Book Reviews

Elizabeth Heger Boyle, Editor

Changing the Guard: Developing Democratic Police Abroad. By David H. Bayley. Oxford, United Kingdom: Oxford University Press, 2006. Pp. vii + 171. $28.00 cloth.

Reviewed by Randy Lippert, University of Windsor

How can the creation of democratic policing be fostered in war-torn countries and those with sordid histories of authoritarian regimes and repressive police practices? *Changing the Guard* addresses this neglected question. This book aims to assess "the prospects for reforming the police abroad as a means of encouraging the development of democratic governments" (p. 6). With accounts of foreign countries that lack basic public infrastructure and have experienced efforts to develop democratic policing, the book immediately focuses attention on the daunting barriers such endeavors must regularly encounter. Among the factors leading to the recent U.S. foreign policy emphasis on improving the nature and capacity of policing abroad are the end of the Cold War and recent U.S. concern over "rogue" nation-states. Bayley sets out a democratic reform agenda first by identifying such "essential practices" of democratic policing as adherence to the rule of law, consistency with international human rights standards, external accountability, and responsiveness to the public. Bayley next describes existing U.S. programs aimed at assisting foreign police, estimating the figure of $636 million as the size of civilian, non-secret U.S. government aid to foreign police. Democratic policing reform strategies (e.g., ensuring police are staffed with the right type of people) and tactics (e.g., preparing for the long term) are then elaborated. Consonant with this discussion, in the book's most important chapter (five), Bayley argues why providing security is not the antithesis of realizing democratic reform. (Of course the application of this claim is not limited—in this post-9/11 security environment—to policing abroad).

A recurring theme of the book is the need for reliable knowledge of what police and, by implication, democratic policing reforms are actually accomplishing. Thus, Bayley advocates "evidence-based policing" (p. 79), or the attempt to manage police activities through ongoing knowledge of their effectiveness. As there are "few careful, systematic, objective evaluations of the impact of

Law & Society Review, Volume 40, Number 4 (2006)
© 2006 by The Law and Society Association. All rights reserved.

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5893.2006.00287.x Published online by Cambridge University Press

foreign assistance abroad" (p. 116), it follows that effective democratic policing reform also requires improved evaluation. He notes that outcomes of U.S. efforts to realize democratic policing abroad are "mixed" (p. 113) but suggests that more systematic judgments about effectiveness first require better evaluation. To this end, prior to his extensive recommendations for programmatic and organizational change in the final chapter, Bayley suggests that all related aid programs have a built-in evaluation component.

This is a highly readable, well-written, and well-organized book. Given the current U.S. endeavor in Iraq, it is also particularly timely. Bayley expertly draws on policy-oriented and scholarly research on policing and on foreign aid more generally to effectively carve out a coherent and convincing approach to fostering democratic policing reforms abroad, one that consistently shows a keen awareness of likely pitfalls and limitations. For example, at the book's outset Bayley discusses the inherent problems of providing assistance to police abroad. He suggests that it may be tantamount to building up an institution traditionally used as a tool of repression against a given country's population or factions thereof and may thus not garner support from certain publics. The book's chief strength lies in its clearly laid–out proposals and how and why they should be enacted, thus making this work highly policy-relevant. More instruction manual—one that includes an executive summary—than academic treatise, scholars looking for assertions about reforming policing abroad informed by sociolegal theories may be disappointed; policy makers seeking reasoned recommendations for progressive reform will not.

A limitation of the book is the recurring tension between policing principles and practices found in the United States and developed countries and those recommended for policing abroad. Bayley advocates reforms that, while usually supported by empirical evidence (e.g., deterrence via the criminal justice system and increasing the number of police above minimal levels will not reduce crime [p. 80]), are not always themselves securely embedded in current U.S. or other Western police institutions, this raises doubts about their effective implementation in more politically unstable and economically uncertain contexts. For example, the lack of evidence-based policing, a consensus that deterrence-based crime control efforts are ineffective in reducing crime, and a commitment to community policing among the rank and file are evident in many police forces in the United States. Bayley is aware of the tension, noting that "foreign advisors should be very careful not to advocate or encourage crime-control strategies abroad that haven't been shown to work at home" (p. 80). But the question lingers: if these practices are not entrenched in U.S. or other Western police institutions, can they

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5893.2006.00287.x Published online by Cambridge University Press

be expected to take hold in countries with inexperienced, fragile, and poorly funded police forces? Putting this aside, this tension also raises moral-ethical doubts about the appropriateness of transferring such policies and practices abroad before U.S. police have their own houses in order. Nevertheless, this is a tension perhaps inherent in foreign aid and development discourse rather than peculiar to what is an excellent book overall.

* * *

Immigrants at the Margins: Law, Race, and Exclusion in Southern Europe. By Kitty Calavita. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2005. Pp. xx+257. $90.00 cloth; $39.99 paper; $32.00 e-book.

Reviewed by Cecilia Menjívar, Arizona State University

Immigrants at the Margins examines the paradoxical nature of immigration in Spain and Italy, two countries with long histories of population movements but with recent experiences of external labor immigration. On the one hand, Italian and Spanish immigration laws emphasize immigrant integration, but on the other hand, both countries treat immigrants strictly as workers, with their legal status dependent on work permits and contracts with employers. Thus, whereas both countries devote resources to programs geared to integration, their laws contribute to keeping immigrants at the margins, denying them permanent residence and restricting their ability to set down roots and to access citizenship and belonging. And while these observations capture the predicament of immigrants in these Mediterranean countries, they are also pertinent for an understanding of immigration to other major receiving countries. As such, this important book is relevant beyond these cases.

Relying on a wide array of empirical sources and making use of a sophisticated analytical lens, Calavita takes us on an examination of a crucial question that characterizes recent immigration in Italy and Spain: why do apparently genuine integration policies fail? Calavita elegantly argues that this failure is linked to the immigrants' economic marginality that the law reproduces. Empirically, she relies on sources such as interviews with government officials, leaders of immigrant associations, union officials, academics, and employers; news media coverage and press conferences; government documents; and other secondary sources. Theoretically, she draws on the literature on law in action, critical race theory, constructions of the "other" or "stranger," racial formation, and citizenship and membership within the

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5893.2006.00287.x Published online by Cambridge University Press