

Law and History Review

Law and History Review

Editor

Christopher Tomlins
American Bar Foundation

Book Review Editor

William J. Novak
University of Chicago

Managing Editor

Diane Clay
American Bar Foundation

Law and History Review (ISSN 0738-2480) is published three times a year, in spring, summer, and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, Illinois 61820-6903. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

© 1998 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

This journal is printed on acid-free paper.

Law and History Review

Volume 16, Number 1

Spring 1998

*Published three times a year by the University of Illinois Press
for the American Society for Legal History*

Editorial Board

- David Abraham
University of Miami
- William P. Alford
Harvard University
- Mary Frances Berry
University of Pennsylvania
- Thomas Brennan
U.S. Naval Academy
- Martin Chanock
*La Trobe University,
Melbourne*
- Elaine Clark
*University of Michigan,
Dearborn*
- Martha F. Davis
*NOW Legal Defense,
New York*
- Thomas J. Davis
Arizona State University
- Cornelia Dayton
*University of California,
Irvine*
- Laura Engelstein
Princeton University
- Jean-Marie Fecteau
*Université du Québec
à Montréal*
- Christian G. Fritz
University of New Mexico
- Judy Fudge
York University, Toronto
- Paul Hyams
Cornell University
- Nancy Isenberg
University of Northern Iowa
- Bruce Kercher
Macquarie University, NSW
- Diane Kirkby
*La Trobe University,
Melbourne*
- Michael Klarman
University of Virginia
- David Konig
*Washington University,
St. Louis*
- Mindie Lazarus-Black
*University of Illinois at
Chicago*
- Kenneth F. Ledford
*Case Western Reserve
University*
- Brian P. Levack
University of Texas at Austin
- Janette Neeson
York University, Toronto
- Kent Newmyer
University of Connecticut
- James P. Oakes
Northwestern University
- John V. Orth
University of North Carolina
- Steven Pincus
University of Chicago
- W. Wesley Pue
*University of British
Columbia*
- Nicole Hahn Rafter
Northeastern University
- Gerry R. Rubin
*University of Kent,
Canterbury*
- Lucy E. Salyer
*University of
New Hampshire*
- John Henry Schlegel
SUNY, Buffalo
- Stephen A. Siegel
De Paul University
- Rayman L. Solomon
Northwestern University
- Robin Chapman Stacey
University of Washington
- Robert J. Steinfeld
SUNY, Buffalo
- Emily Z. Tabuteau
Michigan State University
- Victor M. Uribe
*Florida International
University*
- Barbara Y. Welke
University of Oregon
- James Q. Whitman
Yale University
- Stephen C. Yeazell
*University of California,
Los Angeles*

Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts and books for review. Address manuscript submissions, queries, and all editorial correspondence to Christopher Tomlins, The American Bar Foundation, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, Illinois 60611 (tel. 312 988 6553; fax 312 988 6579). Address books for review to William J. Novak, Department of History, University of Chicago, 1126 East 59th Street, Chicago, Illinois 60637 (tel. 773 702 7938, fax 773 702 7550). Manuscripts must be submitted in double-spaced typescript throughout, with citations prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 14th ed. Please use word processing wherever possible. Manuscripts submitted for publication are subject to double-blind peer review; authors should therefore identify themselves on the title page only. Accepted manuscripts are copyedited for style but not substance; authors remain responsible for citation accuracy and for all statements of fact or opinion. The *Law and History Review* will not consider any manuscript concurrently submitted for publication elsewhere. Submission of a manuscript is understood to commit its author to publish the manuscript in the *Law and History Review* if accepted by the editor.

Contents

Law and History Review Vol. 16, No. 1, Spring 1998

In This Issue vii

Paul L. Murphy, 1923–1997 ix

Articles

Frederic William Maitland and the Earliest English Law
Patrick Wormald 1

When Christianity Was Part of the Common Law
Stuart Banner 27

The Two Percent Solution: Eugenic Jurisprudence and the
Socialization of American Law, 1900–1930
Michael Willrich 63

Forum: On Enlightened Punishment

The Right to Be Punished: Autonomy and Its Demise
in Modern Penal Thought
Markus Dirk Dubber 113

Identity, Difference, and Enlightenment Heritage(s):
Comment on “The Right to Be Punished”
Kenneth F. Ledford 147

The Denials of Justice
Michael Meranze 153

Response

Historical Analysis of Law
Markus Dirk Dubber 159

Rejoinder

“Law and Neoclassical Economics”: A Response to Commentaries
James R. Hackney, Jr. 163

Book Reviews

*An Historical Introduction to Western
Constitutional Law*—R. C. Van Caenegem
reviewed by Albert J. Schmidt 173

<i>An Introduction to Early English Law: The Law-Codes of Ethelbert of Kent, Alfred the Great, and the Short Codes from the Reigns of Edmund and Ethelred the Unready</i> —Bill Griffiths	
reviewed by William Pencak	174
<i>Cultures of Power: Lordship, Status, and Process in Twelfth-Century Europe</i> —Thomas N. Bisson, editor	
reviewed by James A. Brundage	175
<i>Law and Citizenship in Early Modern France</i> —Charlotte C. Wells, and <i>Authority and Sexuality in Early Modern Burgundy (1550–1730)</i> —James R. Farr	
reviewed by Thomas Brennan	177
<i>Law, Society and the State: Essays in Modern Legal History</i> —Louis A. Knafla and Susan W. S. Binnie, editors	
reviewed by Constance Backhouse	180
<i>Law and the Transformation of Aztec Culture, 1500–1700</i> —Susan Kellogg	
reviewed by Inga Clendinnen	183
<i>Zuni and the Courts: A Struggle for Sovereign Land Rights</i> —E. Richard Hart, editor	
reviewed by Patricia Seed	185
<i>The Supreme Court in the Early Republic: The Chief Justiceships of John Jay and Oliver Ellsworth</i> —William R. Casto	
reviewed by Stewart Jay	186
<i>Reconstructing the Household: Families, Sex, and the Law in the Nineteenth-Century South</i> —Peter W. Bardaglio	
reviewed by Nancy G. Isenberg	188
<i>Judicial Enigma: The First Justice Harlan</i> —Tinsley E. Yarborough	
reviewed by Linda Przybyszewski	191
<i>Shaping the Eighteenth Amendment: Temperance Reform, Legal Culture, and the Polity</i> —Richard F. Hamm	
reviewed by Ian Tyrrell	193
<i>A Municipal Mother: Portland's Lola Greene Baldwin, America's First Policewoman</i> —Gloria E. Myers	
reviewed by Barbara A. Terzian	195
<i>Managing Legal Uncertainty: Elite Lawyers in the New Deal</i> —Ronen Shamir	
reviewed by Robert W. Gordon	197

<i>American Legal Realism and Empirical Social Science</i> —John Henry Schlegel reviewed by Jack Balkin	199
<i>The End of Reform: New Deal Liberalism in Recession and War</i> —Alan Brinkley, and <i>The Supreme Court Reborn: The Constitutional Revolution in the Age of Roosevelt</i> —William E. Leuchtenburg reviewed by Carl Landauer	201
<i>On the Limits of the Law: The Ironic Legacy of Title VI of the 1964 Civil Rights Act</i> —Stephen C. Halpern reviewed by Mark V. Tushnet	205
The H-Law Resource Page	209