

the book is conspicuously silent. Chapters instead explore and attempt to recover the dynamic interactions of the built environment with bodies of different types, ages, faiths, genders, and social classes. A Brunelleschi nave can yield disembodied textbook images of tranquil geometry. Karmon scrambles the picture, interested in how different bodies perceived and experienced those buildings and spaces across time.

The book traces how the senses combine in chaotic and complex ways to shape experience, cognition, and emotions for particular people and social groups. Perspective shifts from navigating the treacherous streets of Venice as a woman in towering chopines or laying in the wards of the hospital at Edirne as an ailing patient seeking solace from the wafting aromas of its garden. Karmon compares early modern Christian, Jewish, and Muslim strategies for vivifying and reinforcing religious identity through carefully orchestrated sensory experience, particularly through the often-downgraded sense of smell. A chapter sensitively reconstructs through images, period texts, and inscriptions just how much has been lost to current visitors of the Franciscan chapels of the Sacro Monte at Varallo. An early modern pilgrim would have moved through a more intense, carefully sequenced, and immersive assault on all the senses, especially smell. By contrast, penned together by a militant Christian state, the Jews of Venice found a means through multisensory experience not only to practice their faith but also to draw themselves together as a community and express themselves to each other as Jews.

There is something disquieting about a writer as impeccably credentialed and evidently privileged as Karmon role-playing, lending his voice to subjugated peoples, sex workers, or the infirm without a framework of rich primary evidence. He has an intuitive faith that he can reach across time and retrieve ephemeral sounds, smells, and textures, and conflicting voices do not disturb the polished surface of his chapters. Given the absence of sustained attention to any one location or subject, Karmon breaks little new ground. A methodology rooted in sensory experience is also far from novel for architectural history of recent decades. The book's strength is in its multiplicity, its restlessness and imagination, its optimism that new understandings remain to be gained from even the most well-studied of Renaissance spaces, which can be approached anew.

Laura Camille Agoston, *Trinity University*  
doi:10.1017/rqx.2023.512

*Creating Place in Early Modern European Architecture*. Elizabeth Merrill, ed. Visual and Material Culture 1300–1700. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2022. 380 pp. \$150.

---

A place is not merely a container of space but is invested with meaning. The intersection of the spatial and temporal axes determines the significance of the site, and within this matrix architecture not only responds to the genius loci but also helps to create it.

The ten essays in this book explore architecture in its broadest sense, placing special emphasis on the making of buildings (both design and construction) within their physical, social, and institutional contexts. The anthology grew out of a conference held in Berlin in 2017 that sought to bring together the history of science and architectural history. The shift from “space” to “place” reflects the authors’ emphasis on primary source material, which lends a distinct geographical identity to each contribution. Considering the variety of different approaches and subject matter, it cannot have been easy to formulate a consistent thread to link these heterogenous approaches and contexts. The book is divided into three sections: “Making Place,” “Teaching Place,” and “Excavating Place.”

Elizabeth Merrill’s thoughtful introduction considers the theoretical and philosophical background to the study of place, from Aristotle onward. The book seeks to draw attention away from the single architectural genius to focus on the interacting roles of different agencies of place formation, especially through the physical process of making buildings. Architecture is considered as a discursive practice—that is, the product of systems of knowledge that display links both between places and over time. A further introductory essay, by Wolfgang Lefevre on architectural drawing, contrasts the role of perspective (as a tool for communicating the nature of a place to patrons and lay viewers) with the development of the new conventions of representation through plan, section, and elevation.

The section on “Marking Place” begins with a chapter by Nele De Raedt reviewing the legal and architectural consequences of the confiscation and demolition of the Santa Croce family’s property in late fifteenth-century Rome. After a short exile, they returned to the city to build a new palace, demonstrating their enduring attachment to the site. The essay by Noam Andrews opens with the fall of a meteorite at Ensisheim in Alsace in 1492 and goes on to consider the early modern cosmos “*as* a place, and *in* place” (102). The third contribution, by Federico Bellini, looks at the church interiors of Baroque Rome as sites of multisensory experience. The author discusses the impact of organ lofts and singing galleries, using schematic diagrammatic plans to show the direction of sound emission.

The second section, “Teaching Place,” looks at the ways in which knowledge could be propagated between places. Elizabeth Merrill uses the archives of Santa Maria della Scala in Siena to show how the hospital’s management of its rural properties (granges, mills, quarries, and kilns) helped to communicate technological developments in the fifteenth century, alongside manuscript model books. Paul Brakmann and Sebastian Fitzner consider the *Kunstammer* of Johannes Faulhaber in Ulm as a source of engineering and military technology. Now lost, the collection is known from the printed catalogue of 1628 and from an inventory of 1636, transcribed in the appendix. Though described as secret, the collection of mathematical instruments and machine models attracted many visitors. The last chapter in this section, by Stefan M. Holzer

and Nicoletta Marconi, focuses on the influential system of scaffolding pioneered by Nicola Zabaglia for the Fabbrica of St. Peter's in the eighteenth century.

The final section, on "Excavating Place," opens with a comprehensive account by Merlijn Hurx of the construction of pile foundations in the Netherlands, with particular emphasis on the development of deep foundations in the early modern period, used, for example, in the Amsterdam Town Hall (1648–65). Ludovica Galeazzo addresses the creation of place as a dynamic process with cultural social and economic dimensions, generated in the *Insula dei Gesuiti* in Venice by the conflicting interests of religious and state institutions. In the last chapter, Edward Triplett discusses the Book of Fortresses of Duarte de Armas, surveyed and recorded in 1509–10, which illustrates 55 border fortresses on the Portuguese-Castilian border in 120 perspective drawings and 51 plans. The author uses this remarkable graphic output as a key to the communication of place, using the invented term *platial* to describe the images.

This review has itemized all the essays because of their heterogeneity, which makes it impossible to discuss them in blanket terms. Given the exorbitant cost of the book, it is a pity to find a number of copyediting errors, such as "Siena's principle institutions" (163), or "compliment" for "complement" (249). Nevertheless, all the chapters are based on meticulous primary research and are analyzed thoughtfully and rigorously. Each makes an original and important contribution to the field, although place unifies them only in the sense that each one has a geographical specificity.

Deborah Howard, *St. John's College, University of Cambridge*  
doi:10.1017/rqx.2023.526

*"Di somma aspettazione e di bellissimo ingegno": Pellegrino Tibaldi e le Marche.* Anna Maria Ambrosini Massari, Valentina Balzarotti, and Vittoria Romani, eds. *Fonti e studi per la storia dell'arte e del collezionismo.* Ancona: Il lavoro editoriale, 2021. 200 pp. €40.

---

The restoration of Pellegrino Tibaldi's spectacular *Baptism of Christ* occasioned a conference that took place in Ancona in 2019 on the artist's activities in Marche. During the 1550s, he executed major works in painting and stucco that included a chapel in the Santa Casa in Loreto, considered by Vito Punzi; the *Baptism* altarpiece once in Sant'Agostino and the lost *Resurrected Christ* on the high altar of the cathedral in Ancona; and the vault of the Loggia dei Mercanti, surveyed by Marina Massa. Of the chapel in Loreto, only the detached wall frescoes survive; the Christ figure in the cathedral was destroyed in the eighteenth century, and the merchants' loggia was bombed during WWII, leaving only a few fragments. This, combined with Marche being outside of the art historical mainstream, makes the publication particularly welcome.