

# INDEX

## Abbreviations used in the index

- ACHPR (African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (1981) (Banjul Charter))
- ACtHPR (African Court of Human and Peoples' Rights)
- CERD (UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination)
- CIL (customary international law)
- CLCS (Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf)
- ECHR (European Convention on Human Rights (1950))
- ECtHR (European Court of Human Rights)
- FCDO (UK Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office)
- IACtHR (Inter-American Court of Human Rights)
- ICERD (International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (1965))
- ICSFT (International Convention for the Suppression of Financing of Terrorism (199))
- ILC (International Law Commission/ ILC Articles and Draft Articles)
- ITLOS (International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea)
- OHCHR (Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights)
- SIA (State Immunity Act (1978) (UK))
- STJ (Supreme Tribunal of Justice (Venezuela))
- UAE (United Arab Emirates)
- UNCLOS (UN Convention on the Law of the Sea (1982))

## ACHPR (1981), by article

- 56 (admissibility requirements) [265-6](#)
- 56(2) (compatibility of Communications with Charter) [256](#)

## act of State (foreign State acts), definition/characteristics

academic writings

Mann, F.A. [644](#), [652-3](#)

development of doctrine [651-4](#)

difficulties with [652-3](#)

types of foreign acts of State

type 1: recognition of foreign law relating to property within the foreign State's jurisdiction (private international law) [653](#), [672](#), [680-3](#)

type 2: acceptance, subject to exceptions, of the validity of any sovereign act relating to property within the jurisdiction [653-64](#)

appointment of public officials [654-6](#), [665-8](#), [682-3](#)  
comity, and [659](#)

Crown/personal sovereign acts [658-9](#), [666-8](#)

doctrine, judicial development [655-64](#)

legality of acts of officials, relevance [656-7](#)

sovereignty/executive activity, risk of equating [673](#)

territoriality [668-70](#)

UK court jurisdiction in matters regarding [656-7](#)

type 3: non-justiciability/judicial restraint/abstention [653](#), [664-5](#)  
incidental issue, allegations arising as [670-3](#)

**act of State (foreign State acts), jurisprudence**

- Altimo Holdings* 664, 674
- Bank of Ethiopia v. National Bank of Egypt* 668
- Belhaj* 653, 654-6, 659, 665-9, 671-2, 674, 677, 680-1
- Buck v. A-G* 671, 677, 682
- Buttes Gas* 653, 657, 659, 661, 671, 674
- Carr v. Francis Times* 667
- Dobree v. Napier* 664
- Duke of Brunswick v. King of Hanover* 657-9, 662, 666-8, 678
- Jimenez v. Palacios* 670
- Johnstone v. Pedlar* 659
- Kirkpatrick* 664, 671
- Korea National Insurance* 664
- Kuwait Airways (Nos 4 and 5)* 661, 664
- Lucasfilm v. Ainsworth* 665-6
- Luther v. Sagor* 659
- Oetjen* 659, 660, 662-3, 678
- Oppenheimer v. Cattermole* 664, 676-7
- Pinochet (No 3)* 678
- Piramal v. Oomkarmal* 660
- Playa Larga* 664
- Princess Paley Olga* 657-61, 663, 666
- Rahmatullah* 666
- Ricaud* 662-3
- Underhill* 662-3, 666
- Yukos (No 2)* 653-4, 661, 664-5, 671-2, 674-5, 681

**act of State (foreign State acts), limitations/exceptions**

- commercial activity exception 664
- factual enquiry versus finding on legality of action (*Kirkpatrick* limitation) 664
- indirect/ancillary acts 665
- intellectual property infringement cases 665
- international law/human rights violations including public policy considerations 664
- judicial acts 664
- territorial limitation/act exclusively within own territory 664

**ACtHPR, Rules of the Court, by rule**

- 26(a) (jurisdiction) 327-8
- 39(1) (jurisdiction) 327, 330, 345
- 40 (admissibility requirements) 326, 330, 332-3, 339, 344, 346-7
- 61 (principles of reasoning) 344

**admissibility (ACtHPR), distinguished**

- exhaustion of local remedies, prerogative of mercy (See *Mango and others v. United Republic of Tanzania*)
- joint applications 344-7

**African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights**

- Declaration of Principles on Freedom of Expression and Access to Information in Africa 2019
  - Principle 2 (non-interference with freedom of opinion) 314
  - Principle 21 (protection of reputation) 258-9, 310-11

**African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, Rules of Procedure, by rule**

- 99(2),(3) (presentation of new or additional facts) 282
- 107(4) (admissibility of communications) 283-4

***Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Preliminary Objections), judgment of 4 February 2021***

case overview

background 13-14, 146-53

Court conclusions: principal findings 14-15

facts 13-14, 153-6

preliminary objections raised 156

separate and dissenting opinions 15-17

Court conclusions: principal findings

background and facts 13-14, 146-9, 153-6

CERD exclusions 167-8

claims and requests of parties

Qatar 149-53

UAE 152

indirect discrimination

interpretation 158-61

whether measures characterized as such covered by CERD 177-9

jurisdiction *ratione materiae* 163-79

CERD Committee, examination of admissibility exceptions by 155

Court conclusions 179

Court jurisdiction, general basis for 156

nationality versus national origin 163-72

object and purpose of CERD 165-9

media corporations, measures imposed on

whether racial discrimination 158-9, 162, 175-7

whether within scope of CERD 175-7

nationality, interpretation

CERD Committee General Recommendation XXX 172-4

CERD *travaux préparatoires* 169-72

citizens and non-citizens, differentiation between 167-9, 172-4

Court ruling 175

national origin

generally 158-9

whether includes current nationality 164-8, 172, 175

object and purpose of CERD 165-9

regional human rights courts 174-5

regional human rights instruments 175

treaty interpretation rules 164-7

nationality, interpretation—jurisprudence

*Diallo* 165, 174

*Application of ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation)* 164

*Certain Iranian Assets (Islamic Republic of Iran v. USA)* 168

*Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200*

*Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (Nicaragua v. Colombia)* 164-5

*Genocide case (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Serbia and Montenegro)* 165

*Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France)* 164-5

*Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory* 165

*Legal Consequences of the Separation of the Chagos Archipelago from Mauritius* 168

*Norrttebohm (Liechtenstein v. Guatemala)* 167

*Obligation to Prosecute or Extradite (Belgium v. Senegal)* 165, 168

***Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Preliminary Objections), judgment of 4 February 2021 (cont.)***

- Territorial Dispute (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya/Chad)* 167
  - Whaling in the Antarctic (Australia v. Japan: New Zealand intervening)* 168
  - overview 14-15, 179-80
  - preliminary objections 156
  - racial discrimination, interpretation
    - CERD definition 167, 178
    - CERD *travaux préparatoires* 169-72
    - declarations criticizing a State or policies 179
    - indirect discrimination 158-61
    - media corporations, against 158-9, 162, 175-7
  - subject matter of dispute
    - characterization 156-63
    - Rules of Court requirements 156-7, 161-3
  - separate opinions and declarations
    - Bhandari J (dissenting)
      - CERD Committee
        - General Recommendation XXX 209-10
        - purpose 208-10
      - conclusions 213
      - jurisdiction *ratione materiae* 201-2, 211-12
      - jurisprudence
        - Diallo* 208, 210
        - Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory* 210-11
        - Obligation to Negotiate Access to the Pacific Ocean (Bolivia v. Chile)* 201
    - nationality, interpretation
      - CERD Committee General Recommendation No 30 209-10
      - CERD provisions and exclusions 204-5, 207-8, 212-13
      - CERD *travaux préparatoires* 206-8, 212-13
      - jus sanguinis* model 203-4
      - treaty interpretation principles, and 202-4
      - versus national origin 202-5, 207-8, 211-13
  - overview 16, 200
  - racial discrimination
    - definition 205, 212-13
    - differential treatment, proportionality in 211-12
  - subject matter of dispute 200-2
- Daudet, Judge ad hoc (declaration)
  - conclusions 253
  - overview 17, 250-1
  - parallel proceedings, validity of 251-2
  - preliminary objections, exclusive preliminary character 252-3
  - procedural preconditions 250-1
- Iwasawa J (separate opinion)
  - conclusions 249
  - jurisprudence
    - B.M.S. v. Australia* 242
    - Diop v. France* 238
    - Gueye et al. v. France* 227-8, 237

- Karakurt v. Austria* 237-8
- L.R. v. Slovakia* 241
- Luczak v. Poland* 238
- Queresbi v. Denmark* 238-9
- nationality, interpretation
  - CERD exclusions 233-4
  - CERD object and purpose 234
  - CERD *travaux préparatoires* 234
  - citizenship status 236-8
  - current nationality 224, 239
  - indirect discrimination 239-44
  - national origin versus nationality 224, 233-9
  - regional human rights courts 235-6, 242
- overview 17, 224-5
- preliminary objection
  - collateral or secondary effects 247
  - development of claims 247-9
  - disproportionate prejudicial effect on protected group 245-7
  - indirect discrimination claims 247-9
  - lack of exclusive character 232-3, 244-9
- racial discrimination
  - CERD definition 232, 240-1
  - CERD exceptions 233-4
  - CERD *travaux préparatoires* 234
  - Durban Declaration 243
  - indirect discrimination 239-44
  - jurisdiction under CERD 231-3
  - nationality and national origin, applicability 232-9
  - proportionality 235, 242
  - purpose or effect of discrimination 240
  - scrutiny threshold 235
- rights on non-citizens under international law
  - CERD Committee General Recommendation XXX 230-1, 243-4
  - discrimination based on nationality 227-30
  - historical development 225-9
  - ICCPR Human Rights Committee General Comment No 15 227, 229
  - ICESCR Committee General Comment No 20 228
  - international conventions 225-7, 237-8
  - monitoring bodies, role of 230
  - public emergency exclusions 229
  - regional conventions 227-9, 238
  - UNGA Resolution 40/144 229
- Robinson J (dissenting)
  - conclusion 224
  - jurisprudence
    - Diallo* 217-18
    - Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory* 218-19
    - Nottebohm (Liechtenstein v. Guatemala)* 215
- nationality versus national origins
  - CERD Committee and General Recommendation XXX 217-20
  - CERD provisions and exclusions 214-16

***Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Preliminary Objections), judgment of 4 February 2021 (cont.)***

- CERD *travaux préparatoires* 216-17
- indirect discrimination 220-4
- proportionality principle, and 218-20
- overview 16-17
- racial discrimination, interpretation
  - CERD definition 220
  - indirect discrimination 220-4
- Sebutinde J (dissenting)
  - claims and requests of parties
    - abuse of process, admissibility of claims on grounds of 199
    - Qatar 186-9
    - UAE 189
  - conclusions 200
  - dispute settlement, CERD procedural preconditions
    - Conciliation Commission procedures, obligation to exhaust 197-9
    - nature of 195-6
    - object and purpose of CERD 196
    - parallel proceedings 198
    - whether fulfilled 195-7
  - jurisdiction *ratione materiae*
    - applicability of CERD exceptions 192-5
    - generally 190
    - indirect discrimination 194
    - nationality versus national origin 193-4
    - subject matter of dispute 190-1
    - whether dispute covered by CERD 191-2, 194-5
  - jurisprudence
    - Application of ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation)* 190-1, 193, 195, 199
    - Certain Iranian Assets (Islamic Republic of Iran v. USA)* 191
    - Obligation to Negotiate Access to the Pacific Ocean (Bolivia v. Chile)* 190
    - Oil Platforms (Islamic Republic of Iran v. USA)* 191
  - overview 15-16, 186
  - preliminary objections, lack of exclusive character 186
- Yusuf, President (declaration)
  - jurisdiction *ratione materiae*
    - indirect discrimination 180-1, 183-5
    - national origin versus current nationality 184-5
    - nationality, interpretation 180-3
    - purpose and effect of discriminatory measures 185
  - overview 15, 17
  - subject matter of dispute 180-3

***Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Provisional Measures (First Request)), order of 23 July 2018***

- case overview
  - background and facts 3-4, 19-23
  - Court conclusions: principal findings 4-6
  - separate and dissenting opinions 6-8

- Court findings: principal ruling
  - alleged rights violations
    - failure to condemn racial hatred 25-6, 33
    - imposition of additional entry requirements 26-7
    - incitement of racial hatred and prejudice 25-6, 33
    - OHCHR Technical Report evidence 30, 33
    - right to education and training 25-7, 37, 42
    - right to equal treatment in law 25-7, 37, 42
    - right to freedom of movement 37, 41-2
    - right to freedom of opinion 25
    - right to marriage and choice of spouse 25, 27, 37
    - right to property 25
    - right to public health and medical care 25-7
    - right to work 25
  - background and facts 3-4, 19-23
- CERD
  - definition of racial discrimination 34
  - national origin, interpretation 3
  - “nationality,” *travaux préparatoires* 26
  - object and purpose 37
  - prima facie* jurisdiction 3
  - state obligations 34-7
- conclusions
  - grant of measures other than those requested 43
  - measures to be adopted 42-5
  - non-aggravation of dispute, avoidance of 43
- definition of racial discrimination 34
- exhaustion of local remedies, burden of proof 32
- nationality, interpretation
  - CERD *travaux préparatoires* 26
  - “ethnic origin” 26
  - “national origin” 3, 26
  - “present nationality” 37
- overview 4-6
- prima facie* jurisdiction
  - conclusions 31-2
  - court power to grant provisional measures 23-4
  - existence of dispute concerning interpretation or application of CERD 24-7
  - generally 3
  - genuine attempts to negotiate 28-9
  - jurisprudence
    - Application of CERD (Georgia v. Russian Federation)* 28, 30
    - Application of ICSTF and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation)* 24, 31
    - Immunities and Criminal Proceedings (Equatorial Guinea v. France)* 24-5
    - Interpretation of Peace Treaties with Bulgaria, Hungary and Romania* 24
    - Jadhav (India v. Pakistan)* 24
    - South West Africa (Ethiopia v. South Africa; Liberia v. South Africa)* 24
  - procedural preconditions 27-31
- procedural preconditions
  - cumulative nature 29
  - electa una via* or *lis pendens* exceptions, applicability 31
  - genuine attempts to negotiate 28-31

***Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Provisional Measures (First Request)), order of 23 July 2018*** (cont.)

- negotiations as distinct from mere protests 30
- overview 27-8
- procedures expressly provided under CERD 28-31
- provisional measures, generally
  - binding effect 44
  - Court power to grant 42-4
  - jurisprudence
    - Application of ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation)* 43
    - LaGrand (Germany v. USA)* 44
    - measures other than those requested 43
    - non-aggravation of dispute, avoidance of 43
  - rights for which protection is sought 32-8
    - Application of ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation)* 32
    - court role and powers 32
    - measures requested, link between 38
    - plausibility 32-4, 37-8
    - respect for individual rights, correlation with state obligations 37
    - state obligations under CERD 34-7
  - risk of irreparable prejudice 38-42
    - continuous nature of violation of rights 39-40
    - entry and re-entry restrictions 41-2
    - general Court powers to grant provisional measures 38-9
    - jurisprudence
      - Application of CERD (Georgia v. Russian Federation)* 42
      - Application of ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation)* 39, 41
      - Jadhav (India v. Pakistan)* 38-9
    - mixed-family separations 41-2
    - necessity of Court determination 39-40
    - refusal to terminate discriminatory measures 40-2
    - urgency requirement 39-41
- separate and dissenting opinions
  - Bhandari J (dissenting)
    - overview 7
    - provisional measures, urgency of 84
    - risk of real or irreparable prejudice 82-4
    - unilateral undertakings, relevance of 82-4
  - Cançado Trindade J (separate)
    - arbitrariness 50-1, 56-60, 80
    - CERD Committee General Recommendations 54
    - compromissory clauses under human rights conventions 67-9
    - continuing situations
      - collective expulsions, as 59-60
      - human rights violations, evidence of 75-8
      - plausibility of rights protection, and 60, 62-3, 66-7, 79-80
      - provisional measures in 74-8, 80
      - risk of irreparable prejudice 63
    - humanization of laws, Court role in 57-9
    - IACtHR Advisory Opinion No 18 54-5
    - ICJ adjudication of human rights, developments in 50-2



- international law
  - human rights treaties, importance of 78-9
  - temporal dimension of 73-4
- local remedies
  - applicability of rules on 61-3, 79
  - diplomatic protection versus human rights protection 64-5
  - effectiveness of 60-1, 65-6, 79
  - exhaustion of, rationale of rules on 64-6
- overview 6-7
- plausibility of rights protection
  - continuing situations, in 60, 62-3, 66, 79-80
  - procedural balance, and 63-4
- principles of equality and non-discrimination, as part of *jus cogens* 52-6, 78-9
- provisional measures
  - autonomous legal regime, development of 71-3, 80
  - continuing situations 74-8, 80
  - effectiveness of protection 69-70
  - vulnerable sectors, protection of 69-71
- Cot, Judge ad hoc (dissenting)
  - irreparable prejudice 97-8
  - overview 8
  - provisional measures
    - good faith presumption 99-101
    - necessity 99-102
    - prejudgment of question on merits of proceedings 94-6
    - similarity of requests with claims on merits 96-7
- Crawford J (dissenting)
  - nationality versus national origin, applicability of CERD 1(1) 85
  - overview 7-8
  - provisional measures, urgency requirement 88-9
  - real or imminent irreparable prejudice 85-90
- Salam J (dissenting)
  - nationality, interpretation 90-2
  - overview 8
  - prima facie* jurisdiction 90-1, 93
  - treaty interpretation 90-1
- Tomka, Gaja and Gevorgian JJ (joint declaration)
  - nationality versus national origin, discrimination based on 46-7
  - non-citizens, discriminatory treatment of 46-7
  - overview 6
  - prima facie* jurisdiction 45-7
- Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Provisional Measures (Second Request)), order of 14 June 2019***
  - case overview
    - background and facts 8-9, 102-6
    - Court conclusions: principal findings 9-10
    - separation opinions and declarations 10-13
  - Court findings: principal ruling
    - compromissory clause, interpretation of
      - electa una via* or *lis pendens* principles, applicability 109-10
    - Court conclusions 110-11

***Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Qatar v. United Arab Emirates) (Provisional Measures (Second Request)), order of 14 June 2019*** (*cont.*)

jurisprudence

*Certain Activities Carried Out by Nicaragua in the Border Area (Costa Rica v. Nicaragua)* 109

*Construction of a Road in Costa Rica along the San Juan River (Nicaragua v. Costa Rica)* 109

*Pulp Mills on the River Uruguay (Argentina v. Uruguay)* 106, 107, 110

overview 9-10, 102-6

plausibility of rights claimed 109-10

*prima facie* jurisdiction 106

provisional measures

measures requested by UAE 106-8

Qatari response to measures requested by UAE 108-9

separate opinions and declarations

Abraham J (separate opinion)

overview 10-11

*prima facie* jurisdiction 116-19

provisional measures

parallel proceedings, implications of 119

plausible rights 119-20

rejection, rationale for 119-22

right to procedural fairness, and 120-2

risk of irreparable prejudice 120-1

Cançado Trindade J (separate opinion)

conclusions 136-7

continuing situations 128-32

human rights protected under CERD

fundamental character versus plausibility approaches 135-6

jurisprudence

*Advisory Opinion on the Accordance with International Law of the Unilateral Declaration of Independence in Respect of Kosovo* 133-4

*Diallo* 129-30, 133

*Application of CERD (Georgia v. Russian Federation)* 133-6

*Application of ICSFT and CERD (Ukraine v. Russian Federation)* 135

*Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Croatia v. Serbia)* 130, 134

*Jadhav (India v. Pakistan)* 135

*Jurisdictional Immunities of the State (Germany v. Italy)* 129, 131

*Questions relating to the Obligation to Prosecute or Extradite (Belgium v. Senegal)* 128-9, 133

overview 11-12

principle of equality and non-discrimination 132-6

provisional measures

continuing situations, relevance in 128-31

inconsistencies in requests, relating to CERD Committee 127-8

inconsistencies in requests, relating to CERD Convention 126-7

lack of link between rights for which protection is sought and measures requested 125-6

measures already ordered to secure respect for rights under CERD 124-5

precautionary role of 131-2

rights of persons in situations of vulnerability, and 131-2

case overview 10-13

Cot, Judge ad hoc (dissenting)

*lis pendens* doctrine

compromissory clause, status of 142-3

essential elements of 139-41

interpretation of CERD Art. 22 142-3

plausibility of rights claimed, and 138-43

procedural conditions 143-5

procedural rights, plausibility 142-3

public international law status 139

quasi-judicial bodies, applicability to 140-1

relevance of relief sought 140

risk of irreparable prejudice 144

settlement of CERD-related disputes, and 141-5

suspension of proceedings 144-5

test for 142

overview 12-13

Salam J (declaration) 12, 138

Tomka, Gaja and Gevorgian JJ (joint declaration) 10, 115

Xue, Vice-President (declaration) 10

provisional measures

Court duty relating to international peace and security 112-13

irreparable prejudice 112

non-aggravation of dispute 111-14

*prima facie* jurisdiction 112

### **Arab Charter on Human Rights (2004) by article**

26(2) (compulsory expulsions) 572

### **arbitration clauses/agreement**

anti-suit injunctions in support, legal principles of 694-5

### **Australia**

Foreign States Immunities Act 1985 by section

29 (power to grant relief) 717

34 (restrictions on relief) 717

### **basepoints (general)**

maritime delimitation, role in 476-9, 492-7

### **central banks**

Venezuela

administration of assets abroad, board authority for 622-3

Board appointments 622, 682-3

### **CERD (1965)**

nationality, interpretation

*travaux préparatoires* 26, 169-72, 206-8, 212-13, 234, 602

Preamble 91

principle of equality and non-discrimination, and 53

### **CERD Committee**

General Recommendations

XXII (refugees and displaced persons) 54

XXV (gender-related dimensions of racial discrimination) 54

XXX (citizens/non-citizens) 54, 603, 605-11

**CERD Committee** (*cont.*)

XXXII (meaning and scope of special measures) 592

XXXV (combating racist hate speech) 54

**CIL, formation/requirements**

constant and uniform practice

“substantial uniformity” 716, 718

enforcement under 716-18

**CIL, treaties and other international instruments reflecting, interrelationship**

ILC Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts 530-1

**citizenship**

nationality, relationship with

citizens/non-citizens, differential treatment as racial discrimination 602-4

**coastal façade**

continental shelf delimitation

coastal concavity/convexity 500-3

coastline instability 479-80

**coasts (for purposes of maritime delimitation)**

coastal concavity/convexity 500-3

coastline instability 479-80

**comity**

judicial discretion in arbitration anti-suit injunctions 694-5, 697-8

**Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf**

submissions by Ghana/Côte d'Ivoire in maritime delimitation dispute 446-8

**continental shelf delimitation (CSC 6/UNCLOS 83)**

basis

distance, customary international law 396-7

beyond 200 nautical miles 515-24

coastal façade

coastal concavity/convexity 500-3

coastline instability 479-80

customary equidistance boundary

“clear, sustained and consistent” conduct 463-6

economic consequences 431-3, 435-7

equidistance/relevant circumstances methodology 381-3, 466-8

tacit agreement, establishment of 380-2, 431-3, 435-7

ITLOS Special Chamber jurisdiction 429-30

method

angle bisector 470, 473-6

basepoints 476-9, 492-7

coastal concavity/convexity 500-3

tacit agreement, establishment of 431-3, 435-7

within 200 nautical miles 469-515

**Côte d'Ivoire**

Fisheries Partnership Agreement (FPA) with EU 454-5

maritime delimitation

boundary dispute with Ghana: *see* *Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean*

legislation

Decree 75-769 of 29 October 1975 445-6

Decree of 29 July 1957 443, 460

Law 77-926 on Delimiting the Maritime Zones placed under the National

Jurisdiction of the Republic of the Côte d'Ivoire of 17 November 1977 443-4

Presidential Decree 70-618 of 14 October 1970 443-6, 460

**Declaration of Principles on Freedom of Expression and Access to Information in Africa 2019 (ACHPR)**

Principle 2 (non-interference with freedom of opinion) 314

Principle 21 (protection of reputation) 258-9, 310-11

**deportation/expulsion of national, prohibition**

compulsory expulsions as violation of human rights

recognition under international law 572-3

**diplomatic relations**

recognition of State/government, relevance 630

***Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean, judgment of 23 September 2017***

applicable law 429-30

case overview 380-8

conclusions of Special Chamber 383-8, 458-63, 515, 525, 549-52

customary equidistance boundary

“clear, sustained and consistent” conduct 463-6

economic consequences 431-3, 435-7

equidistance/relevant circumstances methodology 381-3, 466-8

tacit agreement, establishment of 380-2, 431-3, 435-7

delimitation of continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles 515-24

course of delimitation line 522

delimitation methodology 521-2

disproportionality test 523-4

entitlement to continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles 518-21

jurisprudence

*Barbados/Trinidad and Tobago (EEZ and continental shelf delimitation)*  
517

*Bay of Bengal (Bangladesh/India)* 522, 524

*Bay of Bengal (Bangladesh/Myanmar)* 517, 522, 524

*Black Sea* 523-4

*Peru v. Chile* 523

Special Chamber jurisdiction/admissibility 515-18

delimitation of maritime boundary

conclusions of Special Chamber 525

delimitation of continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles 515-24

delimitation of territorial sea 466-9

delimitation of territorial sea, EEZ and continental shelf within 200 nautical miles  
469-515

jurisdiction of Special Chamber 429-30

delimitation of territorial sea 466-9

angle bisector method 466-7

equidistance/relevant circumstances methodology 466-8

*Qatar v. Bahrain* 469

delimitation of territorial sea, EEZ and continental shelf within 200 nautical miles  
469-515

appropriate methodology 469-76

angle bisector method 470, 473-6

basepoints, location of 476-9

coastline instability 479-80

equidistance/relevant circumstances methodology 470-6

feasibility of equidistance 470

interests of neighbouring states 480-1

Jomoro Peninsula, base points on 478-9

***Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean, judgment of 23 September 2017*** (cont.)

- jurisprudence
  - Bay of Bengal (Bangladesh/India)* 472-6
  - Caribbean Sea (Nicaragua v. Honduras)* 471, 474
  - Guinea/Guinea-Bissau* 474-5
  - Gulf of Maine* 471, 474
  - Tunisia/Libyan Arab Jamahiriya* 474
- UNCLOS provisions 472-3
- provisional equidistance line, construction of
  - basepoints 492-7
  - Boundary Treaty between the United Kingdom and France of 1905 486
  - charts to be used 482-5
  - conclusions of Special Chamber 515
  - jurisprudence
    - Barbados/Trinidad and Tobago (EEZ and continental shelf delimitation)* 509
    - Bay of Bengal (Bangladesh/India)* 488-9, 495, 500, 502-3
    - Bay of Bengal (Bangladesh/Myanmar)* 487, 489, 495, 499, 501-2
    - Black Sea* 487-8, 492, 494, 495
    - Eritrea/Yemen* 495-6
    - Greenland/Jan Mayen (Denmark v. Norway)* 507, 508
    - Grisbadarna (Norway/Sweden)* 508-9
    - Gulf of Maine* 507, 509
    - Land and Maritime Boundary (Cameroon v. Nigeria)* 511
    - Libyan Arab Jamahiriya/Malta* 508
    - North Sea Continental Shelf (Germany/Denmark/Netherlands)* 500
    - Territorial and Maritime Dispute (Nicaragua v. Columbia)* 509
    - Tunisia/Libyan Arab Jamahiriya* 510-15
  - process 487-97
  - relevant areas 490-2
  - relevant circumstances
    - coastal concavity/convexity 500-3
    - conduct of the parties 509-15
    - generally 497-500
    - Jomoro Peninsula geography 503-6
    - natural resources location and distribution 506-9
  - relevant coasts 487-90
  - starting point of maritime boundary 485-7
  - submissions of parties 487
- domestic legislation
  - Côte d'Ivoire
    - Decree 75-769 of 29 October 1975 445-6
    - Decree of 29 July 1957 443
    - Law 77-926 on Delimiting the Maritime Zones placed under the National Jurisdiction of the Republic of the Côte d'Ivoire of 17 November 1977 443-4, 461
    - Presidential Decree 70-618 of 14 October 1970 443-6
  - Ghana
    - Law on Petroleum Exploration and Production of 1 June 1984, Art. 4 444
    - Maritime Zones (Delimitation) Law of 2 August 1986, s. 7 444
- equidistance/relevant circumstances methodology
  - customary equidistance boundary, interpretation 381-3, 466-8
  - delimitation of territorial sea, EEZ and continental shelf within 200 nautical miles 470-6
  - disproportionality test 523-4

- oil practices 321-83
- provisional equidistance line, construction of
  - coastal concavity/convexity 500-3
  - conduct of the parties 509-15
  - generally 497-500
  - Jomoro Peninsula geography 503-6
  - natural resources location and distribution 506-9
- estoppel, applicability
  - Bay of Bengal (Bangladesh/Myanmar)* 465
  - “clear, sustained and consistent” conduct 463-6
  - conduct creating the appearance of a particular situation 464-5
  - good faith condition 463-4
  - Gulf of Maine* 463
  - resulting detriment 465
- international responsibilities: Ghana
  - alleged violation of provisional measures prescribed by Special Chamber 546-8
    - drilling activities, restrictive interpretation 546-8
    - obligation to cooperate 546-9
  - alleged violation of sovereign rights 531-7
    - knowledge and dates of disputes in question 535-7
    - material scope of sovereign rights over continental shelf 531-2, 534
    - nature of judicial determination on disputed boundary 533-4, 536-7
    - reparations, appropriateness 533, 535
    - right to information 535
    - Territorial and Maritime Dispute (Nicaragua v. Colombia)* 537
    - understanding of consequences of rights in dispute 535
    - unilateral economic activities in disputed area 531-4
    - variation of claims and claimed areas in dispute 536
    - variations of understanding of consequences of rights in dispute 535
  - alleged violation of UNCLOS 83 538-44
    - Guyana v. Suriname* 541-3
    - obligation not to jeopardize or hamper agreement 538, 540-5
    - obligation to negotiate in good faith 538-40
  - grounds for, generally 525
    - Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo* 529
    - M/V “SAIGA” (No 2)* 530
    - M/V “Virginia G”* 530
    - Responsibilities and obligations of States with respect to activities in the Area, Advisory Opinion* 530-1
  - reparations 533, 535
  - Special Chamber jurisdiction 525-31
    - conduct of parties as indication of acceptance 529-30
- jurisdiction of Special Chamber
  - conduct of parties of indication of acceptance 529-30
  - delimitation of boundary, regarding 429-30
    - continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles 515-18
  - generally 427-8
  - international responsibilities of Ghana 525-31
  - under UNCLOS 428-9
- overview 380-3
- procedural history 410-20
  - consultations 411-12
  - special agreement and notification 410-11

***Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean, judgment of 23 September 2017 (cont.)***

separate opinions

Mensah, Judge ad hoc 388-9, 558-61

*Caribbean Sea (Nicaragua v. Honduras)* 559

oil practices, relevance for boundary interpretation 559-61

threshold for proof of maritime boundaries 559-60

Paik J 388, 552-8

*Guyana v. Suriname* 554, 556

obligation not to jeopardize or hamper agreement 553-8

oil concession limits, validity of equation with maritime boundary 558

provisional measures, criteria for prescribing 554-5

risk of irreparable prejudice 554-7

subject matter of dispute

geographical context 425

maritime boundary delimitation, scope of claim 425-7

submissions of the parties

Côte d'Ivoire 421-3, 424-5, 446

Ghana 421, 423-4, 446-7

tacit agreement, establishment of 430-63

bilateral exchanges/negotiations 448-54

burden of proof 432-3, 440

conclusions of Special Chamber 458-63

Côte d'Ivoire's claims 431-4

customary equidistance boundary 431-3, 435-7

domestic legislation, relevance of 443-6, 460-1

evidence, compelling nature of 459

fisheries arrangements 454-5

geographic meridian approach 453

Ghana's claims 431-3

Joint Commission on Redemarcation of the Ghanaian-Ivorian Border 448-53, 461-2

joint presidential statements 2009/2015 451, 454

jurisprudence

*Burkina Faso/Mali* 440

*Caribbean Sea (Nicaragua v. Honduras)* 456, 459

*Land and Maritime Boundary (Cameroon v. Nigeria)* 456

*Peru v. Chile* 456-7, 462

*Pulau Ligitan/Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia)* 440, 457, 460

*Tunisia/Libyan Arab Jamahiriya* 456

oil activities 433-43, 459-60

drilling 437-9

misleading nature of 438-9

oil concession maps 439-43, 460

oil concession practices 432-6

seismic surveys 436-7, 460

standard of proof 455-8

submissions to CLCS 446-8, 461-2

***Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean, order on request of 25 April 2015***

background 389-93

conclusions of Special Chamber 379-80, 404-5

costs 380



- disputed area
  - actions or omissions not to be construed as waiver of rights 403
  - coordinates, maps and illustrations 393-4
  - customary boundary, basis for 396-7
  - environmental harm, incidents of 399
  - oil operations, rights over 397
  - parties' claims regarding 396
  - plausibility of rights 397-8
  - right to access confidential information about natural resources 396, 397, 400, 402
  - scope of rights over coastal area 402
  - Special Chamber claims 397-8
  - suspension of ongoing activities 400-1
  - violations, supporting evidence 398-9
- overview 378-80
- risk of irreparable prejudice 395-6, 400-2
  - pecuniary compensation, and 401-2
- separate opinions
  - Mensah, Judge ad hoc 380, 405-8
- Special Chamber
  - jurisdiction 403
  - provisional measures, power to prescribe 400, 402-3
  - role and obligations 397-8
  - scope of sovereign rights, interpretation 398
- state obligations
  - duty to cooperate 399
  - duty to protect and preserve 399-400
- submission of the parties 393
- UNCLOS dispute settlement
  - provisional measures
    - jurisdiction 394-5
    - protection of rights of both parties 405-6
    - risk of irreparable prejudice 395-6, 406-7
    - urgency, relevance of 395-6

#### **ECtHR, Rules of Court, by rule**

- 44A (duty to cooperate with Court) 352, 355, 366
- 44C (consequences of failure of duty to cooperate with Court) 355
- 60 (award of just satisfaction) 356-8, 366

#### **exhaustion of local remedies (ACHPR 56(5)/Protocol 6(2))**

- judicial bias 331
- prerogative of mercy 331-3
- remedies to be exhausted
  - ordinary remedies 267

#### **fair and public hearing/access to the courts (ECHR 6), justified restrictions/interference, requirements (ECHR 6(1))**

- state immunity from enforcement, conflicts with 711-18
- justifications under CIL 713-18
- justifications under domestic law 718-21

#### **fishing zones/exclusive fishing zone (EFZ)**

- Fishing Partnership Agreement (Côte d'Ivoire–EU) 454-5

**freedom of expression**

- genocide reporting 305-8
- hate speech, characterization 307-8

**General Assembly resolutions in number/date order**

- 1514 (XV) Declaration on the Granting of Independence to Colonial Countries and Peoples (1960) 91, 168
- 2625 (XXV) Declaration on Friendly relations between States (1970) 99
- 40/144 Declaration on the Human Rights of Individuals Who Are not Nationals of the Country in which They Live (1985) 229

**genocide, definition/requirements/classification as**

- Holocaust 306, 308, 310
- reporting, and freedom of expression 305-8

**Georgia v. Russia (No 1), judgment on just satisfaction**

case overview

- background and facts 350-1
- Court conclusions 351-3
- separate and dissenting opinions 353

principal ruling

- background and facts 353-5
- Court conclusions 372-3

ECHR 41

- applicability to case 356-61
- travaux préparatoires* interpretation 357-8

just satisfaction, award of

- applicant Government submissions 361-2
- burden of proof 368-9
- calculation of award, numerical framework 371-4
- compensation for non-pecuniary damage 370-2
- distribution of award 372-3
- duty of State to cooperate 366-8, 374
- identification of victims 368-70, 373
- inter-State cases, applicability in 357-60

jurisprudence

- Cyprus v. Turkey* 356-7, 360-2, 365-6, 370, 372, 373-4
- Georgia v. Russia (No 1)*, principal judgment 356-7, 360-2
- Greens and M.T. v. UK* 371
- Sargsyan v. Azerbaijan* 367, 370-1
- Varnava and Others v. Turkey* 370-1

justification for claims 360-1

- obligations of respondent State to comply with ruling 371-2
- respondent Government submissions 362-4
- “sufficiently precise and objectively identifiable” group of people, determination of 364-70, 373-4

overview 351-3

relevant legislation 355-6

state obligations under international treaties

jurisprudence

- Diallo (Guinea v. DRC)* 359
- Factory at Chorzów* 358
- Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary v. Slovakia)* 358

reparations, duty to make 358-60

- submissions of the parties
  - applicant Government 356, 361-2
  - respondent Government 356-7, 362-4
- separate and dissenting opinions
  - Dedov J (dissenting) 353, 375
  - Yudkiversuska, Mitts, Hüseyinov and Chanturia JJ (partly concurring) 353, 373-5

## Ghana

- maritime delimitation
  - boundary maritime dispute with Côte d'Ivoire: *see* *Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean*
- legislation
  - Law on Petroleum Exploration and Production of 1 June 1984 444
  - Maritime Zones (Delimitation) Law of 2 August 1986 444-5

## head of State, recognition

- international law principles 629-30
- "one voice" principle 618, 632-8
- recognition of government, distinction between 630

## ICJ jurisdiction (general)

- court power to grant provisional measures 23-4
- existence of dispute 24-7
- genuine attempts to negotiate 28-9
- procedural preconditions 27-31

## ICJ Rules of Court (1978 as variously amended), by rule

- 38(2) (specification of nature of claims) 156
- 49(1) (statement of facts, law and submissions) 157
- 75(2) (power to grant provisional measures other than those requested) 43, 145
- 79*ter* (exclusive character of preliminary objections) 249

## ILC Draft Articles/reports on

- diplomatic protection
  - recommended practice 357, 359
- International Liability for Injurious Consequences Arising out of Acts Not Prohibited by International Law (1994)
  - cessation and non-repetition 365
  - ITLOS Special Chamber jurisdiction 530-1
  - reparations 365

## Inter-American Court of Human Rights

- Advisory Opinion No 18 (of 17 September 2003) on the Juridical Condition and Rights of Undocumented Migrants 54-5

## ITLOS Rules (1997 as variously amended), by rule

- 71(1) (production of documents) 521
- 95(2) (Tribunal request for information on implementation of measures) 404

## just satisfaction obligation (ECHR 41)

- award in inter-State case, applicability 356-61
- distribution of award 372-3
- duty of State to cooperate 366-8, 374
- identification of victims 368-70, 373
- reparation for internationally wrongful act (ILC(SR) 37)/State responsibility rules, applicability 365
- travaux préparatoires* interpretation 357-8

***Maduro Board of Central Bank of Venezuela v. Guaidó Board of Central Bank of Venezuela***

case overview

background and facts 613-14

Court conclusions 615-16

Court ruling

act of State, foreign act

appointment of public officials 652-6, 665-8, 682-3

issue overview 618

judicial development of doctrine 652-4

justiciability of domestic courts on sovereign acts of foreign state 672-83

comity principle, and 677-8

domestic rules on recognition and enforcement of foreign judgments 676

state immunity, and 677-9

validity of STJ as independent court of law 673, 679-80

rule 1: foreign state's legislation/other laws 653-4, 672, 680-3

rule 2: act of foreign state's executive 653-64

appointment of public officials 654-6, 665-8, 682-3

comity, and 659

Crown/personal sovereign acts 658-9, 666-8

doctrine, judicial development 655-64

legality of acts of officials, relevance 656-7

STJ judgments, relevance of 672-80

territorial limitations 668-70

Transition Statute, validity 654-5

UK court jurisdiction in matters regarding 656-7

rule 2: act of foreign state's executive—jurisprudence

*Bank of Ethiopia v. National Bank of Egypt* 668

*Belhaj* 653, 654-7, 659, 665-6, 668-9, 672

*Buttes Gas* 657, 659, 661

*Carr v. Fracis Times* 667

*Dobree v. Napier* 667

*Duke of Brunswick v. King of Hanover* 657-9, 662, 666-8

*Johnstone v. Pedlar* 659

*Kuwait Airways (Nos 4 and 5)* 661

*Lucasfilm v. Ainsworth* 665-6

*Luther v. Sagor* 659

*Oetjen* 659, 660, 662-3

*Piramal v. Oomkarmal* 660

*Princess Paley Olga* 657-61, 663, 666

*Rahmatullah* 666

*Ricaud* 662-3

*Underhill* 662-3, 666

*Yukos (No 2)* 661, 681

rule 3: limitations and exceptions 664-5

incidental issue, allegations arising as 670-3

territoriality 668-70

submissions of the parties 654-5

US law 675-6

background and facts

Commercial Court ruling 614

overview 619-24

- proceedings 624-8
- STJ judgment on nullity of National Assembly decisions 619, 622-3, 681-2
- UK statements recognizing Mr Guaidó as interim President 613, 618, 620, 623-5
- central banks
  - administration of assets abroad, board authority for 622-3
  - board appointments 622, 682-3
- conclusions 683-4
- recognition of foreign state/government
  - de jure* and *de facto* recognition 640-3, 648
  - diplomatic relations, distinguished from 630
  - express and implied recognition 638-40, 643
  - FCDO practice 615, 630-2
  - FCDO statements 644-8
  - head of state recognition, whether distinction between 630, 650-2
  - international law principles 629-30
  - judicial doctrine, development of 632-8
  - jurisprudence
    - British Arab Commercial Bank plc v. National Transitional Council of the State of Libya* 632
    - Duff Development* 635-8, 645-6
    - Kuwait Airways Corpn v. Iraqi Airways Co (No 5)* 647
    - Luther v. Sagor* 635, 641, 643
    - Mohamed v. Breish* 646-7
    - Somalia v. Woodhouse Drake & Carey* 639-40, 647
  - “one voice” principle 615, 682
    - application to case 642-8
    - judicial development 632-8
  - overview of issue 618
  - submissions of the parties
    - Guaidó Board 628
    - Maduro Board 628-9
  - subsequent events, relevance of 649-50
- recognition of head of state
  - foreign state recognition, whether distinction between 630
  - head of government, as 650-2
- Venezuelan domestic law
  - Decree No 8 618, 622
  - Decree No 10 618, 622
  - Transition Statute 2019 618, 620-2
    - appointments under, validity of 622, 682-3
    - legal status 621, 654, 681-2
    - National Assembly, role and powers 621-2
    - purpose 620
- Mango and others v. United Republic of Tanzania***
  - case overview
    - background and facts 318-19
    - Court conclusions 319-20
    - separate and dissenting opinions 320-1
  - principal ruling
    - admissibility
      - cumulative nature 332-3
      - exhaustion of local remedies 331-3

***Mango and others v. United Republic of Tanzania*** (cont.)

- prerogative of mercy 332-3
- rules and requirements 330
- claims of the parties
  - applicants 325-6
  - respondent State 326-7
- Constitution of Tanzania
  - prerogative of mercy, exclusion from 323-4, 331-2
  - unconstitutionality of long-term sentences 325
- costs 334
- Court conclusions 335-6
- discrimination of prisoners serving long-term sentences
  - prerogative of mercy, exclusion from 323-4
- exhaustion of local remedies
  - Diakite Couple v. Republic of Mali* 332
  - judicial bias 331
  - prerogative of mercy 331-3
- jurisdiction, objections to material jurisdiction
  - allegation that application violated rules on *res judicata* 328-9
  - Anudo Ochieng Anudo v. United Republic of Tanzania* 328
  - Court sitting as court of first instance 327-8
  - generally 329-30
- merits
  - proportionality of sentence 333-4
- Minimum Sentences Act
  - jurisdiction of court 327
  - validity and conformity of sentences with constitutional rights 326, 334
- parties 322
- reparations 335
- subject matter of application
  - alleged violations 323-5
  - facts 322-3
- summary of procedure before the Court 325
- separate and dissenting opinions
  - Ben Achour J (dissenting)
    - admissibility of joint applications
      - breach of unity of application principle 344-7
      - exhaustion of local remedies 346-7
    - appeal for unconstitutionality, validity of 347-8
    - overview 321
  - Bensaoula J (dissenting)
    - admissibility requirements for joint applications 341-4
    - overview 320-1
  - Tchikaya J (separate opinion)
    - admissibility rules 337-9
      - exhaustion of local remedies 339
    - overview 320
    - prerogative of mercy, applicable law 339-41
    - presidential pardons under international law 337, 339-41

**nationality**

- citizenship, relationship with
  - citizens/non-citizens, differential treatment as racial discrimination 602-4

**one voice principle**

- recognition of a head of State 615, 636-8, 682
- development of doctrine 632-8
- jurisprudence
  - Arantzazu Mendi* 637-8, 612-13
  - Carl Zeiss (No 2)* 645
  - Charkieb* 633-4
  - Duff Development* 635-8, 645-6
  - Gagara* 634-5
  - Gur* 645
  - Luther v. Sagor* 635, 641, 643
  - Maduro Board/Guaidó Board* 642-8
  - Mohamed v. Breish* 646-7
  - Somalia v. Woodhouse Drake & Carey* 647
  - Suarez* 634
  - Taylor v. Barclay* 633

**provisional measures (ICJ 41/PCIJ 41)**

- binding effect 44
- ICJ Court power to grant 42-4
- measures other than those requested 43
- non-aggravation of dispute, avoidance of 43

***Qatar v. United Arab Emirates* (jurisdiction of Committee/admissibility of communication)**

- case overview
  - background and facts 564-5
- decision on admissibility of Communication (27 August 2019)
  - Court conclusions 567-8
  - exhaustion of local remedies
    - examination jointly with merits, need for 597-8
    - lis pendens/electa via* doctrines, applicability of 600-1
    - obligation to exhaust all available measures 600-1
    - parallel proceedings, validity of 598-601
    - risk to procedural fairness 601
  - nationality, interpretation
    - CERD General Recommendation XXX 603
    - CERD *travaux préparatoires* 602
    - citizens/non-citizens, differential treatment 602-4
    - Committee competence *ratione materiae* 601-4
    - compulsory expulsion, protection from 603
    - legitimate aim and proportionality 603-4
    - racial discrimination, scope of CERD definition 602
  - overview 566-7
  - racial discrimination
    - legitimate aim and proportionality 603-4
    - scope of CERD definition 602
  - submissions of the parties: applicant State
    - abuse of rights and process 595-6
    - exhaustion of local remedies, failure to establish 591-3
    - parallel proceedings, validity of 594-5
  - submissions of the parties: respondent state
    - abuse of rights and process 591

**Qatar v. United Arab Emirates (jurisdiction of Committee/admissibility of communication)** (*cont.*)

- exhaustion of local remedies, failure to establish 585-90
- further submissions 596-7
- parallel proceedings, validity of 590-1
- decision on jurisdiction of Committee (27 August 2019)
  - coercive measures, interference with human rights 582-3
  - Court conclusions 566
  - jurisdiction in respect of communication
    - competence *ratione materiae* 584
    - current and ongoing conduct 584
    - differential treatment based on current nationality 584
    - generally 583
    - inter-state communication, admissibility of 583
  - overview 565-6
  - submissions of the parties: applicant State
    - alleged violations 572-5
    - Committee role and requirements of CERD 11 580-1
    - Committee's consideration, appropriateness of 581-2
    - facts 569-72
    - jurisdiction, on 580
  - submissions of the parties: respondent State
    - absence of Convention violations 575
    - absence of ongoing violations 579-80
    - absence of prohibited treatment on basis of nationality 577-9
    - additional submissions 576-80, 582-3
    - admissibility of communication 583
    - concurrent proceedings 576
    - jurisdiction, lack of 577-80, 582-3
    - non-exhaustion of local remedies 576

**recognition of State/government**

- de jure* and *de facto* recognition 640-3, 648
- diplomatic relations, distinguished from 630
- express and implied recognition 638-40, 643
- general practice, UK 615, 630-2
- international law principles 629-30
- "one voice" principle 615, 682
  - application of principles (*Maduro/Guaidó*) 642-8
  - judicial development 632-8
- recognition of head of State, distinction between 630, 650-2

**reparation for breach of treaty, generally**

- non-pecuniary reparation/satisfaction
  - calculation formula 371-4

**Rwanda**

- criminal law
  - sentencing, proportionality of 274, 293-4, 301, 311-12, 315-16
- fair trial in
  - Gacaca courts 305
  - presumption of innocence 268-9, 287-91
- freedom of expression
  - public figures, criticism of 273, 311-12, 314-15



genocide

reporting, freedom of expression 306, 308, 310

Penal Code (1977) by section

166 (offence of threatening national security) 262, 268-71, 279, 293-5, 298-300, 304

391 (offence of defamation) 262, 270, 273-4, 279, 293, 298-300, 313-16

**State immunity, classification of act as *jure imperii* or *jure gestionis*, distinguishing between**

nature or purpose of transaction as determining factor 709

private person test 709-10

**State Immunity Act 1978 (UK) (SIA)**

anti-avoidance, contractual rights 687

application by other jurisdictions 716

immunity from enforcement

justification under CIL 713-18

right to fair trial conflicts (ECHR 6(1)) 712-13

**State Immunity Act 1978 (UK) (SIA), by section (Part I proceedings in the UK by or against other States)**

1 (adjudicative immunity) 707-8, 710

3(1)(a) (commercial activity exception) 708-10

9(1) (arbitration exception) 710

13 (penalties) 711-12

13(1) (penalties) 710-11

13(2) (enforcement process) 711-18

13(2)(a) (specific performance) 710-11

**Tanzania**

Constitution 1977

prerogative of mercy 323-4, 331-2

unconstitutionality of long-term sentences 325

Constitution 1977, by section

13 (equality before the law) 323-4

45 (prerogative of mercy) 323-4

107A (authority of dispensing of justice) 324

criminal law

sentences, proportionality 334

fair trial in

prerogative of mercy 323-4, 331-3, 337, 339-41

Minimum Sentences Act

jurisdiction of court 327

validity and conformity of sentences with constitutional rights 326, 334

**territorial integrity/inviolability of boundaries principle**

treaties and other international instruments relevant to

UNGA Resolution 2625 (XXV) (Declaration concerning Principles of Friendly Relations and Cooperation) 91, 168

**treaty interpretation**

general principles 165

good faith principle 99-101, 165-6, 202

**UK *P&I Club N.V. and Another v. Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela***

case overview

background and facts 686

***UK P&I Club N.V. and Another v. Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela* (cont.)**

Court conclusions 686-8

## judgment

arbitration proceedings, anti-suit injunctions

comity considerations 697-8

contractual basis 695-7

derived rights approach 695-8

legal principles for 694-5

third party rights 697-8

arbitration proceedings, anti-suit injunctions—jurisprudence

*The Angelic Grace* 695

*The Archangelos Gabriel* 694-5

*Enka* 695

*The Hari Buhm* 696

*OT Africa v. Magic Sportswear* 695-6

background and facts 688-94

contract of insurance 691

proceedings overview 689-94

CIL, justification for breach of ECHR 6 under 713-18

## comity

judicial discretion in arbitration anti-suit injunctions 694-5, 697-8

state immunity enforcement restrictions, and 720-1

Court conclusions 722

## insurance

third party insurance claims under Venezuelan law

direct action applicability, parties' submissions 702-5

motor vehicle claims 699-705

non-motor vehicle claims 706-7

## proceedings

Curaçao court 691-2

Venezuelan First Instance 692-4

## right to fair trial (ECHR 6)

state immunity from enforcement, and 712-18

comity conflicts 720-1

justification under CIL 713-18

justification under domestic law 718-21

## state immunity

adjudicative immunity 707-8, 710

arbitration exception 710

commercial activity exception 708-10

*Kuwait Airways* 709

*London Steamship Owners* 709, 710

## immunity from enforcement

ECHR 6 conflicts with 712-18,

interpretation in light of HRA 1998 721

justifications under CIL 713-18

justifications under domestic law 718-21

legitimacy and proportionality 713-21

scope of 711-12

## immunity from enforcement—jurisprudence

*Al-Adsani* 719-20

*Benkharbouche* 714-989

*Fogarty v. UK* 714-16

- General Dynamics* 719-20
- Micallef v. Malta* 713
- Playa Larga* 715
- Regner v. Czech Republic* 712-13
- jure imperii* versus *jure gestionis* 708-9
- nature or purpose of transaction as determining factor 709
- non-sovereign activities
  - human rights implications (ECHR 6) 711
  - identification 709-10
  - private person test 709-10
  - restrictive theory 708-9
- State Immunity Act 1978 (SIA), by section
  - 1 (adjudicative immunity) 707-8, 710
  - 3(1)(a) (commercial activity exception) 708-10
  - 3(2) (enforcement process) 711-12
  - 9(1) (arbitration exception) 710
  - 13(1) (penalties) 710-11
  - 13(2)(a) (specific performance) 685-6, 710-11
- Venezuelan domestic law
  - Insurance Law 2016 699
  - Land Traffic Law 1996 699, 701-2, 707
  - Land Transport Law 2001 700-2
  - third party insurance claims 699-707
- UN Charter (1945)**
  - revolutionary nature 225-6
- UNCLOS dispute settlement (Part XV: Section 2, compulsory procedures entailing binding decisions)**
  - international responsibilities of states
    - alleged violation: *see Dispute Concerning Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire in the Atlantic Ocean*, judgment of 23 September 2017
    - obligation not to jeopardize or hamper agreement 538, 540-5
    - obligation to negotiate in good faith 538-40
  - provisional measures
    - jurisdiction 394-5
    - protection of rights of both parties 405-6
    - risk of irreparable prejudice 395-6, 406-7
    - urgency, relevance of 395-6
- United Kingdom**
  - recognition of State/governments
    - diplomatic relations, distinguished from 630
    - general practice 615, 630-2
  - state immunity from jurisdiction
    - adjudicative immunity 707-8, 710
    - arbitration exception 710
    - commercial activity exception 708-10
    - enforcement process 711-12
    - human rights conflicts (ECHR 6) 712-18
- United States of America**
  - act of State (acts of foreign State within its own territory: non-justiciability), theory and nature of the doctrine including procedural aspects
    - recognition/enforcement of foreign law 675-6
  - Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 1976 717-18

state immunity from jurisdiction  
remedies, applicability 717-18

**Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), by article**

1 (freedom and dignity) 53  
5 (freedom from torture, inhuman or degrading treatment) 324  
7 (freedom before the law) 53, 324

***Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda***

case overview

background and facts 254-6, 260-1

case procedure 263-5

complaints, summary of 260-3

Court conclusions 256-60

oral submissions

complainant

ACHPR 7 280-1

ACHPR 9 281-2

burden of proof 280-1

*Konaté* 282

legitimate aim requirement 281-2

principle of legality 281

respondent State

ACHPR 7 278-9

ACHPR 9 279-80

defamation 279

evidence, validity of 278

freedom of expression restrictions, validity 279-80

submissions on the merits

complainant 267-74

alleged violation of ACHPR 7 268-70

alleged violation of ACHPR 9 270-4

defamation 273-4

presumption of innocence 268-9

principle of legality 269-70

threat to national security 271-2

respondent State 274-7

abuse of process 274-5

alleged violation of ACHPR 7 275

alleged violation of ACHPR 9 275-6

complainant's observations on 277

evidence, validity of 275

freedom of expression, limitations on 276

principle of legality 275

Court ruling

admissibility of facts and arguments 282-3

Commission role as appellate court 283-4

Commission's decision on 265-6, 283-6

complainants' submissions 265

jurisprudence

*Africa v. Republic of Angola* 266

*Alfred Cudjoe v. Ghana* 267

*Luke Munyandu Tembani v. Angola* 283

respondent State challenges 282-3

Court conclusions 316-17

- criminal proceedings
  - burden of proof 269, 275
  - judicial development of criminal law 293-4
  - legal certainty, and 293
  - presumption of innocence 268-9
- criminal sanctions/sentences
  - defamation, for 274, 293, 311-13, 315
  - proportionality 274, 293-4, 301, 311-12, 315-16
  - protection of national security and public order 311-13
- defamation
  - evidence of sources 273-4
  - jurisprudence
    - Konaté* 311-12
  - legitimate interest requirement, and 299-300
  - necessity of reporting restrictions in democratic society 310-11
  - principle of legality, and 298
  - protection of reputation 258-9, 310-11
  - public figures, criticism of 273, 311-12, 314-15
  - sanctions for 274, 293, 311-13, 315-16
  - scope of offence 262, 270, 273-4, 313-14
- freedom of expression (ACHPR 9)
  - alleged violation 263, 270-4, 294-5
  - compatibility of domestic law with Charter 294-5, 298
  - compatibility of domestic law with international human rights standards 271-4, 294-5
- Declaration of Principles on Freedom of Expression in Africa (2002) 270-1, 273, 296, 301, 310-11, 314
- defamation, and 262, 270, 273-4
- hate speech, characterization 307-8
- historical experience, relevance of 303-6, 315
- jurisprudence
  - COHRE v. Sudan* 303
  - Constitutional Rights Project* case 297-8, 300, 302
  - Gündüz v. Turkey* 302
  - Handyside* 301
  - Jersild v. Denmark* 306-7
  - Jong-Kyu Sohn v. Korea* 302
  - Kenneth Good v. Botswana* 301-2
  - Konaté* 298, 311-12
  - Liesbeth Zegveld and Mussie Ephrem v. Eritrea* 272
  - Observer and Guardian v. UK* 301
  - Shin v. Korea* 302
  - Sürek v. Turkey* 307
  - Zimbabwe Lawyers for Human Rights & Associated Newspapers of Zimbabwe v. Zimbabwe* 300
- legitimate interest requirement for restrictions 274, 295-300
- necessity for restrictions in democratic society 300-16
- permitted restrictions 270-2, 274, 296-7
- principle of legality, and 296-8
- proportionality 300-16
- public figures, criticism of 273, 311-12, 314-15
- real risk of harm 301-4
- restriction within the law 296-8

***Uwimana-Nkusi and Mukakibibi v. Rwanda*** (cont.)

- sanctions, proportionality 301, 315-16
- statutory offences 262
- threat to national security, and 262, 268-71, 301-10
- Law No 21/77, by article
  - Art. 166 (offence of threatening national security) 262, 268-71, 279, 293-5, 298-300, 304
  - Art. 391 (offence of defamation) 262, 270, 273-4, 279, 293, 298-300, 313-16
- local remedies, interpretation 267
- overview 256-60, 286-7
- right to fair trial (ACHPR 7)
  - alleged violation 268-70, 287-94
  - burden of proof 288-90
  - criminal convictions in violation of 262-3
  - evidence, validity of 290-1
  - jurisprudence
    - Konaté* 292
  - presumption of innocence 268-9, 287-91
  - principle of legality 269-70, 291-4
  - right to silence 288-9
  - sanctions/sentences, proportionality 293-4
- threat to national security
  - compatibility with international human rights standards 272
  - definition of offence 271-2
  - Gacaca Courts, role of 305
  - genocide reporting 305-8
  - historical experience, relevance of 303-6
  - jurisprudence
    - Jersild v. Denmark* 306-7
    - Liesbeth Zegveld and Mussie Ephrem v. Eritrea* 272
    - Süreç v. Turkey* 307
  - legitimate interest requirement, and 299-300
  - national security, interpretation 303
  - necessity for restrictions in democratic society 301-10
  - principle of legality, and 298
  - proportionality 272, 301-10
  - real risk of harm 301-4
  - sanctions 311-12
  - scope of offence 262, 304

**Venezuela**

- central banks
  - administration of assets abroad, board authority for 622-3
  - board appointments 622, 682-3
- Commercial Code, by article
  - 1,159 (obligations and contracts) 700
  - 1,164 (obligations and contracts) 700
- Constitution, by article
  - 226 (President as head of state) 650-1
  - 236 (presidential duties) 651-2
- head of State, recognition
  - head of government, whether distinction between 650-2
  - interim President, status and powers of 621-2, 650-2

- insurance
  - insurer liabilities 699-701
  - third party compensation rights 699-707
- National Assembly
  - role and powers under Transition Act 2019 621-2
- Transition Statute 2019
  - appointment of public officials under, validity of 622, 682-3
  - legal status 621, 654, 681-2
  - National Assembly, role and powers 621-2
  - purpose 620

