RUSHTON

University of Leeds, UK

DOUGLASS SEATON

Florida State University, USA

SUSAN WOLLENBERG

University of Oxford, UK

SUSAN YOUENS

University of Notre Dame, USA

SUBSCRIPTIONS *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (ISSN 1479-4098) is published three times a year in April, August and December. Three parts form a volume. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 18 (2021), which includes print and electronic access, is £257 net (US\$406 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; and £53 net (US\$84 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals, ordering direct from the publisher and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £99 (US\$156 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT-registered customers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd., P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Prices include delivery by air where appropriate.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA.

COPYING This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$12. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1479-4098/2019. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. For all other use, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

This journal is included in the Cambridge Core service which can be found at cambridge.org/core.

© Cambridge University Press 2021

Contents

VOLUME 18, ISSUE 2

Notes on Article Contributors	177
Jeremy Yudkin	
Preface	179

ARTICLES

Christopher Reynolds	
Schumann <i>contra</i> Wagner: Beethoven, the F.A.E. Sonata and 'Artwork of the Future'	181
Jacquelyn Sholes	
D-Minor Concertos and Symphonies of the Brahms-Schumann Circle in the 1850s: Cross-Relationships and the Influence of Beethoven	209
William Horne	
Beethoven's String Quintet in C major, Op. 29, and Brahms's String Sextets: A Wallflower Blooms	241
Styra Avins	
Brahms, Beethoven, and a Reassessment of the Famous Footsteps	269
Daniel Beller-McKenna	
Imagination and Memory: Inter-movement Thematic Recall in Beethoven and Brahms	283

BOOK REVIEWS

Nicole Grimes	
<i>Brahms's Elegies: The Poetics of Loss in Nineteenth-Century German Culture</i> by Laurie McManus	309
Joe Davies and James William Sobaskie	
<i>Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert</i> by Michael Weiss	314
Peter Bloom	
<i>Mémoires d'Hector Berlioz de 1803 à 1865, et ses voyages en Italie, en Allemagne, en Russie et en Angleterre, écrits par lui-même</i> by Emmanuel Reibel and translated by James William Sobaskie	320
Anja Bunzel and Natasha Loges	
<i>Musical Salon Culture in the Long Nineteenth Century</i> by David Gramit	323

CD REVIEW

- Ralph P. Locke
André Messager, *Les p'tites Michu* (operetta or opéra-comique, 1897) 327
 Violette Polchi (Marie-Blanche), Anne-Aurore Cochet (Blanche-Marie),
 Marie Lenormand (Mme. Michu), Caroline Meng (Mlle. Herpin), Artavazd
 Sargsyan (Aristide), Philippe Estèphe (Captain Gaston Gigaud), Boris
 Grappe (General des Ifs), Damien Bigourdan (M. Michu), Romain Dayez
 (Bagnolet) Orchestre national des Pays de la Loire and Choeur d'Angers
 Nantes Opéra, Pierre Dumoussaud *cond* Bru Zane 1054 (2 CDs: 103 minutes,
 plus a 174-page book in French and English)

CORRIGENDUM

- Ralph P. Locke
 André Messager, *Les p'tites Michu* (operetta or opéra-comique, 1897) – 335
 CORRIGENDUM

SCORE REVIEW

- Joseph Joachim
Fantasy on Hungarian Themes (1850), *Fantasy on Irish [Scottish] Themes* (1852) 337
for Violin and Orchestra. Piano Reduction by Jacquelyn Sholes

REVIEW ESSAY

- Jonathan Kregor
 A Crash Course in Chopinology 341