

perspective by relating a religious view of life to sociology and mental health. . . . to examine the problems of work in a religious perspective does not mean a sugar-coating of the harsh realities of industrial life with a sentimental piety' (p. xi).

Yet the impression is one of sugar-coating; the section of the book on the Commonwealth and the meaning of work is a glorious failure in strict sociological terms. No reference is made to the growing literature on work and alienation, on participation and industrial democracy. Mr Blum makes his beliefs explicit. They are, however, difficult to substantiate or refute by empirical evidence. The data itself were gathered by participant observation and intensive interviews and could be made to fit a variety of interpretations. A worker in another factory wrote: 'Work to me is the exception to the rule that life cannot exist in a vacuum.' How would this be interpreted by the author? We may guess: 'Wholeness is also an essential

condition for mental health' (p. xvi).

The book suggests that Scott Bader is a community which is deeply concerned with social religious matters and where individuals are striving for, or have reached, existential maturity. My impression is different. Scott Bader is a small industrial community which is developing along new and important directions. It is a small and worthwhile experiment in industrial democracy which has survived because as a work organization it has attracted more than its share of ideologues. For those of us who require a complex philosophy there is much in this book. It will reaffirm the converted in their convictions. The doubters will find the author's own commitment a major obstacle. There are, however, many who are striving towards the same goal as Mr Blum but who will avoid this book because Scott Bader has become the stage from which a philosophy has been delivered rather than the confirmation of these ideas.

ANDREW GOTTSCHALK

**THE GREAT CHURCH IN CAPTIVITY. A STUDY OF THE PATRIARCHATE OF CONSTANTINOPLE FROM THE EVE OF THE TURKISH CONQUEST TO THE GREEK WAR OF INDEPENDENCE,** by Steven Runciman. *Cambridge University Press*, 1968. pp. 10 + 455. 55s.

**THE ORTHODOX CHURCH AND INDEPENDENT GREECE, 1821-1852,** by Charles A. Frazee. *Cambridge University Press*, 1969. pp. 8 + 220. £3.

Sir Steven Runciman and Professor Frazee between them cover a span of six centuries in the history of the Greek Church, from the mid-thirteenth to the mid-nineteenth century—a period which has been all too little studied, either in the west or by the Greeks themselves. Both these works are of a high scholarly standard, and together they constitute a notable addition to the existing literature on the subject. By a happy coincidence—for the books were written independently—Professor Frazee takes up the story at the very point where Sir Steven leaves off, in the year 1821.

Sir Steven begins with an account of Church life in the restored Byzantine Empire of the Palaeologi, during the two hundred years which preceded the fall of Constantinople in 1453. Here, as he himself admits, he adds little to what has been already said by other scholars: but his summary is extremely well done, and will be widely welcomed. He rightly underlines the crucial significance of mystical theology in the Byzantine religious outlook. There is an illuminating chapter on 'The Church and the Philosophers', which speaks among other things of the Byzantine Thomists and which shows how misleading it is to classify all Byzantine theologians as 'Platonists'. One thing emerges

very plainly from Sir Steven's pages. Whatever the political weakness of the Byzantine Empire on the eve of the Turkish conquest, the Byzantine Church was spiritually and intellectually very much alive. In the words of Fr Gervase Mathew, O.P., 'Byzantine civilization was never more fertile than when it was destroyed' (*Byzantine Aesthetics*, London, 1963, p. 141).

After this introductory section, Sir Steven proceeds to what is his main theme: the history of Greek Orthodoxy under Turkish domination. Largely neglected by past historians, this is an epoch of decisive importance in the evolution of Orthodox Christendom. As Professor Frazee rightly insists in the preface to his book, 'There is a prevalent feeling that not much of importance happened during these centuries of isolation, and yet it was during this time that the Orthodox Church as it presently exists in Greece and Constantinople was formed' (p. vii). Sir Steven's chapters comprise the first really satisfying survey of this period to appear in any western European language.

Even so, it has not been possible for him to say everything in the pages of one book. He is at his best when discussing the 'official' or

'diplomatic' history of the Patriarchate of Constantinople—its relations with the Moslem authorities and its negotiations with Christians in the west. He is also excellent on the intellectual background and the state of learning in the Church. By comparison he has far less to say about popular piety and the religious life of the Greek people as a whole—about such matters as conditions in ordinary monasteries and parishes, the daily relations between Christians and Moslems, or the frequency of apostasy to Islam. As a result of these omissions his narrative, for all its brilliance, possesses a somewhat formal and even external character. But when he has offered us so much, it is certainly ungracious to ask for more.

*The Great Church in Captivity* ends by describing the position immediately before the Greek war of independence. It was not a situation which boded well for the future of the Greek Church. The Church, it is true, occupied a central place in the national life, for it was the Church which had enabled the Greek people to endure as a distinctive unit through four centuries of alien rule. Yet the men who planned the rising of 1821 tended to despise the Church as backward and obscurantist, and they looked for guidance to secular and humanistic movements in the west, such as the French revolution. Evidently matters were not going to prove simple for traditionalist Orthodox in the restored Greek kingdom.

Professor Frazee, in his fascinating analysis of Church-state relations during the first thirty years of Greek independence, depicts these emerging difficulties with a painful clarity. King Otho's Bavarian advisers, in particular von Maurer, imposed an Erastian system whereby the Church was treated virtually as a department of the civil service. The conservative party in the Greek Church, along with the Ecumenical Patriarchate of Constantinople, protested vehemently against these arrangements, but with very little success. This unresolved tension between Church and state has continued in modern Greece up to the present time: Professor Frazee's book has thus a sharp contemporary relevance and will help the western observer to appreciate many

developments in Greek Church life since the colonels' *coup* in April 1967.

*The Great Church in Captivity* is written with all the stylistic elegance and narrative skill that we have come to expect from Sir Steven Runciman. Professor Frazee is dealing with a more restricted topic—Church-state relations—and with a much briefer span of time; his book, in consequence, is more heavily loaded with detail than Sir Steven's and makes heavier demands on the concentration of the reader. Yet he also has told his story well. Both books are provided with copious footnotes, of great value to the specialist; and both contain admirable bibliographies, although Professor Frazee has made fuller use of modern Greek works.

When these two books are set side by side, there emerges from them a somewhat unexpected moral. *The Great Church in Captivity* shows a Christian community outwardly in a state of grave decadence, with startling corruption and dishonesty in the upper hierarchy of the Church, and narrow ignorance among the lower clergy. Yet despite all this, and despite the demoralizing status of social inferiority which the Christian *rayah* endured under the Turks, the Church survived and retained the loyalty of the people. Simple men and women preserved a persistent confidence in the promises of the Gospel. This stable perseverance of Orthodoxy under Islam, while externally unheroic, is in reality one of the most remarkable chapters in the history of Christendom. In *The Orthodox Church and Independent Greece*, by contrast, we see the same Church, now no longer under infidel oppression but in a position of apparent privilege. Yet paradoxically the result is not religious revival but rather a progressive decline. As each decade passes in the new Greek kingdom, the influence of the Church diminishes; and it fails signally to offer that spiritual leadership which it had provided in less prosperous days.

It is an interesting cautionary tale. As Origen remarked, times of peace are favourable to Satan rather than to Christ.

KALLISTOS TIMOTHY WARE

**CELTIC NATIONALISM**, by Owen Dudley Edwards, Gwynfor Evans, Ioan Rhys and Hugh MacDiarmid. *Routledge & Kegan Paul*, London, 1968. 358 pp. 45s.

Irish, Welsh and Scottish nationalism are not new to us. The publishers of this volume are chiefly to be congratulated on their attempt to present a picture of a nationalism not merely

'regional' but Celtic. The assumption is that the Celtic peoples in these islands have more in common than a common heritage of suffering at the hands of the English; the theme is