

Ethics & International Affairs

VOLUME 33 • NUMBER 4 • WINTER 2019

SYMPOSIUM: Just War and Unjust Soldiers

*Scott D. Sagan and Benjamin A. Valentino,
with responses from Robert O. Keohane,
Jeff McMahan, and Michael Walzer*

ESSAY

The Ethics of Kin State Activism: A Cosmopolitan Defense

George Vasilev

FEATURE

When Migration Policy Isn't about Migration: Considerations for Implementation of the Global Compact for Migration

Tendayi Bloom

REVIEW ESSAY

Privacy, People, and Markets

Gordon Hull

REVIEWS

Unjust Borders: Individuals and the Ethics of Immigration

Javier S. Hidalgo

REVIEW BY PETER W. HIGGINS

The New Rules of War: Victory in the Age of Durable Disorder

Sean McFate

REVIEW BY REED BONADONNA

Expanding Responsibility for the Just War: A Feminist Critique

Rosemary Kellison

REVIEW BY CARON E. GENTRY

The Politics of the Anthropocene

*John S. Dryzek and
Jonathan Pickering*

REVIEW BY JEN IRIS ALLAN

**CARNEGIE
COUNCIL** *for Ethics in
International Affairs*

Ethics & International Affairs

VOLUME 33 · NUMBER 4 · WINTER 2019

CARNEGIE
COUNCIL *for Ethics in
International Affairs*

Ethics & International Affairs

THE JOURNAL OF THE CARNEGIE COUNCIL

EDITOR IN CHIEF *Joel H. Rosenthal*

EDITOR *Adam Read-Brown*

ASSISTANT EDITOR *Priya Chokshi*

EDITORIAL FELLOW *Shelbi Swanson*

COPY EDITOR *Jana Weinstein*

EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

Christian Barry

Alex J. Bellamy

Daniel Brunstetter

Allen Buchanan

Deen K. Chatterjee

Robyn Eckersley

Toni Erskine

Joy Gordon

Nikolas Gvosdev

Ian Hurd

Anthony F. Lang, Jr.

David Luban

Darrel Moellendorf

Valerie Morkevičius

David Rodin

Jennifer Rubenstein

Henry Shue

Anna Stilz

Jennifer Welsh

Leif Wenar

Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs

The Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs is an independent, nonpartisan, non-sectarian, tax-exempt organization founded in 1914 by Andrew Carnegie. Since its beginnings, the Carnegie Council has asserted its strong belief that ethics, as informed by the world's principal moral and religious traditions, is an inevitable and integral component of all policy decisions, whether in the realm of economics, politics, or national security. The interrelationship of ethics and foreign policy is thus the unifying theme of all Carnegie Council programs. By promoting a greater understanding of the values and conditions that ensure peaceful relations among nations, the Carnegie Council hopes to contribute to a better life for people everywhere.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Brett Buchness

Kathleen Cheek-Milby

Jonathan E. Colby

Michael W. Doyle

Richard A. Edlin,

Treasurer

Anthony L. Faillace,

Vice Chairman

Jonathan Gage

Stephen D. Hibbard,

Chairman

Kristen Edgreen Kaufman

Susan King

Brian Mateo

Robert Perlman

Alexander H. Platt

Joel H. Rosenthal,

President

Robert G. Shaw,

Secretary

HONORARY TRUSTEE *Maurice S. Spanbock, Esq.*

Contents

- Contributors** 393
- ESSAY** **The Ethics of Kin State Activism: A Cosmopolitan Defense**
George Vasilev 395
- SYMPOSIUM:
JUST WAR
AND UNJUST
SOLDIERS** **Just War and Unjust Soldiers: American Public Opinion on the
Moral Equality of Combatants**
Scott D. Sagan and Benjamin A. Valentino 411
- On Reciprocity and Practical Morality: A Response to Sagan and
Valentino**
Michael Walzer 445
- Extremism and Confusion in American Views about the Ethics of
War: A Comment on Sagan and Valentino**
Jeff McMahan 451
- The Condemnation-Absolution Syndrome: Issues of Validity and
Generality**
Robert O. Keohane 465
- On Reciprocity, Revenge, and Replication: A Rejoinder to Walzer,
McMahan, and Keohane**
Scott D. Sagan and Benjamin A. Valentino 473
- FEATURE** **When Migration Policy Isn't about Migration: Considerations for
Implementation of the Global Compact for Migration**
Tendayi Bloom 481
- REVIEW ESSAY** **Privacy, People, and Markets**
Gordon Hull 499
- REVIEWS** **Unjust Borders: Individuals and the Ethics of Immigration**
Javier S. Hidalgo
REVIEW BY PETER W. HIGGINS 511
- The New Rules of War: Victory in the Age of Durable Disorder***
Sean McFate
REVIEW BY REED BONADONNA 513

Expanding Responsibility for the Just War: A Feminist Critique

Rosemary Kellison

REVIEW BY CARON E. GENTRY 516

The Politics of the Anthropocene

John S. Dryzek and Jonathan Pickering

REVIEW BY JEN IRIS ALLAN 518

Briefly Noted 521

PEER REVIEWERS 2018–2019 Peer Reviewers 523

SUBMISSIONS Guidelines for Submission 525

RESOURCES For additional Carnegie Council resources on the topics addressed in these pages, please visit www.eiajournal.org.

ETHICS & INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS (ISSN 0892-6794 print; ISSN 1747-7093 online).

Publisher

Ethics & International Affairs is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, 20th floor, New York, NY 10006.

Information for subscribers

Ethics & International Affairs is published four times per year, in March, June, September, and December, by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, 20th floor, New York, NY 10006. Periodicals postage rate paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to: *Ethics & International Affairs*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, One Liberty Plaza, 20th floor, New York, NY 10006. Send address changes elsewhere to *Ethics & International Affairs*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, England. Institutional subscription prices for 2019 are: Print & Online: US \$620 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £381 + VAT elsewhere. Institutions electronic only: US\$554 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK£338 + VAT elsewhere. Individuals print only: US\$48 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK£32 + VAT elsewhere. The price includes online access to the current and all online back files to January 1st 1997, where available.

Delivery Terms and Legal Title

Prices include delivery of print journals to the recipient's address. Delivery terms are Delivered Duty Unpaid (DDU); the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Legal title passes to the customer on despatch by our distributors.

Production Editor: Katrina Swartz (email: kswartz@cambridge.org).

Electronic Access Access to this journal is available free online within institutions in the developing world through the AGORA initiative with the FAO, the HINARI initiative with the WHO and the OARE initiative with UNEP. For information, visit www.aginternetwork.org, www.healthinternetwork.org, www.oarescience.org.

Abstracting and Indexing Services The Journal is indexed by Academic Search (EBSCO), Academic Search Premier (EBSCO), CSA Environmental Sciences & Pollution Management Database (CSA/CIG), CSA Sustainability Science Abstracts (CSA/CIG), Current Abstracts (EBSCO), Current Contents®/Social and Behavioral Sciences (Thomson Reuters), Expanded Academic ASAP (Thomson Gale), IBSS: International Bibliography of the Social Sciences (LSE), InfoTrac, International Political Science Abstracts (IPSA), Journal Citation Reports/ Social Sciences Edition (Thomson Reuters), OMNIFILE Full Text Mega Edition (OMNIFILE), PAIS: Public Affairs Information Service (CSA/CIG), Proquest 5000 (ProQuest), Proquest Discovery (ProQuest), Proquest Platinum (ProQuest), Proquest Research Library (ProQuest), Proquest Social Science Journals (ProQuest), Social Sciences Citation Index® (Thomson Reuters), Social Sciences Index/Abstracts (HW Wilson), Student Resource Center College (w/ Academic ASAP), Wilson OMNIFILE Full Text Select (HW Wilson) and Worldwide Political Sciences Abstracts (CSA/CIG).

Disclaimer The Publisher, Carnegie Council, and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher, Council and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher, Council and Editors of the products advertised.

Copyright and Photocopying Copyright © 2019 Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm> Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Printed in USA by The Sheridan Press.

View this journal online at journals.cambridge.org/EIA.

ISSN 0892-6794 (Print)

ISSN 1747-7093 (Online)

Ethics &
International
Affairs