

solidarity with industrial workers. Only by their 'presence' could these Christians attempt to break down 'the barriers caused by the past actions or inactions of the church and present misunderstanding' (Williamson).

These priests, their families and friends, in the 1950s and 1960s often found that Catholics, both in their workplace and further afield, understood best what they were striving to do. They drew constantly upon the example of the French *prêtres ouvriers*. I suspect that the leading part played by Dominicans among others in this movement is no longer widely remembered; a pity, since it involved an impressive and costly work of Christian solidarity. It came to grief when the Roman authorities decided to curb left-wing political involvement. But these men were at that time in France necessarily and by vocation 'fellow-travellers'.

What did these worker priests achieve by 'travelling' alongside their workmates? As one French priest put it to a somewhat sceptical Ted Wickham of the Sheffield Industrial Mission: 'C'est la présence! C'est la présence!'. And in forty-five years time the attitude of the French workers to the Church will be different because of this presence' (*Abbé Hollande*). High, unrealisable hopes! Today, with an ongoing *embourgeoisement* of the Church in Britain and with dramatic changes in the industrial landscape, is this episode in the Church's history in any way relevant? We must hope so.

While warmly commending Mantle's book, I cannot help regretting that it ends on so valedictory a note: 'Though many of them [worker priests] are still with us, we may never see their like again, and the Christian Church will be the poorer for it. Perhaps, one day, someone will grant them just a few lines in the *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*.' If the worker priests are so insecure in the memory of the Church, then so much the worse for the Church!

TONY CROSS

**SHAME : THEORY, THERAPY, AND THEOLOGY** by Stephen Pattison, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2000. Pp. 343, £14.95 pbk.

The starting point of this book is very interesting. The author, an Anglican priest and research fellow in 'practical theology' at Cardiff University, has, as he very frankly tells us, long suffered from shame in the form of feelings of defilement and unworthiness. This led him to fifteen years of treatment by a psychotherapist, and to write this book. In writing it, his intention was to find an adequate definition for shame, and then, while presenting something of his own experience, to see what contemporary psychology and psychotherapy have to say about the causes and cure of shame and how all this relates to the Christian understanding of shame.

This could have been the recipe for a marvellous book. But I

354

felt myself disappointed, even though there are some positive aspects, the extensive tour of contemporary literature on the question of shame, and the author's mercifully jargon-free style. Stephen Pattison is surely quite right to use Wittgenstein's metaphor of 'family resemblances' to justify the use of the one word 'shame' for a variety of psychological conditions. Unfortunately, he is too preoccupied by the problem of shame as a generalised internalised sense of inadequacy, that he does not explore in any detail other meanings of shame, and his references to shame in non-Western cultures are largely confined to noting the now discarded distinction between 'shame' and 'guilt' cultures. He therefore finds it difficult to see shame as possessing positive qualities, and never really asks the question 'What would human beings be like without shame?'

My answer would be that we would all have to be Robinson Crusoes, since the capacity to feel and to communicate shame is very closely tied in to the human capacity for living in society. While Pattison notes that there is something of a taboo against writers on psychology quoting their own experiences, and considers that he is justified in breaking this, it seems to me that his self-revelation is both sufficiently adequate to serve as a case study, while at the same time his bringing up what are clearly very painful memories is more likely to provoke pity rather than empathy.

While, as I have said, the survey of contemporary psychology literature on shame is the best part of the book, it is curious that so little attention is given to the founders of the various psychiatric schools. Freud is found unhelpful (p.44), even though the author's account of his own problems reminds me of the classic Freudian paradigm of the autocratic super ego and the anarchical id ganging up against the ego and preventing it getting real maturity. While, evidently, much that is interesting has been written about shame over the past thirty years, this has not really brought about much progress in treatment. Pattison tells us (p.170) 'Most psychotherapeutic treatments of chronic shame are costly, lengthy, demanding and unpredictable'.

When Pattison leads us to meet Christian theologians who have written on shame, his choice falls first on Protestants of Germanophone background: Barth, Bonhoeffer, Reinhold Niebuhr and Tillich. None of these seems very satisfying ('Tillich is thus better at diagnosis than at cure' p.195). He then considers a number of pastoral theologians, some of whom seem certainly very interesting, notably James and Evelyn Whitehead, who have sought to stress the positive aspect of shame, and the Barthian psychotherapist Dorothy Van Deusen Hunsinger. But even with these, Pattison's verdict is predominantly unfavourable: 'The Christian pastoral theology that I have described...stands arraigned of not taking shame seriously enough, despite its own considerable best efforts' (p.223).

But how satisfactory is Pattison's own theology? Reading his

book, I was reminded of the Methodist dictum that for creative Christian theology there is needed not only the testimonies of Scripture, tradition and reason but also Christian experience. Pattison's Christian experience has been so subjectively disappointing and objectively impoverished that he is not able to achieve his ambition of promoting a dialogue between psychotherapy and Christian theology. This comes out particularly in his interpretation of forgiveness: 'if God has the power to forgive and reconcile, shall this also be seen as a kind of distortion and defence that sets God apart or alienates God from creation? In which case, does our understanding of God need fundamental reconstruction to acknowledge that God's saving work is ultimately a relinquishing of the power to forgive?' (p.201). This relates to his early experiences: 'my own early experiences of Christian ideas and practices did little to dissipate my own sense of shame and defilement and much to reinforce it' (p.230). A God who does not forgive, or who cannot forgive, would simply not be the Father of Jesus whom we know from the New Testament. And if somebody, belonging to a Christian community, finds that the good news of forgiveness is really bad news, then there is something very wrong with them or with the community.

My own intention in writing thus is not to insult Stephen Pattison. I should be delighted if this review provoked him, or someone else, to write another book, better informed on, and more sympathetic to, the Christian tradition.

ADRIAN C. EDWARDS C.S.Sp.

***SPES SCOTORUM: HOPE OF SCOTS: SAINT COLUMBA, IONA AND SCOTLAND*, edited by Dauvit Broun and Thomas Owen Clancy, T&T Clark, Edinburgh, 1999. Pp. xv + 314, £15.95 pbk.**

This fine collection of ten essays forms part of the Scottish Catholic Historical Association's marking of the 1400th anniversary of St Columba. Six have earlier published versions in *The Innes Review* and *Journal of Church Architecture*.

Part 1 explores historical developments surrounding Columba's *paruchia*. Thomas Owen Clancy traces the growth in Scotland of Columba's cult, reviewing the rare posthumous miracles. He suggests Adomnán himself helped to promote interest, partly in an attempt to underpin his own authority. We see the heavenly Columba variously called to intercede, and the use of his relics, including poems and hymns, which celebrate, invoke, and impersonate the saint, the latter in a distinctively Gaelic manner, and from early in the seventh century.

Simon Taylor surveys abbatial place names which trace the routes along which the mission of Iona progressed. He includes Fergna's nephew Commán and Adomnán's bishop Cói. 356