Index

accountability, investigation and, 95-9 ACHPR. See African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights acquisition of territory. See occupation of territory Additional Protocols to Geneva Conventions (1077)combatant/non-combatant distinction, 120 human rights and, 5 IACs and, 2 NIACs and, 3 African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (ACHPR) co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 64-5 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 50, 52 Akande, Dapo, 240 Aldrich, George, 114, 155 Al-Qaeda. See terrorism applicable law. See co-applicability of IHL and IHRL; human rights; international humanitarian law (IHL); peacetime violence; transnational conflicts Aristotle, 115 armed conflict. See also classification of conflicts; international armed conflicts; non-international armed conflicts: transnational conflicts; use of force applicability of law of, 1 armed attacks, definition of, 254 battle as legal concept, 127 boundaries of, 4 causes of indeterminacies in law of, 196 civilian participation, 120, 129 classification of conflicts. See classification of conflicts

combatant/non-combatant distinction, 110-27 complexity of, 17-18 crisis narratives, 118 determination of existence of, 235 distinctiveness of current conflicts, 135 existence of, 22-4 historical development of law of war, 127 irregular fighting, rise of, 120, 127-33 legal controversies, 10 moral approach to. See morality normative approach to, 11 'overlapping consensus' on law of. 278 protracted armed confrontations as, 201 reduction in casualties, 134 technological developments, 132-9 total warfare, 128 traditional warfare, reduction of, 127-33 Trialogue approach to, 10-14, 266 battle as legal concept, 127

Baxter, Richard, 15 bearers duty-bearers, 22–39 rights-bearers, 43–4 Ben-Naftali, Orna, 173 Berman, Paul, 136 Brussels Declaration (1874), combatant/ non-combatant distinction, 120 Bush, George W., 137

Charter of the UN. See United Nations chivalry as obligation, 125 Churchill, Winston, 120, 133 civil disturbances. See peacetime violence civil wars. See non-international armed conflicts civilians civilian/combatant distinction, 119-27, 191 obligation to investigate deaths of, 96 participation in wars, 120, 129 review of detention of, 87 right to life under IHL, 206-13 clarity of legal concepts and definitions, 115 classification of conflicts Aristotle and, 115 armed confrontations other than IAC or NIAC, 239 clarity of legal concepts and definitions, 115 conclusions of Trialogue as to, 266-8, 278 core jurisdictional struggle, 108 critical legal studies approach, 122 disputes over ('classification crisis'), 107 formalist approaches, 107 generally, 4, 16, 106 IACs, 24-32, 239-41 importance of, 106 intensity as measure of conflict, 236 internal confrontations encroaching on neighbouring State, 240 internal confrontations with international support for non-State party, 240 internal confrontations with international support for State party, 240 level of use of force, 25-6 NIACs, 32, 237, 239-41 novel wars, 108, 109, 173 Plato and, 115 pluralist approaches, 108 social discourse approaches, 107 transnational confrontations between State and non-State parties entirely within non-consenting third State, 240 types of armed conflict, 235-41 violent confrontations as armed conflict. 235-9 wartime/peacetime divide, 112-19 Clausewitz, Carl von, 120, 127, 170 CLS. See critical legal studies co-applicability of IHL and IHRL acceptance of complexity of, 100, 103 adjudication, role of, 104 adjudicatory approaches to, 59-64 challenges of, 101, 104 concept of, 12, 15 conclusions of Trialogue on, 278 confirmation of shift towards, 19-20

conflict between IHL and IHRL, 202 contextual approach, 71, 79-83, 103 continued relevance of non-prioritised body of norms, 82-3 denial of applicability, 99 factors for development of, 100 general recognition of, 99 harmonious interpretation and, 71, 72-4, 103 human rights approach, 101 identification of particular context within conflict, 81 identification of specific norms, 82, 102 importance, 100 increase in adjudication, 54-8 increase in level of engagement, 101 international adjudication and, 54-71 interplay of primary and secondary norms, 71, 77-8 interpretive approach, 71, 78-9 legal mechanisms of coordination, 270-3 lex specialis approach, 71, 74-7 normative perspectives on, 273-7 norm-by-norm analysis, 80 practical issues, 83 prioritisation of norms, 71 proportionality, 191 rights of disempowered individuals, 187 States and, 102 type of conflict as factor, 81-2 combatant/civilian distinction, 119-27, 191 Communism and terrorism, 137 core jurisdictional struggle arising of, 108, 164, 167, 168, 171, 173, 181 causes of, 175 core jurisdictional narratives, 167 effects of, 169 IHL, 108, 196 IHRL, 171-95 rejection of pluralism, 108 Corn, Geoffrey S., 6, 151 counter-terrorism. See terrorism courts and tribunals 'age of adjudication' and, 20 classification of conflicts, 26 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 54-71, 101, 104 extraterritoriality of IHRL, 179 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHL, 46 intensity of NIACs, 32

courts and tribunals (cont.) lawfulness of detention in NIACs, 68-71, 84, 187 obligation to investigate and prosecute war crimes, 97 parties to NIACs, 34 targeted killings, 91 Cover, Robert, 176, 177, 186 Creasy, Edward, 120 crime. See war crimes critical legal studies (CLS) classification of conflicts, 122 role of legal norms, 164 customary international law IACs and, 2 prohibition on use of force, 252 cyberspace, co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 93-5 deadly force, targeted killings, 90-2 death. See permissible killing declarations of war non-issuing of, 112 recognition of, 235 detention, lawfulness in NIACs, 68-71, 84-90, 187 Dunant, Henri, 130 duties. See obligations ECtHR. See European Court of Human Rights enforcement of obligations and rights, 192-4 European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) civilians' right to life, 212 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 65-71 first moral task of law in war, 244 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 51, 52 lawfulness of detention in NIACs, 68-71, 86, 187 obligation to investigate and prosecute war crimes, 97 rights of disempowered individuals, 187 extraterritoriality IHL, 179, 182 IHRL, 6, 179 formalism

classification of conflicts, 107 role of legal norms, 164 Garner, James, 151 Geneva Conventions I-IV (1949) Additional Protocols. See Additional Protocols to Geneva Conventions (1977) applicability to all armed conflicts, 235 belligerent occupation of territory, 38 classification of IACs, 24 classification of NIACs, 32, 237 combatant/non-combatant distinction, 120 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHL, 45 human rights and, 5 IACs and, 2 individual rights under IHL, 205 intensity of hostilities, 248 lawfulness of detention in NIACs, 87 NIACs and, 3, 152 positive causal interventions under, 216 right to POW status, 120 wartime/peacetime divide, 113 geographical applicability (ratione loci) beyond territory, 46-8 generally, 44 throughout territory, 45-6 Germany, Nazism and terrorism, 136 Hague Conventions I-XIV (1907) declarations of war, 112 IACs and, 2 Hague Regulations (1899) combatant/non-combatant distinction, 120

Martens Clause. See Martens Clause

Haque, Adil, 205, 217 historical development of law of war, 127

Hohfeld, Wesley N., 175

holders. See bearers

HRC. See Human Rights Committee

Huber, Max, 163

human rights

'age of adjudication' and, 20–2

applicability, 7, 10, 195, 197 armed conflict and, 6

co-applicability with IHL. See co-

applicability of IHL and IHRL controversies, 10

controversies, 10 convergence with IHL, 19

core jurisdictional struggle, 108, 171-95

disempowered individuals, 186-8

disputes over applicability, 107

duty-bearers, 22–39

effects outside armed conflict, 10

emergence and expansion of, 5-7 enforcement, 192-4 extraterritoriality, 6, 179-82 geographical applicability (ratione loci), 44-53 IHL and, 5-10, 11, 55, 160, 172, 175-8, 191 IHL authorisation of conduct that amounts to human rights violation, 216–20 individualised approach by, 8 lex specialis, 19, 82, 102, 172, 191 Lotus ruling and, 160 Martens Clause. See Martens Clause material applicability (ratione materiae), 39-40 moral dimension. See morality nature-of-things jurisprudence and, 188 necessity, 209 non-universality (social contract conception), 177 obligations and rights in relation to, 175-8, 182-6 paradigm, 7 personal applicability (ratione personae), 40-4 regulatory approach, 8 right to life. See right to life rights-bearers, 43-4 soldiers, 190 State practice on applicability, 39 strengths, 8 symmetrical application, 201, 256, 258 temporal applicability (ratione temporis) of IHL and IHRL, 53-4 Trialogue approach to, 9, 266 universal scope, 40 universality ('state of nature' conception), 177 wartime applicability, opposition to, 195 weaknesses, 8 Human Rights Committee (HRC) civilians' right to life, 208 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 56 first moral task of law in war, 244 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 52 soldiers' right to life, 214 humanity as obligation, 125

IACs. See international armed conflicts IACtHR. See Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR)

ICC. See International Criminal Court (ICC) ICJ. See International Court of Justice ICTY. See International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia IHL. See international humanitarian law IHRL. See human rights intensity as measure of conflict, 32-4, 236, 243-6, 257-63 Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 59-61 Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR) co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 61-4 obligation to investigate and prosecute war crimes, 97 international armed conflicts (IACs) applicability of IHL, 2, 201 beginning and end of, uncertainties over, 112 classification of, 24-32 definition of, 201 disputes over classification of, 107, 114 IAC/NIAC ratio, 134 IHL authorisation of conduct that amounts to human rights violation, 217 internal confrontations as, 239-41 inter-State wars, 106 level of use of force, 25-6 material applicability (ratione materiae) of IHL and IHRL, 24-32 non-protracted, 201 non-State armed groups and, 2 protracted, 201 reduction in casualties, 134 reduction in numbers, 134 State intervention against non-State armed groups without territorial State consent, 27 'symmetrical IHRL' applied to, 201 Syrian conflict classified as, 28-32 transnational conflicts as, 110, 141 transnational confrontations as, 240 transnational use of force by States, 26-8 undeclared wars, 112 International Court of Justice (ICJ) applicability of IHRL, 39 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 74, 202 definition of armed attacks, 254 general applicability of human rights, 7 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 50

Index

International Criminal Court (ICC) classification of conflicts, 26 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHL, 48 intensity of NIACs, 32 International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR), geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHL, 46 International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY) 'age of adjudication' and, 20 classification of conflicts, 26 classification of NIACs, 237 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHL, 46 human rights and, 5 intensity of NIACs, 32 parties to NIACs, 34 international human rights law (IHRL). See human rights international humanitarian law (IHL) 'adaptation' approaches, 12, 118, 121, 152, 194-5 'age of adjudication' and, 20-2 applicability, 2-5, 11, 109, 197 applicability beyond territory, 46-8 applicability throughout territory, 45-6 authorisation of conduct that amounts to human rights violation, 216-20 balance of humanitarian and military considerations, 5 beginning of, 130, 162, 178 chivalry as obligation, 125 civilian/combatant distinction, 191 civilians' right to life, 206-13 clarity of concepts and definitions, 116 co-applicability with IHRL. See coapplicability of IHL and IHRL controversies, 10 convergence with human rights, 19 core jurisdictional struggle, 108, 164, 165, 196 crisis narratives, 118 declarations of war as trigger, 235 disputes over applicability, 107 duty-bearers, 22-39, 185 enforcement, 192-4 extraterritoriality, 179, 182 function of. 2 geographical applicability (ratione loci), 45-8 historical development of law of war, 127

human rights and, 5-10, 11, 160, 172, 175-8, 191 human rights treaties and, 55 humanity as obligation, 125 IAC/NIAC distinction, 106 imperfect obligations, 124, 125 individual rights under, 204 institutional framework of, 4 intensity of conflict as applicability factor, 236, 239 lex specialis, 17, 19, 60, 70, 81, 82, 141, 172 material applicability (ratione materiae), 22-39 military commanders' duty to enforce, 185 military professional ('warrior') approaches, 131, 189 moral dimension. See morality nature-of-things jurisprudence approach, 122 necessity, 200 necessity as obligation, 125 non-crisis 'adaptation' approaches, 118, 121 normative challenge to, 4 obligations and rights in relation, 175-8 obligations-based System, as, 178 pacifist approaches, 131 paradigm, 7 perfect obligations, 124 personal applicability (ratione personae), 40-4 premises of, 110 principle of legality, 124 proportionality, 124, 191 regulatory approach, 8 rights of disempowered individuals, 187 rights-bearers, 43-4 scepticism about, 170 soldiers' protection, 190 soldiers' right to life, 213-16 Statist-positivist approaches, 131 strengths, 8 technological developments in warfare and, 133-0 temporal applicability (ratione temporis) of IHL and IHRL, 53-4 traditional warfare and, 127, 130 transnational conflicts, 109 Trialogue approach to, 1, 9, 266 wartime/peacetime divide, 113 weaknesses, 8

Index

international law. See also customary international law applicability to peacetime violence, 106 authorisation of use of force, 252 beginning of, 162 causes of indeterminacies in, 196 crisis narratives, 118 Trialogue approach to, 1 US core jurisdictional struggle over, 168-71 International Law Commission (ILC), co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 72, 73 interpretation. See also Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT) co-applicability of IHL and IHRL. See co-applicability of IHL and IHRL inter-State wars. See international armed conflicts investigation, accountability and, 95-9 Iraq anti-ISIS operations as IAC, 30 anti-Kurdish operations as IAC, 30 irregular fighting. See armed conflict Islamic State (ISIS). See terrorism Israel adaptation approach to NIACs, 152 applicability of IHRL, 39 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 57 enforcement of obligations and rights, 192 extraterritoriality of IHL, 179 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 52 judicial review of extraterritorial air bombings, 179 right to POW status, 152 rights-based IHL approach to judicial review, 102 targeted killings, 91 transnational conflicts as IACs, 141 ius in bello. See armed conflict Jinks, Derek, 219 judicial review detention in NIACs, 69, 83 extraterritorial air bombings, 179 IHL-based, 187

standards of, 103 jurisdiction. See co-applicability of IHL and IHRL; core jurisdictional struggle

rights-based IHL approach to, 192

Kaldor, Mary, 135 Kant, Immanuel, 195 killing. See permissible killing Krieger, Heike, 10 Kurdish forces, operations against as IAC, 30 law of armed conflict. See armed conflict lawfulness of detention in NIACs, 68-71, 83, 187 legal concepts and definitions, clarity of, 115 legality. See principle of legality lethal force. See deadly force lex specialis co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 71, 74-7 continued relevance of non-prioritised body of norms, 82 IHL as, 17, 19, 60, 70, 81, 82, 141, 172 IHRL as, 19, 82, 102, 172, 191 prioritisation of norms and, 77-8 right to life and, 202 life. See right to life Lotus ruling, 160–64 Luban, David, 173, 178

Martens Clause, 122, 125, 162 material applicability (ratione materiae) belligerent occupation of territory to, 38-9 existence of armed conflict, 22-4 IACs to, 24-32 IHL of, 22-39 IHRL of, 39-40 NIACs to, 32-8 Maurice, John F., 112 Meron, Theodor, 5 military commanders' duty to enforce IHL, 185 military professional ('warrior') approaches to IHL, 131, 189 military technological developments, 133-9 Moltke, Helmuth Karl Bernhard Graf von, 170 morality. See also permissible killing; right to life authorisation of use of force, 252 choice of IHL or IHRL, 200 conclusions of Trialogue on moral approach to IHL/IHRL, 278 first moral task of law in war, 199, 243-6, 249-57 IHRL and moral tasks of law, 242-63 IHRL as morally better law during war, 199, 258 intensity of hostilities and, 243-6, 257-63

morality (cont.) legal context for use of force and, 249-57 moral approach to armed conflict, 13 moral approach to IHL/IHRL applicability, 198, 263-5 moral division of labour between IHRL and IHL, 201, 235, 263, 270, 275 moral obligations and outcomes of warfare, 198 moral tasks of law during war, 199, 220-6, 242-63 reality of armed conflict and, 200 second moral task of law in war, 199, 257-63 symmetrical application of IHRL, 201, 256, 258 use of force across international borders and, 242-63 Napoleon (Bonaparte), 136, 195 nature-of-things jurisprudence IHL and, 122 IHRL and, 188 Nazism and terrorism, 136 necessity differences between IHL and IHRL, 209 obligation as, 125 permissible killing, 206-13 NIACs. See non-international armed conflicts non-combatant/combatant distinction. 119-27, 191 non-international armed conflicts (NIACs) applicability of IHL, 3, 201 beginning and end of, uncertainties over, 112 civil wars, 106 classification, 16, 32-8 disputes over classification of, 107, 114 history of regulation of, 140, 149-59 IAC/NIAC ratio, 135 IHL authorisation of conduct that amounts to human rights violation, 218 intensity, 32-4 intensity threshold for, 237 internal confrontations as, 239-41 internationalisation, 26 lawfulness of detention, 68-71, 83, 187 material applicability (ratione materiae) of IHL and IHRL, 32-8 non-State armed groups and, 2 parties, 34-5 POW status in, 31 reduction in casualties, 134

reduction in numbers, 134 soldiers' right to life, 213 transnational conflicts as, 110, 140 transnational confrontations as, 240 transnational terrorism as, 35-8 transnational use of force by States, 26-8 non-State armed groups applicability of IHL, 3 State intervention against, without territorial State consent, 27 norms accountability norms, 95-9 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL. See coapplicability of IHL and IHRL conflict between IHL and IHRL norms, 268-70 normative approach to armed conflict, 11 novel wars. See classification of conflicts nullum crimen sine lege. See principle of legality OAGs. See non-State armed groups Obama, Barack, 134, 137 obligations disempowered individuals, towards, 186-8 enforcement of, 192-4 IHL as obligations-based system, 178 investigate and prosecute war crimes, 97 military commanders' duty to enforce IHL, 185 moral obligations and outcomes of warfare, 108 perfect and imperfect. See international humanitarian law rights and, 175-8 occupation of territory, material applicability (ratione materiae) of IHL and IHRL, 38-9 organised armed groups (OAGs). See non-State armed groups Osiel, Mark, 124 Pal, Radhabinod, 136 peace restoration of, 113 wartime/peacetime divide, 112-19 peacetime violence civil disturbances, 106 international law applied to, 106 permissible killing. See also right to life civilians of, 206-13 moral tasks of law during war, 220-6

necessity, 206-13 soldiers of, 213-16 personal applicability (ratione personae) duty-bearers, 22-39 rights-bearers, 43-4 Pictet, Jean, 173 Plato, 115 pluralist approaches to classification of conflicts, 107, 108 Powell, Colin, 156 POWs. See prisoners of war principle of legality, 124 prisoners of war (POWs) obligation to investigate deaths of, 96 review of detention of, 87 right to POW status, 31, 120, 127, 128, 147, 152, 155 proportionality, 124, 191 protected persons. See civilians; prisoners of war ratione loci. See geographical applicability ratione materiae. See material applicability

ratione personae. See personal applicability ratione temporis. See temporal applicability Raz, Joseph, 220 right to life. See also permissible killing civilians' right under IHL, 206-13 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 202 IHL and, 230-5 IHL authorisation of conduct that amounts to violation of, 216-20 IHRL and, 226-30 IHRL exception to, 215 moral tasks of law during war, 199, 220-6 soldiers' right under IHL, 213-16 right to POW status. See prisoners of war rights. See human rights Russian Federation co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 67 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHL, 47 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 52 Seward, William H., 113 social discourse approaches to law, 107 soldiers protection under IHL and IHRL, 190 right to life under IHL, 213-16 Solferino, battle of (1859), 130

spatial applicability. See geographical applicability State practice adaptation approach to NIACs, 152 classification of IACs, 29 classification of NIACs, 34 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 57, 66 enforcement of obligations and rights, 192 extraterritoriality of IHL, 179 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHL, 46 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 52 IHL and transnational conflicts, 109, 141 lawfulness of detention in NIACs, 68-71, 84, 187 Lotus ruling, 160-64 obligation to investigate and prosecute war crimes, 97 personal applicability (ratione personae) of IHL and IHRL, 43 restoration of peace, 113 right to POW status, 147, 152, 155 targeted killings, 91 temporal applicability (ratione temporis) of IHL and IHRL, 53 transnational conflicts as IACs, 141 transnational conflicts as NIACs, 140 transnational terrorism classified as NIAC, 35 Statist (Westphalian) model of conflict regulation Lotus ruling and, 160-64 Westphalian model, 143-9 Sweden, personal applicability (ratione personae) of IHL and IHRL, 43 Syrian conflict as IAC, 28-32 Taft, William H., 156 targeted killings, co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 90-2 technological developments in warfare, 133-0 temporal applicability (ratione temporis) of IHL and IHRL, 53-4 territorial acquisition. See occupation of territory territorial applicability. See geographical applicability terrorism anti-Al-Qaeda operations as NIAC, 35 anti-ISIS operations as IAC, 30

terrorism (cont.) applicability of IHL and IHRL, 17 Communism and, 137 distinctiveness of current conflicts, 136 Nazism and, 136 right to POW status, 152 Syrian conflict as IAC, 28-32 temporal applicability (ratione temporis) of IHL and IHRL, 53 'torture memos' (US), 109, 120, 140, 151, 155, 160 transnational terrorism as NIAC, 35-8 torture, definition of, 5 total warfare. See armed conflict transnational conflicts. See also armed conflict; international armed conflicts; non-international armed conflicts classification as NIACs, 140 disputes over applicable law, 107, 110, 164 disputes over classification of, 107 history of regulation of, 137-64 IAC/NIAC distinction, 110 IHL applicability, 109 Lotus ruling and, 160-64 Martens Clause and, 162 novel wars as, 100 Statist (Westphalian) model of regulation, 143-9 Trialogue approach, 1, 10-14, 266 tribunals. See courts and tribunals Turkev anti-Kurdish operations as IAC, 30 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 66 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 52 undeclared wars, frequency of, 112 United Kingdom classification of NIACs, 34 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 68 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 52 human rights of disempowered individuals, 187 IHL and transnational conflicts, 141 lawfulness of detention in NIACs, 68-71, 86, 187 obligation to investigate and prosecute war crimes, 97

United Nations. See also Human Rights Committee applicability of IHRL, 39, 41 authorisation of use of force, 252 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 56, 92, 95, 98 prohibition of use of force, 252 United States adaptation approach to NIACs, 154 applicability of IHRL, 39 co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 57 core jurisdictional struggle over international law, 168-71, 173 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHL, 46 geographical applicability (ratione loci) of IHRL, 52 IHL and transnational conflicts, 109, 142 lawfulness of detention in NIACs, 84 restoration of peace, 113 right to POW status, 147, 155 Syrian conflict and, 29 temporal applicability (ratione temporis) of IHL and IHRL, 53 'torture memos', 109, 120, 140, 151, 155, 160 transnational conflicts as NIACs, 140 transnational terrorism classified as NIAC, 35 use of force across international borders, 242-63 authorisation of, 216-20, 252 first moral task of law in war and, 243-6 level of, 25-6 morality and legal context for, 249-57 prohibition of, 252 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT), co-applicability of IHL and IHRL, 78 violence. See armed conflict; peacetime violence violent confrontations as armed conflict, 235-9 war. See armed conflict

war crimes, obligation to investigate and prosecute, 97 Westphalian (Statist) model of conflict regulation, 143–9

Wilson, George G., 114