

January 2002  
Volume 117 Number 1

# PMLA

---

*Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*

Published six times a year by the association

THE MODERN LANGUAGE  
ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

[ Organized 1883, Incorporated 1900 ]

*Officers for the Year 2002*

President: STEPHEN GREENBLATT  
*Harvard University*  
First Vice President: MARY LOUISE PRATT  
*Stanford University*  
Executive Director: PHYLLIS FRANKLIN

*Executive Council*

FOR THE TERM ENDING 31 DECEMBER 2002

ROLAND GREENE  
*Stanford University*  
FRANÇOISE LIONNET  
*University of California, Los Angeles*  
CARY NELSON  
*University of Illinois, Urbana*

FOR THE TERM ENDING 31 DECEMBER 2003

REED WAY DASENBROCK  
*University of New Mexico, Albuquerque*  
ROSEMARIE SCULLION  
*University of Iowa*  
SIDONIE SMITH  
*University of Michigan, Ann Arbor*  
KATIE TRUMPENER  
*University of Chicago*

FOR THE TERM ENDING 31 DECEMBER 2004

JUDITH BUTLER  
*University of California, Berkeley*  
REY CHOW  
*Brown University*  
TEY DIANA REBOLLEDO  
*University of New Mexico, Albuquerque*

*Trustees of Invested Funds*

JOHN H. D'ARMS  
*New York, New York*  
CAROLYN G. HEILBRUN  
*New York, New York*  
MALCOLM B. SMITH (Managing Trustee)  
*New York, New York*

*PMLA* (ISSN 0030-8129) is published six times a year, in January, March, May, September, October, and November, by the Modern Language Association of America. Membership in the association is open to persons who are professionally interested in the modern languages and literatures. Annual (calendar-year) dues, which include subscription to *PMLA*, are based on members' incomes and are graduated as follows: student members (seven years maximum), \$20; new regular members (first year), \$35; regular members (income under \$15,000), \$25; regular members (income \$15,000–\$20,000), \$40; regular members (income \$20,000–\$30,000), \$50; regular members (income \$30,000–\$40,000), \$65; regular members (income \$40,000–\$50,000), \$75; regular members (income \$50,000–\$60,000), \$85; regular members (income \$60,000–\$70,000), \$95; regular members (income \$70,000–\$80,000), \$105; regular members (income \$80,000–\$100,000), \$125; regular members (income \$100,000–\$120,000), \$145; regular members (income \$120,000–\$140,000), \$165; regular members (income over \$140,000), \$175; joint members (two individuals sharing the same household, who receive one subscription to *PMLA* but two copies of all other publications), add \$20 to dues category of higher-income member; foreign members, same as regular members (use the American-dollar equivalent to ascertain the dues category). Membership applications are available on request and at the MLA Web site (<http://www.mla.org/>).

The subscription price of *PMLA* for libraries and other institutions is \$123. An institutional subscription including a bound volume at the end of the year is \$265, domestic and foreign. Agents deduct four percent as their fee. Single copies of the January, March, May, and October issues can be purchased for \$12 each; the September (Directory) issue is \$50; the November (Program) issue is \$35.

Issues for the current year are available from the Member and Customer Services Office of the association (646 576-5151; [membership@mla.org](mailto:membership@mla.org)). Claims for undelivered issues will be honored if they are received within six months of the publication date; thereafter the single-issue price will be charged.

Volumes up to 2000 can be obtained on microfilm from UMI, 300 North Zeeb Road, PO Box 1346, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 (800 521-0600; <http://www.umi.com/>).

The office of publication and editorial offices are located at 26 Broadway, 3rd floor, New York, NY 10004-1789 (646 576-5000; [pmlasubmissions@mla.org](mailto:pmlasubmissions@mla.org)).

All communications concerning membership, including change-of-address notifications, should be sent to the Member and Customer Services Office, MLA, 26 Broadway, 3rd floor, New York, NY 10004-1789 (646 576-5151; [membership@mla.org](mailto:membership@mla.org)). If a change of address also involves a change of institutional affiliation or a new e-mail address, that office should be informed of this fact at the same time.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

© 2002 by The Modern Language Association of America. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 12-32040. United States Postal Service Number 449-660.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Member and Customer Services Office, MLA, 26 Broadway, 3rd floor, New York, NY 10004-1789.

# Contents

JANUARY 2002

- 5 A Statement of Editorial Policy  
 6 Features in *PMLA*  
 6 Forthcoming in *PMLA*  
 9 Editor's Column: 11 September 2001



*Special Topic: Mobile Citizens, Media States*  
 Coordinated by Emily Apter, Anton Kaes, and D. N. Rodowick

- 13 Introduction  
 D. N. RODOWICK
- 24 **Citizenship, Language, and Modernity**  
 IAIN CHAMBERS
- 32 **Transporting the Subject: Technologies of Mobility  
 and Location in an Era of Globalization**  
 CAREN KAPLAN
- 43 **Cyber-Aztecs and Cholo-Punks: Guillermo Gómez-  
 Peña's Five-Worlds Theory**  
 THOMAS FOSTER

### criticism in translation

- 68 World Borders, Political Borders  
 ETIENNE BALIBAR  
 Translated by ERIN M. WILLIAMS. Introduction by EMILY APTER

### talks from the convention

- 79 Mobile Citizens, Media States: A Panel at the 2000  
 MLA Convention  
 EMILY APTER
- 84 The Sweatshop Sublime  
 BRUCE ROBBINS
- 98 Digital Networks and Citizenship  
 MARK POSTER

PUBLICATIONS OF THE  
 MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION  
 OF AMERICA

[ Published six times a year ]

### INDEXES

VOLS. 1–50, 1935; 51–60, 1945; 51–79, 1964



### Editor

CARLOS J. ALONSO  
*University of Pennsylvania*

*Managing Editor*  
 JUDY GOULDING

*Associate Managing Editor*  
 ERIC WIRTH

*Assistant Editors*  
 JOHN D. GOLBACH  
 MARGIT LONGBRAKE

*Advertising Manager and  
 Submissions Associate*  
 ANNABEL SCHNEIDER

*Administrative Assistant*  
 ANGEL BUTTS

### Editorial Board

R. HOWARD BLOCH, 2003  
*Yale University*

JOSEPH A. BOONE, 2003  
*University of Southern California*

JAY FLIEGELMAN, 2002  
*Stanford University*

AVITAL RONELL, 2003  
*New York University*

MIREILLE ROSELLO, 2002  
*Northwestern University*

BRUCE R. SMITH, 2002  
*Georgetown University*

### Advisory Committee

DUDLEY ANDREW, 2004  
*Yale University*

PAULA BLANK, 2004  
*College of William and Mary*

PAUL ANTHONY BOVÉ, 2004  
*University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh*

BELLA BRODZKI, 2002  
*Sarah Lawrence College*

MARGARET BROSE, 2004  
*University of California, Santa Cruz*

HEIDI BYRNES, 2002  
*Georgetown University*

KENNETH S. CALHOON, 2004  
*University of Oregon*

(continued)

*Advisory Committee (continued)*

ANTHONY J. CASCARDI, 2003  
*University of California, Berkeley*

MICHAEL DAVIDSON, 2003  
*University of California, San Diego*

MARGRETA DE GRAZIA, 2003  
*University of Pennsylvania*

FRANCES E. DOLAN, 2002  
*Miami University, Oxford*

MADHU DUBEY, 2003  
*Brown University*

IAN DUNCAN, 2003  
*University of California, Berkeley*

LYNN ENTERLINE, 2002  
*Vanderbilt University*

ROSEMARY G. FEAL, 2002  
*State University of New York, Buffalo*

CATHERINE GALLAGHER, 2004  
*University of California, Berkeley*

HAZEL GOLD, 2002  
*Emory University*

FARAH JASMINE GRIFFIN, 2003  
*University of Pennsylvania*

PHILLIP BRIAN HARPER, 2002  
*New York University*

JOSEPH HARRIS, 2002  
*Duke University*

JULIA HELL, 2004  
*University of Michigan, Ann Arbor*

SUVIR KAUL, 2003  
*University of Illinois, Urbana*

DEIDRE SHAUNA LYNCH, 2004  
*Indiana University, Bloomington*

AMY MANDELKER, 2004  
*Graduate Center, City University of New York*

WILLIAM D. PADEN, 2002  
*Northwestern University*

DONALD E. PEASE, 2004  
*Dartmouth College*

LESLIE W. RABINE, 2002  
*University of California, Irvine*

JOSEPH ROACH, 2003  
*Yale University*

JACQUELINE JONES ROYSTER, 2002  
*Ohio State University, Columbus*

GEOFFREY RUSSOM, 2003  
*Brown University*

RICHARD L. STEIN, 2002  
*University of Oregon*

KENNETH W. WARREN, 2003  
*University of Chicago*

LOUISE YELIN, 2003  
*State University of New York, Purchase*

JANUARY 2002

- 
- 104 Publicity and Indifference (Sarajevo on Television)  
THOMAS KEENAN
- 117 The Complexities of Seriation  
N. KATHERINE HAYLES
- 122 Forum  
ARTURO ARIAS, DANIEL P. DENEAU, M. THOMAS INGE, LOUISA  
MACKENZIE, STACEY MARGOLIS, DAVID E. E. SLOANE, DAVID STOLL,  
CARL F. WIECK, GEORGE T. WRIGHT, AND SHERRY LUTZ ZIVLEY
- 133 Forthcoming Meetings and Conferences of General Interest
- 135 Index of Advertisers
- 156 Professional Notes and Comment  
156 Announcements  
160 Journal Notes  
162 Meeting of the MLA Executive Council  
174 In Memoriam
- 192 Abstracts

## A Statement of Editorial Policy

*PMLA* welcomes essays of interest to those concerned with the study of language and literature. As the publication of a large and heterogeneous association, the journal is receptive to a variety of topics, whether general or specific, and to all scholarly methods and theoretical perspectives. The ideal *PMLA* essay exemplifies the best of its kind, whatever the kind; addresses a significant problem; draws out clearly the implications of its findings; and engages the attention of its audience through a concise, readable presentation. Manuscripts in languages other than English are accepted for review but must be accompanied by a detailed summary in English (generally of 1,000–1,500 words) and must be translated into English if they are recommended to the Editorial Board. Articles of fewer than 2,500 words or more than 9,000 words are not considered for publication. The word count includes notes but excludes works-cited lists and translations, which should accompany foreign language quotations. The MLA urges its contributors to be sensitive to the social implications of language and to seek wording free of discriminatory overtones.

Only members of the association may submit articles to *PMLA*. For a collaboratively written essay to be eligible for submission, all coauthors must be members of the MLA. *PMLA* does not publish book reviews or new works of fiction. Each article submitted is sent to two reviewers, usually one consultant reader and one member of the Advisory Committee. Articles recommended by these readers are then sent to the members of the Editorial Board, who meet periodically with the editor to make final decisions. Until a final decision is reached, the author's name is not made known to consultant readers, to members of the Advisory Committee and the Editorial Board, or to the editor. Because the submission of an article simultaneously to more than one refereed journal can result in duplication of the demanding task of reviewing the manuscript, it is *PMLA*'s policy not to review articles that are under consideration by other journals. An article found to have been simultaneously submitted elsewhere will not be published in *PMLA* even if it has already been accepted for publication by the Editorial Board.

Submissions, prepared according to the *MLA Style Manual and Guide to Scholarly Publishing*, should be sent in duplicate and addressed to the Managing Editor, *PMLA*, Modern Language Association, 26 Broadway, 3rd floor, New York, NY 10004-1789. With each submission please include a self-addressed envelope and enough postage for one copy to be returned. Authors' names should not appear on manuscripts; instead, a cover sheet, with the author's name and address and the title of the article, should accompany each manuscript. Authors should not refer to themselves in the first person in the submitted text or notes if such references would identify them; any necessary references to the author's previous work, for example, should be in the third person.

Cover illustration: *Facsimile*, an installation planned for the Moscone Convention Center, in San Francisco. A sixteen-by-twenty-seven-foot screen, mounted with cameras that point into and away from the building, will travel across the exterior facade, displaying live and recorded video imagery. Architects, Diller + Scofidio (principals: Elizabeth Diller and Ricardo Scofidio; project architect: Lyn Rice); client, San Francisco Arts Commission; engineers, Pol-X West: Les Okreglak; technical collaborator, EAR Studio: Ben Rubin.

## Forthcoming in *PMLA*

### IN THE MARCH ISSUE

- GEORGE HOFFMANN. "Anatomy of the Mass: Montaigne's 'Cannibals'"
- BRUCE BOEHRER. "'Lycidas': The Pastoral Elegy as Same-Sex Epithalamium"
- TED UNDERWOOD. "Romantic Historicism and the Afterlife"
- MAYA SOCOLOVSKY. "The Homelessness of Immigrant American Ghosts: Hauntings and Photographic Narrative in Oscar Hijuelos's *The Fourteen Sisters of Emilio Montez O'Brien*"
- SARAH BROPHY. "Angels in Antigua: The Diasporic of Melancholy in Jamaica Kincaid's *My Brother*"
- JULIA KRISTEVA. Interview on forgiveness with Alison Rice. With responses by Peter Brooks, Colin Davis, Susan VanZanten Gallagher, Heidi Grunebaum, Ruth Kluger, Brenda Murphy, Cary Nelson, and Sigrid Weigel (Theories and Methodologies)

## Features in *PMLA*

Manuscripts and correspondence related to the features described below should be sent to the Managing Editor, *PMLA*, Modern Language Association, 26 Broadway, 3rd floor, New York, NY 10004-1789.

### Special Topic

Articles on the general topic are invited; the subtopics listed are provided by way of example and suggestion only. Submissions to *PMLA* must meet the requirements given in the statement of editorial policy.

### SCIENCE FICTION AND LITERARY STUDIES: THE NEXT MILLENNIUM

*Deadline for submissions: 31 May 2002*

COORDINATORS: Marleen S. Barr (Columbia Univ.)

Carl Freedman (Louisiana State Univ., Baton Rouge)

The central concept of the special topic is the future, particularly in Ernst Bloch's sense of a utopian Not-Yet, a drive felt in the present toward the potential reconfiguration of the world. As futurity becomes an ever more urgent concern, the importance of science fiction (the genre of the future par excellence) is increasingly evident, and science fiction criticism becomes a privileged mode of literary and cultural analysis. The special topic is less a stocktaking of past achievements in science fiction criticism (though there is room for that) than an exploration of the potential of this criticism to define the literary profession in this decade, as postcolonial criticism did in the late 1980s and early 1990s. Contributors might address the following specific issues, among others: what is science fiction?; science fiction and its generic others (e.g., fantasy, realism, modernism, postmodernism); the history of science fiction (whether this history is held to begin as recently as the 1920s, with the American pulp magazines, or as long ago as Lucian or even the *Epic of Gilgamesh*); science fiction and critical theory, gender, race, or the canon; global science fiction (the genre's expansion beyond its traditional homelands—Britain, the United States, France, and eastern Europe—to such new frontiers as Brazil, Japan, and Australia); science fiction and film or electronic media like radio, television, video games, and the Internet; science fiction and an increasingly science-fictional real world.

### Criticism in Translation

MLA members are invited to submit to the *PMLA* Editorial Board proposals for translations. Articles, as well as chapters or sections of books that can function as independent units, will be considered. The originals may be in any language. Two types of proposals are welcome: (1) significant scholarship from earlier periods that has not lost its forcefulness and whose retrieval in English in *PMLA* would be a noteworthy event for a broad body of readers and (2) contemporary work of sufficient weight and potential influence to merit the attention of the field as a whole.

A member who wishes to make a proposal should first ascertain that no previous English translation exists. The proposer should then provide the managing editor with the following materials: (1) a photocopy of the original essay, (2) an extended summary of the entire essay in English, (3) an introductory statement of approximately 1,000 words, prepared in accordance with MLA style, that will be published with the essay if the essay is accepted, (4) information on the copyright status of the original (if the translation is accepted for publication, the proposer will be responsible for obtaining permission to print it). In addition, if the proposer wishes to serve as translator of the essay or to designate a translator (who must also be an MLA member), a 1,000-word sample of the translation should be submitted; otherwise the Editorial Board will select a translator.

The translated essays should normally not exceed *PMLA*'s 9,000-word limit. The Editorial Board will approve or decline the proposals, evaluate the quality of the translations, and cooperate with the proposers and translators.

### Little-Known Documents

MLA members are invited to submit to the *PMLA* Editorial Board proposals regarding little-known documentary material that merits the attention of a broad range of readers. Consideration will be given to archival data from any period and in any language that do not exceed *PMLA*'s 9,000-word limit.

A member who wishes to make a proposal should provide the managing editor with the following materials: (1) a photocopy of the document, (2) an extended summary of the document in English, (3) an introductory statement of approximately 1,000 words, prepared in accordance with MLA style, that will be published with the document if it is accepted, (4) information on the copyright status of the original (if the document is accepted for publication, the proposer will be responsible for obtaining permission to print it). In addition, if the document is not in English and if the proposer wishes to serve as translator or to designate a translator (who must also be an MLA member), the proposal should include a 1,000-word sample of the translation; otherwise the

## Forthcoming in *PMLA*

### IN OTHER ISSUES

CHRISTINE FERGUSON. "Decadence as Scientific Fulfillment"

DENISE GIGANTE. "The Monster in the Rainbow: Keats and the Science of Life"

BARRI J. GOLD. "The Consolation of Physics: Tennyson's Thermodynamic Solution"

TERRELL SCOTT HERRING. "Frank O'Hara's Open Closet"

ANNE MALLORY. "Burke, Boredom, and the Theater of Counterrevolution"

MAURA B. NOLAN. "Metaphorical History: Narrative and New Science in the Work of F. W. Maitland"

TODD SAMUEL PRESNER. "Jews on Ships; or, How Heine's *Reisebilder* Deconstruct Hegel's Philosophy of World History"

CAROLINE WEBER. "The Sins of the Father: Colonialism and Family History in Diderot's *Le fils naturel*"

---

Editorial Board will select a translator of accepted non-English material. The Editorial Board will approve or decline the proposals.

### **Solicited Contributions**

The editor and the Editorial Board periodically invite studies and commentaries by specific authors on topics of wide interest. These contributions appear in the following series: Theories and Methodologies, The Changing Profession, The Book Market, The Journal World, Letters from Librarians, Correspondents Abroad, and Convention Miscellany. MLA members are welcome to suggest topics that might be addressed under these rubrics.