

Social Philosophy & Policy

Moral Obligation

CONTENTS

CHARLES LARMORE	Reflection and Morality	1
TERRY HORGAN and MARK TIMMONS	Untying a Knot from the Inside Out: Reflections on the "Paradox" of Supererogation	29
HOLLY M. SMITH	Subjective Rightness	64
THOMAS HURKA	Underivative Duty: Prichard on Moral Obligation	111
STEPHEN DARWALL	"But It Would Be Wrong"	135
JOHN SKORUPSKI	Moral Obligation, Blame, and Self-Governance	158
PATRICIA GREENSPAN	Making Room for Options: Moral Reasons, Imperfect Duties, and Choice	181
PAUL GUYER	The Obligation to Be Virtuous: Kant's Conception of the <i>Tugendverpflichtung</i>	206
ANDREW JASON COHEN	A Conceptual and (Preliminary) Normative Exploration of Waste	233
BERNARD R. BOXILL	The Duty to Seek Peace	274
R. G. FREY	Goals, Luck, and Moral Obligation	297
H. TRISTRAM ENGELHARDT, JR.	Moral Obligation after the Death of God: Critical Reflections on Concerns from Immanuel Kant, G. W. F. Hegel, and Elizabeth Anscombe	317

Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

Editor: Ellen Frankel Paul

Associate Editors: Fred D. Miller, Jr., and Jeffrey Paul

Managing Editor: Harry Dolan

Administrative Editor: Tamara Sharp

Social Philosophy and Policy Center

Editorial Board

David Braybrooke

University of Texas, Austin

Baruch Brody

Rice University

Allen Buchanan

Duke University

James M. Buchanan

*Center for Study of Public Choice,
George Mason University*

Jules Coleman

Yale Law School

Jack Douglas

University of California, San Diego

Richard A. Epstein

University of Chicago Law School

James Fishkin

Stanford University

Antony G. N. Flew

University of Reading (Emeritus)

Martin Golding

Duke University

John Gray

*London School of Economics and
Political Science*

Gilbert Harman

Princeton University

Eric Mack

Tulane University

Harvey Mansfield, Jr.

Harvard University

Wallace I. Matson

University of California, Berkeley

Jan Narveson

University of Waterloo

Nicholas Rescher

University of Pittsburgh

David Sidersky

Columbia University

Hillel Steiner

University of Manchester

James Q. Wilson

*Pepperdine University,
Malibu*

Leland B. Yeager

Auburn University

Social Philosophy & Policy is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

Editorial Office: Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403-0188, USA.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information: See inside back cover.

Copyright © 2010 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/10 \$15.00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

CONTRIBUTORS

Charles Larmore is W. Duncan MacMillan Family Professor in the Humanities, and Professor of Philosophy, at Brown University. Previously, he taught at Columbia University and at the University of Chicago. His work is centered in the areas of moral and political philosophy, though he has also written on the nature of the self and on various topics in metaphysics and epistemology. Among his recent books are *Les pratiques du moi* (2004), for which he received the Grand Prix de Philosophie from the Académie Française; *The Autonomy of Morality* (2008); and *Dernières nouvelles du moi* (with Vincent Descombes, 2009).

Terry Horgan is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Arizona. He is the author, with Matjaž Potrč, of *Austere Realism: Contextual Semantics Meets Minimal Ontology* (2008), and the editor, with Mark Timmons, of *Metaethics after Moore* (2006). His essays have appeared in such journals as *Philosophical Studies*, *Philosophy of Science*, *Mind*, and the *Southern Journal of Philosophy*.

Mark Timmons is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Arizona. He is editor of *Oxford Studies in Normative Ethics*, a newly inaugurated annual whose first volume will be published in 2011. He and Terry Horgan have coauthored many papers in metaethics, including "What Does Moral Phenomenology Tell Us about Moral Objectivity?" *Social Philosophy and Policy* (2008).

Holly M. Smith is Professor of Philosophy at Rutgers University. She has published widely on topics in normative ethics and biomedical ethics, and is currently working on a book manuscript (forthcoming, Oxford University Press) exploring how moral theories should accommodate the errors, ignorance, and misunderstandings that all too frequently impede us when we confront occasions for moral decision-making. Her essays have appeared in a number of journals, including *Ethics*, the *Philosophical Review*, *Noûs*, and the *Journal of Philosophy*.

Thomas Hurka is Chancellor Henry N.R. Jackman Distinguished Professor of Philosophical Studies at the University of Toronto, where he has taught since 2002. He is the author of *Perfectionism* (1993), *Principles: Short Essays on Ethics* (1993), and *Virtue, Vice, and Value* (2001), as well as of many articles on topics in normative ethics and political philosophy. He is currently finishing a trade book on the theory of value entitled *The Good Things in Life*, and is preparing to write a scholarly book entitled *British*

CONTRIBUTORS

Moral Philosophers from Sidgwick to Ewing. His contribution to this volume grows out of his research for the latter book.

Stephen Darwall is Andrew Downey Orrick Professor of Philosophy at Yale University and John Dewey Distinguished University Professor Emeritus at the University of Michigan. He has written widely on the foundations and history of ethics. His books include *Impartial Reason* (1983), *The British Moralists and the Internal "Ought": 1640–1740* (1995), *Philosophical Ethics* (1998), *Welfare and Rational Care* (2002), and *The Second-Person Standpoint: Morality, Respect, and Accountability* (2006). He is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, a past president of the Central Division of the American Philosophical Association, and a founding coeditor (with David Velleman) of *The Philosophers' Imprint*.

John Skorupski is Professor of Moral Philosophy and Head of Graduate Studies at the University of St. Andrews. He studied philosophy and economics at Cambridge University. Previously, he has been a lecturer at the University of Glasgow, as well as the Chair of Philosophy at Sheffield University. He is the author of *Ethical Explorations* (1999) and *Why Read Mill Today?* (2006).

Patricia Greenspan is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Maryland, College Park. She has published articles on ethics and philosophy of action in the *Journal of Philosophy*, *Philosophical Review*, *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, *Ethics*, and other leading journals, as well as essays in various anthologies. She is the author of *Emotions and Reasons: An Inquiry into Emotional Motivation* (1988) and *Practical Guilt: Moral Dilemmas, Emotions, and Social Norms* (1995). Her most recent work focuses on practical rationality.

Paul Guyer is Professor of Philosophy and Florence R.C. Murray Professor in the Humanities at the University of Pennsylvania. He is the author, editor, and translator of numerous works about and by Immanuel Kant, including most recently *Kant* (2006), *Kant's Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals: A Reader's Guide* (2007), and *Knowledge, Reason, and Taste: Kant's Response to Hume* (2008). He is currently completing a history of modern aesthetics and is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and a Research Prize Winner of the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation.

Andrew Jason Cohen is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Georgia State University in Atlanta, Georgia. He has published articles in *Ethics*, *The Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, and elsewhere. Most of his current work revolves around toleration—what it is, why it is a value, and what it requires. He seeks to determine the normative limits of toleration of individuals, families, cultural groups, business entities, and states. He has

CONTRIBUTORS

also examined issues relating to individualism, communitarianism, and the nature of exchange.

Bernard R. Boxill is Pardue Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. His essays on moral and political issues have appeared in leading philosophical journals since 1972, and have centered mainly on African American political thought, including theories of reparation, affirmative action, and race, as well as on peace, war, and related topics. He is the author of *Blacks and Social Justice* (revised edition, 1992) and the editor of *Race and Racism* (2001).

R. G. Frey is Professor of Philosophy at Bowling Green State University. He is the author or editor of numerous books and articles in moral and political philosophy, including, with Christopher Heath Wellman, one of the standard contemporary works on applied ethics, *A Companion to Applied Ethics* (2003), and, with Gerald Dworkin and Sissela Bok, one of the seminal works on euthanasia, *Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide* (1998). He is the former editor of Cambridge University Press's series in applied ethics, *For and Against*, and the editor, with Tom L. Beauchamp, of the forthcoming *Handbook on Ethics and Animals*.

H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr., is Professor of Philosophy at Rice University, and Professor Emeritus of Medicine and Community Medicine at Baylor College of Medicine in Houston, Texas. He is senior editor of the *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* and the journal *Christian Bioethics*, both published by Oxford University Press. He is also senior editor of the book series *Philosophy and Medicine*, with over one hundred volumes in print, and of the book series *Philosophical Studies in Contemporary Culture*. His publications include *The Foundations of Bioethics* (second edition, 1996), *Bioethics and Secular Humanism* (1991), and *The Foundations of Christian Bioethics* (2000). His recent edited volumes include *Global Bioethics: The Collapse of Consensus* (2006) and *Innovation and the Pharmaceutical Industry: Critical Reflections on the Virtues of Profit* (2008).