

---

## List of Contributors

- Lionel Bently Faculty of Laws, King's College, University of London, Strand, London WC2R 2LS, UK Tel: (071) 836 5454 Fax: (071) 873 2465
- Sarah Dromgoole Faculty of Law, University of Leicester, Leicester LE1 7RH, UK Tel: (0533) 522287 Fax: (0533) 522200
- Igor Emetz Institute of Archaeology, Department of Classical Archaeology, Dm. Ulyanova Street 19, Moscow 117036, Russia
- Caroline Forder Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid, Privaatrecht, Rijkuniversiteit Limburg Postbus 616, 6200 MD Maastricht, NL Tel: 31 43 88-3206/3097, Fax 0340 258981
- Nicholas Gaskell Faculty of Law, University of Southampton, Southampton S09 5NH, UK Tel: (0703) 593710 Fax: (0703) 593024
- Anatoly Golentzov Institute of Archaeology, Department of Classical Archaeology, Dm. Ulyanova Street 19, Moscow 117036, Russia
- Joanna Goyder European Co-Ordinator, Baker & McKenzie, Boulevard du Régent 40, 1000 Brussels, Belgium Tel: 010 32 2 5063611 Fax: 010 32 2 5116280
- John Murdoch Assistant Director (Collections), Victoria and Albert Museum, South Kensington, London SW7 2RL, UK Tel: (071) 938 8602 Fax: (071) 938 8477
- Norman E. Palmer Faculty of Laws, University College of London, Bentham House, 4–8 Endsleigh Gardens, London WC1H OEG, UK Tel: (071) 380 7326 Fax: (071) 387 9597

---

List of Contributors

---

- Robert K. Paterson Faculty of Law, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada V6T 1Z1 Tel: (604) 822 3905 Fax: (604) 822 8108
- Benoît Pelletier Faculty of Law (Fauteux Hall), University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada K1N 6N5 Tel: (613) 564 7075 Fax: (613) 564 9889
- Marina Schneider UNIDROIT, Via Parisperna, 28 Rome 00184, Italy Tel: 39 6 684 1372 Fax: 39 6 684 1394
- Kurt Siehr Rechtswissenschaftliches Seminar der Universität Zürich Centrum Für Internationales Privatrecht, Wiesenstraße 9, CH-8008 Zürich Tel: 257 31 11/12 Fax: 382 02 85
- Martin P. Wyss Lägernstraße 28, CH-8037 Zürich Tel: 364 10 32

---

# Index to Volume Two

## Table of Contents

### Articles

Church, Judith, 'Evolving U.S. Case Law on Cultural Property Disputes'	47–71
Davenport, Brian and Ross, Anthony, 'Market Overt'	25–45
Dromgoole, Sarah and Gaskell, Nicholas, 'Who has a Right to Historic Wrecks and Wreckage?'	217–273
Frigo, Manlio, 'The Proposed EEC Council Directive on the Return of Unlawfully Exported Cultural Objects'	73–80
Katz, Stephen, 'Penal Protection of Cultural Property: The Canadian Approach'	11–24
Murdoch, John, 'Attribution and the Claim to Objectivity'	319–334
Palmer, Norman, 'Treasure Trove and Title to Discovered Antiquities'	275–318

### Book Reviews

Kleeberg, Rudolf and Eberl, Wolfgang, <i>Cultural Objects in Private Possession. Handbook on the Law of Monuments and their Taxation</i> (Kurt Siehr)	185
Fechner, Frank, <i>Legal Protection of Archaeological Cultural Property</i> (Kurt Siehr)	410–411
Knott, Hermann, <i>The Right to Claim Restoration of Stolen and Illegally Exported Goods</i> (Christina Fischauer)	183–184
Lewis, Justin, <i>Art, Culture and Enterprise: The Politics of Art and Cultural Industries</i> (Lionel Bentley)	401–407
Moulin, Raymonde, <i>L'artiste, l'institution, le marché</i> (Thomas Dreier)	171–175
Reichelt, Gerte, (ed.) <i>Internationale Kulturgüterschutz – Wiener Symposium 18./19. Oktober 1990</i> (Martin Phillip Wyss)	408–409
Tait, Simon, <i>Palaces of Discovery</i> (Lady Mason)	412–413
Weyergraff-Serra, C. and Buskirk, M., (eds.) <i>The Destruction of 'Tilted Arc': Documents</i> (David Saunders)	176–182
Wolff, Janet and Seed, John, (eds.) <i>The Culture of Capital: art power and the nineteenth-century middle class</i> (Phillip Smith)	186–187

**Case Notes**

Bragg, Richard, 'Trade Descriptions and the Art World'	127–131
Forder, Caroline, 'The Bredius Museum Case: Public Interest and Private International Law'	117–125
Kohler, Paul, 'Colonel Sanders, Finding and Possessory Title'	133–145
Montgomery, Jonathan, 'The Responsibility of Church and State for Preserving Cultural Property'	105–110
Paterson, Robert, 'Bolivian Textiles in Canada'	359–370
Pelletier, Benoît, 'The Case of the Treasure of L'Ange Gardien: An Overview'	371–382
Polzer, Anna-Maria, 'A Clock in Court: East German Export of Cultural Property Considered by West German Courts'	111–115

**Chronicles and Events**

April 1992 – September 1992	87–103
October 1992 – March 1993	339–358

**Conference Reports**

'International Conference on the Theme 'Eredità Contestata?' Rome 29–30 April 1991 (Brian Cook)	189–195
'The Legal Aspects of International Trade in Art' Madrid 12–14 February 1992 (Astrid-Maria Muller)	196–201
'The Penal Protection of Cultural Property. A Seminar held by the International Institute of Higher Studies in Criminal Sciences' Siracusa 22–26 March 1992 (Marina Schneider)	393–400
'Sixth Annual Conference of the Institute of Field Archaeologists' Birmingham 6–8 April 1992 (Brian Cook)	202
'The Second International Art, Antique and Architectural Theft Conference held by Trace Magazine and the Georgian Group' London 8–11 June 1992 (Ben Ward)	203–207

**Documents**

Draft License for Landowners Wishing to allow Metal Detecting on their Land	160
German Archaeology Institute – The Berlin Declaration	157–158
The National Council for Metal Detecting Code of Conduct	159

**Essays**

Cumming, Valerie, 'Some Observations on a Recent Acquisition'	81–85
Emetz, Igor and Golentzov, Anatoly, 'The Pillage of the Ancient Tombs in the Crimea'	335–337

**Opinion**

- Jenkins, Simon, 'Dead and Dismembered on the Nile'  
Extract from *The Times* 383–385

**Projects in Progress**

- Egoumenidou, Frosso, 'The Cyprus Department of Antiquities and the Protection of Monuments of the Recent Past' 163–169

**Treaties and EC Matters**

- Goyder, Joanna, 'European Community Free Movement of Cultural Goods and European Community Law'  
Part III: 'Two New Legislative Proposals' 147–155  
Part IV: 'Progress of Legislative Proposals' 387–392

## Table of Statutes

**Europe**

- Cyprus  
1964 Antiquities Law 163–169
- Denmark  
1963 Law Concerning the Protection of Historic Wreckage 230
- Finland  
1963 Act on Historic Relics 230
- France  
1962 'Loi Malraux' 165
- Germany (East)  
1976 International Commercial Transactions Act 113
- Germany  
1971 Monuments Act (Baden-Württemberg) 410
- Italy  
1909 Regulation for the Execution of Law No 364 57  
1913 Royal Decree No 363 57 ff.,  
1939 Statute for the Protection of Items of Artistic  
of Historical Interest, Law No 1089 58–60, 78  
1990 Criminal Code 397–398
- 419

<b>Netherlands</b>	
1925 Museum Act	117–122
<b>Spain</b>	
1962 <i>Estatuto</i> nr. 60/62	229
<b>Switzerland</b>	
1989 Federal Statute on International Private Law	183
<b>United Kingdom</b>	
1275 Statute of Westminster I	241–242
1588 Sale of Horses Act	29
1 Jac. I. cap. 21	33
5 Geo. IV cap.cix	37
1858 Government of India Act	227
1871 Lloyd's Act	237–238
1893 Sale of Goods Act	36, 37, 39–40
1894 Merchant Shipping Act	218, 222 ff., 243 ff., 256
1906 Marine Insurance Act	235 ff., 239–240
1906 Merchant Shipping Act	243
1925 Law of Property Act	284
1947 Indian Independence Act	227
1968 Theft Act	37, 288
1973 Protection of Wrecks Act	218, 223, 256
1977 Torts (Interference with Goods) Act	277, 288
1979 Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act	289
1979 Sale of Goods Act	25, 29, 30, 34, 39, 105, 277
1985 Food and Environment Protection Act	230
1986 Protection of Military Remains Act	219, 231–232, 256
1987 Consumer Protection Act	129
<b>The Americas</b>	
<b>Canada</b>	
1977 Cultural Property Export and Import Act	7, 11–24, 360ff.
1986 Customs Act	364, 366
<b>Cayman Islands</b>	
1977 Abandoned Wreck Law	229
<b>Guatemala</b>	
1965 Constitution	49
1966 Decree Law No 437	49
<b>Mexico</b>	
1897 Law on Archaeological Monuments	51–53
1917 Constitution	52
1930 Law on the Protection and Conservation of Monuments and Natural Beauty	51
1934 Law for the Protection and Preservation of Archaeological and Historic Monuments, Typical Towns and Places of Scenic Beauty	51–52

1970 Law Concerning Cultural Patrimony of the Nation	51–52
1972 Law on Archaeological, Artistic and Historic Monuments and Zones	52–54
Peru	
1929 Law No 6634	55–56
1985 Law No 24047	55
1985 Supreme Decree and Statute	55–56
United States	
1919 National Motor Vehicle Theft Act	49
1934 National Stolen Property Act	48 ff.
1983 Cultural Property Implementation Act	54, 56, 61
1983 New York State Artists' Authorship Rights Act	177
1987 Abandoned Shipwreck Act	218 ff., 230, 235, 256
1988 Berne Convention Implementation Act	177
<b>Australasia</b>	
Australia	
1976 Historic Shipwrecks Act	228–229
New Zealand	
1952 Shipping and Seamen Act	218

## Table of Cases

Australia	
Byrne v Hoare (1965)	298
Robinson v Western Australian Museum (1977)	234
Canada	
Kowal v Ellis (1977)	299
Musées nationaux du Canada c. Fabrique de la paroisse de l'Ange-Gardien (Qué.) (1987)	371–382
R v Heller, Zango and Kassam (1983)	17–20, 360–361, 366, 367
R v Yorke (1992)	361–367
Germany	
Kammergericht Berlin (17 U 492/87) (1987)	111–115
Ireland	
Webb v Ireland and the Attorney General (1988)	294–297
	421

Netherlands	
Alnati (1966)	119
The Bredius Case (1990)	117–124
New Zealand	
Tamworth Industries v A-G (1991)	133–145
United Kingdom	
Ardath Tobacco v Ocker (1930)	39
Armory v Delamirie (1721)	298
Association and The Romney, The	249
A-G v Trustees of the British Museum (1903)	280
A-G of the Duchy of Lancaster v G E Overton (Farms) Ltd (1982)	278, 280, 285, 293
A-G of New Zealand v Ortiz (1984)	7, 21, 60, 183, 367
Bailiffs of Tewkesbury v Diston, The (1805)	34, 35
Bishopsgate Motor Finance Corporation Ltd v Transport Brakes Ltd (1949)	37 ff.
Case of the Crown Jewels (1457)	27, 35
Case of Market Overt (1596)	27, 29, 32, 36
Chaddock, In re (1992)	281(n.53), 283(n.66)
Clayton v Le Roy (1911)	28, 31, 36
Cossmann v West (1887)	246–247
Crane v London Dock Company (1864)	35, 38
Eastern Trust Co Ltd v National Trust Co Ltd (1914)	296–297
Elwes v Brigg Gas Company (1886)	219, 299
Hamilton v Davis (1771)	242–243
Hannah v Peel (1945)	284
Hargreave v Spink (1892)	31, 37–38
Hartop v Hoare (1743)	33
Hill v Smith (1812)	35
Kerby v Wichelow (1502)	34
Lang v Jones and Skinner (1990)	32
Lee v Bayes (1856)	32–33, 37
London Corp'n v Appleyard (1963)	298, 300–301
Lusitania, The (1986)	233, 239, 244, 252, 256
Lyons v De Pass (1840)	30–31
McDowell v Ulster Bank Ltd (1899)	298
May v Vincent (1990)	127–131
Mayor of London v Joint Stock Bank (1881)	27–28
Moffat v Kazana (1969)	284
Moyce v Newington (1878)	37
Parker v British Airways Board (1982)	252, 281 ff., 296, 299
Pryor of Lantony's Case, The (1472)	28
R v Forty-nine Casks of Brandy (1836)	241
R v Hancock (1990)	204, 276, 280, 288–289
R v Property Derelict (1835)	244
Reid v The Metropolitan Police Commissioner and Cocks (1973)	35–36



St Bartholomew's Aldborough, Re (1990)	105–109
St Gregory's Tredington, Re (1971)	105–106
St Mary's Broadwater, Re (1976)	106, 109
St Stephen, Walbrook, Re (1987)	106, 108
Simon v Taylor (1975)	234
South Staffordshire Water Co v Sharman (1896)	299
Title of the Finder, The. See McDowell v Ulster Bank Ltd	
Tubantia, The (1924)	233, 248–249
Winkfield, The (1902)	287, 297
Winkworth v Christie, Manson and Woods (1980)	205
USA	
Autocephalous Greek Orthodox Church of Cyprus v Goldberg (1990)	205
Boston Corporation v France, Fenwick & Co (1923)	236
Columbus America Discovery Group v The Unidentified, Wrecked and Abandoned Sailing Vessel (1992)	214, 237, 249–250, 252–256
Jeanneret v Vichey (1982)	47, 56–60
Peru v Johnson (1989)	47, 53, 54–56, 61
Treasure Salvors Inc v The Unidentified, Wrecked and Abandoned Sailing Vessel (1978)	252 ff.
United States v Hollinshead (1973)	47 ff., 60
United States v McClain (1977)	47, 50 ff., 60, 205
United States v Steinmetz (1991)	234
United States v Swetnam (1988)	48, 54–56

## Table of Conventions and Treaties

1886 Berne Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Works	177
1910 Salvage Convention	251
1950 European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	366
1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Even of Armed Conflict	205, 215
1957 EEC Treaty of Rome	74 ff., 147 ff., 199, 387 ff., 395 ff., 410
1958 Geneva Convention on the Continental Shelf	220ff.
1970 UNESCO Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property	16, 19, 50, 76 ff., 183–4, 189 ff., 197, 202, 205, 360 ff., 383, 397, 411

1970 Treaty of Cooperation Between the United States and Mexico Providing for the Recovery of Stolen Archaeological, Historical and Cultural Properties	54
1973 Washington Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Flora and Fauna	411
1982 UN Convention on the Law of the Sea	221
1986 EC Single European Act	395
1988 Hague Convention on Succession	121–4
1989 Salvage Convention	251, 252
1992 EC Maastricht Treaty on European Union	79, 395

## Subject Index

- Alabama*, CSS 227, 234  
Aldborough helmet 105–109  
Amiot, Laurent 376  
Art market 171–175, 186–187  
    legal aspects of 196–201, 203 ff.,  
Arts funding in UK 401–407  
Baillairgé, Francois 376  
*Birkenhead*, HMS 228–229  
Bode, Wilhelm 331–333  
Canova, Antonio, 408  
*Central America*, SS 214, 253–256, 357–358  
Chagall, Marc 320  
Coke, Sir Edward 27  
    interpretation of market overt 29 ff.,  
    interpretation of treasure trove 277  
Cultural property, illegal trade in  
    Canada 11–24, 359–371, 398–399  
    EC 73–80, 147–155, 189 ff., 203 ff., 387–392, 393 ff.  
    Germany 111–115, 348, 410–411  
    Guatemala 49–50, 51  
    Italy 58–60, 393ff.  
    Mexico 50–54  
    Peru 54–56, 361 ff.  
    Russia 205–206, 335–337, 347, 348  
    Switzerland 397  
    USA 47–71, 183, 348, 350, 361 ff., 396  
Church of England 105 ff.,  
Crimea 335–337  
*Cy-près* doctrine 123  
Derrynaflan hoard 294–297  
Gariépy, Joseph-Henry 371, 373 ff.  
German Archaeology Institute 157–158  
*Grace Dieu* 224  
*Grosvenor*, HMS 227  
Lang, Jack 174  
*Lex situs* rule 112, 183, 204, 213  
Lippi, Fra Filippo 329–330  
Lloyd's of London 223, 229, 237–238  
Long, Basil 326–227  
*Lusitania* 223, 239, 243–244  
*Lutine* 224, 229, 236  
Machaquila Stela 2, 49  
Market overt 8, 25–45, 105, 213  
    Coke's Rule of 29–30  
    exceptions to 30–37  
    history of 25–27

- time of day and 35–37  
 proposals for abolition of  
 39–40  
 sales in 38–39  
 statutory markets and 37–38  
*Mary Rose* 224, 226  
 Metal detecting 160–161, 336  
 National Council for 159  
 Middleham jewel 276, 280–281  
 Monkton Deverill (torc) 276,  
 283  
 Montague, Samuel, 81 ff.,  
 Moore, Sir Henry 106  
 Morelli, Giovanni 327–333  
 Munter, Gabrielle 127 ff.,  
 Museum of London 81–85  
*Nemo dat* rule 8, 25 ff., 60, 204,  
 213, 277, 396  
 Nok culture 18–20, 360  
*Nuestra Señora de Atocha* 229,  
 253  
 Pentney (Anglo-Saxon  
 Brooches) 283–284 ff., 302  
 Possessory title 134–136 ff.,  
 214, 298 ff.  
 Priority rules 118–120  
 Quebec  
 civil law of and ‘sacred’ ob-  
 jects 371–382  
 Ranvoyzé, Francois 375–376  
 Reynolds, Graham 325 ff.  
 Royal Armouries 105–109  
 Salvage 245–256  
 and finding 252–256  
 Sasseville, Francois 375–376  
 Serra, Richard 176–181  
 Snettisham Hoard 276, 279, 305  
 Stonham Aspel (hoard) 284  
 Thetford Hoard 285 ff., 301, 303  
*Titanic* 217, 238, 347  
 Treasure trove 8, 141–142, 159,  
 161, 214, 275–318  
*animus recuperandi* and 276,  
 279–281  
 civil law of finders and  
 297–301  
 ingredients of 277–281  
 procedure in cases of  
 281–282  
 protection of in criminal law  
 288–290  
 reform initiatives and  
 290–294  
 rewards and 282–288  
 rights of landowners and  
 294–297  
 Turner, JMW 127–129 ff., 342,  
 348, 353  
 UNIDROIT 7  
 draft convention of 74,  
 183–184, 196 ff., 394 ff.  
 Van Mander, Karel 324  
 Vertue, George 324  
 Victoria and Albert Museum  
 82 ff., 319–334, 340, 343, 352  
 Winter, Carl 326 ff.  
 Wreck 217–273  
 abandonment of rights in  
 232–235  
 Crown rights in 240–245  
 human remains and 230–232  
 insurers’ interests in 235–240  
 international law and  
 218–222  
 ownership of 224–230  
 personal possessions and  
 230–232  
 receiver of wreck service  
 222–224  
 salvors’ rights in 245–256  
 Wren, Sir Christopher 106, 108  
 Zenonos, tower of 335



---

Contents

---

- |     |   |   |
|-----|---|---|
| 408 | Gerte Reichelt (ed.)<br><i>Internationaler<br/>Kulturgüterschutz –<br/>Wiener Symposium 18./19.<br/>Oktober 1990</i><br>Martin Philipp Wyss | Archaeological Cultural<br>Property]<br>Kurt Siehr          |
| 410 | Frank Fechner<br><i>Rechtlicher Schutz<br/>archäologischer<br/>Kulturgüter</i> [Legal<br>Protection of                                      | 412 Simon Tait<br><i>Palaces of Discovery</i><br>Lady Mason |
|     |   | 415 List of Contributors                                    |
|     |   | 417 <b>Index</b>  |

# Contents

No. 2 · Vol. 2 · 1993

- 213 Editorial  
Norman Palmer

## Articles

- 217 Who has a Right to  
Historic Wrecks and  
Wreckage?  
Sarah Dromgoole and  
Nicholas Gaskell
- 275 Treasure Trove and Title  
to Discovered Antiquities  
Norman E. Palmer
- 319 Attribution and the Claim  
to Objectivity  
John Murdoch

## Essay

- 335 The Pillage of the Ancient  
Tombs in the Crimea  
Igor Emetz and  
Anatoly Golentsov

## 339 Chronicles

## Case Notes

- 359 Bolivian Textiles in  
Canada  
Robert K. Paterson
- 371 The Case of the Treasure  
of L'Ange Gardien:  
An Overview  
Benoît Pelletier

## Opinion

- 383 'Dead and Dismembered  
on the Nile': Extract  
from *The Times*  
Simon Jenkins

## Treaties and EC Matters

- 387 European Community  
Free Movement of  
Cultural Goods and  
European Community  
Law  
Part IV: Progress of  
Legislative Proposals  
Joanna Goyder

## Conference Reports

- 393 The Penal Protection of  
Cultural Property: A  
Seminar held by the  
International Institute of  
Higher Studies in  
Criminal Sciences  
(ISISC), Siracusa (Italy),  
22–26 March 1992  
Marina Schneider

## Book Reviews

- 401 Justin Lewis *Art, Culture  
and Enterprise: The  
Politics of Art and the  
Cultural Industries*  
Lionel Bently