

St. Francis of Assisi, St. Therese of Lisieux, and St. John Paul II himself, while also noting resonances with non-Catholic figures such as Gandhi.

Second, Sweeney emphasizes the role of Mother Teresa's dark night. This experience, which only became public knowledge with the publication of *Come Be My Light* in 2007, began around 1950. Sweeney effectively notes how this private experience was connected with her increasingly public image as a holy figure, highlighting in many cases how knowledge of the dark night colors some of the statements in her letters and speeches. Third, Sweeney does a fine job of showing the role of technology in Mother Teresa's public image. He highlights that although she never advanced technologically beyond the typewriter herself, the spread of her vocation and the ubiquity of her image were a result of broadcast (and later digital) technologies, even describing her as "the first great saint of the television age" (xi).

Like other volumes in Liturgical Press's "People of God" series, *Teresa of Calcutta* is targeted at more of a general than a scholarly audience. Sweeney writes well in this format, having previously written the series' entry on Fr. James Martin, SJ, in 2020. The main text is a fairly brisk 132 pages that cover the full sweep of her life and includes many illuminating anecdotes without getting too bogged down into details. This biography is suitable for all readers who want an easy introduction to the life of this remarkable and contemporary saint, but those looking for a fuller account of Mother Teresa's life or for a deeper analysis of her work, theological commitments, or impact will want to look elsewhere. Happily, Sweeney does include a good set of endnotes and a brief annotated bibliography of books and films about her life that could give some direction to those looking for further resources.

STEPHEN OKEY

Saint Leo University, USA  
[stephen.okey@saintleo.edu](mailto:stephen.okey@saintleo.edu)

*The Karamazov Case: Dostoevsky's Argument for His Vision.* By Terrence W. Tilley. London: T&T Clark, 2023. vii + 172 pages. \$115.00.

doi:10.1017/hor.2024.13

Rejecting the common (mis)reading of Fyodor Dostoevsky's *The Brothers Karamazov* as a contest between faith and reason, Tilley finds six alternative forms of life of varying degrees of reasonableness depicted in this novel. These include materialism (Ivan), sensualism (Fyodor), superstition (Fr. Ferapont), religious naivete (pilgrims), manipulation (Rakitin), and realism (Alyosha).

Tilley notes that these positions are also properly described as “faiths” in the sense of being ways of living in relation to a center of value or meaning. Tilley’s central contention is that Dostoevsky invites us to grapple with the question of which, if any, of these forms of life is truly rational in being able to respond to new circumstances, to enable people to live well, and to result in the sort of world we want to inhabit. In and through the depictions of these characters (and other characters whose doubling or mirroring provide variations of these six main positions), Dostoevsky seeks to persuade the reader that the most reasonable position is not the disengaged materialism of Ivan but Alyosha’s “realist” commitment to responsible love for a broken world.

Deeply steeped in the rich body of Dostoevsky scholarship, Tilley brings to the interpretative task the additional lens of his theological expertise, and especially his familiarity with the nuanced Christian concepts of freedom, grace, and community that are integral to Dostoevsky’s orthodox view. Tilley is thus able to discern—and provide a compelling defense of—an underlying structure that reveals the deeper meaning of major and minor events in this sprawling novel. For example, the various conversions, near conversions, and missed conversions attain clearer significance as explorations of the six main “faith” stances, while the story of the woman who clung to her onion is interpreted from various angles that show this story to be profoundly illuminative of Dostoevsky’s understanding of the human person.

Most importantly, Tilley clarifies that the questions the novel posed to readers in Dostoevsky’s day are also among the pressing questions of our time. What does it mean to be free? How can we live well in our world? What is the role of community, and communal traditions, in forming us to become our true selves? More specifically, for those who would reject the lack of freedom in the extremes of Fyodor’s unbridled sensuality, on the one hand, and the antlike obedience enforced by the Grand Inquisitor, on the other hand, what kinds of communities and authorities will foster the responsible freedom through which we might flourish together?

These are profoundly theological questions and ones that those of us who teach theology encourage our students to ponder. We too live in a world where manipulation, hedonism, religious naivete or superstition, and narrow rationalism often appear to be more attractive options than discipleship for loving solidarity. Tilley helps us to see that this novel is an occasion for serious thought about these choices and where they are likely to lead. My hunch is that students who are suspicious of theological arguments will respond better to Dostoevsky’s polyphonic literary exploration of these issues, especially as illuminated by Tilley.

Anyone teaching *The Brothers Karamazov* will benefit from including *The Karamazov Case* in the course readings. Tilley’s slim volume is clearly written,

accessible to undergraduates, and enormously helpful in clarifying the major issues at stake in the novel. Indeed, all who are interested in Dostoevsky's work will want to engage this perceptive interpretation. Reading *The Karamazov Case* is like spending a delightful afternoon discussing what it means to live well with a wise theologian who brings a lifetime of insight and a lively mind to the conversation.

Those who do not have the luxury of including a novel the size of *The Brothers Karamazov* in their courses will find that Tilley's sixth chapter discussing Ivan Karamazov and freedom can be profitably read along with "Rebellion" and perhaps "The Grand Inquisitor." Tilley's interpretation will push students beyond their usual facile positions and may have the added bonus of inspiring their interest in reading the whole of both books.

MARY DOAK

University of San Diego, USA

[mdoak@sandiego.edu](mailto:mdoak@sandiego.edu)

*From Ignatius to Francis: The Jesuits in History.* By Michael Walsh. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2022. viii + 333 pages. \$29.95.

doi:10.1017/hor.2024.20

Library shelves are replete with books and historical research about Jesuits and their exploits. More appear each year, bringing new insight and depth of understanding about Jesuits, their works, their successes, and their failures. Why, then, another? Walsh provides two reasons. First, it is important to "bring some of this new research to a wider audience." (1) This he accomplishes abundantly well, weaving together more venerable sources with the latest emerging scholarship. His second reason for the book is more subtle. While most histories of the Jesuits "give prominence to what Jesuits *did*," in this work he wants "to give rather more coverage of what Jesuits *thought*" (1–2). It took me a second reading to grasp what Walsh means by this. In part this requires attending to Jesuit involvement in the theological controversies of their day. But the story of what Jesuits thought and how that is related to their history is, as Walsh illustrates over ten chapters, complex.

From their beginnings, Jesuits have been shaped by and given shape in return to the times in which they live and act. These times are characterized by diverse and evolving ideas, attitudes, prejudices, and ambitions. The story of the Jesuits adds to this the encounter between European and non-European cultures. The times explored in this volume are shaped by powers great and