

SPRING 1999

# Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN, AND  
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

## DISCUSSION

**Boris N. Mironov** : *New Approaches to Old Problems: The Well-Being of the Population of Russia from 1821 to 1910 as Measured by Physical Stature*

**Stephen G. Wheatcroft** : *The Great Leap Upwards: Anthropometric Data and Indicators of Crises and Secular Change in Soviet Welfare Levels, 1880–1960*

**Steven L. Hoch** : *Tall Tales: Anthropometric Measures of Well-Being in Imperial Russia and the Soviet Union, 1821–1960*

**John Komlos** : *On the Biological Standard of Living in Russia and the Soviet Union*

**Boris N. Mironov and Stephen G. Wheatcroft** reply

## ARTICLES

**Stephen C. Hutchings** : *Making Sense of the Sensual in Pavel Florenskii's Aesthetics: The Dialectics of Finite Being*

**Charles King** : *The Ambivalence of Authenticity, or How the Moldovan Language Was Made*

**Richard Taylor** : *Singing on the Steppes for Stalin: Ivan Pyr'ev and the Kolkhoz Musical in Soviet Cinema*

**Igor Lukes** : *The Rudolf Slánský Affair: New Evidence*

## EDITOR

DIANE P. KOENKER

ASSOCIATE EDITOR, JANE T. HEDGES

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

STEPHEN M. HERZOG      HEATHER L. TAFEL      REBECCA BARNES WEITZENHOFFER

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### *History*

Barbara Alpern Engel, *University of Colorado* • Gregory L. Freeze, *Brandeis University* • Daniel H. Kaiser, *Grinnell College* • Lynn Mally, *University of California, Irvine* • Lewis H. Siegelbaum, *Michigan State University* • Maria Todorova, *University of Florida*

### *Literature and Linguistics*

Clare Cavanagh, *Northwestern University* • Beth Holmgren, *University of North Carolina* • Irina Paperno, *University of California, Berkeley*

### *Social Sciences*

Valerie Bunce, *Cornell University* • Richard E. Ericson, *Columbia University* • Michael D. Kennedy, *University of Michigan* • Gail Kligman, *University of California, Los Angeles* • Philip Roeder, *University of California, San Diego*

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

*Slavic Review* (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all association members. Members also receive *NewsNet*, the AAASS newsletter. Membership is open to individuals interested in Slavic studies and the study of the non-Slavic peoples of eastern Europe and Eurasia. Applications for membership are accepted by the AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138; (617) 495-0677.

Membership Dues: salary \$10,000–\$19,999—\$25.00; \$20,000–\$29,999—\$40.00; \$30,000–\$39,999—\$50.00; \$40,000–\$49,999—\$60.00; \$50,000–\$59,999—\$70.00; \$60,000–\$69,999—\$80.00; \$70,000 or more—\$90.00. Joint members with one subscription to *Slavic Review*, add \$20.00 to dues of higher paid member. Dues for students or those with salaries under \$10,000 are \$25.00. Subscriptions without membership are \$60.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$20.00; for members, \$15.00 each. For overseas postage, please add \$20.00. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address, or items for *NewsNet* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters at Cambridge.

Articles, books for review, and correspondence concerning editorial matters or advertising should be sent to *Slavic Review*, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 57 E. Armory Avenue, Champaign, IL 61820. Telephone: 217-333-3621; fax: 217-333-3872; e-mail: slavrev@uiuc.edu. Technical requirements for manuscript submissions may be found at the end of the advertising section or at our web site: <http://www.econ.uiuc.edu/~slavrev>.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Text set in Baskerville by G&S Typesetters, Inc., Austin, Texas. Printed by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania. Second-class postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138.

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in *Historical Abstracts*, *America: History and Life* and *ABC Pol Sci: A Bibliography of Contents*.

*Slavic Review* is published at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, with support from the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences, the Graduate College, the Russian and East European Center, the Department of History, and the Humanities Council.

Copyright © 1999 *Slavic Review* ISSN 0037-6779 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Permission to reprint must generally be obtained from the association's office. Copying is permitted in accordance with the fair use guidelines of the US Copyright act of 1976. The association permits the following additional educational uses without permission or payment of fees: academic libraries may place materials from *Slavic Review* on reserve (in multiple photocopied or electronically retrievable form) for students enrolled in specific courses; teachers may reproduce or have reproduced multiple copies (in photocopied or electronic form) for students in their courses. Those wishing to reproduce material from *Slavic Review* for any other purpose (general distribution, advertising or promotion, creating new collective works, resale, etc.) must obtain permission from the association.

# Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN AND  
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

---

VOLUME 58 NUMBER 1 • SPRING 1999

<b>CONTRIBUTORS</b>	vii
<b>DISCUSSION</b>	
New Approaches to Old Problems: The Well-Being of the Population of Russia from 1821 to 1910 as Measured by Physical Stature BORIS N. MIRONOV	1
The Great Leap Upwards: Anthropometric Data and Indicators of Crises and Secular Change in Soviet Welfare Levels, 1880–1960 STEPHEN G. WHEATCROFT	27
Tall Tales: Anthropometric Measures of Well-Being in Imperial Russia and the Soviet Union, 1821–1960 STEVEN L. HOCH	61
On the Biological Standard of Living in Russia and the Soviet Union JOHN KOMLOS	71
Tall Requirements and “Small” Reality BORIS N. MIRONOV	80
Toward an Objective Evaluation of the Complexities of Soviet Social Reality under Stalin STEPHEN G. WHEATCROFT	91
<b>ARTICLES</b>	
Making Sense of the Sensual in Pavel Florenskii’s Aesthetics: The Dialectics of Finite Being STEPHEN C. HUTCHINGS	96

The Ambivalence of Authenticity, or How the Moldovan Language Was Made CHARLES KING	117
Singing on the Steppes for Stalin: Ivan Pyr'ev and the Kolkhoz Musical in Soviet Cinema RICHARD TAYLOR	143
The Rudolf Slánský Affair: New Evidence IGOR LUKES	160
 <b>BOOK REVIEWS</b>	
Katherine Verdery, <i>What Was Socialism and What Comes Next?</i> (Stelian Tanase)	188
James C. Scott, <i>Seeing Like a State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed</i> (Ronald Grigor Suny)	190
Jon Elster, Claus Offe, and Ulrich K. Preuss, with Frank Boenker, Ulrike Goetting, and Friedbert W. Rueb, <i>Institutional Design in Post-Communist Societies: Rebuilding the Ship at Sea</i> (Andrew C. Janos)	191
David L. Weimer, ed., <i>The Political Economy of Property Rights: Institutional Change and Credibility in the Reform of Centrally Planned Economies</i> (Grażyna Skąpska)	192
William L. Miller, Stephen White, and Paul Heywood, <i>Values and Political Change in Postcommunist Europe</i> (David S. Mason)	194
János Kornai, <i>Struggle and Hope: Essays on Stabilization and Reform in a Post-Socialist Economy</i> (Marie Lavigne)	195
Horst Brezinski and Michael Fritsch, eds., <i>The Emergence and Evolution of Markets</i> (Jacek Kochanowicz)	196
Martin Rein, Barry L. Friedman, and Andreas Wörgötter, eds., <i>Enterprise and Social Benefits after Communism</i> (Linda J. Cook)	197
Randall Bluffstone and Bruce A. Larson, eds., <i>Controlling Pollution in Transition Economies: Theories and Methods</i> (Michael Toman)	198
Mary Kaldor and Geneviève Schméder, eds., <i>The European Rupture: The Defence Sector in Transition</i> (Ian Anthony)	199
Gale Stokes, <i>Three Eras of Political Change in Eastern Europe</i> (Robert M. Hayden)	200
Philip L. Cottrell, ed., <i>Rebuilding the Financial System in Central and Eastern Europe, 1918–1994</i> (Zdenek Drabek)	201
Derek Sayer, <i>The Coasts of Bohemia: A Czech History</i> , trans. Alena Sayer (Robert B. Pynsent)	203

Bronislava Volková, <i>A Feminist's Semiotic Odyssey through Czech Literature</i> (Anna Makolkin)	204
Samuel Fiszman, ed., <i>Constitution and Reform in Eighteenth-Century Poland</i> (Daniel Stone)	205
Mathias Niendorf, <i>Minderheiten an der Grenze: Deutsche und Polen in den Kreisen Flatow (Złotów) und Zempelburg (Śępólno Krajeńskie) 1900–1939</i> (Richard Blanke)	206
Dalia Ofer and Leonore J. Weitzman, eds., <i>Women in the Holocaust</i> (Rachel Feldhay Brenner)	207
Arista Maria Cirtautas, <i>The Polish Solidarity Movement, Revolution, Democracy, and Natural Rights</i> (Andrzej Walicki)	209
Andrew A. Michta, <i>The Soldier-Citizen: The Politics of the Polish Army after Communism</i> (Jerzy J. Wiatr)	210
Daniel H. Cole, <i>Instituting Environmental Protection: From Red to Green in Poland</i> (Hubert Tworzecki)	212
Maria Csanádi, <i>Party-States and Their Legacies in Post-Communist Transformation</i> (Andrew A. Michta)	213
Aleksandar Pavković, <i>The Fragmentation of Yugoslavia: Nationalism in a Multinational State</i> (Robert J. Donia)	214
Noel Malcolm, <i>Kosovo: A Short History</i> (Karl Kaser)	215
Jane C. Sugarman, <i>Engendering Song: Singing and Subjectivity at Prespa Albanian Weddings</i> (John Kolsti)	216
Liudmyla Smoliar, <i>Mynule Zarady Majbutn' noho: Zhinochy Rukh naddnyprians'koi Ukrainy II polovyny XIX–pochatok XX st., storinky istorii</i> (Martha Bohachevsky Chomiak)	217
Vincent Shandor, <i>Carpatho-Ukraine in the Twentieth Century: A Political and Legal History</i> (Peter J. Potichnyj)	218
Oleh S. Ilnytzkij, <i>Ukrainian Futurism, 1914–1930: A Historical and Critical Study</i> (George S. N. Luckyj)	219
Yongjin Zhang and Roubin Azizian, eds., <i>Ethnic Challenges beyond Borders: Chinese and Russian Perspectives of the Central Asian Conundrum</i> (Anoushiravan Ehteshami)	220
Mohammad-Reza Djalili, Frédéric Grare, and Shirin Akiner, eds., <i>Tajikistan: The Trials of Independence</i> (Muriel Atkin)	221
Anatoliy P. Derev'anko, Demitri B. Shimkin, and W. Roger Powers, eds., <i>The Paleolithic of Siberia: New Discoveries and Interpretations</i> , trans. Inna P. Laricheva (Jiří Svoboda)	222
R. G. Skrynnikov, <i>Istoriia Rossiiskaia IX–XVII vv.</i> (Lawrence Langer)	223

- Hartmut Rüss, *Herren und Diener: Die soziale und politische Mentalität des russischen Adels, 9.–17. Jahrhundert* (Georg Michels) 224
- Erik Tiberg, *Moscow, Livonia, and the Hanseatic League, 1487–1550* (Carol B. Stevens) 226
- Conrad Grau, Serguei Karp, and Jürgen Voss, eds., *Deutsch-Russische Beziehungen im 18. Jahrhundert: Kultur, Wissenschaft und Diplomatie/Germano-russkie otnosheniia 18 veka: Kul' tura, nauka, diplomatiia* (Roderick E. McGrew) 226
- Serge Schmemmann, *Echoes of a Native Land: Two Centuries of a Russian Village* (Christine D. Worobec) 228
- Adrian Jones, *Late Imperial Russia: An Interpretation—Three Visions, Two Cultures, One Peasantry* (Boris N. Mironov) 229
- Peter Waldron, *Between Two Revolutions: Stolypin and the Politics of Renewal in Russia* (Mary Schaeffer Conroy) 231
- Jamie H. Cockfield, *With Snow on Their Boots: The Tragic Odyssey of the Russian Expeditionary Force in France during World War I* (Roger R. Reese) 232
- Robert Service, *A History of Twentieth-Century Russia* (John Keep) 233
- Morgan Philips Price, *Dispatches from the Revolution: Russia 1916–1918*, ed. Tania Rose, with a foreword by Eric Hobsbawm (Tsuyoshi Hasegawa) 234
- V. P. Butt, A. B. Murphy, N. A. Myshov, and G. R. Swain, eds., *The Russian Civil War: Documents from the Soviet Archives* (Michael Melancon) 235
- Vera Tolz, *Russian Academicians and the Revolution: Combining Professionalism and Politics* (Harley Balzer) 237
- Tamash Kraus (Tamás Krausz), *Sovetskii termidor: Dukhovnye predposylki stalinskogo povorota (1917–1928)*, trans. Sergei Filippov (Larry E. Holmes) 238
- G. I. Cherniavskii and M. G. Stanchev, *V bor'be protiv samovlastiia: Kh. G. Rakovskii v 1927–1941 gg.*; V. A. Golovko, M. G. Stanchev, and G. I. Cherniavskii, *Mezhdú Moskvoi i Zapadom: Diplomaticeskaiia deiatel'nost' Kh. G. Rakovskogo* (Ronald Kowalski) 239
- John McCannon, *Red Arctic: Polar Exploration and the Myth of the North in the Soviet Union, 1932–1939* (Hiroaki Kuromiya) 241
- Galina Mikhailovna Ivanova, *GULAG v sisteme totalitarnogo gosudarstva* (Donald J. Raleigh) 242

Gennady Andreev-Khomiakov, <i>Bitter Waters: Life and Work in Stalin's Russia</i> , trans. with an introduction by Ann E. Healy (Mary Buckley)	243
Bruce A. Elleman, <i>Diplomacy and Deception: The Secret History of Sino-Soviet Diplomatic Relations, 1917–1927</i> (Jon Jacobson)	244
Eva-Maria Stolberg, <i>Stalin und die chinesischen Kommunisten 1945–1953: Eine Studie zur Entstehungsgeschichte der sowjetisch-chinesischen Allianz vor dem Hintergrund des kalten Krieges</i> (O. A. Westad)	245
Sergei Viktorovich Cheshko, <i>Raspad sovetskogo soiuza: Etnopoliticheskkii analiz</i> (Stephen P. Dunn)	246
Robert Chenciner, <i>Daghestan: Tradition and Survival</i> (Moshe Gammer)	247
Hilary Pilkington, <i>Migration, Displacement, and Identity in Post-Soviet Russia</i> (David D. Laitin)	248
Peter Juviler, <i>Freedom's Ordeal: The Struggle for Human Rights and Democracy in Post-Soviet States</i> (Donald D. Barry)	250
Linda Racioppi and Katherine O'Sullivan See, <i>Women's Activism in Contemporary Russia</i> (Norma C. Noonan)	251
Loren R. Graham, <i>What Have We Learned about Science and Technology from the Russian Experience?</i> (Douglas R. Weiner)	252
Jeffrey L. Roberg, <i>Soviet Science under Control: The Struggle for Influence</i> (Stephen Fortescue)	253
L. G. Svitich and A. A. Shiriaeva, <i>Zhurnalistskoe obrazovanie: Vzgliad sotsiologa</i> , ed. Ia. N. Zasurskii (Vera Tolz)	254
Hannes Adomeit, <i>Imperial Overstretch: Germany in Soviet Policy from Stalin to Gorbachev. An Analysis Based on New Archival Evidence, Memoirs, and Interviews</i> (Jeffrey Gedmin)	254
Hall Gardner, <i>Dangerous Crossroads: Europe, Russia, and the Future of NATO</i> (Sharyl Cross)	256
Shimon Naveh, <i>In Pursuit of Military Excellence: The Evolution of Operational Theory</i> (Colin McInnes)	257
Fred Wehling, <i>Irresolute Princes: Kremlin Decision Making in Middle East Crises, 1967–1973</i> (Roland Dannreuther)	258
Sarah E. Mendelson, <i>Changing Course: Ideas, Politics, and the Soviet Withdrawal from Afghanistan</i> (Jeffrey T. Checkel)	259
Simon Clarke, ed., <i>Structural Adjustment without Mass Unemployment? Lessons from Russia</i> (Vladimir Popov)	261

Noel E. Firth and James N. Noren, <i>Soviet Defense Spending: A History of CIA Estimates, 1950–1990</i> (William T. Lee)	262
Matthew Cullerne Bown, <i>Socialist Realist Painting</i> (Elizabeth Kridl Valkenier)	264
Boris M. Gasparov, <i>Iazyk, Pamiat', Obraz: Lingvistika iazykovogo sushchestvovaniia</i> (Bernard Comrie)	265
Michele Colucci and Riccardo Picchio, eds., <i>Storia della Civiltà Letteraria Russa</i> (Victor Terras)	266
Dimitri Shvidkovsky, <i>The Empress and the Architect: British Architecture and Gardens at the Court of Catherine the Great</i> (Richard Wortman)	267
Mattias Freise, <i>Die Prosa Anton Čechovs: Eine Untersuchung im Ausgang von Einzelanalysen</i> (George Mihaychuk)	268
Karen L. Ryan-Hayes, ed., <i>Venedikt Erofeev's Moscow-Petushki: Critical Perspectives</i> (Cynthia Simmons)	269
Helena Goscilo, <i>The Explosive World of Tatyana N. Tolstaya's Fiction</i> (Nadya L. Peterson)	270
<b>COLLECTED ESSAYS</b>	273
<b>BOOKS RECEIVED</b>	277
<b>LETTERS</b>	281