

over the naked obscenity of the incidents she describes. This self-restraint is admirable, on one level, and situates her historiographically. On the other hand, it limits her willingness to engage with David Kertzer's provocative thesis about the links between older ecclesiastical antisemitisms (such as those on display throughout this book) and the still darker, more destructive antisemitisms of the twentieth century's totalitarian societies. For an author who claims that 'early modern Catholicism cannot be understood without reference to these Jews and this spectacle' (p. 9), Michelson might also have gone further in spelling out the implications for that. The hand of Simon Ditchfield is strong in her characterisation of Catholicism's global and essentially missionary nature. However, I wondered where she would situate her conception of it as highly communal and ritualised in relation to John Bossy's older arguments about Christianity's transformation into a personal faith of conscience. Such quibbles are, however, minor. This is an outstanding book.

AUSTRALIAN CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY

MILES PATTENDEN

Itē missa est. Ritual interactions around mass in Chinese society (1583–1720). By Hongfan Yang. (Studies in the History of Christianity in East Asia, 7.) Pp. xii + 325 incl. 10 colour and black-and-white figs and 6 tables. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2022. €100. 978 90 04 49957 7; 2542 3681
JEH (74) 2023; doi:10.1017/S0022046923000866

Through her book Hongfan Yang has provided an important contribution to our understanding of missionary interaction with Chinese society and the development of the Chinese Church in the earlier missionary period. Scholarship has slowly moved further away from the missionary actors and has shifted from a Eurocentric to a Sinocentric study of Chinese Christianity. This book fits well into this development through its focus on ritual and mass. This book is particularly interesting as it takes a step back to the first period of the missionary arrival in China with a focus on the early Jesuits as it explores 'the diverse and dynamic interaction of both Christianization in Chinese society and Sinicization of Catholic rituals' (p. 5).

Yang's book engages with this theme throughout five major sections focusing on different aspects of worship in the Christian Church in China. The first two sections focus on ritual and purpose of worship. An interesting point related to inculturation was in the discussion around the use of 'heaven (tian/天)' and the 'To Revere Heaven' tablet even after Pope Innocent x condemned its usage. Yang reports that some individuals like Michael Fernandez-Oliver only required a change to 'To Revere the Lord of Heaven' (p. 18). She notes that some were afraid that not using it might 'prevent them from approaching Catholicism' (p. 18). However, Charles Maigrot, the Vicar Apostolic of Fujian, forbade its usage in the Church and any tablet with them, even suspending two Jesuits who ignored his wishes. In the end, this led to conflict with the local Chinese Catholics (pp. 19–20). Yang concludes that the efforts to bring together the Lord of Heaven and the Chinese concept of heaven was one component leading to the inculturation of Christianity in Chinese society.

Yang also provides an interesting look at Sinicisation/inculturation in the chapter titled 'Performer of worship' when she focuses on missionaries' work to place themselves and the pope as the religious figures in the faith. On page 128 Yang notes that some Chinese rejected the pope's status due to it resembling the emperor, but Giulio Aleni moved to place priests as 'the intermediary' and Lodovico Buglio emphasised the power of the priest to celebrate mass (p. 128). The author is keen to point out that the relationship priests had with their converts was quite different from in Chinese religions. In particular, they involved themselves in the private lives of their converts more than the other Chinese religions. While some of their activities coincided with other Chinese religious leaders, the Jesuit priests sought to show a different role for Church leaders.

The developments and actions by the missionaries sometimes led to opposition and violence against the Catholics, leading to an urgency to develop an indigenous clergy. The author goes on to note that priests maintained that they were the only ones who could celebrate mass, but they also 'deputised' Chinese catechists with the ability to perform baptisms, lead prayer when a priest could not celebrate mass and other duties (p. 133). In this transition, the Holy Office declared that the Chinese clergy were allowed to produce a Bible in literary Chinese and that they could hold mass in Chinese rather than Latin. The issue of Latin was a key stumbling block to developing a Chinese clergy but this permitted its formation without the requirement that they be able to say mass and perform other duties in Latin (pp. 161–2). Yang shows that Sinicisation even extended down to the 'sacrificial hat' that Chinese priests wore during mass. The hat clearly displays Chinese traditions in the form of flowers mixed with Christian images of the cross (p. 177). Through her detailed analysis of all aspects of the mass Yang is able to include some enlightening examples of Sinicisation/inculturation.

The book is clearly well researched with a plethora of related secondary sources and new primary sources, particularly Chinese language sources. Overall, Hongfan Yang has produced an excellent book that gives the reader a clear view of the development of the Catholic Church in China and the engagement with Chinese society of Catholic rituals in the early period of Jesuit missionary activity.

KUTZTOWN UNIVERSITY,
PENNSYLVANIA

JOHN R. STANLEY

Metaphors of eucharistic presence. Language, cognition, and the body and blood of Christ.

By Stephen R. Shaver. Pp. xiv + 290 incl. 54 figs. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 2022. £64. 978 0 19 758080 6

JEH (74) 2023; doi:10.1017/S0022046923000817

In a short monograph of 2018 Stephen Shaver investigated eucharistic sacrifice using a cognitive linguistic approach. Now in this much longer and deeper study he uses the same methodology to discuss eucharistic presence with the belief that this can be of ecumenical benefit. An Episcopalian priest, Shaver notes that the Anglican liturgical tradition tends towards a hermeneutic of multiplicity, and therefore is an ecclesial tradition that is disinclined to commit to a single metaphor to explain the transcendent. Shafer's preferred lens is that of metaphor, which in