

ISSN 0066-622X

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY

volume 59: 2016



SOCIETY OF ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIANS OF GREAT BRITAIN

The Alice Davis Hitchcock Medallion is presented annually to authors of outstanding contributions to the literature of architectural history. A full list of winners since 1959 may be found on the SAHGB website. Recent awards have been:

- 2015: Michael Hall for *George Frederick Bodley and the later Gothic Revival in Britain and America*
2014: Anthony Geraghty for *The Sheldonian Theatre: Architecture and Learning in Seventeenth-Century Oxford*
2013: G. A. Bremner for *Imperial Gothic: Religious Architecture and High Anglican Culture in the British Empire c. 1840-1870*
2012: Richard Fawcett for *The Architecture of the Scottish Medieval Church, 1100-1560*
2011: John Goodall for *The English Castle: 1066-1650*
2010: Mark Girouard for *Elizabethan Architecture: Its Rise and Fall, 1540-1640*
2009: Peter Draper for *The Formation of English Gothic: Architecture and Identity*
2008: Eitan Karol for *Charles Holden Architect, 1887-1960*
2007: David Robinson for *The Cistercians in Wales*
2006: Peter Guillery for *The Small House in Eighteenth-Century London*

The Society's Essay Medal is presented annually to the winner of the Society's Essay Competition, the regulations for which are available on the SAHGB website along with a full list of winners since 1982. Recent winners have been:

- | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 2015: Edward Gillin | 2010: Jessica Holland |
| 2014: Richard Butler | 2009: Philip Aspin |
| 2013: Karl Kinsella | 2008: Tristram Bainbridge |
| 2012: No award was made | 2007: James Maxwell Stevenson |
| 2011: Otto Saumarez Smith | 2006: Matthew Whitfield |

The James Morris Prize is awarded to the best essay received on British Colonial and PostColonial Architecture. Past Winners:

- | | |
|-------------------------|-----------------|
| 2015: No award was made | 2013: Irit Katz |
| 2014: Emily Turner | |

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY PANEL

- Guido Beltramini (Andrea Palladio Study Centre, Vicenza, Italy)
Maarten Delbeke (University of Ghent, Belgium; Leiden University, The Netherlands)
Eric Fernie (Courtauld Institute of Art, London)
Charles Hind (RIBA Drawings and Archives Collection, London)
Maurice Howard (University of Sussex)
Tim Knox (Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge)
Ron Lewcock (University of Queensland, Australia)
Mary McLeod (Columbia University, USA)
Stefan Muthesius (University of East Anglia)
Konrad Ottenheim (Utrecht University, The Netherlands)
Sarah Pearson (independent scholar, formerly of the Royal Commission on Historic Monuments in England)
Alan Powers (independent scholar)
Christine Stevenson (Courtauld Institute of Art, London)
Nancy Stieber (University of Massachusetts, Boston, USA)
Robert Thome (independent scholar, formerly of Alan Baxter and Associates, London)

Cover image: North porch of Boxford Church, Suffolk (Photo: R. Beech)

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY

*Journal of the Society of Architectural
Historians of Great Britain*

Volume 59: 2016

SOCIETY OF ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIANS OF GREAT BRITAIN

Founded 1956: incorporated 1964

The Society exists to encourage an interest in the history of architecture, to provide opportunities for the exchange and discussion of ideas related to this subject and to publish, in its journal, Architectural History, the results of original research.

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE 2015–16

President: Maurice Howard

Chairman: Anthony Geraghty

Past President: Malcolm Airs

Secretary: Jonathan Kewley

Treasurer: David Lermon

Journal Editor: David Hemsoll

Conference Co-ordinators: Joanne O'Hara, Katie Carmichael, Ann-Marie Akehurst

Events Secretaries: Andrew Martindale, Pete Smith

Education Officer: Julian Holder

Website Officer: Danielle Willkens

Publicity Officers: Anya Matthews, Trudy McGregor, Neal Shasore

Minutes Secretary: Eleanor Grace

Magazine Editors: Kay Carson, Nick Jones

Fundraising and Development Officer: Lisa Hirst

Reviews Editor: Cat Gray

Executive Committee Members without portfolio: Alistair Fair, Simon Green, Kent Rawlinson, Frances Sands, Catherine Staniland

The Society's Intern: Amy Smith

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY EDITORIAL TEAM 2016

Lead Editor: David Hemsoll

Deputy Editors: Geoff Brandwood, Elizabeth Darling, Julian Holder, Judi Loach, Matthew Walker

Current contact details for the Society and its publications are shown at www.sahgb.org.uk

Registered Office: Beech House, Cotswold Avenue, Lisvane, Cardiff CF14 OTA

Copyright © Society of Architectural Historians 2016

ISSN: 0066-622X

*Printed in the United Kingdom at
Bell & Bain Ltd, Glasgow*

CONTENTS

EDITORIAL	1
RICHARD OF ST VICTOR'S SOLUTIONS TO PROBLEMS OF ARCHITECTURAL REPRESENTATION IN THE TWELFTH CENTURY by Karl Kinsella	3
THE HAMMER-BEAM ROOF OF WESTMINSTER HALL AND THE STRUCTURAL RATIONALE OF HUGH HERLAND by Robert Beech	25
FIRST PRINCIPLES: GABRIELE STORNALOCO AND MILAN CATHEDRAL by Giulia Ceriani Sebregondi and Richard Schofield	63
THE DYNAMIC OF DESIGN: 'SOURCE' BUILDINGS AND CONTRACT MAKING IN ENGLAND IN THE LATER MIDDLE AGES by Gabriel Byng	123
REVIVING ANTIQUITY WITH GRANITE: SPOLIA AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF ROMAN RENAISSANCE ARCHITECTURE by Michael J. Waters	149
CONCEPTION AND CONSTRUCTION: GALEAZZO ALESSI AND THE USE OF DRAWINGS IN SIXTEENTH-CENTURY ARCHITECTURAL PRACTICE by Rebecca M. Gill	181
A 'SHAFTESBURIAN AGENDA'? LORD BURLINGTON, LORD SHAFTESBURY AND THE INTELLECTUAL ORIGINS OF ENGLISH PALLADIANISM by Alexander Echlin and William Kelley	221
'PROCEEDING LIKE GUY FAUX': THE ANTIQUARIAN INVESTIGATION OF ST STEPHEN'S CHAPEL WESTMINSTER, 1790–1837 by Rosemary Hill	253
STONES OF SCIENCE: CHARLES HARRIOT SMITH AND THE IMPORTANCE OF GEOLOGY IN ARCHITECTURE, 1834–64 by Edward John Gillin	281
RICHARD NEUTRA'S SEARCH FOR THE SOUTHLAND: CALIFORNIA, LATIN AMERICA AND SPAIN by Brett Tippey	311
BOOK REVIEWS	
JAMES STEVENS CURL AND SUSAN WILSON, <i>THE OXFORD DICTIONARY OF ARCHITECTURE</i> Reviewed by Hannah Malone	353
HUGH MELLER, <i>THE COUNTRY HOUSES OF DEVON</i> Reviewed by Paul Holden	355

ADAM HARDY, <i>THEORY AND PRACTICE OF TEMPLE ARCHITECTURE IN MEDIEVAL INDIA: BHOJA'S SAMARĀNGANASŪTRADHARA AND THE BHOJPUR LINE DRAWINGS</i>	
Reviewed by Peter Draper	356
ANN C. HUPPERT, <i>BECOMING AN ARCHITECT IN RENAISSANCE ITALY: ART, SCIENCE, AND THE CAREER OF BALDASSARRE PERUZZI</i>	
Reviewed by David Hemsoll	357
DAMIANA LUCIA PATERNÒ, <i>PALLADIO NEL TEMPO: TRASFORMAZIONI, AUTENTICITÀ, MITO TRA OTTOCENTO E NOVECENTO</i>	
Reviewed by Gordon Higgott	360
MARGARET STEWART, <i>THE ARCHITECTURAL, LANDSCAPE AND CONSTITUTIONAL PLANS OF THE EARL OF MAR, 1700–32</i>	
Reviewed by Jeremy Musson	362
DANIEL MAUDLIN, <i>THE IDEA OF THE COTTAGE IN ENGLISH ARCHITECTURE, 1760–1860</i>	
Reviewed by Rosemary Yallop	364
STEFAN W. KRIEG AND DIETER POMMER (EDS), <i>MAX POMMER: ARCHITEKT UND BETONPIONIER</i>	
Reviewed by Robert Thorne	366
ELAIN HARWOOD, <i>SPACE, HOPE AND BRUTALISM</i> ; AND ELAIN HARWOOD, <i>ENGLAND'S POST-WAR LISTED BUILDINGS</i>	
Reviewed by Neil Jackson	367
GABRIELE NERI, <i>CARICATURE ARCHITETTONICHE: SATIRA E CRITICA DEL PROGETTO MODERNO</i>	
Reviewed by Stefan Muthesius	369
BARNABAS CALDER, <i>RAW CONCRETE: THE BEAUTY OF BRUTALISM</i>	
Reviewed by Alistair Fair	370
WILLIAM WHYTE, <i>REDBRICK: A SOCIAL AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY OF BRITAIN'S CIVIC UNIVERSITIES</i>	
Reviewed by Alistair Fair	373
ALISTAIR FAIR (ED.), <i>SETTING THE SCENE: PERSPECTIVES ON TWENTIETH-CENTURY THEATRE ARCHITECTURE</i>	
Reviewed by Paul Holden	375