

# Law and History Review

# Law and History Review

---

The purpose of *Law and History Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The Review is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History.

Back issues of *Law and History Review* may be ordered directly from *Law and History Review*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Dept., One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006-4020, USA.

**Editorial Office:** Department of History, American University, 4400 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20016, USA. Gautham Rao, Editor; telephone: 202-885-6745; e-mail: [gauth.rao@gmail.com](mailto:gauth.rao@gmail.com)

Address all general editorial correspondence to Gautham Rao, Editor, *Law and History Review*, American University, 4400 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20016, USA (tel: 202-885-6745; e-mail: [gauth.rao@gmail.com](mailto:gauth.rao@gmail.com)). Address correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing on the Americas to Angela Fernandez, Associate Editor, University of Toronto Faculty of Law (email: [angela.fernandez@utoronto.ca](mailto:angela.fernandez@utoronto.ca)). Address correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing on Europe to Elizabeth Papp Kamali, Associate Editor, Harvard Law School (email: [ekamali@law.harvard.edu](mailto:ekamali@law.harvard.edu)). Address correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing on Asia, Africa, and the Pacific to Jedidiah Kroncke, University of Hong Kong Faculty of Law (email: [jkroncke@hku.edu](mailto:jkroncke@hku.edu)). Address correspondence regarding digital projects to Michan Connor, Associate Editor (email: [michan.connor@gmail.com](mailto:michan.connor@gmail.com)).

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006-4020, USA (for USA, Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK (for UK and elsewhere).

*Law and History Review* (ISSN 0738-2480) is published four times a year, in February, May, August, and November by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006-4020, USA / Cambridge University Press, University Printing House, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8BS, England for the American Society of Legal History. Annual institutional subscription rates for Volume 37 (2019) USA, Canada, and Mexico / Elsewhere are \$308 / £182 for print and electronic subscriptions. Single part: \$88 / £53. Prices include postage and insurance. *Law and History Review* and all other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/>.

© The American Society for Legal History, Inc. 2019. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

Forwarding and return postage guaranteed, address correction requested. Postmaster: Send address changes in the USA and Canada to *Law and History Review*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Dept., One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006-4020, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Law and History Review*, Cambridge University Press, University Printing House, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8BS, England.

Abstracting and Indexing Information: America: History and Life; CSA Worldwide Political Science Abstracts; Current Law Index; Current Abstracts; SocIndex; SocIndex with Full Text; TOC Premier; Scopus; Family Index; Academic OneFile; General OneFile; InfoTrac Custom; LegalTrac; Biography Index; Index to Legal Periodicals & Books; Historical Abstracts.

# Law and History Review

---

Volume 37, Number 3

August 2019

---

*Published four times a year by Cambridge University Press for the  
American Society for Legal History*

**Editor**

Gautham Rao  
*American University*  
 Department of History  
 4400 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
 Washington, DC 20016  
 202.885.6745  
 FAX: 202.885.6166  
 EMAIL: gauth.rao@gmail.com

**Associate Editor  
 (Book Reviews, Asia, Africa,  
 Pacific)**

Jedidiah Kroncke  
*University of Hong Kong Faculty  
 of Law*  
 EMAIL: jkroncke@hku.edu

**Associate Editor  
 (Book Reviews, Americas)**

Angela Fernandez  
*University of Toronto Faculty of  
 Law*  
 EMAIL: angela.fernandez@  
 utoronto.ca

**Associate Editor  
 (Digital Projects)**

Michan Connor  
*Independent Scholar*  
 EMAIL: michan.connor@gmail.  
 com

**Associate Editor  
 (Book Reviews, Europe)**

Elizabeth Papp Kamali  
*Harvard Law School*  
 EMAIL: ekamali@law.harvard.  
 edu

---

**Editorial Board**

David Anderson  
*University of Warwick*

Constance Backhouse  
*University of Ottawa*

Edward J. Balleisen  
*Duke University*

Nicholas Barreyre  
*L'ecole des Hautes Etudes en  
 Sciences Sociales*

Felice Batlan  
*ITT Chicago-Kent College of Law*

Fihad Bishara  
*University of Maryland*

Holly Brewer  
*University of Maryland*

Thomas Buoye  
*University of Tulsa*

Christopher Capozzola  
*Massachusetts Institute  
 of Technology*

Amy Chazkel  
*Queens College, CUNY*

Li Chen  
*University of Toronto-  
 Scarborough*

Andrew Wender Cohen  
*Syracuse University*

Rohit De  
*Yale University*

Alejandro de la Fuente  
*Harvard University*

Laura F. Edwards  
*Duke University*

Carole Emberton  
*University at Buffalo*

Lisa Ford  
*University of New South Wales*

Sally E. Hadden  
*Western Michigan University*

Amalia Kessler  
*Stanford University*

Daniel M. Klerman  
*University of Southern  
 California*

Elizabeth Kolsky  
*Villanova University*

Adriaan Lanni  
*Harvard University*

Kenneth F. Ledford  
*Case Western Reserve University*

David Lieberman  
*University of California, Berkeley*

Assaf Likhovski  
*Tel Aviv University*

Rebecca McLennan  
*University of California, Berkeley*

Ajay Mehrota  
*American Bar Foundation*

M. C. Mirow  
*Florida International University*

Devin Pendas  
*Boston College*

Intisar Rabb  
*Harvard University*

Stephen Robertson  
*Roy Rosenzweig Center for  
 History and New Media*

Lena Salaymeh  
*Tel Aviv University*

Reuel Schiller  
*Hastings College of Law*

Karl Shoemaker  
*University of Wisconsin*

Karen Tani  
*University of California, Berkeley*

Heather Ann Thompson  
*University of Michigan*

Stefan Vogenauer  
*Max Planck Institute*

James Q. Whitman  
*Yale University*

Anders Winroth  
*Yale University*

Will Hanley  
*Florida State University*

# Contents

Law and History Review

Vol. 37, No. 3, August 2019

Full text available at <http://journals.cambridge.org/lhr>

## **In This Issue**

v

### **Articles**

- “Amongst the Most Desirable Reading”: Advertising and the Fetters of the Newspaper Press in Britain, c. 1848–1914  
Anat Rosenberg 657
- Symposium: Originalism and Legal History: Rethinking the Special Relationship**
- Two Early Dutch Translations of the United States Constitution: Public Meaning in a Transnational Context  
Michael Douma 707
- Interpreting Article II, Section 2: George Washington and the President’s Powers  
Lindsay M. Chervinsky 725
- “Plant Yourselves on its Primal Granite”: Slavery, History and the Antebellum Roots of Originalism  
Aaron R. Hall 743
- Common Law Confrontations  
Bernadette Meyler 763
- Originalism and the Academy in Exile  
Paul Baumgardner 787
- Originalism and the Law of the Past  
William Baude and Stephen E. Sachs 809
- Reading the Constitution, 1787–91: History, Originalism, and Constitutional Meaning  
Saul Cornell 821
- Method and Dialogue in History and Originalism  
Logan Everett Sawyer III 847

**Review Essay**

The Closing of the Constitution

*The Second Creation: Fixing the American Constitution in the  
Founding Era*—Jonathan Gienapp

reviewed by Kevin Arlyck

861