

# Social Philosophy & Policy

## Natural Law and Modern Moral Philosophy

### CONTENTS

LARRY ARNHART	Thomistic Natural Law as Darwinian Natural Right	1
DOUGLAS J. DEN UYL AND DOUGLAS B. RASMUSSEN	Ethical Individualism, Natural Law, and the Primacy of Natural Rights	34
MARK C. MURPHY	Natural Law, Consent, and Political Obligation	70
GEORGE KLOSKO	The Natural Basis of Political Obligation	93
MICHAEL S. MOORE	Law as Justice	115
HADLEY ARKES	The "Laws of Reason" and the Surprise of the Natural Law	146
DAVID LUBAN	Natural Law as Professional Ethics: A Reading of Fuller	176
JOSEPH BOYLE	Fairness in Holdings: A Natural Law Account of Property and Welfare Rights	206
MICHAEL ZUCKERT	Natural Law, Natural Rights, and Classical Liberalism: On Montesquieu's Critique of Hobbes	227

# Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

**Editor:** Ellen Frankel Paul

**Associate Editors:** Fred D. Miller, Jr., and Jeffrey Paul

**Managing Editor:** Matthew Buckley

*Social Philosophy and Policy Center*

## Editorial Board

David Braybrooke

*University of Texas, Austin*

Baruch Brody

*Rice University*

Allen Buchanan

*University of Arizona*

James Buchanan

*Buchanan Center for Political Economy,*

*George Mason University*

Jules Coleman

*Yale University*

Jack Douglas

*University of California, San Diego*

Richard A. Epstein

*University of Chicago Law School*

James Fishkin

*University of Texas, Austin*

Antony G.N. Flew

*University of Reading (Emeritus)*

Martin Golding

*Duke University*

John Gray

*London School of Economics and*

*Political Science*

Gilbert Harman

*Princeton University*

Seymour Martin Lipset

*George Mason University and*

*Hoover Institution, Stanford University*

Eric Mack

*Tulane University*

Harvey Mansfield, Jr.

*Harvard University*

Wallace I. Matson

*University of California, Berkeley*

Jan Narveson

*University of Waterloo*

Robert Nozick

*Harvard University*

Nicholas Rescher

*University of Pittsburgh*

David Sidorsky

*Columbia University*

Hillel Steiner

*University of Manchester*

James Q. Wilson

*University of California,*

*Los Angeles*

Leland B. Yeager

*Auburn University*

*Social Philosophy & Policy* is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

**Editorial Office:** Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403, USA.

**Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information:** See inside back cover.

Copyright © 2001 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/01 \$9.50) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

## CONTRIBUTORS

**Larry Arnhart** is Professor of Political Science at Northern Illinois University. He is the author of *Darwinian Natural Right: The Biological Ethics of Human Nature* (1998), *Political Questions: Political Philosophy from Plato to Rawls* (1987), and *Aristotle on Political Reasoning: A Commentary on the "Rhetoric"* (1983). He is currently working on a book on the interrelation of biology and natural law from Thomas Aquinas to Edward O. Wilson.

**Douglas J. Den Uyl** is Vice-President of Educational Programs at Liberty Fund. His interests are in the areas of social and political philosophy and ethics. He is the author of *The Virtue of Prudence* (1991) and *Power, State, and Freedom: An Interpretation of Spinoza's Political Thought* (1983); he is also a coauthor of *Liberalism Defended: The Challenge of Post-Modernity* (with Douglas B. Rasmussen, 1997) and *Liberty and Nature: An Aristotelian Defense of Liberal Order* (with Douglas B. Rasmussen, 1991).

**Douglas B. Rasmussen** is Professor of Philosophy at St. John's University. He is a coauthor of *Liberalism Defended: The Challenge of Post-Modernity* (with Douglas J. Den Uyl, 1997) and *Liberty and Nature: An Aristotelian Defense of Liberal Order* (with Douglas J. Den Uyl, 1991); in addition, he is a coeditor of *Liberty for the Twenty-First Century* (with Tibor R. Machan, 1995). He has also published numerous articles on epistemology, ethics, and political philosophy, and he guest-edited the January 1992 issue of *The Monist* on the topic "Teleology and the Foundation of Value."

**Mark C. Murphy** is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Georgetown University. He is the author of a number of articles on natural law theory, the theory of political obligation, and the moral and political views of Thomas Hobbes. He is the author of *Natural Law and Practical Rationality* and the editor of *Alasdair MacIntyre*; both titles are forthcoming from Cambridge University Press. His current research interests include natural law political philosophy as well as the nature of divine authority.

**George Klosko** is Professor of Government and Foreign Affairs at the University of Virginia. His books include *Democratic Procedures and Liberal Consensus* (2000), *The Principle of Fairness and Political Obligation* (1992), and *The Development of Plato's Political Theory* (1986). He is also the author of the two-volume *History of Political Theory: An Introduction* (1993, 1995).

**Michael S. Moore** is Warren Distinguished Professor of Law at the University of San Diego and Co-Director of the Institute of Law and Philos-

ophy at the University of San Diego. His books include *Educating Oneself in Public: Critical Essays in Jurisprudence* (2000), *Placing Blame: A General Theory of the Criminal Law* (1998), and *Act and Crime: The Philosophy of Action and its Implications for Criminal Law* (1993). He is also the coauthor of *Foundations of Criminal Law* (with Leo Katz and Stephen Morse, 1999).

**Hadley Arkes** is Edward Ney Professor of Jurisprudence and American Institutions at Amherst College. His books include *The Return of George Sutherland: Restoring a Jurisprudence of Natural Rights* (1994), *Beyond the Constitution* (1990), and *First Things: An Inquiry into the First Principles of Morals and Justice* (1986).

**David Luban** is Frederick Haas Professor of Law and Philosophy at the Georgetown University Law Center. He has written many articles on law, ethics, and political philosophy. He is also the author of *Legal Modernism* (1994) and *Lawyers and Justice: An Ethical Study* (1988), the editor of *The Ethics of Lawyers* (1994), and the coeditor of *Legal Ethics* (with Deborah L. Rohde; 2d ed., 1995).

**Joseph Boyle** is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Toronto, and is the Principal of St. Michael's College. He has written in the areas of bioethics, social and political philosophy, and just war theory. He is the coauthor of *Nuclear Deterrence, Morality, and Realism* (with John Finnis and Germain Grisez, 1987), and is the coeditor of *Philosophical Perspectives on Bioethics* (with L. W. Sumner, 1996).

**Michael Zuckert** is Nancy R. Dreux Professor of Government and International Studies at the University of Notre Dame. He works in the areas of political philosophy, American constitutional theory, and American political thought. He is the author of *The Natural Rights Republic: Studies in the Foundation of the American Political Tradition* (1996) and *Natural Rights and the New Republicanism* (1994).