

AMERICAN  
JOURNAL  
OF LAW   
& MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBERS 2 & 3 1987

JUSTICE HARRY A.  
BLACKMUN:  
THE SUPREME COURT  
AND THE LIMITS OF  
MEDICAL PRIVACY

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE AND THE  
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$40.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$20.00 for air mail postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$10 (plus \$3 for postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$85.00 for 1987). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445).  
ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Worcester, Massachusetts, in accordance with Permit No. 5 (Nonprofit Org.).

#### **AMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW**

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., PH.D., LL.D., (hon.), LH.D., (hon.), *President*,

*University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

WILLIAM SCHWARTZ, M.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

COLIN S. DIVER, B.A., LL.B., *Associate Dean*

BARBARA LAUREN, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Assistant Dean*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

DANIEL FREEHLING, B.A., M.S., *Director, Law Library*

MARGARET D. HAGOPIAN, A.C.S., *Executive Assistant to the Dean*

#### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE**

ANGELA R. HOLDER, LL.M., *President*

RONALD E. CRANFORD, M.D., *President-Elect*

ALEXANDER M. CAPRON, LL.B., *Secretary*

JANE L. GREENLAW, R.N., M.S., J.D., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

AUBREY MILUNSKY, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc. F.R.C.P., D.C.H., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

AMERICAN  
JOURNAL  
OF LAW   
& MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBERS 2 & 3 1987

**JUSTICE HARRY A. BLACKMUN:  
THE SUPREME COURT  
AND THE LIMITS OF  
MEDICAL PRIVACY**

Guest Editor  
Larry Gostin

George J. Annas  
Paul S. Appelbaum  
Harry A. Blackmun  
William J. Brennan, Jr.  
Alexander M. Capron  
Ronald E. Cranford

Sheila Jasanoff  
Harold H. Koh  
Robert J. Levin  
John A. Robertson  
David R. Smith  
Alan A. Stone

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## BOARD of EDITORS

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

**Frances H. Miller, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

### EXECUTIVE EDITOR

**Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.**

### DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS

**American Society of Law & Medicine**  
**Joyce Coleman**

### CIRCULATION MANAGER

**Sharin Paaso**

## EDITORS

### **Michael Baram, J.D.**

Boston University Schools of Law  
and Public Health

### **Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Henry Beyer, J.D.**

Boston University School of Law

### **Patrick R. Carroll, J.D.**

Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel  
Massachusetts Hospital Association

### **William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.**

Harvard University School of  
Public Health

### **Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.**

Powers & Hall  
Boston, Massachusetts

### **Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.**

Harvard Medical School

### **Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**

Department of Preventive Medicine  
Medical College of Wisconsin

### **Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.**

Duke University School of Law

### **Nathan Hershey, J.D.**

University of Pittsburgh  
Graduate School of Public Health

### **Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.**

General Counsel  
American Medical Association

### **Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.**

Hollowell & Silverstein  
Raleigh, North Carolina

### **Richard G. Huber, J.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Jay Katz, M.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Sylvia A. Law, J.D.**

New York University School of Law

### **Peter Martin, J.D.**

Dean, Cornell Law School

### **Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc., F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**

Boston University School of Medicine

### **Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.**

University of Medicine and Dentistry  
of New Jersey

### **Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.**

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida  
Jacksonville, Florida

### **Honorable Max Rosenn**

United States Court of Appeals for the  
Third Circuit

### **Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.**

Founder, American Society of  
Law & Medicine  
Harvard Medical School

### **William Schwartz, J.D., M.A.**

Dean, Boston University School of Law

### **E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.**

New York Law School

### **Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.**

Director, Medical Genetics Center  
University of Texas at Houston

### **Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.**

Dean, Tufts University School of  
Dental Medicine

### **Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.**

Grad. Sch. of Business Administration  
University of Michigan

### **David G. Warren, J.D.**

Duke University

### **Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.**

Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal  
Medicine

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBERS 2 & 3 1987

## **INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS**

**Dr. M.A.M. Wachter**  
Director  
Institute of Bioethics  
The Netherlands

**Dr. S.S. Fluss**  
Chief, Health Legislation  
World Health Organization  
Switzerland

**Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch**  
Institute for Pharmaceutical and  
Medical Law  
University of Gottingen  
Federal Republic of Germany

**Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.**  
Professor  
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine  
University of Toronto  
Canada

**Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen**  
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde  
Universiteit van Amsterdam  
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice  
Michael J. Kirby**  
President, Court of Appeals  
Supreme Court  
Australia

**Kotchi Bai**  
Professor of Law  
Faculty of Law  
Tokyo Metropolitan University  
Japan

**P.D.G. Skegg**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Otago  
New Zealand

**Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen**  
Institute for International, Foreign  
and Comparative Law  
Director,  
Working Centre for International  
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law  
The Free University of Berlin  
Federal Republic of Germany

**Professor Amos Shapira  
Lubowski** Professor of Law &  
Biomedical Ethics  
Faculty of Law  
Tel Aviv University  
Israel

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBERS 2 & 3 1987

**BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW  
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS  
1987-1988**

**EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**  
Beth Margolis

**EXECUTIVE EDITOR**  
Lisa A. Sheeler

**MANAGING EDITOR**  
D. Mark Leonard

**PROJECTS EDITOR**  
Michael D. Povman

**ARTICLES EDITORS**  
Steven Reske  
Thomas K. Schulte  
Bruce Shapiro  
Susan E. Stenger

**SYMPOSIUM EDITOR**  
Duncan Anthony Maio

#### **CASE & NOTE EDITORS**

Susan Clement  
Lori Goldstein  
Lori B. Krauss  
Peter R. Lash

David Rosen  
Cheryl B. Schreiber  
Ilene Taback  
Robert Whalen

#### **THIRD YEAR EDITORS**

Scott Baker  
Donald Bollella  
Laurence Cote  
Paul E. Dwyer  
Christine Fedas  
Denise George  
Gail K. Gordon

Brian Kehoe  
Ann T. Lampport  
David L. McEvoy  
Wendy Ravitz  
Debra Rosen  
Amy Spitofsky  
Pamela Worstell  
Jean Zoubek

#### **STAFF MEMBERS**

David Babner  
Diane M. Crawford  
Tracy Croft  
Steven DeLuca  
Aileen C. Denne Bolton  
Michael DeVito  
Jeffrey Dollinger  
James R. Eddy  
Joel Freedman  
Mary L. Gallant  
Margaret Graham  
Steven Hamel  
Steven N. Jacobs

Joseph P. Kelly  
Todd Kirsch  
Sara Lander  
Karen Laufer  
Frances Lynch  
Maureen A. MacFarlane  
Michael D. Mann  
Steven H. Meyer  
Kathleen Norton  
Donna M. Praiss  
Elizabeth A. Reingold  
Shep A. Rosenman  
Todd L. Safon

Stacey H. Synder  
Joseph C. Stanko, Jr.  
Constance N. Stratton  
Edward Tumavicus  
Ann M. VanDeventer  
Richard I. Shakter  
David Van Speybroeck  
Karl S. Vasiloff  
Robert D. Webb  
Jonathan C. Wilk  
Eric E. Wolf  
Michelle S. Wolf  
Ellen Wright

*Special thanks to Zoltan Kerekes, Rebecca Miller and Marlene Munnely,  
1988 Summer Staff*

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBERS 2 & 3 1987

<b>GUEST EDITOR'S INTRODUCTION</b>	153	Larry Gostin
<b>TRIBUTE</b>	163	Justice Wm. J. Brennan, Jr.
<b>REMARKS</b>	167	Justice Harry A. Blackmun
<b>ARTICLES</b>		
SO QUICK BRIGHT THINGS COME TO CONFUSION	169	Alexander M. Capron
GESTATIONAL BURDENS AND FETAL STATUS: JUSTIFYING <i>ROE V. WADE</i>	189	John A. Robertson
THE IMPACT OF MEDICAL TECHNOLOGY ON THE PREGNANT WOMAN'S RIGHT TO PRIVACY	213	George J. Annas
CONSCIOUSNESS: THE MOST CRITICAL MORAL (CONSTITUTIONAL) STANDARD FOR HUMAN PERSONHOOD	233	Ronald E. Cranford David R. Smith
BIOLOGY AND THE BILL OF RIGHTS: CAN SCIENCE REFRAME THE CONSTITUTION?	249	Sheila Jasanoff
JUSTICE BLACKMUN: A SURVEY OF HIS DECISIONS IN PSYCHIATRY AND LAW	291	Alan A. Stone
REBALANCING THE MEDICAL TRIAD: JUSTICE BLACKMUN'S CONTRIBUTIONS TO LAW AND MEDICINE	315	Harold H. Koh
THE EMPIRICAL JURISPRUDENCE OF THE UNITED STATES SUPREME COURT	335	Paul S. Appelbaum
MEDICAL ETHICS AND PERSONAL DOCTORS: WHAT WE TEACH AND WHAT WE WANT	351	Robert J. Levine
<b>STUDENT DEVELOPMENT NOTE</b>		
THE EVOLUTION OF THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY AFTER <i>ROE V. WADE</i>	365	

Copyright 1987 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. All or any part of materials appearing in the Journal may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.