

people are never left without the external goods they need to practise virtue. This may seem smug but Bowlin illustrates well the ambiguity in Aquinas about the relation of external goods and virtuous action. Virtues like magnanimity and magnificence do seem to presuppose a significant share in this world's goods. On the other hand fortune's goods are unnecessary for the beatific vision in which perfect human happiness consists.

That the virtues are rendered fragile by fortune's whim led Aristotle to a kind of asceticism in the face of possible despair. Aquinas replaces this asceticism with hope and with charity 'which eliminates fortune's authority'. For Bowlin this is a distinctively stoic feature of virtue theory, to remove the moral life from the reach of fortune. As regards natural virtue Aquinas is an aristotelian and refuses this 'stoic withdrawal'. But to express his theologically-charged discontent with the virtue and happiness available in this life, Aquinas resorts to a stoic account. Bowlin refers to Cicero, Gregory and Augustine as sources for this.

His point requires further substantiation, though, since the perceived similarity between Aquinas's theological virtue and stoic natural virtue may simply be accidental. If it arises for Aquinas in the conviction that the place of human happiness is the beatific vision, the attainment of which requires a kind of virtue other than that naturally acquirable, then we are dealing with something which cannot simply be described as stoic. Other traditions contained accounts of 'virtue ascending'. Plotinus offers one (which Aquinas considers at *ST* I.II 61,5) and Aristotle himself offers another in those problematic texts where he speaks of the highest human activities as 'divine'. For Aquinas there is also of course the New Testament, as Bowlin himself notes (pp.148–49).

This is a valuable book with fine expositions of many aspects of Aquinas's moral philosophy. But the assertion that Aquinas's understanding of theological virtue is, at a key point, stoic remains to my mind not proven.

VIVIAN BOLAND OP

'FIRST THE BOW IS BENT IN STUDY': DOMINICAN EDUCATION BEFORE 1350 by M. Michele Mulchahey *Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto, 1998. Pp. xxii+618, \$110 hbk.*

We are used to thinking of the early Dominicans as closely engaged with the great universities of Paris and Oxford, as both learning their intellectual trade there, and in many distinguished cases lecturing there themselves. Michele Mulchahey shows in this impressively learned book how the universities in fact hosted only a fraction of the total educational activity of the young Order of Preachers. She quarries a wide range of sources, from provincial *acta* to pastoral guides to high theology, and including a mass of manuscripts, to uncover the lives of the conventual schools and the houses of study of the Order's first hundred years, to trace their curricula and their methods of teaching, and to identify the wealth of written material used by, and provided for, their teachers. Above all, she emphasises the way in which the pastoral focus of the friars preachers shaped the structures and the details of their educational institutions; her title quotes a line from Hugh of St Cher: 'first the bow is bent in study, and then the arrow is released in preaching.'

506

Professor Mulchahey was a pupil of Leonard Boyle, to whom the book is warmly dedicated, and his influence is evident in the scholarship, the choice of topic, and the approach. This is history from below: Aquinas's *Summa Theologiae*, for example, comes into the story only after the complex intellectual context in which it developed has been explained in detail; and then it is able to appear as one particularly sturdy plant flourishing in a full and rich garden. Indeed, Mulchahey endeavours to locate precisely the origins of specific parts of the *Summa* in the lectures given in Thomas's theology courses at Santa Sabina in Rome in 1265–8 and at San Domenico in Naples in 1272–3. In these, she argues, Thomas was developing a curriculum for the province of Italy.

The provincial *studia theologiae* at which Thomas gave those courses, which developed in the second half of the thirteenth century, provided only one of several types and levels of Dominican schooling. The basis of the whole system was the individual convent. The primitive constitutions already expected each community to include a doctor to teach the brothers Scripture and basic theology. From his first profession onwards, every friar was required by repeated legislation daily to 'attend classes in the *schola* and take part in its exercises'. (I would like to have heard more of the extent to which dispensation, laxness and the exigencies of life in practice modified this ambitious intention.) The Bible and Lombard's *Sentences* were the standard texts in these humble schools, just as in the lofty lecture-halls of Paris. (When Aquinas was eventually introduced into the curriculum in 1313, it was his Commentary on Peter Lombard that was selected for use.) Teaching also included regular disputations. Mulchahey argues that it is a mistake to assume that contemporary collections of quodlibets or commentaries on Lombard must have originated in universities rather than local schools or houses of study.

The more able brothers might then be sent on to the provincial *studia* (once they had developed) or to the *studia generalia*, which were instituted by the general chapter as resources for the whole Order, taking students from anywhere. In some cases, in particular Paris and Oxford, the *studia* were closely linked to the universities, especially where university masters became Dominicans and vice versa. Elsewhere, however, Mulchahey argues, for example in Barcelona, Cologne and Florence, the Dominican *studia generalia* were not part of the university system: they pre-dated university faculties by many years (and indeed provided education for local laymen such as Dante). The primary role of the *studia* was to train Dominicans to teach not in the universities, but in the schools of their own provinces, and the majority of students returned there after two or three years. In short, the Order's education was not for the good of the universities: university learning was for the sake of training ordinary preachers.

The final part of the book describes the content and use of a range of texts used to train future preachers and confessors: collections of model sermons and *exempla*, *florilegia*, preaching manuals, commentaries, handbooks of moral theology. The Biblical concordance was developed at St Jacques in Paris, and was soon followed by the index and alphabetical reference. Thus the necessity of students and sermon-writers was mother to inventions that every educated person today takes for granted.

This volume provides an authoritative reference for anyone seriously

interested in either early Dominican history or education in the later middle ages. It is not a light read; yet it offers many suggestive glimpses of the friars' lives: the subprior of Spoleto who was punished for accepting unworthy students by being made to teach them grammar himself; Humbert of Romans's advice that the master of students should sit at the trainee preacher's elbow to nudge him if he went on too long; the debates over whether the conventual lectors should teach across the summer break (eventually heat and human weakness defeated ascetical idealism on this one!). Humble moments such as these constituted the soil which nourished the magnificent Dominican contribution to thirteenth-century learning.

MARGARET ATKINS

AB AQUILONE: NORDIC STUDIES IN HONOUR AND MEMORY OF LEONARD E. BOYLE, O.P. ed. by Marie-Louise Rodén, *Swedish National Archives*, *Skrifter utgivna av Riksarkivet 14; Svenska Institutet i Rom, Suecoromana 6, Stockholm, 1999. Pp. 272, \$62.50 hbk.*

The title of this collection derives from the inscription under the fresco of the North Wind in the Vatican *Torre dei Venti: Ab Aquilone Pandetur Omne Malum*. While it alluded to the papacy's late-sixteenth-century alarm at the Protestant North, Pope Alexander VII had it concealed in expectation of Queen Christina's visit to Rome in 1655. It has since been restored, and here the same words are taken up by a number of Nordic scholars in gratitude to and appreciation of the friendship of Fr Leonard Boyle OP, who was Prefect of the Vatican Library from 1984 to 1997. From early in the twentieth century, the Vatican's collections have been of importance to the researches of scholars of northern Europe and Scandinavia into the histories of their own nations, while more recent decades have witnessed the broadening interests of Nordic scholars of a wide variety of disciplines.

This volume is offered as an 'affectionate tribute ... to the memory of a man who more than most did hold his great door generously open to all searchers for truth of the entire international community of scholars, to those from near and far, equally to the young unproven and to the old and eminent, thereby worthily embodying the universalist claims of his Masters'(p.10). In particular Fr Boyle had undertaken the promotion of official contacts with Swedish research institutes, and had been instrumental in the realisation of the 1989 exhibition on Queen Christina in the *Salone Sistino* of the Vatican Museum and Library, of a further exhibition on St Birgitta, and of the cataloguing of Queen Christina's manuscript collection as a collaborative work of the Vatican Library and the Swedish Institute in Rome, one of the sponsors of the present volume. The volume itself brings together a wide-ranging collection of recent Nordic scholarship based on research undertaken in the Vatican Library and Archives, and it was nearing completion when Fr Boyle died on 25 October 1999. Its fourteen contributions are in various languages, Italian, English, German; cover a wide period, medieval, Renaissance, modern; and come from a variety of disciplines, archaeology, philology, history, gender, library and archival studies. Of