

The black and white photographs chosen to illustrate this account are rather variable but this reflects the source material, often representing the only visual record of buildings now lost. Some are poignantly evocative of what has gone; others uplifting in showing what can be and has been achieved.

Perhaps inevitably the horror stories of important buildings lost or disfigured remain in the mind but the overwhelming impression is one of consistent dedicated effort ensuring through the multitude of everyday cases that the vast majority of the buildings we have inherited are passed on to future generations in good order. This book does much to set the work of Diocesan Advisory Committees in context, and can be warmly recommended to all concerned with the care, protection, adaptation and continued use of our precious legacy of ecclesiastical buildings, be they members of Diocesan Advisory Committees, Diocesan legal advisers, Archdeacons or incumbents. A wealth of information is packed into this concise booklet; there is something here for everyone.

*A BROAD AND LIVING WAY—CHURCH AND STATE A CONTINUING ESTABLISHMENT*, JOHN MOSES, Canterbury Press, Norwich, 1995, 260 pp. £11.95, ISBN 1 85311 112 0.

and

*THE MONARCHY AND THE CONSTITUTION*, VERNON BOGDANOR, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1995, 328 pp, £19.99, ISBN 0 19 827769 5.

A review by Canon Peter Boulton

The first of these books is by the former Provost of Chelmsford, now Dean of St Paul's, and provides a thoroughgoing and erudite analysis of the inevitable encounter of an incarnational and redemptorist Church with the world, in terms of its organised statehood, from its earliest days to the present. Although his declared aim is 'to argue unashamedly for a continuing establishment of religion in England', Dr Moses deserves to be taken seriously by all involved in the contemporary debate from inside and outside the Church of England and whether for or against its establishment. His thesis divides into four parts, each of about sixty well-packed pages and three to four chapters with end-notes.

In Part 1, 'On Being the Church', we are taken through the first 500 years of the Church's life, when the priority of mission unavoidably brought contact with world and state in some form. New Testament and early Church history bear out the author's analysis, which gives us a broad interpretative method, for tracing the steps of a Church committed to the task of mission. It is increasingly 'woven into the fabric of society through the activity of its members'; nevertheless it retains 'a fair degree of spiritual detachment' by the witness of its bishops, prophets and martyrs to 'a Kingdom not of this world'. Moses forces us to face the truth that both in Medieval and post-Reformation Europe all churches (not solely the Roman) attempted the 'Empire' model, but he fails to grapple with the fact that the *locus classicus* is already there in the vision of the last New Testament theologian, as a Kingdom in which 'the kingdoms of this world are become the kingdoms of our Lord and of his Christ'. The history of such attempts, however well-meaning, has turned both in ecclesiology and in practice towards the humbler paths of the Servant Church of the Man for Others. This change is most vividly to be seen in our own century in the contrast of the Roman Catholic decrees of Vatican I and Vatican II with the subsequent Canon Law Codes of 1918 and 1983.

The question this book raises for all branches of the Universal Church, with

their distinctive histories, is how best to carry forward their missionary task with sufficient involvement in and detachment from the world Christ came to save, so as to be at once true to and effective in her calling and without yielding to the attractions of identifying with the short-term values of current socio-political thinking.

Part II describes the 'English Experience', in terms of the Church's place in the history of the nation. It begins with the obvious, but oft-forgotten, truth that 'the English nation was the child of the Church'. The state did not establish the Church but was established by it, when in the seventh century it gave the seven Saxon kingdoms a national basis for unification. The parish system gave it shape and an educated clerisy provided administrators, as the nation emerged from the dark ages. The roots of the state are seen to be closely tied into the country's story and the Church's mission inextricably involved with the state at every level. The depapalised Church after the Reformation is set out clearly as responsible to the monarchy; consecrating Crown appointees as bishops, drafting canon law for royal assent and exercising administration in recognised church courts, yet bringing the Word and Sacraments to its people as it had ever been called by God and authorised by the Universal Church to do.

Hooker's 'Polity' providing the constitutional theory and ecclesiology for the Reformation settlement is given full recognition and spills over into Chapter 6 on 'The English Tradition', to include Caroline divines, evangelicals, deists, tractarians and liberal Catholics in its scope. Even if one feels at times they themselves might have objected to being so comprehended, Dr Moses' grasp of the history and literature of the periods cannot be gainsaid, except in minor details. In chapter 7, the author follows the movement of national history to the present state of the Church establishment, and it is splendidly done. Even if at times carried away by his own rhetoric, he is faithful to the history to which his widely chosen references attest. He traces its gradual transformation from the Toleration Acts of the eighteenth century, through the Acts reforming church and state in the nineteenth century, to the increased autonomy of the Church within the establishment in the twentieth century, but gives less than due weight to the post-war canon law revision.

Moses has a firm grasp of the point made by Bishop Hensley Henson, Archbishop Garbett and others that 'National Christianity may not be so national as to cease to be Christian', and quotes Canon A1 to show that the Church of England, though 'established according to the laws of this realm', affirms its primary loyalty to 'the true and apostolic Church of Christ'. On the basis of this principle Dr Runcie clashed with Prime Minister Thatcher over the Falklands' commemoration and inner-city decline and the General Synod has refused to acquiesce in issues of social injustice. They were in the tradition of Shaftesbury, Wilberforce, Kingsley and Maurice who had asserted the Magna Carta tradition of the Church's freedom to criticise the government whilst closely identified with the nation.

Whatever the constitutional position, in his assessment of the establishment, our author has the wisdom to recognise the place of 'the parish, the parish church and the parish priest (in) the church's desire to offer ministry to the whole nation'. He reminds us of Alan Wilkinson's study of the effect of World War I on Church and nation, making the transition from nineteenth-century rivalry to twentieth-century co-operation between the Churches, as expressed by Christopher Driver; 'In England now, instead of an Established Church, we have an established religion (still identifiable with Christianity), together with various constitutional, legal and financial relics of the days when it was more important to be an Anglican than to be a Christian'.

However, the manner in which this *de facto* establishment is dependent on the

*de jure* establishment seems to have been missed by Dr Moses, even when he comes closest to it in the final chapter. The odd factor in the whole discussion over the past thirty years is that none of the main-line Churches in England have called for disestablishment. One can only conclude that because the Church of England has been at the forefront of ecumenical action in this century, the *de facto* situation is a beneficially inclusive one and that no Christian Church wishes to encourage the state to repudiate its religious roots. Of recent years our Church has been encouraged to stick to its special mission in the state by its ecumenical friends.

In Part III, 'Patterns of Engagement', Moses sketches the history of religious settlements between Church and state as various as those under the Christian emperors of Rome, Byzantium and Moscow; the nation states of Europe; in the USA and in Kenya, with a number of studies in modern law and practice. The English reader should note well: dangers in privatising of denominations in the USA; the persistent effect of the Orthodox worship on its ability to survive persecution; the weakening effect on mission of over-identification of the Church with any regime, whether it be a royal house or a political party; the refusal of the Church to turn its back on its history and people by accepting the role of a sect; the importance of the prophetic calling of the Church in a situation where party and state are close to becoming completely identified, as in Kenya's recent history.

In Part IV, 'A Continuing Establishment', Dr Moses deploys his researches upon the post-war situation of the national church and draws conclusions about its usefulness to the state. He could have drawn attention to the 1944 and 1988 Education Acts and the National Health Service Act 1946 which recognise the psycho-somatic nature of human beings and provide for government-financed, broadly Christian, education in all schools and hospital chaplaincy services. It is also the case that the thousands of clergy and church people involved in the creation, organisation and co-ordination of voluntary societies and charities at all levels of national life mean that the church is often better informed on social issues than government itself, and certainly more in direct contact with people in need. This means the bishops in the House of Lords, with their independent networks of information and as bearers of the English religious tradition, make for a broader and deeper critique of the executive than otherwise would be the case. There also stands behind them the highly respected Churches Main Committee founded in 1941 on the initiative of the Church of England (always chaired by a senior bishop) to raise issues (other than education) affecting the ministry and mission of the churches and the Jewish community with the executive at all levels of government.

The author concludes his thesis for continuation of establishment on the basis of the Church of England's being 'serviceable, accessible, evocative, worthy of respect and tolerant', for the people of England, its fellow religionists, and the well-being of the state. With a wealth of evidence, he sees the legal establishment as a minimal but necessary expression of the church's motherhood, nurture and service of an emerging state throughout their common history. In consequence, he finds the occasional demand for disestablishment to be a random test of the Church's tenacity of its historic mission and the state's need of it. This is only possible if the Church 'is Christian first and national second, knowing itself to be always under the judgement of God and bound to render to God what it may not render to Caesar' (Canon Henry Balmforth in *Prospect for Christendom*, Faber, 1946). This is a book for every thinking member of the Church and should be compulsory reading for ordinands, clergy, canonists—and parliamentarians.

Professor Bogdanor's book is also very readable. It is a timely publication when commentators of every national journal feel it vital to their reputations to bring the present monarchy under scrutiny on the basis of highly idiosyncratic interpretations of history and government. The most damaging of these is to present the

monarchy as archaic, inhibiting to social change and stuck in a time-warp whilst other national institutions reflect and contribute to our developing democracy. Mr Bogdanor, Reader in Government of the University of Oxford, provides his readers with eight chapters on the historical, constitutional and organisational factors by which the powers of British monarchy have been modified to the present day. Chapters on both Church and Commonwealth complete the picture. The book concludes with sage practical advice for politicians, palace advisers, churchmen and journalists alike. Its five useful appendices and select bibliography provide a menu of facts and preliminary reading which should be compulsory for anyone thinking of lifting the pen to write on the subject in future.

Bogdanor draws conclusions from the evidence where history has established them, but wisely leaves tentative prediction to the last chapter where he sees the symbolic role of the present royal house as combining continuity of constitutional legitimacy for democratic government with philanthropic action in areas which require a national spotlight. In this, the Queen and her private secretaries (whose role is high-lighted in chapter 8, by fresh research) have faithfully followed Bagehot's dictum 'to be invisible is to be forgotten . . . to be a symbol, and an effective symbol, you must be vividly and often seen'.

My own concerns about this book are, first, its underestimation of the place of biblical and canon law in the constitutional development of monarchy and nation at least since the reign of Alfred, long before the Magna Carta from which Bogdanor says 'the real beginning of the idea of constitutional monarchy dates' (p. 3). Second, Bogdanor fails to draw out the influence of the Coronation rite upon ruler and ruled where the ruler is seen as the head of the nation and 'head of state, robed in the traditional vestments of the deacon [*diaconos*]' holding the symbols of power [*exousia*]*—*as found in the *locus classicus* of the servant-king in Romans 13: 1–10. He also fails to note the close personal proximity of the Primate of All England to the sovereign throughout the history of the monarchy in terms of status and responsibility in and for the nation.

Chapter 8 on Sovereign and Church is largely fair and accurate, not least where it refers to disestablishment, but there are some misunderstandings. On Senior Appointments (p. 232) provosts are appointed by the diocesan bishop—not the Crown. The present system for archbishops and bishops might be extended to include deans and canons when a parallel route from diocese to Downing Street is agreed, but this depends upon further discussions referred to in 'A Code of Practice for Senior Church Appointments' (House of Bishops in General Synod of June 1995, GS Mis 455). The important issue is that the Prime Minister receives advice from the Church in a form that can be easily dealt with—perhaps (as with suffragan bishops) by providing two names of which the first is always chosen.

On a matter of a statutory Establishment, the author is correct in thinking that the Church of England is unlikely to erect a new relationship with the state along the lines of that of the Church of Scotland. Yet he understates the saga of the detachment of the Church of England within the establishment. That is the result of hard-fought negotiations with the state, agreed on the basis of the Church of England Assembly (Powers) Act 1919, given detail in the Canon Law Revision (1947–69) and further enhanced by the Synodical Government Measure 1969 and the Church of England (Worship and Doctrine) Measure 1974. All these modifications to the Tudor and Stuart Acts are enshrined in parliamentary legislation which the Church, with all-faith support, has recently upheld. Any reform of the House of Lords which increased the representation of other Churches and faiths would not be done by any political party with the intention of forcing disestablishment, nor taken to be such by the Church which has every intention of pursuing its historic mission in both state and nation.