

VOLUME 77 NUMBER 2

SPRING 2015

*The*  
Review  
of  
Politics

ARTICLES

**Alexander I. Orwin**, “Democracy under the Caliphs: Alfarabi’s  
Unusual Understanding of Popular Rule”

**Juliana Udi**, “Locke and the Fundamental Right to Preservation:  
On the Convergence of Charity and Property Rights”

**Sean Illing**, “Between Nihilism and Transcendence:  
Camus’s Dialogue with Dostoevsky”

**Naomi Choi**, “Liberalism and the Interpretive Turn:  
Rival Approaches or Cross-Purposes?”

**Review Essay: Michael J. Perry**, “American Religious Freedom”

THE UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

*Editor*

CATHERINE H. ZUCKERT

*Executive Associate Editor*

DENNIS WM MORAN

*Book Review Editor*

RUTH ABBEY

Editorial Board

Ruth Abbey  
*University of Notre Dame*  
Shlomo Avineri  
*Hebrew University of  
Jerusalem*  
Barry Cooper  
*University of Calgary*  
Fred Dallmayr  
*University of Notre Dame*  
John Dunn  
*Cambridge University*  
Elizabeth Frazer  
*University of Oxford*  
Michael A. Gillespie  
*Duke University*  
Leslie Goldstein  
*University of Delaware*  
Russell Hittinger  
*University of Tulsa*  
Axel Honneth  
*Institute for Social Research,  
Frankfurt*  
Shozo Iijima  
*Waseda University,  
Tokyo*

Ramin Jahanbegloo  
*York University*  
Pierre Manent  
*L'Ecole des Hautes Etudes en  
sciences sociales*  
Harvey C. Mansfield  
*Harvard University*  
Mary Nichols  
*Baylor University*  
Daniel Philpott  
*University of Notre Dame*  
Arlene Saxonhouse  
*University of Michigan*  
William E. Scheuerman  
*Indiana University, Bloomington*  
Steven B. Smith  
*Yale University*  
Peter Steinberger  
*Reed College*  
Vickie Sullivan  
*Tufts University*  
Jean M. Yarbrough  
*Bowdoin College*

Copyeditor: LES HARRIS

Editorial Interns: Kyle Beam and Theresa Smart

Administrative Assistant: Kelli Brown

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian  
M.A. Fitzsimons  
Thomas Stritch

Frederick J. Crosson  
Donald P. Kommers  
Walter Niegorski

*The Review of Politics* publishes primarily philosophical and historical studies of politics, especially those in political theory and American political thought. The journal also includes thoughtful scholarly reflections on all aspects of politics—laws, and institutions, international relations, comparative politics—as well as literary reflections on politics or political interpretations of literature.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS SPRING 2015

Vol. 77	SPRING 2015	No. 2
<i>Harry V. Jaffa: In Memoriam</i> . . . . . 169		
<i>Alexander I. Orwin</i>		
	Democracy under the Caliphs: Alfarabi's Unusual Understanding of Popular Rule . . . . .	171
<i>Juliana Udi</i>		
	Locke and the Fundamental Right to Preservation: On the Convergence of Charity and Property Rights . . . . .	191
<i>Sean Illing</i>		
	Between Nihilism and Transcendence: Camus's Dialogue with Dostoevsky . . . . .	217
<i>Naomi Choi</i>		
	Liberalism and the Interpretive Turn: Rival Approaches or Cross-Purposes? . . . . .	243
<i>Scholarly Exchange:</i>		
	Why We Need Positive Liberty—George Crowder . . . . .	271
	Reply to Crowder—Gina Gustavsson . . . . .	279
<i>Announcement:</i>		
	The Papers of Edward Goerner and Gerhart Niemeyer . . . . .	285
<i>Review Essay:</i>		
	<i>Michael J. Perry</i>	
	American Religious Freedom . . . . .	287
<i>Reviews:</i>		
	<i>Gerald Mara</i>	
	Review of Lorraine Smith Pangle's <i>Virtue Is Knowledge: The Moral Foundations of Socratic Political Philosophy</i> . . . . .	301
	<i>Walter Nicgorski</i>	
	Review of Jed W. Atkin's <i>Cicero on Politics and the Limits of Reason: The "Republic" and "Laws"</i> . . . . .	303
	<i>Markus Fischer</i>	
	Review of David N. Levy's <i>Wily Elites and Spirited Peoples in Machiavelli's Republicanism</i> . . . . .	306

Steven Johnston	
Review of Jimmy Casas Klausen's <i>Fugitive Rousseau: Slavery, Primitivism, and Political Freedom</i> . . . . .	309
Julia V. Douthwaite	
Review of Jonathan Israel's <i>Revolutionary Ideas: An Intellectual History of the French Revolution from "The Rights of Man" to Robespierre</i> . . . . .	312
David Lewis Schaefer	
Review of Arthur Melzer's <i>Philosophy between the Lines: The Lost History of Esoteric Writing</i> . . . . .	316
Horst Mewes	
Review of Robert Howse's <i>Leo Strauss: Man of Peace</i> . . . . .	318
Cyril Ghosh	
Review of Elizabeth Beaumont's <i>The Civic Constitution: Civic Visions and Struggles in the Path Toward Constitutional Democracy</i> . . .	321
Robert Faulkner	
Review of Jeffrey A. Becker's <i>Ambition in America: Political Power and the Collapse of Citizenship</i> . . . . .	324
Arto Laitinen	
Review of Axel Honneth's <i>Freedom's Right: The Social Foundations of Democratic Life</i> . . . . .	327
Kean Birch	
Review of Giuseppe di Palma's <i>The Modern State Subverted: Risk and the Deconstruction of Solidarity</i> . . . . .	330
Martha L. Merritt	
Review of Archie Brown's <i>The Myth of the Strong Leader: Political Leadership in Modern Age</i> . . . . .	332
Gerald J. Russello	
Review of Ralph A. Rossum's <i>Understanding Clarence Thomas: The Jurisprudence of Constitutional Restoration</i> . . . . .	335
Jonathan Allen	
Review of Stephen Eric Bronner's <i>The Bigot: Why Prejudice Persists</i> . .	337
Richard Sakwa	
Review of Daniel J. Mahoney's <i>The Other Solzhenitsyn: Telling the Truth about a Misunderstood Writer and Thinker</i> . . . . .	339
Brian Esparza Walker	
Review of David Elstein's <i>Democracy in Contemporary Confucian Philosophy</i> and Sung Moon Kim's <i>Confucian Democracy in East Asia: Theory and Practice</i> . . . . .	342
Peter R. Moody	
Review of Franklin Perkins's <i>Heaven and Earth Are Not Humane: The Problem of Evil in Classical Chinese Philosophy</i> . . . . .	346

**Subscription Information:** *The Review of Politics* (ISSN 0034-6705) is published quarterly in February, May, August and November by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 USA/University Printing House, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK for the University of Notre Dame. Annual subscription rates for Volume 77 (2015): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$180.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £105.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$150.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £90.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$173.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £103.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$46.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £26.00 + VAT elsewhere. Correspondence concerning subscriptions should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, University Printing House, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK.

**Editorial Office:** All correspondence concerning submissions and manuscripts under review should be sent to *The Review of Politics*, University of Notre Dame, 547 Flanner Hall, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Phone: 574-631-6623. Email: ROP.Editor.1@nd.edu. Website: [www.nd.edu/~rop](http://www.nd.edu/~rop)

**Abstracting and Indexing Information:** Articles in *The Review of Politics* are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index; abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts; and abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI., Historical Abstracts, Social Science Index (also available in the electronic versions), Book Review Index, and International Bibliography of the Social Sciences.

Copyright © 2015 University of Notre Dame. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press, Rights and Permissions Manager, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 USA. For further information see <http://us.cambridge.org/information/rights/>

Periodicals postage paid in New York, NY and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes to *The Review of Politics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133 USA.

Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: the Item-Fee Code for the publication (0034-6705/15 \$9.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) provided that the appropriate remittance of \$9.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.