

VOLUME 31

NUMBER 3

JULY 2022

# CQ

---

*Cambridge*

---

*Quarterly of*

---

*Healthcare*

---

*Ethics*

---

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to  
Engaging a World Community  
of Bioethicists*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



**Cambridge**  
**Quarterly of**  
**Healthcare**  
**Ethics**

*A Quarterly  
Journal Devoted  
to Engaging a  
World Community  
of Bioethicists*

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*  
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *Aalto University, Helsinki, Finland*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*  
William Andreck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco, USA*  
Martin Buijsen, *Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands*  
Arthur Caplan, *NYU Langone Medical Center, New York, USA*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York, USA*  
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center of Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University, USA*  
Paul J. Ford, *Cleveland Clinic, USA*  
James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center, USA*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, United Kingdom*  
David Lawrence, *University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom*  
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands*  
Guillermo Palchik, *California Pacific Medical Center, USA*  
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York, USA*  
Doris Schroeder, *University of Central Lancaster, United Kingdom*  
Pavel Tichschenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburgh & West Virginia University, USA*

**The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups: Connecting Bioethics Educators Around the World**

The purpose of the Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups is to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. These focus groups invite others to share their information and develop mutual projects to further how bioethics is taught in universities, hospitals, and for the general public.

<https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/cambridge-quarterly-of-healthcare-ethics/cambridge-bioethics-education-working-groups>

CLINICAL NEUROETHICS ADVISORY BOARD

EDITOR

Thomasine Kushner, *University of California, Berkeley*  
[kushnerk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnerk@gmail.com)

EDITORIAL BOARD

Yves Agid, *Institut du Cerveau et de la Moelle Épineière, France*  
Martin Buijsen, *Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands*  
Benjamin Capps, *Dalhousie University, Canada*  
John Danaher, *National University of Ireland, Galway, Ireland*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York, USA*  
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic, USA*  
Grant Gillett, *University of Otago Medical School, New Zealand*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, United Kingdom*  
Stephen Hauser, *University of California, San Francisco, USA*  
Göran Hermerén, *Lund University, Sweden*  
Judy Illes, *The University of British Columbia, Canada*  
Philipp Kellmeyer, *University of Freiburg Medical Center, Germany*  
Karola Kreitmair, *University of Wisconsin–Madison, USA*  
David Lawrence, *University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom*  
Guillermo Palchik, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco, USA*

Neuroethics Network/Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education/International Bioethics Retreat  
<http://www.icmbioethics.com/cambridge-home.html>

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 31, Number 3, July 2022

## CONTENTS

### *Special Section: Transplant Ethics*

- Guest Editorial: The Transplant Trolley Problem  
ROBERT OSORIO AND GUILLERMO PALCHIK 281

### *The Great Debates*

- Should Compensation for Organ Donation Be Allowed?  
ARTHUR CAPLAN AND ROSAMOND RHODES 286

### *Articles*

- Ethical Solutions to the Problem of Organ Shortage  
AKSEL BRAANEN STERRI, SADIE REGMI, AND JOHN HARRIS 297

- Full Reciprocity: An Essential Element for a Fair Opt-Out  
Organ Transplantation Policy  
LEONARD FLECK 310

- Balancing Equity and Efficiency in Kidney Allocation: An  
Overview  
AMIR ELALOUF AND JOSEPH S. PLISKIN 321

- The Duty to Protect, Abortion, and Organ Donation  
EMILY CARROLL AND PARKER CRUTCHFIELD 333

### *Commentary*

- Ethical Issues Concerning Organ Donation  
JOHN J. PARIS 344

- Restrictivism, Abortion, and Organ Donation  
WILLIAM SIMKULET 348

### *Articles*

- Existing Ethical Tensions in Xenotransplantation  
L. SYD M. JOHNSON 355

- Organ Trafficking: Why Do Healthcare Workers Engage in It?  
TREVOR STAMMERS 368

- Cases Abusing Brain Death Definition in Organ Procurement  
in China  
NORBERT W. PAUL, KIRK C. ALLISON, AND HUIGE LI 379

- Case Vignettes in Transplant Psychiatry Ethics  
H. PAUL CHIN 386

*Contents continued*

*Contents continued*

Altruistic Organ Donation: On Giving a Kidney to a Stranger  
LEONARD FLECK AND ARTHUR WARD 395

Notes from an Organ Recipient: Once is Enough  
ANNIE KLEBAHN CONDON 400

*Departments and Columns*

*The Case I Can't Forget*

If You Catch the Ball, We Win the Game. If You Drop It,  
We Lose  
ROBERT W. OSORIO 403

*Perspectives*

A Philosophy for Choosing Doctors  
JACOB M. APPEL 407

*CQ Review*

*Games: Agency as Art*  
by Nguyen Thi  
REVIEWED BY AUDREY YAP 411

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Articles should be submitted via ScholarOne at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/cqhe>. Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should also be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to [kushnertk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnertk@gmail.com).

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006/ Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 31 (2022) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$735/£457; online only: \$561/£350; print only: \$744/£465. Individual rates, print only: \$156/£95; online only: \$118/£72. Single part: \$214/£134. Students and retirees: \$132/£83. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: \$111/£66. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK.

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2022. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).